

P802.1Qcx CFM YANG

Resolution of Comments on
Project Authorization Request (PAR) and
Criteria for Standards. Development (CSD)

2017-07-12

802.3 Comment on PAR 5.3

› Comment:

5.3 (contingencies) — If this project is dependent on completion of the 802.1Q revision so that it can be considered by RevCom per the 3 year 3 amendment rule P802.1Q should also be stated. Per PAR form instructions, the document titles should also be included in an 8.1 explanatory note.

› Response:

Accept

–5:3 extended with “IEEE P802.1Q-Rev”

–8.1 extended with

› “IEEE P802.1Q-Rev Bridges and Bridged Networks”

› “IEEE P802.1Qcp Bridges and Bridged Networks – Amendment: YANG Data Model”

802.3 Comment on PAR 6.1.b

Comment:

- › 6.1.b (registration activity) — Please reconsider if this question is answered correctly. Will the new specifications reference registry assignments or terms (Std 802.1Q certainly does). An 8.1 explanation of the yes or no should not be forgotten (for yes what registries/terms are being used (e.g., OUI/CID or EUI addresses); if no indicate that Connectivity Fault Management does not use registry terms in its operational specifications or the terms will not be used in the YANG specifications). Based on a recent ProCom ad hoc, CFM op code assignments are made and will be coordinated in the 8.1 note. If not answered yes, the ad hoc work should cause this project to be flagged for RAC review anyway because those assignments are by IEEE-SA definition, a registry.

802.3 Comment on PAR 6.1.b

Response:

› 6.1.b answer changed to Yes

Explanation added:

“The YANG Data Model will be assigned a URN based on the RA URN tutorial and IEEE Std 802d. The YANG data model will use a type definition for MAC addresses.”

› 8.1 item updated to:

“IEEE Std 802.1Q assigns CFM OpCodes, but this project will not make any changes or additions to the CFM OpCodes. This project will be coordinated with organizations for whom CFM OpCodes have been previously assigned.”

802.3 Comment on CSD 1.1.1

› Comment:

1.1.1 (management) — The answer is a bit strange. The question asks nothing about SNMP. Perhaps simply: "This project is primarily a management project that adds enabling specifications for management of specific IEEE 802.1Q capabilities through YANG data models."

› Response:

Accept in principle

1.1.1 updated to:

"This project is primarily a management project that enables the management of IEEE 802.1Q CFM using a YANG data model."

802.3 Comment on CSD 1.2.5 item a)

› Comment:

1.2.5 (economic feasibility) item a)

It might be better to indicate that YANG remote management utilizes a balance between end-station and infrastructure capabilities.

› Response:

Accept in principle

1.2.5 item a) updated to:

“Management using YANG utilizes a balance between end station and infrastructure capabilities; the balance will be similar to that of existing management methods.”

802.3 Comment on CSD 1.2.5 item b)

› Comment:

1.2.5 (economic feasibility) item b)

If SNMP management is already defined for the subject 802.1Q capabilities, indicating the balance will be similar to that for SNMP management, if not, provide more substance in the response.

› Response:

Accept in principle

1.1.1 updated to:

“The cost factors will be similar to those of existing management methods.”

802.3 Comment on CSD 1.2.5 item c) and d)

Comment:

› 1.2.5 (economic feasibility) item c) and d)

It isn't clear why a vague response about VLAN bridges is relevant to management of Connectivity Fault Management. If this project simply adds to a YANG base capability for the listed 802.1Q functions, that should be stated in a more descriptive response. For what types of existing implementations will it improve installation and operation costs. Is the cost benefit from eliminating multiple management platforms and this is one more module in a complete YANG solution, if so, that should be stated somewhere and considered in responses to economic feasibility.

802.3 Comment on CSD 1.2.5 item c) and d) Response:

› Accept in principle

1.2.5 item c) updated to:

“This project extends the YANG capabilities of IEEE Std 802.1Q with CFM as a step towards a complete YANG management solution. This helps to eliminate multiple management platforms, thus reduces installation cost.”

1.2.5 item d) updated to:

“This project extends the YANG capabilities of IEEE Std 802.1Q with CFM as a step towards a complete YANG management solution. This helps to eliminate multiple management platforms, thus reduces operational cost.”