This provides responses to comments JTC1 ballot of IEEE 802.1AC-2016 (ISO/IEC/ IEEE FDIS 8802-1AC).

The voting results on IEEE 802.1AC-2016 (ISO/IEC/IEEE FDIS 8802-1AC):

- Passed 12/1/11
- 1 comment was received with the China NB NO vote

China NB comment 1 on IEEE 802.1AC-2016 (ISO/IEC/IEEE FDIS 8802-1AC)

ISO/IEC/IEEE FDIS 8802-1AC is implemented with IEEE 802.11 architecture and 802.1AE security technology. China NB has submitted comments regarding to IEEE 802.11 and 802.1AE because there are security technology defects in the two referenced standards (please refer to 6N15494 and 6N15556). However, ISO/IEC/IEEE FDIS 8802-1AC still adopts the two defective standards. Therefore, China NB cannot support this proposal.

Proposed change: It is recommended not to reference the defective standards and to enhance its security mechanisms.

The comments have been processed in a timely manner using the mechanisms defined and agreed in 6N15606.

This document provides the responses from IEEE 802 to the comment by China NB on this ballot.

IEEE 802 response to CN.1 on IEEE 802.1AC-2016 (ISO/IEC/IEEE FDIS 8802-1AC).

The China NB's ballot response states it will not approve 802.1AC-2016 (ISO/IEC/ IEEE FDIS 8802-1AC) because it references IEEE 802.1AE-2006 (ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-1AE:2013), which the China NB has consistently and repeatedly asserted is defective since at least 2012.

The documents referenced in the China NB ballot (6N15494 and 6N15556) date from 2012 and 2013 and responses to comments were submitted from IEEE 802 at that time. The general assertions raised in the China NB's ballot were discussed at length in 2013 at an IEEE 802 meeting in Geneva (with IEEE 802 and Switzerland NB representatives in attendance) and in both 2013 and 2014 at SC6 meetings in Seoul and Ottawa (with IEEE 802, China NB and Switzerland NB representatives in attendance). During those meetings, IEEE 802 fully responded to all of the claims made by both the China NB and Switzerland NB representatives and also provided additional information about the design and specification of IEEE 802 technologies.

Since that time, however, the China NB has failed to substantiate these assertions, despite numerous requests from IEEE 802. The invitation for a representative of the China NB (as well as representative from other interested SC6 NBs) to attend an IEEE 802 Plenary meeting remains open.

IEEE 802 believes that the security defects asserted by the China NB have all been shown to be not valid and will not make changes to IEEE 802.1AC-2016 (ISO/IEC/IEEE FDIS 8802-1AC) without substantiation of these assertions.