Minutes of the 802.1 Plenary meeting held in Dallas, 10-13 November 2008

Attendees

Last Name	First Name	<u>Affiliation</u>	<u>Sign-</u> ins
Alon	Zehavit	Nokia Siemens Networks	<u></u> 8
Bajko	Gabor	Nokia	1
Bjorkman	William	Verizon	1
,-		HARMAN INTERNATIONAL INDUSTRIES,	
Boatright	Robert	INCORPORATED	2
BONNAMY	Jean-Michel	France Telecom	7
Bottorff	Paul	Nortel Networks	5
Busch	Alexander	BMW Group	6
Carlson	Craig	QLogic Corporation	7
Chang	Amy	Xilinx, Inc.	1
Cheng	Weiying	Tellabs	7
Cherukuri	Rao	Juniper Networks, Inc.	4
Choi	Jin-Seek	Hanyang Univerisity	8
		ETRI - Electronics and Telecommunications Research	
CHOI	WOO	Institute	8
Congdon	Paul	Hewlett-Packard Development Company, L.P.	7
Connor	Donald	FUJITSU	6
Crupnicoff	Diego	Mellanox Technologies	6
Davari	Shahram	TPACK	2
DeSanti	Claudio	Cisco Systems, Inc.	7
Ding	Zhemin	Ericsson	8
Dunbar Elie-Dit-	Linda	Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd.	8
Cosaque	David	ALCATEL-LUCENT	6
Farkas	Janos	Ericsson	7
Fedyk	Donald	Nortel Networks	7
Finn	Norman	Cisco Systems, Inc.	2
Florit	Lionel	Cisco Systems, Inc.	7
Frazier	Robert	Ericsson	5
Fuller	John	CONSULTANT	7
Garner	Geoffrey	Broadcom Corporation	7
Ghanwani	Anoop	Brocade Communications	7
Godbole	Avanindra	Juniper Networks, Inc.	6
Goetz	Franz	Siemens	4
Gravel	Mark	Hewlett-Packard Development Company, L.P.	7
Gray	Eric	Ericsson	7
Grewal	Karanvir	Intel Corp	5
Guan	Yanfeng	ZTE Corporation	1
	· ·	HARMAN INTERNATIONAL INDUSTRIES,	
Gunther	Craig	INCORPORATED	8
Gusat	Mitch	IBM	7

Haddock	Stephen	Stephen Haddock	6	
Hudson	Charles	Stephen Haddock Hewlett-Packard Development Company, L.P.		
Jeffree	Anthony	Cisco Systems, Inc.	6 7	
Jha	Pankaj	Foundry Networks, Inc.	6	
Jones	Girault	Apple Computer, Inc.	7	
Jost	Thomas	Vitesse Semiconductor Corporation	8	
3031	momas	ETRI - Electronics and Telecommunications Research	O	
Kang	Taekyu	Institute	4	
Karandikar	Abhay	Tejas Networks India Ltd/IIT Bombay	8	
Kashyap	Prakash	Extreme Networks	5	
Kilcrease	Keti	Cisco Systems, Inc.	6	
Kim	Yongbum	Broadcom Corporation	1	
Klein	Philippe	Broadcom Corporation	7	
Kumar	Vinod	Tejas Networks Ltd	7	
Kwan	Bruce	Broadcom Corporation	7	
Laihonen	Kari	TeliaSonera	8	
Lemon	John	ADTRAN Inc.	2	
Lerer	Michael	Soapstone Networks	7	
Lipshteyn	Marina	Voltaire	7	
Loewen	Jonathan	PMC-Sierra, Inc.	1	
Loh	Zhi-Hern	Fulcrum Microsystems, Inc.	5	
MACE	Gael	Thomson, Inc.	7	
Mack-Crane	Thomas	Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd.	7	
Martin	David	Nortel Networks	8	
Mayhew	David	Advanced Micro Devices - AMD	5	
Mcguire	Alan	British Telecom (BT)	7	
McIntosh	James	Vitesse Semiconductor Corporation	7	
Menuchehry	Menu	Marvell	8	
Messenger	John	ADVA Optical Networking Ltd.	7	
Montenegro	Gabriel	Microsoft	7	
Mora	Matthew	Apple Computer, Inc.	6	
Multanen	Eric	Intel Corporation	7	
Nolish	Kevin	Ericsson	7	
Noseworthy	Bob	University of New Hampshire	5	
Noseworthy	Вор	HARMAN INTERNATIONAL INDUSTRIES,	J	
Olsen	David	INCORPORATED	7	
Pannell	Donald	Marvell	6	
Parsons	Glenn	Nortel Networks	7	
Pearson	Mark	Hewlett-Packard Development Company, L.P.	8	
Pelissier	Joseph	Cisco Systems, Inc.	4	
pritikin	max	Cisco Systems, Inc.	6	
Ramanathan	Ramasamy	Juniper Networks, Inc.	7	
Randall	Karen	NSA/IAD	6	
Rhee	June-Koo	ICU-Information and Communications University	1	
Rohde	Derek	QLogic Corporation	5	
Romascanu	Dan	Avaya Inc.	7	
Rouyer	Jessy	ALCATEL-LUCENT	8	
Ryu	Hyunsurk	Samsung Electronics	6	
Sadler	Jonathan	Tellabs	6	
Sajassi	Ali	Cisco Systems, Inc.	5	
Salowey	Joseph	Cisco Systems, Inc.	6	
,	•		•	

Saltsidis Sathe Seaman Sefidvash Sen Seto Shah Shay Stanton Sultan Suzuki Teener Terry Thaler Thorp	Panagiotis Satish Michael khorvash Jaydip Koichiro Himanshu Gregory Kevin Robert Muneyoshi Michael John Patricia Oliver	Ericsson Brocade Communications CONSULTANT Tata Consultancy Services Limited Hitachi Ltd. Ciena Corporation Telos Systems Inc Intel Corporation Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd. NTT Communications Broadcom Corporation Brocade Communications Broadcom Corporation FUJITSU	802.3	7 5 6 1 1 7 6 4 6 7 8 7 7 5
Wang	Xi	Fujitsu Laboratories of America, Inc.		3
Wang Warren	Yan Niel	Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd. Apple Computer, Inc.		4 7
Weis	Brian	Cisco Systems, Inc.		6
white	martin	Marvell		5
Winkel	Ludwig CHIEN-	Siemens		1
WU Young Zorn	HSIEN Ken Glen	Broadcom Corporation GridPoint, Inc. NetCube Technologies, Inc.		7 7 6

802.1 Opening Plenary

The slide set presented by the Chair, Tony Jeffree, can be found at:

http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/minutes/2008-11-opening-plenary-slides.pdf

AVB Task Group Minutes

Tue., Nov. 11, 2008 AVB Task Group

Michael Johas Teener issued the call for patents; no one responded.

Tony Jeffree led a discussion about the comments received on the recent 802.1Qav ballot.

Serge Fourcand gave a Timestamp-Based Synchronization presentation.

Geoff Garner led further comment resolution for 802.1AS.

Craig Gunther presented changes he is making to 802.1Qat.

Philippe Klein presented an overview of 802.11 QoS provisons.

Wed., Nov. 12, 2008 AVB TG with 802.11aa

Michael Johas Teener issued the call for patents; no one responded.

Ganesh Venkatesan gave a status update for 802.11aa

Graham Smith presented 802.11 document 1214r2, an 802.11 QoS Tutorial.

Craig Gunther presented 802.1 document at-cgunther-qat-status-1108.pdf, a status of Qat.

Tony Jeffree presented the 801.11Qav draft.

Wed., Nov. 12, 2008 AVB Task Group (without 802.11aa)

Michael Johas Teener issued the call for patents; no one responded.

Craig Gunther led a continued discussion of Qat (see document at-cgunther-msrp-qay-1108-v04.pdf).

Tony Jeffree continued the discussion of ballot comments on 802.1Qav.

Don Pannell led a discussion of the AVB Assumptions document.

Tony Jeffree continued the discussion of ballot comments on 802.1Qav.

Geoff Garner gave a presentation of document av-garner-maxburst-formulas-1108.pdf.

Dave Olsen gave a presentation of document avb-dolsen-1722-maap-1108.pdf.

Thur., Nov. 13, 2008 AVB TG with 802.11aa

Osama Aboul-Magd presented 802.11 document 1222r2 on 802.11/802.1Qat QoS interworking.

Kevin Stanton presented 802.1 document as-kstanton-8021AS-overview-for-dot11aa-1108.pdf.

Thur., Nov. 13, 2008 AVB Task Group (without 802.11aa)

Robert Boatright and Alex Busch led a discussion of automotive considerations.

Interworking TG Minutes

November 10, 2008 Interworking Task Group

IEEE Plenary, Dallas

Meeting called to order at 9:00.

Stephen Haddock presented agenda for the week.

Presented patent policy slides. No response to the call for patents.

Mick Seaman discussed proposals for MSTP updates related to accommodating Shortest Path Bridging, fragile bridges, and the RSTP/MSTP merge to be done as part of Q-REV. The following papers were discussed:

http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2008/aq-seaman-merged-spanning-treeprotocols-1108.pdf

http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2008/aq-seaman-fragile-bridges-0908.pdf

Don Fedyk presented a status report on the 802.1aq Shortest Path Bridging document, and discussed a proposal for the ISIS digest:

http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2008/aq-fedyk-SPB-status-update-1108-v1.pdf http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2008/aq-fedyk-ISIS-data-models-1108-v1.pdf http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2008/aq-fedyk-ISIS-digest-summary-1108v1.pdf

http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2008/aq-fedyk-ISIS-digest-1108-v1.pdf Mick discussed the 802.1ah interpretation request he submitted regarding L2GP.

http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2008/ah-seaman-l2gp-interpretation-req-1008.pdf

Recess at 11:50.

<No afternoon session of Interworking Task Group. 802.1 Plenary occupied the afternoon.>

November 11, 2008 Interworking Task Group IEEE Plenary, Dallas

Meeting called to order at 9:00.

Presented patent policy slides. No response to the call for patents.

Panagiotis (Panos) Saltsidis presented a status report on the 802.1Qay PBB-TE project, and led a comment resolution discussion on the working group ballot of draft 4.5. Results of last ballot: 24 approve and 5 disapprove out of 77 responses from 107 eligible voters. A total of 124 comments received with roughly a 70/30 split between editorial/technical comments. The latest document of the comments and their dispositions can be found at:

http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2008/ay-saltsidis-project-status-1108-v01.pdf http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/ay-drafts/d4/802-1ay-D4-5-pdis-sc-v02.pdf

Break for lunch at 11:50.

Resume at 1:00.

Linda Dunbar presented the status of the 802.1Qaw DDCFM project, and led a comment resolution discussion on the working group recirculation ballot on draft 3.2. Plan is to do another 802.1Qaw recirculation ballot prior to the January interim meeting, and to request conditional approval to initiate sponsor ballot following the January interim. The comments and dispositions can be found at:

 $\underline{\text{http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/aw-drafts/d3/802-1aw-D3-2-comments-pdis-v1.pdf}}$

Glenn Parsons presented the status of the 802.1ap MIB project, and discussed comments received in the sponsor recirculation ballot on draft 4.3. There were 61 affirmative votes and 3 abstentions out of a ballot pool of 73. There is one outstanding negative ballot that is a reiteration of a comment that has been recirculated. The plan is to forward the document to RevCom.

 $\underline{http://ieee802.org/1/files/private/ap-drafts/d4//802-1ap-d4-3-dis-v1.pdf}$

John Messenger began the comment resolution discussion on the working group recirculation ballot of 802.1aj TPMR draft 3.1.

Adjourn at 5:00pm.

November 12, 2008 Interworking Task Group

IEEE Plenary, Dallas

Meeting called to order at 9:00.

Presented patent policy slides. No response to the call for patents.

John Messenger presented the status of the 802.1aj TPMR project and continued the comment resolution discussion on the working group recirculation ballot of draft 3.1.

 $\frac{http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2008/aj-messenger-editor-report-1008-v02.pdf}{http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/aj-drafts/d3/802-1aj-d3-1-pdis-v2.pdf}$

Decision regarding how to specify TPMR as vlan-unaware but priority-aware:

- 1. TPMR uses an 802.1D MAC Relay Entity, with the modified Bridge Port transmit and receive functionality specified in 8.5.2.
- 2. Add a new subclause in 6 for support of the ISS in a TPMR component. This subclause will allow recognizing VLAN tags and extracting the priority/drop precedence on receive. In a given TPMR this subclause will recognize either S-tags or C-tags but not both simultaneously (just as the Support of the EISS subclause supports either but not both). It was not decided whether this subclause would allow modification of the PCP value in a VLAN tag on transmit.

Adjourn at 12:15 am.

Resume at 1:15 pm.

Panos resumed the discussion to resolve comments received in the 802.1Qay-d4.5 ballot. Zehavit Alon gave a presentation supporting her comment regarding manual switch operation. http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2008/ay-alon-manual-switch-11-08-v01.ppt

John Messenger resumed the discussion to resolve comments received in the 802.1aj-d3.1 ballot. Alan McGuire presented some slides on TPMR use cases posted for the Eilat meeting:

 $\frac{http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2008/aj-mcguire-network-demarcation-0508.ppt}{}$

A straw poll was taken: Given that the scope statement says a TPMR is remotely manageable we have a choice of mandating that remote management must be supported but the specific

management protocol to be used is not mandated, or that a specific protocol is mandated (with the assumption that others may be supported as well). Results:

Don't mandate a specific protocol: 13

Mandate SNMP over Ethernet as a specific protocol to be supported: 2

Adjourn at 6:40pm.

November 13, 2008 Interworking Task Group

IEEE Plenary, Dallas

Meeting called to order at 9:00.

Presented patent policy slides. No response to the call for patents.

The group discussed received liaison letters that are pertinent to Interworking. There were two liaisons from the IETF. Several people indicated interest in reviewing the TRILL document and may generate comments for a liaison response to be discussed at the March interim. Some discussion of the IS-IS liaison. That discussion will continue in the afternoon plenary session. The liaisons from the MEF are available at the links below. The result of the discussion is that it may be possible to draft a response to be voted on in the afternoon plenary. Otherwise a response will be generated at the March plenary.

 $\frac{http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2008/liaison-mef-27028-002-liaison-to-802-1-drop-prec-mac-status-1108.doc$

 $\frac{http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2008/liaison-mef-27033-001-liaison-to-802-1-level-0-mip-creation-in-802-1aj-1108.doc}{}$

John Messenger resumed the discussion to resolve comments received in the 802.1aj-d3.1 ballot.

Adjourn at 12:50am.

Security TG Minutes

<Not provided>

DCB TG Minutes

<Not provided>

802.1 Closing Plenary

The slide set presented by the Chair, Tony Jeffree, can be found at:

http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/minutes/2008-11-closing-plenary-slides.pdf