

IEEE 802.1Qbf Editor's Report
September 2010 Interim Meeting
York, UK

Bob Sultan (bsultan@huawei.com)

802.1Qbf Draft 0.2 Task Group Ballot

Ballot Results

Approve	2
Disapprove	3
Abstain	26
Total	31
Commenters	5

Comments Submitted

	Required	Not Required	Total
Technical	17	1	18
Editorial	42	4	46
Total	59	5	64

Going Forward

- Expect to issue D1.0 in time for completion of working group ballot before November meeting;
- D1.0 will reflect comments made against D0.4 but should otherwise be unchanged;

Comment Review Plan

- Commenters (and others) had opportunity to review proposed remedies before review session;
- It is proposed that all comments be accepted except for comments 4 (Panos), 62 (Zhemin) and 34 (Ting) which are proposed accept in principle;
- In the editor's opinion, only comment 62 raises a significant issue (see next slide) and requires working group discussion;
 - but if you think others require discussion, speak up!
- Other comments are related to editorial and technical errors rather than concepts or issues;

Comment Summary

- Clause 12 clarification that candidate protection segments are specified by priority;
- Suggestions to improve newly added figure 8-8; and to move IPS Control outside (above) the MAC Relay entity;
- Comment that the TESI List associated with an IPG is not defined and suggestion to replace this with 2-tuple list;
 - We agreed at last meeting that we would associate TESI List rather than 2-tuple list with IPG;
 - Current draft does not provide Clause 3 definition of TESI list and does not consistently call this the TESI List; this will be corrected;
- Improvements/corrections to state machines;
- Corrections to wording, references, figure numbers, etc.

Comment #62

- Zhemin observes that the Protection Segment Selection state machine does not work properly when 1:1 protection is configured to be in non-revertive mode;
- Panos and Zhemin suggest that a fix would be complex and would impact the 1:1 protection state machine;
- It is proposed that 1:1 protection is always revertive when M:1 protection is configured.
 - Text would be added to describe this.