Proposed Comment Resolution for Sponsor Ballot V04

Geoffrey M. Garner
Huawei (Consultant)

gmgarner@alum.mit.edu

IEEE 802.1 TSN TG
2019.04.29
Thanks to all who reviewed the document and commented.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>All respondents</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>Percent</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes (voters)</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>87 (87.93)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No (voters)</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>12.07</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voting Yes or No</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstain Time</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstain Expertise</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstain Total</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5.69</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respondents</td>
<td>123</td>
<td>75.93</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voting Members</td>
<td>162</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-voting commenters</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Commenters</td>
<td>25 (11 voted No)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Comments</td>
<td>421</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TR</td>
<td>108</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T</td>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ER</td>
<td>22</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>57</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR</td>
<td>196</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G</td>
<td>22</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Comments Done So Far and Grouped Comments

- Comments not listed below or on slides that follow will be discussed (in addition, there could be duplicate listings)

- Comments resolved in 2019-03-04 TSN call (22 comments):

- Grouped comments:
  - Referencing 802.1 presentations: 3, 4
  - Definitions of precision and accuracy: 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 266, 370, 371
  - Hyperlinking list items: 345, 347, 348, 359
  - Superscript for $2^{-16}$: 355, 356, 357, 358
  - Put definitions from 1588 in a separate subclause: 387, 388, 389, 393
  - PTP Link and PTP Port: 264, 391
  - PTP Instance definition: 247, 390
  - Font sizes in figures: 340 (and possibly others)
  - Replace the word “slave” with an equivalent word: 31 – 47, 52 – 226 (192 comments)
Grouped Comments - 2

- **Grouped comments:**
  - syncLocked and +/- 1 s accuracy for originTimestamp and preciseOriginTimestamp fields, in 1588: 282, 283, 284
  - Figures not in sections where referenced: 402, 403 (note that 2 comments done in 2019-03-04 call also were on this topic)
  - “Detection, Correction, Action” in discussion of redundancy: 401, 244, 245
  - Wrong use of “may”: 15, 16, 336, 337, 231, 17, 18, 19
  - Add new figures to Clause 7: 404, 405
  - Referencing 1588 (both 2011 and Rev): 5, 375, 376, 377
  - ISS Priority for PTP messages: 30, 317, 318, 29
  - Several distinct topics that are referenced by related comments:
    - tlvType should be ORGANIZATION_EXTENSION_DO_NOT_PROPAGATE: 257, 406
    - Making Table 10-6 consistent with IEEE 1588-Rev: 250, 266
    - Domain 0; TLV forwarding: 265, 233, 407
  - EPON referencing construction of sourcePortIdentity incorrectly: 48, 277
  - RAC comments and related comments: 49, 280
Grouped comments:

- RAC comments and related comments: 19, 50, 279
- Remove subclause 14.15.3 on sdold: 241, 309
- Logic in state machines that set rates on receiving a Signaling Message with a TLV: 409, 412, 410, 411, 413
- How to refer to 1588-Rev: 25, 316, 374
- Domains: 399, 400
- Rewording certain subclauses of Clause 14 to make it clear that the respective managed objects are RW and not R: 303, 304, 306, 307, 308, 312, 313, 314, 315
- Wrong data types in Table 14-10: 234, 242, 298, 299, 301, 302, 305
Other comments (49 comments, not grouped)

The following editorial comments are considered to be straightforward and can be accepted; it is planned to accept them, and discuss them only if there is a request to discuss them:

- Delete strikethroughs: 16, 259, 235, 260
- Typo (missing space): 383, 21; 373, 229 (2 different places)

Other editorial comments (15 comments; these will be discussed):

- 272, 273, 325, 344, 346, 369, 379, 380, 382, 386, 414, 415, 416, 419, 420