P802.1AS-Rev/D8.0
Editor’s Report

Proposed Comment Resolution for Sponsor Ballot

Geoffrey M. Garner
Huawei (Consultant)

gmgarner@alum.mit.edu

IEEE 802.1 TSN TG
2019.03.25
Ballot Statistics

Thanks to all who reviewed the document and commented

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>All respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes (voters)</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No (voters)</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voting Yes or No</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstain Time</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstain Expertise</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstain Total</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respondents</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voting Members</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-voting commenters</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Commenters</td>
<td>25 (11 voted No)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Comments</td>
<td>421</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TR</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ER</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Comments Done So Far and Grouped Comments

Comments resolved in 2019-03-04 TSN call (22 comments):


Grouped comments:

- Referencing 802.1 presentations: 3, 4
- Definitions of precision and accuracy: 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 266, 370, 371
- Hyperlinking list items: 345, 347, 348, 359
- Superscript for $2^{-16}$: 355, 356, 357, 358
- Put definitions from 1588 in a separate subclause: 387, 388, 389, 393
- PTP Link and PTP Port: 264, 391
- PTP Instance definition: 247, 390
- Font sizes in figures: 340 (and possibly others)
- Replace the word “slave” with an equivalent word: 31 – 47, 52 – 226 (192 comments)
- syncLocked and +/- 1 s accuracy for originTimestamp and preciseOriginTimestamp fields, in 1588: 282, 283, 284

IEEE 802.1 TSN
Grouped Comments - 2

Grouped comments:

- Figures not in sections where referenced: 402, 403 (note that 2 comments done in 32019-03-04 call also were on this topic)
- “Detection, Correction, Action” in discussion of redundancy: 401, 244, 245
- Wrong use of “may”: 15, 16, 336, 337, 231, 17, 18, 19
- Add new figures to Clause 7: 404, 405
- Referencing 1588 (both 2011 and Rev): 5, 375, 376, 377
- ISS Priority for PTP messages: 30, 317, 318, 29
- Typo (missing space): 383, 21; 373, 229 (2 different places)
- Several distinct topics that are referenced by related comments:
  - tlvType should be ORGANIZATION_EXTENSION_DO_NOT_PROPAGATE: 257, 406
  - Making Table 10-6 consistent with IEEE 1588-Rev: 242, 250, 266
  - Domain 0; TLV forwarding: 265, 233, 407
- EPON referencing construction of sourcePortIdentity incorrectly: 48, 277
- RAC comments and related comments: 49, 280
- RAC comments and related comments: 19, 50, 279
- Editorial – delete strikethroughs: 16, 259, 235, 260
Grouped Comments - 2

Grouped comments:

- Wrong data types in Table 14-10: 234, 298, 299, 301, 302, 305
- Remove subclause 14.15.3 on sdoId: 241, 309
- Rewording certain subclauses of Clause 14 to make it clear that the respective managed objects are RW and not R: 303, 304, 306, 307, 308, 312, 313, 314, 315
- Logic in state machines that set rates on receiving a Signaling Message with a TLV: 409, 412, 410, 411, 413