

This provides responses to comments received on ISO/IEC JTC1/SC6 ballot of 802.1Qca-2015.

The voting results on IEEE 802 in 6N16446

- Support need for ISO standard? Passed 8/1/9
- Support this submission being sent to FDIS? 8/1/9
- 1 negative vote and comment was received from the China NB

The comments have been processed in a timely manner using the mechanisms defined and agreed in 6N15606.

This document provides the responses from IEEE 802 to all comments by China NB on the ballot.

China NB comment 1

IEEE 802.1Qca-2015 is an amendment to IEEE 802.1Q-2014 that is based on IEEE 802.1x-2010. China has already submitted the comments on IEEE 802.1Q-2014 during its pre-FDIS ballot and FDIS ballot about the security problems in IEEE 802.1x-2010 that is referenced by IEEE 802.1Q-2014. Up to now, there is no reasonable and appropriate disposition on Chinese comments. IEEE 802.1Qca-2015 is based on a defective standard; therefore, China NB cannot give support on IEEE 802.1Q-2014 and its amendment.

Proposed change: Recommend not referencing the defective standards or enhancing its security mechanism

IEEE 802 response to CN.1 on IEEE 802.1Qca-2015

The ballot response states that the China NB cannot support IEEE 802.1Qca-2015 because it relies on IEEE 802.1X-2010 (ISO/IEC /IEEE 8802-1X:2013), which the China NB has repeatedly asserted is defective but has declined to substantiate after numerous requests. IEEE 802 declines to make any change to 802.1Qca-2015. IEEE 802.1X-2010 (ISO/IEC /IEEE 8802-1X:2013) is not defective. Furthermore, conformance to and use of IEEE 802.1X is not a requirement of any of the possible claims of conformance to IEEE 802.1Q-2014.

IEEE 802 recognizes that the China NB has asserted in that past that man-in-the-middle (and other) attacks are possible against IEEE 802.1X-based systems. However, the technical details of such an attack (or a demonstration of an attack) have not yet been supplied by the China NB. IEEE 802 invites the China NB to submit such technical details for consideration. In the absence of technical substantiation of the claims, IEEE 802.1 cannot consider modification of the existing ISO standards.