IEEE 802.1 Minutes, March 1998

Pre-Meeting, Monday, March 9, 1998

Order of Business – Tony Jeffree
>> The pre-meeting will handle the confirmation ballot of .1Q and the sponsor ballot of .1p/D

Ballot Comments for 802.1Q
>> Comment 7 – Satoshi Obara – Make the change
>> Comment 8 – Robin Tasker – Accept Tony's disposition
>> Comment 9 – Rosemary Slager – Rosemary accepted Tony's disposition.

>> All comments were resolved to the satisfaction of the commentator, therefore, 802.1Q has a "clean" confirmation ballot. 802.1Q is ready for sponsor ballot.

Sponsor Ballot for 802.1p
>> Tony Jeffree's Comments
>>>> Comment 1 – Bit ordering – make same as Q
>>>> Comment 2 – Pics issue – make same as Q
>>>> Comment 3 – Pics management operations – make the change
>> David Carlson
>>>> Comment 4 – Update references – This will be completed before publication
>> Rich Seifert
>>>> Comment 5 – Change bars – Next draft, if needed, will have change bars
>>>> Comment 6 – 802.11 is now a standard
>>>> Comment 7 – Change the title of the section
>>>> Comment 8 – Fix title of section
>>>> Comment 9 – Fix reference revision level
>>>> Comment 10 – FER – Reject change
>>>> Comment 11 – Editorial
>>>> Comment 12 – Type/Length Field. This will be fixed in a maintenance revision.
>>>> Comment 13 – FCS pad field. Tony will clarify.
>>>> Comment 14 – Editorial
>>>> Comment 15 – Code Representation - Rejected
>>>> Comment 16 – Terminology – Make the change
>>>> Comment 17 – References – Tony will add reference
>> Alan Chambers
>>>> Comment 18 – Make the change
>>>> Comment 19 – Editorial
>> David Law
>>>> Comment 20 – Make the change
>>>> Comment 21 – Editorial
>>>> Comment 22 – Editorial
>>>> Comment 23 – Editorial
>>>> Comment 24 – Make the change
>>>> Comment 25 – Editorial
>>>> Comment 26 – Editorial
>>>> Comment 27 – Editorial
>>>> Comment 28 – Remove the No option
>>>> Comment 29 – Editorial
>>>> Comment 30 – Revise the text
>>>> Comment 31 – Editorial
>>>> Comment 32 – Editorial

Opening Working Group Plenary, Monday, March 9, 1998

Voters and voting – Bill Lidinsky
>Alan and Michael will take Jef's place for this meeting.

Minutes from Montreal and Seattle Meetings - Bill Lidinsky
>Look at them. There will be a vote to approve Thursday.

802 Plenary Meeting Fees - Bill Lidinsky
>Everyone has to pay!

Theft of laptops - Bill Lidinsky
>Reminder that laptops have been stolen out of meeting rooms at this hotel, so watch them.

Report on the Executive Committee Meeting - Bill Lidinsky
>US TAG – Position to ISO on .1D will be forwarded.
>Purchase of XGA overhead projectors. They have been purchased and are available for use
>Hibernation rules and executive committee makeup – There is ongoing discussions about the makeup and length of term of members of the executive committee.
>Pre-registration via email is now available
>802.11 paperless ballots – Flash cards for ballots.
>Personal Area Networks (PAN) has been placed in .11. There will be a tutorial.
>Turf battle between IEEE-CS and IEEE standards board. CS wants to regulate.
>International participation fund – 802 is paying for almost the entire SEC 6, JTC 1, we should reduce the outlay.

Reaffirmation of 802.0 chairs - Bill Lidinsky
>It is time to vote for the chairs of the dot groups.

Reaffirmation of 802.1 chair – Alan Chambers
>Motion: Reaffirm Bill Lidinsky as chair of 802.1

>Move: Tony Jeffree
>Second: Michael Wright

>YES: 28   NO: 0   ABSTAIN: 1

Reaffirmation of 802.1 vice chair – Bill Lidinsky
>Motion: Nominate Tony Jeffree for vice chair of 802.1

>Move: Mick Seaman
>Second: Alan Chambers

>YES: 21   NO: 0   ABSTAIN: 1

Ethertype Field Acquisition Process – Mick Seaman
>There is now a process in place to acquire an Ethertype. The RAC is getting an independent technical advisor to make sure a particular protocol is okay. Mart Morley is the technical advisor. There will be a meeting of the RAC during this working plenary. There is also info on the IEEE web page about getting an ethertype.

802.1 Web Page – Sundar Subramaniam
>There are a couple of links that are not working.
>We need to populate the news and projects sections.

<u>802.11 Service Definition – Tony Jeffree</u>
.11 has written and balloted their part for .1D. It will go to sponsor ballot after this meeting. Tony and Alan think the text looks good.

<u>Garp Proprietary Attribute Registration Protocol (GPRP) - Bill Lidinsky</u>
.1 needs a par for this work. Tony will have one for Thursday.

<u>Sponsor ballot for 802.1Q - Bill Lidinsky</u>
802.1Q is ready to go to sponsor ballot.

<u>802.3 Interim Meeting on Link Aggregation - Bill Lidinsky</u>
There will be an 802.3 interim meeting in May, hosted by Cabletron, in the Boston area.
There are several issues with link aggregation and bridges – Mick Seaman.
Who is planning to attend?

<u>Technical Plenary - Bill Lidinsky</u>
Link Aggregation will have a presentation at 8:30 PM.
There will not be an 802.1 Technical Plenary on Wednesday.

<u>802.1D and 802.1Q Plans for the Week – Tony Jeffree</u>
Both ballots have passed. There is one negative ballot on .1D. Tony will be talking to Rich Seifert, the negative voter, to see if our disposition is acceptable. If it is not we will have to do a formal rebuttal. We have to construct the US position for the ISO ballot that is underway now. Tony recommends that we take this morning depositions to create a US position. In the closing plenary we need motions to take .1Q to sponsor ballot, .1D to REVCOM, and forward US position on .1D to the US TAG.
We are finished with .1p/D and .1Q for this meeting.

<u>Overview and Architecture – Alan Chambers</u>
Wednesday afternoon we will review ballot comments.

<u>802.1 New Work Items – Mick Seaman</u>
Mick reviewed the list of possible new work items.

Multiple Spanning Tree
802.1D Maintenance PAR
Effects of Link Aggregation on .1D
        Ports merging and demerging, spanning tree effects, filtering database effects.
GPRP
Spanning Tree Reconfiguration
        Times and Timers
Additional Ingress Rules (Non-port based VLANs)
Filtering Database Configuration Rules
Flow Control
LAN Aggregation – Cabletron will have a presentation.
QOS Discussion

We need folks to bring in PAR stuff for each category.

802.1 will meet tomorrow with presentations starting at 9:00 AM.

<u>Motion to Adjourn</u>
Motion: Motion to Adjourn

Move: Tony Jeffree

Second: Alan Chambers

YES: Unanimous   NO: 0   ABSTAIN: 0

Working Group Session, Tuesday AM, March 10, 1998

Rich Seifert's Objection to Comment 10 .1D Disposition
>   Rich Seifert objects to .1 resolution of his comment 10, undetected FER, for the .1D sponsor ballot.
>   There was much discussion of undetected error rates.
>
>   After the discussion we had three possibilities:
>   1) Do what Rich proposed
>   2) Make a change Mick suggested i.e. a number
>   3) Do not accept the comment.
>   .1 decided that Tony should write a rebuttal to Rich's comment.

Presentations – Mick Seaman
>   Cabletron's LAN Aggregation – Dick Bussiere, Anil Rijhsinghani
>>   Mick asked .1 if there was interest in doing LAN Aggregation. Yes; however, we need to decide what we are going to do. The goals have to be limited so they are achievable.
>
>   Cisco's Multiple Spanning Trees – Norm Finn
>>   Norm presented a par for multiple spanning trees. .1 reviewed and discussed it.
>>   Mick asked .1 if there was interest. Yes. There will be a vote on the par Thursday. Bill will distribute par to the executive committee.

More Discussion of Rich Seifert's Comment 10
>   Tony reported back to .1 that Rich would withdraw the no vote if a note were added at the end of 6.37. Tony will propose a specific note to Rich. Tony will report back to .1.

Working Group Session, Tuesday PM, March 10, 1998

Overview and Architecture – Alan Chambers
>   Reviewed the ballot comments of Alan Chambers, Ariel Hendel, Tony Jeffree, Bill Lidinsky, Satoshi Obara, Robin Tasker, and Michael Wright.

Working Group Session, Wednesday AM, March 11, 1998
>   .1 meet with .3 for a discussion of link aggregation. This portion was a .3 meeting, therefore no minutes for .1.
>
>   The web site for 802.3 link aggregation is:
>   http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/3/trunk_study/index.html

Working Group Session, Wednesday PM, March 11, 1998

Overview and Architecture – Alan Chambers
>   Reviewed the ballot comments of Pat Thaler, Tony Jeffree, and Ariel Hendel.

802.11 Bridge Supplement – Tony Jeffree
>   We have the .11 portion for .1D. It has to go to sponsor ballot. Also, .1 will include it in the US position for ISO.

Closing Working Group Plenary, Thursday, March 12, 1998

Voters – Alan Chambers
        Alan presented a list of voters for .1

Minutes – Michael Wright
Motion: Move that the minutes for the November plenary be accepted.

        Move: Michael Wright
        Second: Ayman Sayed

        YES: 10   NO: 0   ABSTAIN: 0

Motion: Move that the minutes for the Seattle interim be accepted.

        Move: Michael Wright
        Second: Ayman Sayed

        YES: 8   NO: 0   ABSTAIN: 2

Meeting Fees – Bill Lidinsky
        Bill reviewed the changes to the meeting fees. They are $275 for pre-registration $300 at the door.

802.11c/D4 Bridging Supplement – Alan Chambers
        .11 will submit for sponsor ballot.

802.1 B, E, and f – Bill Lidinsky
        All passed sponsor ballot for reaffirmation. Bill is doing the paperwork to REVCOM to complete the reaffirmation process.

Re-engineering of 802 – Bill Lidinsky
        There will be new rules posted for electing chairs, executive committee membership, and hibernation.

Ethertype File Acquisition Process – Mick Seaman
        We have to get Bay a new Ethertype to replace the one used for .1Q. Mick will make sure the RAC (Registration Authority Committee) does this.

        Resolution: 802.1 Resolves that: Sixteen ethertypes to be allocated for local assignments within organizations to permit local and experimental uses within an organization without the need for a global, unique assignment. 802.1 further requests its secretariat to expedite these assignments by communication with the RAC administrator and 802.0. The assignments are to be non-contiguous.

        Move: Mick Seaman
        Second: Norm Finn

        YES: 16   NO: 0   ABSTAIN: 0

        Resolution: 802.1 Requests that: ISO/JTC1 SC6 be requested to create an ISO technical report in the ISO/SEC 11802 Series for the purpose of documenting standard ethertype assignments.

        Move: Mick Seaman
        Second: Sharam Hakimi

YES: 15   NO: 0   ABSTAIN: 1

802.1D Instructions to the Editor – Tony Jeffree

Resolution: 802.1 Instructs the editor for P802.1D to produce P802.1D/D16, on the basis of the editorial changes agreed as resolution of the Sponsor Ballot, as documented in the final disposition of that ballot.
802.1 Request that: the 802 Executive committee give permission for the text of P802.1D/D16 to be forwarded to Rev Com for approval as an IEEE standard.

Move: Tony Jeffree
Second: Michael Wright

YES: 14   NO: 0   ABSTAIN: 1

US Position on ISO Ballot of 802.1D

Resolution: 802.1 Instructs the Editor for P802.1D: To document a proposed US National Body position on the ISO/IEC Final CD ballot of ISO/IEC FCD 15802-3 (MAC Bridges). This proposed position will document the editorial changes agreed as resolution of the Sponsor ballot of P802.1D, and also request that P802.11c (802.11 support for the Bridge Internal Sublayer Service) be incorporated into the text of 15802-3.

802.1 Request that: The 802 Executive Committee give permission for this proposed NB position to be forwarded to the US TAG for ISO/IEC SC6, requesting that they forward it to the SC6 secretariat as the US response to the FCD ballot of 15802-3, accompanied by a vote of "Approve with comments."

Move: Tony Jeffree
Second: Michael Wright

YES: 16   NO: 0   ABSTAIN: 0

802.1Q Instructions to the Editor – Tony Jeffree

Resolution: 802.1 Instructs the Editor for P802.1Q: To produce P802.1Q/D10, on the basis of the editorial changes agreed as resolution of the P802.1Q/D9 Ballot, as documented in the final disposition of that ballot.

802.1 Requests that: The 802 Executive Committee gives permission for P802.1Q/D10 to be distributed for Sponsor Ballot.

Move: Tony Jeffree
Second: Michael Wright

YES: 16   NO: 0   ABSTAIN: 0

ISO Version of 802.1Q – Tony Jeffree

Resolution: 802.1 Requests that: The 802 Executive Committee give permission for P802.1Q/D10 to be forwarded to the US TAG for ISO/IEC SC6, requesting that they take the necessary steps to initiate the process of starting a new work item in SC6 to develop the ISO/IEC version of the VLAN standard.

Move: Tony Jeffree
Second: Michael Wright

YES: 15   NO: 0   ABSTAIN: 1

Maintenance PAR for 802.1D and 802.1Q – Tony Jeffree

Resolution: 802.1 Instructs the Chair of 802.1 to draft maintenance PARs for 802.1D and 802.1Q and to forward them to the Executive committee for approval at the next 802 plenary meeting (July '98).

Move: Tony Jeffree
Second: Michael Wright

YES: 15   NO: 0   ABSTAIN: 0

GPRP PAR – Tony Jeffree

Resolution: 802.1 Resolves to forward the GPRP PAR to the Executive committee for approval at the next 802 plenary meeting (July '98).

Move: Tony Jeffree
Second: Michael Wright

YES: 9   NO: 0   ABSTAIN: 6

Multiple Spanning Trees – Tony Jeffree

Resolution: 802.1 Resolves to forward the Multiple Spanning Tree PAR and "5 criteria", as developed during this meeting, to the Executive committee for approval at the next 802 plenary meeting (July '98).

Move: Tony Jeffree
Second: Norm Finn

YES: 16   NO: 0   ABSTAIN: 0

Email from Johnny Zweig – 802.1D non-comment – Tony Jeffree
Mr. Zweig posted an email about AppleTalk, Netware, and 802.1H issue. Rich Seifert had responded with an email telling the history of these issues. .1 felt Rich's response was sufficient, therefore Tony will send email saying we discussed issue and agreed with Rich's response.

Instructions to the Editor 802 Overview and Architecture – Alan Chambers

Resolution: P802.1 instructs the editor for P802 (Overview and Architecture revision), Alan Chambers, to produce a revised text of P802 according to the summary instructions to the editor from the March 1998 WG ballot resolution meeting (P802.1-98/nn). The resulting draft, P802/D26, is to be circulated for confirmation ballot to P802.1 and liaisons, and subject to no new disapproval votes is to be submitted for LMSC Sponsor Ballot.

Move: Alan Chambers
Second: Michael Wright

YES: 16   NO: 0   ABSTAIN: 0

Motion to Adjourn – Bill Lidinsky

Motion: Move to Adjourn.

Move: Michael Wright
Second: Han Chin

YES: Unanimous   NO: 0   ABSTAIN: 0