IEEE 802.1 Minutes, November 1997

Pre-meeting, Monday, November 10, 1997

802.1p/D8 Ballot Comment Disposition - Tony Jeffree

      Comment 1: Make change
      Comment 2: Make change
      Comment 3: Make change
      Comment 4: Make change
      Comment 5: Make sure p and Q are consistent
      Comment 6: TBD

802.1Q/D7 Ballot Comment Disposition - Tony Jeffree

      Issue 1 Management issues
            Comment 1 P9: Drop it
            Comment 2 P9 & Comment 130 P54: Editor will clarify
            Comment 48 P22: Editor will clarify
            Comment 3 P9: Editor will clarify
            Comment 22 P13: Editor will rework
            Comment 38 P18: Yes, with some clarification
            Comment 57 P26: Yes, add it
            Comment 87 P35: Editor will clarify text
            Comment 141 P56: Editor will clarify text
            Comment 181 P67: Leave as is
            Comment 109 P42: Leave as is

      Comments 2, 48, and 3 were discussed and resolved together
      Comments 181 and 109 were discussed and resolved together

      Issue 2 Conformance Issues
            Comment 20 P13: Editor will make change
            Comment 145 P58: Yes. Question was asked would anyone vote no if this is allowed.
            No one indicated they would vote no on this issue.

Opening Working Group Plenary, Monday, November 10, 1997

Review Opening Plenary Agenda - Bill Lidinsky

Voting Membership - Jeff Dietz
      The rules for becoming a voting member of 802.1 were reviewed.
      A list of the current-voting members was displayed.

Approve July and September Meeting Minutes - Bill Lidinsky
Motion: Approve July 1997 and the September 1997 meeting minutes.

      Move: Michael Wright
      Second: Tony Jeffree

      YES: YES - 1   NO: 0   ABSTAIN: 1

Executive Committee Report - Bill Lidinsky

> Money Reserve
> Fiber bit rate
> Conditional approval for sponsor ballot
> Voting rights
> Overview and Architecture - Alan Chambers
> Executive committee makeup
> University student discount for 802 Plenary sessions
> Purchase of projectors
> Hibernation for .2, .4, and .6
> IEEE/SA
> 802 Web sites. Create pointer to each of the working group's web sites.
> 802.1 needs a Webmaster!!!
> Ethertype procedures

802.1G Remote Mac Bridging - Bill Lidinsky & Alan Chambers
> Alan is doing lots of minor editing. 802.1G will be published 1Q98 as ISO 15802-5.

802.1 Completed Ballots - Bill Lidinsky
> Thanks to Tony for his efforts.
> Thanks to all of .1 for reviews and comments.

802.0 Overview and Architecture & Functional Requirements Document(FRD) - Alan Chambers
> The five criteria for a PAR will be moved to the operating rules. Some other stuff will be moved
> to the Overview and Architecture document. This will complete the demise of the FRD. Another
> ballot of Overview and Architecture will be needed before March Plenary.

802.1D, 802.1d, 802.1p, 10038, 15802-3 - Bill Lidinsky
> ANSI is willing to use 802.1p document in place of 10038-1993.
> Meetings this week with the 802 executive committee will determine how to proceed.

802.3ac - Bill Lidinsky
> There was a meeting held by the .3ac task force with Tony and Bill attending.
> 802.1 will have five members and 802.5 will have two members voting on 802.3ac.

Tagged Frame Ethertype - Bill Lidinsky
> The following resolution was offered.
>
> RESOLUTION:
> > 802.1 resolves that the TPID value that shall be allocated for use in the 802.1Q standard
> > shall be 81 - 00, as donated for this purpose by Bay Networks. The editor of 802.1Q is
> > therefore instructed to incorporate this value in the relevant table in the next draft of
> > 802.1Q
>
> Move: Tony Jeffree
> Second: David Delaney
>
> YES: Unanimous   NO: 0   ABSTAIN: 0

<u>Ethertype for Bay Networks - Bill Lidinsky</u>
> Bill Lidinsky agreed to start the process of obtaining replacement Ethertype for Bay Networks.
> The procedure for getting an Ethertype from the IEEE is not in place.
> Bill is meeting with the executive committee this week to establish the procedure.

<u>Interoperability Laboratory of University of New Hampshire - Barry Reinhold</u>
> Barry Reinhold of U of H Interoperability Laboratory presented how the laboratory could setup interoperability testing of 802.1Q bridges.

<u>Flow Control - Bill Lidinsky</u>
> Flow Control may become an 802.1 work item. It needs to be considered further by members of 802.1

<u>802.11c Standard for Wireless LAN Bridging - Bill Lidinsky</u>
> A PAR exists for this work.
> 802.11 will develop the standard and 802.1 will review it.
> 802.1 needs to establish a working arrangement with 802.11.

<u>Agenda for the rest of the Week - Bill Lidinsky, Tony Jeffree, and Mick Seaman</u>
> Continue with Q ballot responses.
> Presentation on GARP Proprietary Attribute Registration Protocol (GPRP).
> Parallel Link usage - 802.3 will present a tutorial Tuesday at 8:00pm.
> Overview and Architecture ballot comment review.

<u>Technical Plenary - Bill Lidinsky</u>
> No technical plenary will be held this week.

Working Group Session, Tuesday AM, November 11, 1997

<u>802.1Q/D7 Ballot Comment Disposition - Tony Jeffree</u>
> The following issues were dealt with during this session. To see the disposition of each comment see the Disposition of Ballot Comments document for each revision. This document is available on the ftp server.
>
> Issue 2: Conformance Issues
> > VIDs and PVIDs
> > > Comments 29, 92, 152, 93, 149, and 107 were handled.
> > Discard frames parameter
> > > Comments 125, 158, 177, 183, 184, 162, 151, and 190 were handled.

Working Group Session, Tuesday PM, November 11, 1997

<u>802.1Q/D7 Ballot Comment Disposition - Tony Jeffree</u>
> The following issues were dealt with during this session. To see the disposition of each comment see the Disposition of Ballot Comments document for each revision. This document is available on the ftp server.
>
> Issue 3: Miscellaneous Issues
> > Comments 1, 91, 94, 96, 198, 155, 99, 102, 117, 115, 137, and 161 were handled.
> Issue 4: Token Ring issues (Source routing)
> > Comments 53, 59, 114, 113, and 116 were handled

Working Group Session, Wednesday AM, November 12, 1997

802.1Q/D7 Ballot Comment Disposition - Tony Jeffree
> The following issues were dealt with during this session. To see the disposition of each comment see the Disposition of Ballot Comments document for each revision. This document is available on the ftp server.

> Issue 5: Terminology
> > Comments 98, 167, and 50 were handled.
> Issue 6: FDB Issues
> > Comments 118, 148, 203, 118, 163, 174, 49, and 201 were handled.
> Side Bar discussion:
> Several folks expressed interest in looking at IP multicast issues in VLANs. Also, several folks expressed interest in looking at multiple spanning trees. See Closing Plenary Future Work section later in this document.

Working Group Session, Wednesday PM, November 12, 1997

802.1Q/D7 Ballot Comment Disposition - Tony Jeffree
> The following issues were dealt with during this session. To see the disposition of each comment see the Disposition of Ballot Comments document for each revision. This document is available on the ftp server.

> New Problem: Static entries in the shared model has implications for handling multicast packets. Resolution: The editor will clarify the text to show how to handle multicast. Allow multicast to be treated MFD in a SFD bridge.

> During this time period there was a parallel meeting to review ballot comments for the Overview and Architecture document.

> Issue 6: FDB Issues
> > Comments 118, 148, 203, 118 parts 1 and 2, and 163 were handled.

Working Group Session, Thursday AM, November 13, 1997

802.1Q/D7 Ballot Comment Disposition - Tony Jeffree
> The following issues were dealt with during this session. To see the disposition of each comment see the Disposition of Ballot Comments document for each revision. This document is available on the ftp server

> Bob Wittosch's Comments
> > Comments 208, 210, and 211 were handled.
> Wayne Hathway's Comments
> > Comments 28 and 36 were handled

Discard Tagged and Discard Untagged Discussion - Tony Jeffree

There was much discussion .

Eventually, a straw poll was taken. The following six options were considered. Only yes votes were taken and you could vote yes as many times as you desired.

	Option	YES Votes
1)	As agreed yesterday.	10
2)	Remove "Discard Tagged"	25
3)	Add read only parameter to say "this port is non tagged aware and may behave nonstandard"	7
4)	Two plus Three	16
5)	Keep as in current standard	2
6)	Manageable parameter to permit all combinations from the group VLAN tagged, untagged, and priority tagged.	9

Two questions were asked after the vote.

Question 1) Is item 2 completely unacceptable to anyone? Answer: No
Question 2) Is item 4 completely unacceptable to anyone? Answer: Yes

Option 2 was agreed based upon the straw vote.

The morning meeting adjourned so folks could attend the 802.3 Trunking discussion.

Closing Working Group Plenary, Thursday, November 13, 1997

802.3 Trunking Meeting - Bill Lidinsky

A meeting sponsored by 802.3 will be held in Bellevue, WA on Feb 4, 1998.

Meeting location information:
Doubletree
Bellevue Center
818 112 Avenue NE
Bellevue, WA 98004
Telephone: 425-455-1515
Fax: 425-454-3964

Location: 20 minutes from SeaTac airport.
Estimated cost is 142 per night single or double occupancy.

Straw poll asking who plans to attend:
18 would probably attend
15 would stay overnight Thursday
15 would stay overnight Tuesday

Interim Meeting - Bill Lidinsky
>Hard stop at Friday noon.
>It will be held in conjunction with the 802.3 Trunking meeting.
>Venue: Bellevue, WA
>Dates: Feb. 4 - 6, 1997

>Resolution: An interim meeting will be held in Bellevue, WA on Feb. 4 - 6, in conjunction with 802.3.

>Move: Jeffree
>Second: Backes

>YES: YES - 1   NO: 0   Abstain: 1

Voting Membership - Dietz
>Voting rules were reviewed and a list of voting members was displayed.

Email Exploder - Hal Keen

FTP Site - Bill Lidinsky
>A discussion of managing the ftp site took place.

802.11c Presentation - Victoria Poncini
>A presentation concerning the work in .11 concerning bridging.
>Bill Lidinsky stated "We need some .1 folks to look at the .11c work."
>Tony Jeffree and Alan Chambers volunteered.

802.3ac - Bill Lidinsky
>The five voting liaisons for 802.3ac from 802.1 are Norm Finn, Andrew Smith, Dave Delaney, Tony Jeffree, and Mick Seaman.

802.1G Remote MAC Bridging Status and Publishing Plans - Alan Chambers
>The standard will be published in the first quarter of 1998 as an ISO standard. There will not be a separate 802 document published.

Ethertype acquisition process - Bill Lidinsky
>Floyd will get the procedure and publish it on the mailer.

Useful information on 802.1 - Bill Lidinsky and Tony Jeffree
>There are several documents on the ftp site that describe "How 802.1 works" Hal Keen will cleanup, Bill and Tony will publish.

802.1p/D9 - Tony Jeffree

D9 will go to sponsor ballot.

There is a problem, 802.1D needs to be revised in IEEE and ISO. Tony recommends, since 802.1p is a superset of 802.1D, 802.1p be used instead of revising 802.1D.

RESOLUTION:

Resolve that
802.1p/D9 traffic Class Expediting and Dynamic Multicast Filtering be submitted for sponsor ballot as

802.1D: Standard for Local Area Network MAC (Media Access Control) Bridges: Revision.

Move: Tony Jeffree
Second: Robin Tasker

YES: 31   NO: 0   ABSTAIN: 0

RESOLUTION:

802.1 instructs the editor of 802.1p to include the standard multicast addresses, allocated for GARP application use, in the next draft of 802.1p. The addresses are 01-80-C2-00-00-20 through 01-80-C2-00-00-2F.

Move: Tony Jeffree
Second: Hal Keen

YES: 30   NO: 0   ABSTAIN: 0

RESOLUTION:

Whereas:
The editor for TR11802-2 has provisionally allocated the following block of standard group MAC addresses for use by 802.1D, pending a formal allocation request: 01-80-C2-00-00-20 through 01-80-C2-00-00-2F
Therefore:
Resolve that 802 SEC initiate a formal request to SC6, through appropriate channels, that the provisional allocation be approved.

Move: Tony Jeffree
Second: Jeff Dietz

YES: 27   NO: 0   ABSTAIN: 1

RESOLUTION:

802.1 instructs the Editor of P802.1p to revise the document in accordance with the ballot resolutions agreed during the Montreal meeting, November 1997.

Move: Tony Jeffree
Second: Michael Wright

YES: 27   NO: 0   ABSTAIN: 1

RESOLUTION:
> 802.1 instructs the Editor of P802.1Q to revise the document in accordance with the ballot resolutions agreed during the Montreal meeting, November 1997. The resultant document, P802.1Q/D8, to be circulated for 30-day working group ballot during the December time-frame.

Move: Tony Jeffree
Second: Alan Chambers

YES: 29   NO: 0   ABSTAIN: 0

RESOLUTION:
> Resolve that
>> P802.1Q/D8 Virtual Bridge Local Area Networks be forwarded for sponsor ballot subject to the upcoming 30 day working group ballot be successfully completed, passing without any outstanding negative ballots.

Move: Tony Jeffree
Second: Hal Keen

Side bar: At this point Bill Lidinsky ask "Is anyone going to vote no on .1Q?"
> No one indicated they would vote no.

YES: 27   NO: 0   ABSTAIN: 0

Overview and Architecture - Alan Chambers

RESOLUTION:
> 802.1 instructs the editor for Overview and Architecture, Alan Chambers, to complete the revision of P802/D24 in accordance with the proposals in the Proposed Disposition of Comments on P802/D23 (8802.1 - 97). The resulting text is to be submitted for WG ballot in 802.1 as P802/D25 and distributed to 802 SEC with a view to encouraging liaison responses from other WGs.

Move: Alan Chambers
Second: Chin

YES: 26   NO: 0   ABSTAIN: 0

Synchronization of Ballots - Bill Lidinsky
> .1Q ballot will go out in mid December and run to mid January.
> 802 Overview and Architecture will go out in mid December with a working group ballot running mid January to mid February.

Trunking
> A study group is being requested.

New Work Investigation Proposal - Bill Lidinsky and Tony Jeffree
> Tony gave a short presentation on GPRP: GARP Proprietary Attribute Registration Protocol. This document is available on the ftp site.

New Work Investigation and Contributions - Bill Lidinsky
        The following areas have been proposed as possible new work for 802.1.

        Non-port based VLANs
        QoS over 802 bridges in Internet and ATM environments
        Flow and rate control

        If you have a contribution put it on the ftp site in incoming and notify one of the 802.1
management   folks. They are Bill Lidinsky, Alan Chambers, Tony Jeffree, Jeff Dietz, or Michael
Wright.

New Work Proposal - Multiple Spanning Trees - Norm Finn
        There was a discussion about multiple spanning trees and the level of interest in the group to
        pursue this idea.

Webmaster - Bill Lidinsky
        Someone volunteered to be the Webmaster. My apologies I did not get individual's name!

Plenary Pre-registration - Bill Lidinsky
        The exec is considering email registration for the Plenaries. There would be a fifty dollar price
        difference between on site registration and email. Email registration would be $250 and on site
        would rise to $300.

Pre-Meeting at March Plenary - Bill Lidinsky

        RESOLUTION:
            802.1 will hold a pre-meeting at the March Plenary in Irvine, CA starting at 9:00am
            Monday.

        Move: Tony Jeffree
        Second: Jim Binder

        YES: Unanimous   NO: 0   ABSTAIN: 0

2000 Venues - Bill Lidinsky
        The possible plenary meeting sites were discussed.

Question about 802.1D - Bill Lidinsky
        Someone wrote to 802.1 asking if an 802.1D compliant bridge should forward BDPUs if
spanning   tree is turned off.

        802.1's response is: 802.1D does not support turning off spanning tree therefore the standard
does   not address this configuration.

Motion to Adjourn
        RESOLUTION:
            Move the meeting be adjourned.

        Move: Tony Jeffree
        Second: Michael Wright

        YES: Unanimous   NO: 0   ABSTAIN: 0