802.1 Plenary - 11/2008

Closing Agenda

The following are 802.1 voters:

Aboul-Magd, Osama	Goetz, Franz	Menuchery, Menucher	Seaman, Michael
Alon, Zehavit	GOFF, YANNICK LE	Messenger, John	Seto, Koichiro
Bestler, Caitlin	Gray, Eric,	Mohan, Dinesh	Shah, Himanshu
Bialkowski, Jan	Grewal, Karanvir,	Mora, Matthew	Shenoy, Ravi
Boatright, Rob	Gunther, Craig	Nolish, Kevin	Sprecher, Nurit
Bonnamy, Jean-Michel	Gusat, Mitch	Ohta, Hiroshi	Stanton, Kevin B
Bottorff, Paul	Haddock, Stephen	Olsen, David	Sultan, Robert A
Brandner, Rudolf	Hausauer, Brian	Pannell, Don	Suzuki, Muneyoshi
Carlson, Craig W	Hazarika, Asif	Parsons, Glenn	Swallow, George
Chao, Frank	Insler, Romain	Patton, Ken	Takacs, Attila
Cherukuri, Rao	Jeffree, Anthony	Pelissier, Joseph	Tallet, Francois
Cheung, Taesik	Karandikar, Abhay	Peterson, David	Teener, Michael Johas
Congdon, Paul	Kashyap, Prakash	Porat, Hayim	Terry, John
Conta, Alex	Keen, Hal	Pritikin, Max	Thaler, Patricia
Crupnicoff, Diego	Kilcrease, Keti	Rajagopal, Ananda	Thorp, Oliver
Desanti, Claudio	Kim, Yongbum	Randall, Karen	Tuck, Fred
Dunbar, Linda	Klein, Philippe	Roden, Robert	Vissers, Maarten
Elbakoury, Hesham M	Ko, Mike	Roeck, Guenter	Wadekar, Manoj
Elie-Dit-Cosaque David ,	Kondapalli, Raghu R	Roese, Josef	Wang, Yan
Farkas, Janos	Kwan, Bruce	Romascanu, Dan	Weis , Brian
Fedyk, Donald	Laihonen, Kari	Roth, Moran	Wijnen, Bert
Feng, Felix Feifei	Mace, Gael	Rouyer, Jessy V	Winkel, Ludwig
Finn, Norman	Mack-Crane, Ben	Sajassi, Ali	Wright, Michael D
Frazier, Robert	Martin, David	Salowey, Joseph	Wu, Chien-Hsien
Fuller, John	Martinotti, Riccardo	Saltsidis, Panagiotis	Young, Ken
Garner, Geoffrey	Mascitto, Marco	Sathe, Satish	Zorn, Glen
Ghanwani, Anoop	McGuire, Alan	Sauer, John	

The following have become voting members if they are here this week:

Bjorkman, Bill
Cheng, Weiying
Ding, Zhemin
Ganon, Edna
Kreifeldt, Rick
Kumar, Vinod
Lerer, Michael
Sharma, Suman

Instructions for the WG Chair

The IEEE-SA strongly recommends that at each WG meeting the chair or a designee:

– **Show slides #1 through #4 of this presentation**
– **Advise the WG attendees that:**
  - The IEEE's patent policy is consistent with the ANSI patent policy and is described in Clause 6 of the *IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws*;
  - Early identification of patent claims which may be essential for the use of standards under development is strongly encouraged;
  - There may be Essential Patent Claims of which the IEEE is not aware. Additionally, neither the IEEE, the WG, nor the WG chair can ensure the accuracy or completeness of any assurance or whether any such assurance is, in fact, of a Patent Claim that is essential for the use of the standard under development.

– **Instruct the WG Secretary to record in the minutes of the relevant WG meeting:**
  - That the foregoing information was provided and that slides 1 through 4 (and this slide 0, if applicable) were shown;
  - That the chair or designee provided an opportunity for participants to identify patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) and/or the holder of patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) of which the participant is personally aware and that may be essential for the use of that standard
  - Any responses that were given, specifically the patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) and/or the holder of the patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) that were identified (if any) and by whom.

– The WG Chair shall ensure that a request is made to any identified holders of potential essential patent claim(s) to complete and submit a Letter of Assurance.
– It is recommended that the WG chair review the guidance in *IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual* 6.3.5 and in FAQs 12 and 12a on inclusion of potential Essential Patent Claims by incorporation or by reference.

Note: **WG** includes Working Groups, Task Groups, and other standards-developing committees with a PAR approved by the IEEE-SA Standards Board.

(Optional to be shown)

Participants, Patents, and Duty to Inform

All participants in this meeting have certain obligations under the IEEE-SA Patent Policy. Participants:

- "Shall inform the IEEE (or cause the IEEE to be informed)" of the identity of each "holder of any potential Essential Patent Claims of which they are personally aware" if the claims are owned or controlled by the participant or the entity the participant is from, employed by, or otherwise represents
  - "Personal awareness" means that the participant "is personally aware that the holder may have a potential Essential Patent Claim," even if the participant is not personally aware of the specific patents or patent claims

- "Should inform the IEEE (or cause the IEEE to be informed)" of the identity of "any other holders of such potential Essential Patent Claims" (that is, third parties that are not affiliated with the participant, with the participant's employer, or with anyone else that the participant is from or otherwise represents)

- The above does not apply if the patent claim is already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance that applies to the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group

    Quoted text excerpted from IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws subclause 6.2

- **Early identification of holders of potential Essential Patent Claims is strongly encouraged**
- **No duty to perform a patent search**

Patent Related Links

All participants should be familiar with their obligations under the IEEE-SA Policies & Procedures for standards development.

Patent Policy is stated in these sources:

IEEE-SA Standards Boards Bylaws

http://standards.ieee.org/guides/bylaws/sect6-7.html#6

IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual

http://standards.ieee.org/guides/opman/sect6.html#6.3

Material about the patent policy is available at

http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-material.html

If you have questions, contact the IEEE-SA Standards Board Patent Committee Administrator at patcom@ieee.org or visit http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/index.html

This slide set is available at http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.ppt

Call for Potentially Essential Patents

- **If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance:**
  - Either speak up now or
  - Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible or
  - Cause an LOA to be submitted

Patent policy announcements

- **TG Chairs please note:**
  - At the start of each TG meeting, TG Chair needs to perform the Call for Patents as per the previous slides.
  - During the rest of the week, please announce each morning that the meeting is subject to the Patents Policy as read and displayed at the opening of the TG meeting. If there are any responses to the call, minute it.
  - Point attendees at the PatCom website for details of the policy:

  http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/index.html

  and for the slide set:

  http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.ppt

Future interim meetings

- Jan 2009 (firm):
  - 12th-15th New Orleans, joint with 802.3
  - http://www.marriott.com/hotels/travel/MSYMC?groupCode=IEEIEEA&app=resvlink&fromDate=1/11/09&toDate=1/17/09
  - http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/3/interims/web-reg_1.html

- May 2009 (firm):
  - Pittsburgh Pen 18th-21st

- September 2009 (offer):
  - Tunisia Sept 21-24 sponsored by the Arab ICT Organization (AICTO) (followed by Sept 24-25 - IEEE/ITU joint workshop on Carrier Ethernet and Sept 28 - Oct 9 - ITU-T SG15 plenary)

P802-REV Overview & Architecture: progression

- Initial "merge" draft produced (incorporates 802a and 802b and some obvious edits)
- Needs a long-term editor

TG reports

- Interworking
- Security
- AV
- DCB

(IN)Sanity check – current workload

1. 802 O&A – initial draft constructed. Needs an Editor. End date Dec '11
2. 802.1H revision - PAR approved. Editors in place. End date Dec '10
3. 802.1Q-REV – PAR approved. End date Dec '12
4. 802.1X-REV (Key agreement) – WG ballot. End date Dec '12
5. 802.1AB (LLDP) revision – WG ballot. End date Dec '11
6. 802.1AC (MAC Service): Second draft. End date Dec '10
7. 802.1aj (Two-port MAC relay) WG ballot. End date Dec '10
8. 802.1ap (Q MIB). RevCom submission. End date Dec '09
9. 802.1aq (Shortest Path) TG ballot. End date Dec '09
10. 802.1AR (Device identifiers) WG ballot. End date Dec '09
11. 802.1AS (Time synch) – WG ballot. End date Dec '10
12. 802.1Qat (SRP) TG ballot. End date Dec '10
13. 802.1Qau (Congestion Notification) TG ballot. End date Dec '10
14. 802.1Qav (AVB Forwarding & Queuing) - WG ballot End date Dec '11
15. 802.1Qaw (DD-CFM) – Sponsor ballot. End date Dec '11
16. 802.1Qay – PBB-TE – Sponsor ballot. End date Dec '11
17. 802.1Qaz – ETS – TG ballot. End date Dec '12
18. 802.1BA – PAR approved. End date Dec '12
19. 802.1Qbb – PFC – TG ballot. End date Dec '12

Motions

MOTION

- 802.1 approves the September 2008 and July 2008 minutes.

- Proposed: messenger   Seconded: nolish

- For   21   Against   0   Abstain   0

MOTION

- 802.1 resolves to hold pre-meeting(s) on the Monday morning of the March 2009 plenary session.

- 802.1 Proposed: messenger

- Second: martin

  – For: 26   Against: 0   Abstain: 0

Motions - AVB

MOTION

- Motion: The AVB TG will continue to have teleconferences weekly at 9AM (US Pacific) Wednesdays for AVB general topics and 10AM (US Pacific) Mondays for 802.1AS specific topics. Access information will be sent to the 802.1 reflector immediately after the plenary.

- Proposed: Johas Teener
- Second: garner
  - For: 16
  - Against: 0
  - Abstain: 10

MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1AS (Geoff Garner) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Working Group balloting.

- Proposed: Johas Teener Second: garner

- For: 21   Against:0   Abstain: 2

MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1Qav (Tony Jeffree) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Working Group balloting.

- Proposed: Johas Teener   Second:fuller

- For: 27   Against: 0   Abstain: 1

Motions - DCB

MOTION

- Motion: Authorize CN and DCBX ad hoc teleconferences weekly at 9AM and 10AM, respectively, (US Pacific) Thursdays. Access information will be sent to the 802.1 reflector immediately after the plenary.
- Proposed: thaler
- Second: finn
  - For:24
  - Against:0
  - Abstain:16

MOTION

- The editor of P802.1Qau (Norm Finn) is instructed to prepare a draft for working group ballot based on comment resolution at the January interim.

- The Chair is authorized to submit the draft for working group balloting.

- Proposed: Thaler Second: finn

- For: 31   Against: 0   Abstain: 9

Motion

- Authorize pre-circulation of the PAR for 802.3 Amendment: MAC Control Frame for Priority-based Flow Control with any edits from the January interim:

- http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2008/bb-thaler-pfc-frame-par-1108.pdf

- Authorize the chair to pre-submit to NesCom for March approval

- Proposed: Thaler Second:DeSanti

- For: 28   Against: 1   Abstain:13

Motions - Security

- None

Motions - Interworking

MOTION

- 802.1 requests approval of the EC to submit 802.1ap to RevCom.
- Proposed: haddock Second: lemon
- For: 28   Against: 0   Abstain: 10
- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:

MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1Qaw (Linda Dunbar) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Working Group recirculation balloting.

- Proposed: Haddock Second: Dunbar

- For: 26   Against: 0   Abstain: 14

MOTION

- 802.1 requests conditional approval of the EC, as per current P&P, to forward P802.1Qaw to Sponsor Ballot following completion of recirculation balloting.

- Proposed: Haddock Second: Dunbar

- For: 28 Against: 0 Abstain: 16

- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:

-

MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1Qay (Panos Saltsidis) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Working Group recirculation balloting.

- Proposed: Haddock Second: Saltsidis

- For: 44   Against: 0   Abstain: 8

MOTION

- 802.1 requests conditional approval of the EC, as per current P&P, to forward P802.1Qay to Sponsor Ballot following completion of recirculation balloting.

- Proposed: Haddock Second: Saltsidis

- For: 40   Against: 0   Abstain: 8

- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:

-

MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1aj (John Messenger) to prepare a further draft based on the resolution of ballot comments received. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Working Group recirculation balloting.

- Proposed: Haddock Second: Messenger

- For: 38   Against: 0 Abstain: 8

MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1aq (Don Fedyk) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Task Group balloting.
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Seaman
- For: 33   Against: 0   Abstain: 9

Motions

- 802.1 approves the following text as a response to the interpretation request on 802.1ah (re: L2GP operation)

The P802.1ah amendment changes and additions to IEEE Std 802.1Q subclauses 13.1 through 13.37 are not consistent with the other provisions of Clause 13. Specifying the necessary corrections is beyond the scope of a response to an interpretation request. The corrections suggested in the interpretation request will be considered as part of an amendment under development (P802.1aq).

- Proposed: Seaman Second: haddock
- For: 24   Against: 0   Abstain: 16

Motions

- 802.1 approves the following text as a response to the interpretation request on 802.1Q (re: MST Region definition)

The clause 13.8 specification of MST Region takes precedence over the 3.87 definition. The latter will be changed in a future amendment or revision of 802.1Q.

- Proposed: Seaman Second: haddock
- For: 26   Against: 1   Abstain: 16

Motions

- 802.1 approves the text of the liaison to MEF "Reply to MEF 27033-001"
- Proposed: Finn Second: haddock
- For: 26   Against: 0   Abstain: 12

Motions

- 802.1 approves the text of the liaison to MEF "Reply to MEF 27028-002"
- Proposed: Finn Second: haddock
- For: 27 Against: 0   Abstain: 9