

This provides responses to comments received on ISO/IEC JTC1/SC6 ballot of 802.1Qcd-2015.

The voting results on IEEE 802 in 6N16464

- Support need for ISO standard? Passed 8/0/10
- Support this submission being sent to FDIS? 6/1/11
- 1 negative vote and comment was received from the China NB

The comments have been processed in a timely manner using the mechanisms defined and agreed in 6N15606.

This document provides the responses from IEEE 802 to all comments by China NB on the ballot.

China NB comment 1

IEEE 802.1Qcd-2015 is an amendment to IEEE 802.1Q-2014 that refers to IEEE 802.1x in several chapters, such as Chapter 8.13.9, 10.1, 25.2, 25.6-2010. However, as we have mentioned in the ballots of IEEE 802.1X, IEEE 802.1Xbx, IEEE 802.1AB, IEEE 802.1AR, IEEE 802.1AS and IEEE 802.1Q, there are technical flaws in IEEE 802.1X that China expressed in 6N15555. IEEE 802.1Xbx, IEEE 802.1AB, IEEE 802.1AR, IEEE 802.1AS and IEEE 802.1Q are implemented with IEEE 802.1X or based on IEEE 802.1X, which China has already submitted the comments in 6N16140, 6N16364, 6N15626, 6N16135. Moreover, many documents distributed in SC6 have already pointed out the existing problems in IEEE 802.1X, such as 6N15613, 6N15662, 6N15523.

For IEEE 802.1QTM-2014, China has already submitted the comments on IEEE 802.1QTM-2014 during its pre-FDIS ballot and FDIS ballot about these technical flaws (security problems) in IEEE 802.1x-2010 that is referenced by IEEE 802.1QTM-2014. Up to now, there is no reasonable and appropriate disposition on Chinese comments. IEEE 802.1QcdTM-2015 is based on a standard, in which the technical flaws exist.

In summary, China suggests IEEE 802.1Qcd™-2015 should not reference the security mechanism from IEEE 802.1x-2010, or recommend enhancing its security mechanism. Otherwise, China NB will not give support on IEEE 802.1QTM-2014 and its amendment.

Proposed change: Recommend not referencing the standard with technical flaws or enhancing its security mechanism.

IEEE 802 response to CN.1 on IEEE 802.1Qcd-2015

The ballot response states that the China NB will not support IEEE 802.1Qcd-2015 because it references IEEE 802.1X-2010 (ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-1X:2013), which the China NB has repeatedly asserted is defective. However, the China NB has failed to substantiate this assertion after numerous requests from IEEE 802. IEEE 802 declines to make any change to 802.1Qcd-2015 without substantiation of the claims against IEEE 802.1X-2010. IEEE 802.1X-2010 (ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-1X:2013) has not been shown to be defective.

Furthermore, conformance to and use of IEEE 802.1X is not a requirement for conformance to IEEE 802.1Q-2014.

IEEE 802 recognizes that the China NB has asserted in the past that there are technical flaws and security problems in IEEE 802.1X-2010. However, the technical description of any of the alleged flaws, security problems, or attacks has not yet been supplied by the China NB. IEEE 802 invites the China NB to submit such technical details for consideration. In the absence of technical substantiation of the claims, IEEE 802.1 cannot consider modification of the existing ISO standards.