IEEE 802 Response to comments on ISO/IEC JTC1/SC6 pre-ballots of IEEE 802.1Q-2014 and IEEE 802.1Xbx-2014

28 April 2015

Authors:

Name	Company	Phone	email
Karen Randall	Randall Consulting	+1 609 240-3844	karen@randall-consulting.com

This provides responses to comments on ISO/IEC JTC1/SC6 pre-ballots of IEEE 802.1Q-2014 and IEEE 802.1Xbx-2014

- The voting results on IEEE 802. 1Q-2014 in 6N16135
  - It passed 11/1/6 (China NB voted negative)
  - 2 comments were received with the China NB NO vote
- The voting results on IEEE 802.1Xbx-2014 in 6N16140
  - It passed 8/1/10 (China NB voted negative)
  - 2 comments were received with the China NB NO vote
- The comments have been processed in a timely manner using the mechanisms defined and agreed in 6N15606
- This provides the proposed responses from IEEE 802 to all comments by China NB on both of the pre-ballots.

China NB comment 1 on IEEE 802.1Q-2014

China NB comment 1 on IEEE 802.1Q-2014

- *China NB noticed that IEEE submitted IEEE 802.1Q™-2014 (N16114) and IEEE 802.1Xbx™-2014 (N16115) for 60-day ballot according to the PSDO Agreement. As we know, IEEE Std 802.1Q™-2014 conducts access control by invoking IEEE 802.1x-2010, and IEEE Std 802.1Xbx™-2014 is the enhancement standard of IEEE 802.1x-2010, however, the security problems of IEEE 802.1x-2010 still exist, therefore, we still oppose the proposals based on IEEE 802.1x.*

China NB comment 1 on IEEE 802.1Q-2014 (continued)

Proposed IEEE 802 response to CN.1 on IEEE 802.1Q-2014

- IEEE Std 802.1Q explains how it can be used in conjunction with IEEE Std 802.1X. However conformance to and use of IEEE Std 802.1X is not a requirement of any of the possible claims of conformance to IEEE Std 802.1Q (both for the mandatory and the optional requirements). In that respect the China NB understanding of the relationship between the IEEE standards is incomplete. IEEE Std 802.1Q does not depend on the use of IEEE Std 802.1X.

China NB comment 2 on IEEE 802.1Q-2014

China NB comment 2 on IEEE 802.1Q-2014

Moreover, there are non-normative references in N16114 and N16115, not all the referenced RFCs are Internet Standards or Best Current Practices, we also propose to deleted them from the drafts.

Proposed IEEE 802 response to CN.2 on IEEE 802.1Q-2014

- IEEE Std 802.1Q has been developed according to the IEEE Standards Association standards development process and IEEE-SA Standards Style Manual. Editing and maintenance will continue to be the responsibility of IEEE 802 and will conform to the IEEE policies and procedures. The mechanisms defined and agreed in 6N15606 will apply.
- It is appropriate to reference these published specifications in IEEE Standards.
- As part of the normal maintenance process for IEEE Std 802.1Q, the IEEE 802.1 WG will review the references to ensure that only required references are included, RFC references are up to date, and normative RFC references have an appropriate status. Additionally, the IETF has defined a DownRef Registry, RFC 3967 (BCP 97), "*Clarifying when Standards Track Documents may Refer Normatively to Documents at a Lower Level*". Documents added to the Registry are considered Normative by the IETF, and thus are considered as standards by the IETF.

China NB comment 1 on IEEE 802.1Xbx-2014

China NB comment 1 on IEEE 802.1Xbx-2014

- *China NB noticed that IEEE submitted IEEE 802.1Q™-2014 (N16114) and IEEE 802.1Xbx™-2014 (N16115) for 60-day ballot according to the PSDO Agreement. As we know, IEEE Std 802.1Q™-2014 conducts access control by invoking IEEE 802.1x-2010, and IEEE Std 802.1Xbx™-2014 is the enhancement standard of IEEE 802.1x-2010, however, the security problems of IEEE 802.1x-2010 still exist, therefore, we still oppose the proposals based on IEEE 802.1x.*

China NB comment 1 on IEEE 802.1Xbx-2014 (continued)

Proposed IEEE 802 response to CN.1 on IEEE 802.1Xbx-2014

- IEEE Std 802.1X is widely and successfully used by public networks today, and is the basis for many effective authentication and authorization systems. Moreover, IEEE 802 standards are subject to regular maintenance in order to ensure they remain relevant and up to date. For example, where an Extensible Authentication Protocol (EAP) is used, IEEE 802.1X-2010 mandates the use of mutual authentication methods, reflecting current needs, best practice, and experience from IEEE 802.1X-2004.
- IEEE Std 802.1X-2010 and IEEE Std 802.1Xbx-2014 do not expose the public network or its user to (unspecified) security problems as stated by the China NB comment. In the past, the China NB has alleged that man-in-the-middle (and other) attacks are possible without the technical details of such an attack being supplied or the attack being demonstrated.

China NB comment 2 on IEEE 802.1Xbx-2014

China NB comment 2 on IEEE 802.1Xbx-2014

- *Moreover, there are non-normative references in N16114 and N16115, not all the referenced RFCs are Internet Standards or Best Current Practices, we also propose to deleted them from the drafts.*

Proposed IEEE 802 response to CN.2 on IEEE 802.1Xbx-2014

- IEEE Std 802.1Xbx has been developed according to the IEEE Standards Association standards development process and IEEE-SA Standards Style Manual. Editing and maintenance will continue to be the responsibility of IEEE 802 and will conform to the IEEE policies and procedures. The mechanisms defined and agreed in 6N15606 will apply.
- It is appropriate to reference these published specifications in IEEE Standards.
- As part of the normal maintenance process for IEEE Std 802.1Xbx, the IEEE 802.1 WG will review the references to ensure that only required references are included, RFC references are up to date, and normative RFC references have an appropriate status. Additionally, the IETF has defined a DownRef Registry, RFC 3967 (BCP 97), "*Clarifying when Standards Track Documents may Refer Normatively to Documents at a Lower Level*". Documents added to the Registry are considered Normative by the IETF, and thus are considered as standards by the IETF.