P802.1AS-Rev/D5.0
Editor’s Report

Comment Resolution for 1st WG Ballot
Revision 3 (after 8/14/2017 call)

Geoffrey M. Garner
Huawei (Consultant)

gmgarner@alum.mit.edu

IEEE 802.1 TSN TG
2017.08.14
Resolution of several comments submitted prior to closing of ballot occurred during July 2017 802.1 TSN F2F meeting.

After close of ballot, resolution continued in:

- July 24, July 31, and August 7, 2017 802.1AS-Rev calls (11am – 1pm EDT)
- August 14, 2017 TSN call (approximately 11:40am – 1:10 EDT; began on conclusion of two other TSN topics)

This report summarizes the status after the August 14 call.
Thanks to all who reviewed the document and commented

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>All respondents</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>Percent</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes (voters)</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>53.85</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No (voters)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>46.6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voting Yes or No</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstain Time</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstain Expertise</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstain Other</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>45.83</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respondents</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>48.98</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voting Members</td>
<td>49</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-voting commenters</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Commenters</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Comments</td>
<td>75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TR</td>
<td>34</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ER</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Comments by Category - 1

- **Editorial Comments (Category E) that are, in the judgement of the editor, trivial**
  - These will be accepted or accepted in principle, and will not be discussed unless someone indicates a desire to discuss them
    - 27, 31, 48, 49, 50, 51, 52, 53, 54, 55, 56, 59, 60, 61
  - Already resolved (with some discussion): 3, 9, 15,
  - Not yet indicated as done; will be discussed: 71, 72, 73, 74

- **Editorial Comment (Category E) proposed to be rejected**
  - 64, 69 (this will be discussed)

- **Editorial Required Comments (Category ER)**
  - 67, 70 (will not be discussed)
  - 22, 57, 58, 66 (will be discussed)

- **Technical (T) and Technical Required (TR) Comments; will be discussed**
  - Related to 802.11 and already done: 1, 2, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14
  - Related to 802.11 and not yet done: 62, 63 (E, but related to FTM; will be discussed with 802.11 comments)
Technical (T) and Technical Required (TR) Comments; will be discussed (cont.)

- Resolved at July, 2017 face-to-face meeting: 30
- Resolved July 31, 2017: 41 – 45, 16, 17, 18, 20, 39
- Resolved August 7, 2017: 46, 23, 25, 26, 28, 29, 32, 36, 37, 38
- Other T and TR comments (not related to 802.11, and not yet resolved): 19, 21, 24, 33, 34, 35, 40, 47, 65, 68, 75
  - Of these, the following were briefly discussed on August 7, and deferred to future call (when other interested participants are present): 21, 24, 33, 34, 35
Comments planned for Next Few Calls

August 21, 2017 (Monday)
- Comments 20 and 39 (grouped)
- Comments 57, 58, 72 (grouped) (if commenter of 57 and 58 is present, and if time))
- Comments 33, 34, 35 (grouped) (if time)
- Remaining T, TR, and ER comments (if time)
  • Except comments 62, 63 (these are deferred to September, 2017 802.1 interim meeting)

August 28, 2017 (Monday)
- Comments not completed on August 21 (except comments 62, 63, which are deferred to F2F meeting)

September, 2017 IEEE 802.1 F2F meeting
- Comments 62, 63
- Other comments not completed in 802.1AS-Rev calls