

## **This provides responses to comments received on ISO/IEC JTC1/SC6 ballot of 802.1AB-2016.**

The voting results on IEEE 802 in 6N16447

- Support need for ISO standard? Passed 8/1/9
- Support this submission being sent to FDIS? 8/1/9
- 1 negative vote and comment was received from the China NB

The comments have been processed in a timely manner using the mechanisms defined and agreed in 6N15606.

This document provides the responses from IEEE 802 to all comments by China NB on the ballot.

### **China NB comment 1**

*IEEE 802.1AB-2016 is the revision of IEEE 802.1AB-2009. However, IEEE 802.1AB-2016 is still implemented with IEEE 802.1X and 802.1AE which have also been proposed to ISO under the PSDO agreement. China NB has expressed objection to the submissions of IEEE 802.1X and 802.1AE and provided detailed comments. IEEE has acknowledged the receiving of China NB's comments but has not made any satisfactory attempts to change Chinese negative vote. Since Chinese objection to the base/associated standards still stands, we cannot support other standards that rely on previous standards.*

*For previous China NB comment, please refer to 6N15555 and 6N15556.*

*Proposed change: Recommend not referencing the defective standards or enhancing its security mechanism*

### **IEEE 802 response to CN.1 on IEEE 802.1AB-2016**

The ballot response states that the China NB cannot support IEEE 802.1AB-2016 because it relies on IEEE 802.1X-2010 (ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-1X:2013) and IEEE 802.1AE-2006 (ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-1AE:2013), to which the China NB has expressed objection but has not provided any technical substantiation, even after repeated requests. Therefore, IEEE 802 declines to make any change to 802.1AB-2016.

IEEE 802 recognizes that the China NB has asserted in that past that man-in-the-middle (and other) attacks are possible against IEEE 802.1X based systems. However, the technical details of such an attack (or a demonstration of an attack) have not yet been supplied by the China NB. IEEE 802 invites the China NB to submit such technical details for consideration. In the absence of technical substantiation of the claims, IEEE 802.1 cannot consider modification of the existing ISO standards.