802.1 Plenary - 11/2009
Atlanta, GA

Closing Agenda

802.1 officers etc

- **Officers**
  - Chair: Tony Jeffree
  - Vice Chair: Paul Congdon
  - Recording Secretary: Eric Gray
  - Security TG Chair: Mick Seaman
  - Interworking TG Chair: Steve Haddock
  - AV Bridging TG Chair: Michael Johas Teener
  - Data Center Bridging TG Chair: Pat Thaler
  - Maintenance of website: John Messenger
  - Maintenance of Email exploder: Hal Keen

- **Website**
  - http://www.ieee802.org/1/
  - Username: p8021   Password: go_wildcats

Administrative stuff – Upload area

- **Website – New Upload area**
  - The new file upload facility can be accessed from the filenaming conventions page at:

    http://ieee802.org/1/filenaming.html

The following are 802.1 voters:

Alon, Zehavit
Bialkowski, Jan
Boatright, Rob
Bonnamy, Jean-Michel
Bottorff, Paul
Brandner, Rudolf
Carlson, Craig
Cheng, Weiying
Cherukuri, Rao
Choi, Jin-Seek
Congdon, Paul
Connor, Don
Crupnicoff, Diego
Desanti, Claudio
Ding, Zhemin
Dunbar, Linda
Elie-Dit-Cosaque, David
Farkas, Janos
Fedyk, Donald
Finn, Norman
Frazier, Robert
Fuller, John
Garner, Geoffrey
Ghanwani, Anoop
Goetz, Franz
Goff, Yannick

Gray, Eric
Grewal, Karanvir
Gunther, Craig
Gusat, Mitch
Haddock, Stephen
Hazarika, Asif
Hudson, Charles
Insler, Romain
Jeffree, Anthony
Jha, Pankaj
Karandikar, Abhay
Kashyap, Prakash
Keen, Hal
Kilcrease, Keti
Kim, Doyeon
Kim, Yongbum
Klein, Philippe
Ko, Mike
Kumar, Vinod
Kwan, Bruce
Laihonen, Kari
Lakshmikantha, Ashvin
Lemon, John
Lerer, Michael
Lipshteyn, Marina
Mace, Gael
Mack-Crane, Ben
Martin, David
McGuire, Alan
McIntosh, James
Menuchery, Menucher

Messenger, John
Montenegro, Gabriel
Mora, Matthew
Morris, John
Multanen, Eric
Nikolich, Paul
Nolish, Kevin
Olsen, David
Pannell, Donald
Parsons, Glenn
Pelissier, Joseph
Peterson, David
Porat, Hayim
Pritikin, Max
Randall, Karen
Roese, Josef
Rohde, Derek
Romascanu, Dan
Rouyer, Jessy
Sadler, Jonathan
Sajassi, Ali
Salowey, Joseph
Saltsidis, Panagiotis
Sathe, Satish
Sauer, John
Seaman, Michael

Seto, Koichiro
Shah, Himanshu
Sprecher, Nurit
Stanton, Kevin
Sultan, Robert
Suzuki, Muneyoshi
Teener, Michael
Thaler, Patricia
Thorp, Oliver
Wadekar, Manoj
Wei, Yuehua
Weis , Brian
White, Martin
Wijnen, Bert
Wright, Michael D.
Wu, Chien-Hsien
Young, Ken
Zorn, Glen

The following have become voting members if they are here this week:

Ao, Ting
Busch, Alex

The following could become voting members if they are here this week and email me indicating their intention to do so:

Godbole, Avanindra
Gravel, Mark

Instructions for the WG Chair

The IEEE-SA strongly recommends that at each WG meeting the chair or a designee:

- **Show slides #1 through #4 of this presentation**
- **Advise the WG attendees that:**
    - The IEEE's patent policy is consistent with the ANSI patent policy and is described in Clause 6 of the *IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws*;
    - Early identification of patent claims which may be essential for the use of standards under development is strongly encouraged;
    - There may be Essential Patent Claims of which the IEEE is not aware. Additionally, neither the IEEE, the WG, nor the WG chair can ensure the accuracy or completeness of any assurance or whether any such assurance is, in fact, of a Patent Claim that is essential for the use of the standard under development.

- **Instruct the WG Secretary to record in the minutes of the relevant WG meeting:**
    - That the foregoing information was provided and that slides 1 through 4 (and this slide 0, if applicable) were shown;
    - That the chair or designee provided an opportunity for participants to identify patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) and/or the holder of patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) of which the participant is personally aware and that may be essential for the use of that standard
    - Any responses that were given, specifically the patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) and/or the holder of the patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) that were identified (if any) and by whom.

- The WG Chair shall ensure that a request is made to any identified holders of potential essential patent claim(s) to complete and submit a Letter of Assurance.
- It is recommended that the WG chair review the guidance in *IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual* 6.3.5 and in FAQs 12 and 12a on inclusion of potential Essential Patent Claims by incorporation or by reference.

    Note: **WG** includes Working Groups, Task Groups, and other standards-developing committees with a PAR approved by the IEEE-SA Standards Board.

(Optional to be shown)

Participants, Patents, and Duty to Inform

All participants in this meeting have certain obligations under the IEEE-SA Patent Policy. Participants:

- "Shall inform the IEEE (or cause the IEEE to be informed)" of the identity of each "holder of any potential Essential Patent Claims of which they are personally aware" if the claims are owned or controlled by the participant or the entity the participant is from, employed by, or otherwise represents
  - "Personal awareness" means that the participant "is personally aware that the holder may have a potential Essential Patent Claim," even if the participant is not personally aware of the specific patents or patent claims

- "Should inform the IEEE (or cause the IEEE to be informed)" of the identity of "any other holders of such potential Essential Patent Claims" (that is, third parties that are not affiliated with the participant, with the participant's employer, or with anyone else that the participant is from or otherwise represents)

- The above does not apply if the patent claim is already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance that applies to the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group

  Quoted text excerpted from IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws subclause 6.2

- **Early identification of holders of potential Essential Patent Claims is strongly encouraged**
- **No duty to perform a patent search**

Slide #1

Patent Related Links

All participants should be familiar with their obligations under the IEEE-SA Policies & Procedures for standards development.

Patent Policy is stated in these sources:

IEEE-SA Standards Boards Bylaws

http://standards.ieee.org/guides/bylaws/sect6-7.html#6

IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual

http://standards.ieee.org/guides/opman/sect6.html#6.3

Material about the patent policy is available at

http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-material.html

If you have questions, contact the IEEE-SA Standards Board Patent Committee Administrator at patcom@ieee.org or visit http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/index.html

This slide set is available at http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.ppt

Call for Potentially Essential Patents

- **If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance:**
  - Either speak up now or
  - Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible or
  - Cause an LOA to be submitted

Other Guidelines for IEEE WG Meetings

- **All IEEE-SA standards meetings shall be conducted in compliance with all applicable laws, including antitrust and competition laws.**

  - **Don't discuss the interpretation, validity, or essentiality of patents/patent claims.**

  - **Don't discuss specific license rates, terms, or conditions.**

    - Relative costs, including licensing costs of essential patent claims, of different technical approaches may be discussed in standards development meetings.

      - Technical considerations remain primary focus

  - **Don't discuss or engage in the fixing of product prices, allocation of customers, or division of sales markets.**

  - **Don't discuss the status or substance of ongoing or threatened litigation.**

  - **Don't be silent if inappropriate topics are discussed … do formally object.**

See *IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual*, clause 5.3.10 and "Promoting Competition and Innovation: What You Need to Know about the IEEE Standards Association's Antitrust and Competition Policy" for more details.

Slide #4

Future interim meetings

- **January 2010:**
  - Austin, Tx, 19th through 22nd, hosted by HP
- **May 2010:**
  - Offer from ITU-T to host a meeting 24th through 27th in Geneva, followed by a joint ITU-T/802.1/802.3 workshop on mutually interesting topics
- **September 2010:**
  - Offer from John Messenger/Adva to host in York, England (13th-16th)
- **January 2011:**
  - Potential offer from Don Eastlake to host a meeting in Kauai 11th - 13th

TG reports

(IN)Sanity check – current workload

1. 802 O&A – TG ballot. PAR to Dec '11
2. 802.1H revision – TG ballot. PAR to Dec '10
3. 802.1Q-REV – PAR approved. PAR to Dec '12
4. 802.1X-REV (Key agreement): Submit to RevCom. PAR to Dec '10 (12)
5. 802.1AC (MAC Service): TG ballot. PAR to Dec '10
6. 802.1aj (Two-port MAC relay) Submit to RevCom. PAR to Dec '10
7. 802.1aq (Shortest Path) TG/WG ballot. PAR to Dec '11
8. 802.1AR (Device identifiers) Submit to RevCom. PAR to Dec '09
9. 802.1AS (Time synch) – Sponsor ballot. PAR to Dec '10
10. 802.1Qat (SRP) Sponsor ballot. PAR to Dec '10
11. 802.1Qau (Congestion Notification) Sponsor ballot. PAR to Dec '10
12. 802.1Qav (AVB Forwarding & Queuing): Submit to RevCom. PAR to Dec '11
13. 802.1Qaz – ETS – WG ballot. PAR to Dec '12
14. 802.1BA – AVB Systems – TG ballot. PAR to Dec '12
15. 802.1Qbb – PFC – WG ballot. PAR to Dec '12
16. 802.1Qbc – Remote Customer Service Interface – TG ballot - PAR to Dec '13
17. 802.3bd – MAC control frame – WG ballot - PAR to Dec '13
18. 802.1Qbe – MIRP – WG ballot - PAR to Dec '13
19. 802.1Qbf – PBB-TE infrastructure protection – TG ballot - PAR to Dec '13
20. 802.1Qbg - Edge Virtual Bridging - PAR submitted
21. 802.1Qbh - Bridge Port Extension - PAR submitted

Chair/Vice-Chair elections

- These elections will take place during the closing 802.1 Plenary in March 2010
- Nominations are invited at any time from now until the start of the closing 802.1 Plenary in March 2010
- The existing Chair and Vice-Chair intend to stand for re-election; however, this does not preclude other nominations
- If there are multiple nominees for a post, then an election will take place in which only 802.1 voters participate and in which each voter casts a single vote for their preferred candidate. To win the election, a majority of voters present in the room is required. If a majority is not achieved, then the candidate with the least number of votes is eliminated and the vote re-taken.
- A motion to approve the winning candidate (in the case of an election) or the single nominee (in the event that there is only one candidate for the post) will then be made and voted upon by 802.1 voting members.

Chair/Vice-Chair elections

- From 802 Operations Manual clause 3.2.1:
- "An individual who has served as Chair or Vice Chair of a given WG for a total of five terms or part-terms in that office may not run for election to that office again, unless the WG has passed a motion, one plenary in advance of the election, permitting that individual to stand for re-election.
- For this motion to pass, 75% or greater approval of the voting membership present in the meeting is needed."

Motions

MOTION

- 802.1 gives permission to Tony Jeffree to run for a further term as 802.1 WG Chair in the March 2010 Plenary.
- Proposed: messenger
- Seconded: fuller
- For_38___Against__0__Abstain__1__

MOTION

- 802.1 gives permission to Paul Congdon to run for a further term as 802.1 WG Vice Chair in the March 2010 Plenary.
- Proposed: hudson
- Seconded: seaman
- For_36___Against__0__Abstain__2__

MOTION

- 802.1 approves the July 2009 and September 2009 minutes.
- Proposed: thaler   Seconded: pelissier
- For   Against   Abstain

-         Approved by acclamation

MOTION

- 802.1 resolves to hold pre-meeting(s) on the Monday morning of the March 2010 plenary session.
- Proposed: thaler
- Second: congdon
  - For: Against: Abstain:

- Approved by acclamation

MOTION

- 802.1 resolves to hold its January interim meeting in Austin hosted by HP, 19th through 22nd.

- Proposed: congdon

- Second: messenger
  - For: 38   Against: 0   Abstain: 3

MOTION

- 802.1 resolves to hold its May interim meeting in Geneva hosted by ITU-T, 24th through 27th

- Proposed: Parsons

- Second: congdon

  - For: 23   Against: 3   Abstain: 12

MOTION

- 802.1 resolves to take part in a joint ITU-T/802.1/802.3 1-day information exchange workshop following the Geneva interim, on time synch, and PBB-TE protection switching.

- Proposed: Parsons

- Second: garner

  - For: 17   Against: 0   Abstain: 19

MOTION

- 802.1 resolves to hold its September 2010 interim meeting in York, UK hosted by ADVA, 13th-16th.

- Proposed: Messenger

- Second:finn

  - For: 33   Against: 0   Abstain: 1

Motions - Interworking

MOTION

- 802.1 requests approval of the EC to forward P802.1aj to RevCom.
- Proposed: Haddock   Second: Messenger
- For: 32   Against: 0   Abstain: 0
- EC proposed: Jeffree   Second:
-

MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1aq (Don Fedyk) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Task and Working Group balloting.

- Proposed: Haddock   Second: Fedyk

- For: 27   Against: 0   Abstain: 3

MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1Qbe (Norm Finn) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Working Group balloting.
- Proposed: Haddock   Second: Finn
- For: 26   Against: 0   Abstain: 2

MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1Q-REV to prepare an initial draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Working Group balloting. The draft will include all approved amendments, corrigenda and approved interpretations.

- Proposed: Haddock   Second: Thaler

- For: 28   Against: 0   Abstain: 5

MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1Qbf (Bob Sultan) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Task Group balloting.
- Proposed: Haddock   Second: Sultan
- For: 26   Against: 0   Abstain: 4

MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1Qbc (Ben Mack-Crane) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Task Group balloting.
- Proposed: Haddock   Second: Mack-Crane
- For: 28   Against: 0   Abstain: 3

MOTION

- 802.1 approves the liaison letter to the MEF regarding MA name formats:

- \<see text as presented\>.

- Proposed: Haddock   Second: Messenger

- For: 28   Against: 0   Abstain: 7

Motions

- 802.1 approves the response to the interpretation request on Loopback Response error reporting.

- <see text as presented>.

- Proposed: Haddock Second: Finn

- For: 20   Against: 0   Abstain: 8

Motions

- 802.1 approves the response to the interpretation request on Linktrace Message reception, forwarding and replying.

- <see text as presented>.

- Proposed: Haddock Second: Finn

- For: 20   Against: 0   Abstain: 12

Motions

- 802.1 authorizes its January interim meeting to develop a draft PAR and 5C to change the allowable destination addresses for Link Aggregation (802.1AX). The PAR scope may also include a clarification of the operation of LLDP in aggregated links, provided that the complexity that this adds is consistent with the address fix. The 802.1 Chair is authorized to pre-circulate the draft PAR/5C to the EC >30 days before the March 2010 meeting.
- Proposed: haddock Second: messenger
- For: 23   Against: 0   Abstain: 0

Motions - AVB

MOTION

- Motion: The AVB TG will continue to have teleconferences weekly at 9AM (US Pacific) Wednesdays for AVB general topics and 10AM (US Pacific) Mondays for 802.1AS specific topics. Access information will be sent to the 802.1 reflector immediately after the plenary.

- Proposed: Fuller
- Second: Garner
  - For: Approved by acclamation
  - Against:
  - Abstain:

MOTION

- 802.1 requests approval of the EC to forward P802.1Qav to RevCom.
- Proposed: Fuller Second: Garner
- For: 22   Against: 0   Abstain: 2
- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:

MOTION

- 802.1 requests conditional approval of the EC to forward P802.1Qat to Sponsor ballot.
- Proposed: Fuller Second: Garner
- For: 21 Against: 0 Abstain: 9
- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:

MOTION

- 802.1 authorises its Chair to request EC approval, via email ballot, to forward P802.1AS to Sponsor ballot following satisfactory completion of WG recirculation balloting.
- Proposed: Garner Second: Fuller
- For: 21 Against: 3 Abstain: 7
- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:

MOTION

- The editor of P802.1BA (Tony Jeffree) is instructed to prepare a draft for task group ballot based on discussion during the November meeting.

- The Chair is authorized to submit the draft for task group balloting.

- Proposed: Garner   Second: Fuller

- For: 22   Against: 0   Abstain: 6

Motion

- 802.1 authorizes its Chair, Tony Jeffree, to forward the text of the joint 802.1/802.3 liaison letter to ITU-T:

http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2009/liaison-resp-itut-sg-15-epon-1109.doc

- Proposed: Fuller   Second: Garner
- For: 17   Against: 0   Abstain: 7

Motions - Security

MOTION

- 802.1 requests approval of the EC to forward P802.1AR to RevCom.

- Proposed: Seaman Second:

- For: 23   Against: 0   Abstain: 4

- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:

MOTION

- 802.1 requests approval of the EC to forward P802.1X-REV to RevCom.
- Proposed: Seaman Second: congdon
- For: 24 Against: 0   Abstain: 2
- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:

Motions - DCB

MOTION

- Motion: Authorize the following teleconferences with access information to be sent to the 802.1 reflector immediately after the plenary.
  - DCBX ad hoc weekly 10AM (US Pacific) Thursdays.
  - EVB ad hoc weekly 11AM (US Pacific) Tuesdays.
- Proposed: thaler
- Second: gray
  - For: Approved by acclamation
  - Against:
  - Abstain:

MOTION

- 802.1 approves pre-submission of 802.1Qau to RevCom prior to the March 2010 meeting if sponsor balloting is substantially complete.

- Proposed: Thaler

- Second: finn
  - For:18
  - Against: 0
  - Abstain:6

MOTION

- The editor of P802.1Qaz (Craig Carlson) is instructed to prepare a draft for working group ballot based on input from the November 09 meeting.

- The Chair is authorized to submit the draft for working group balloting.

- Proposed: Thaler

- Second: gray

  - For:20

  - Against: 0

  - Abstain:2

MOTION

- The editor of P802.1Qbb (Claudio DeSanti) is instructed to prepare a draft for Working group ballot based on comment resolution at the November 09 meeting

- The Chair is authorized to submit the draft for working group balloting.

- Proposed: Thaler Second: gray
- For: 22   Against: 0   Abstain:2

MOTION

- The editor of P802.3bd (Pat Thaler) is instructed to prepare a draft for Working group ballot based on input at the November 09 meeting

- The Chair is authorized to submit the draft for 802.1 working group balloting.

- Any 802.3 voters that choose to participate will be treated as voters.

- Proposed: Thaler Second: gray

- For: 17 Against: 3   Abstain: 5

MOTION

- Motion: Authorize a ballot resolution teleconference to resolve comments from DCB recirculation ballots on some or all of AU, AZ, BB, 3BD:
  - February 19 at 10 AM to 1 PM Pacific
- Proposed: Thaler
- Second: gray
  - For:17
  - Against: 0
  - Abstain: 7

MOTION

- 802.1 requests EC approval to forward the draft PAR for 802.1Qbg Edge Virtual Bridging to NesCom. The PAR text and 5C text are:

http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2009/new-bg-thaler-par-1109.pdf
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2009/new-bg-thaler-5c-1109.pdf

- Proposed: thaler
- Second: gray
  - For:26
  - Against:0
  - Abstain: 3

MOTION

- 802.1 requests EC approval to forward the draft PAR for 802.1Qbh Bridge Port Extension to NesCom. The PAR text and 5C text are:

http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2009/new-bh-thaler-par-1109-v2.pdf

http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2009/new-bh-thaler-5C-1109.pdf

- Proposed: thaler
- Second: congdon
  - For:17
  - Against: 0
  - Abstain: 3

MOTION

- 802.1 requests EC approval to forward the PAR modification for 802.1Qaz Enhanced Transmission Selection to NesCom

http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2009/az-thaler-draft-par-1109.pdf

(There were no changes to the 5C)

- Proposed: thaler
- Second: gray
  - For:20
  - Against: 0
  - Abstain: 4