IEEE 802 Plenary Meeting
March 2010, Orlando, Florida
802.1 Meeting Minutes, 14-19 March 2010

Attendees

SURNAME	First Name	Middle Name or Initial	Affiliation
Alon	Zehavit		Nokia Siemens Networks
Ashwood-Smith	Peter		Interworking TG
Ayandeh	Siamack		3Com Corporation
Babu	Biju		WG802.1
Bao	Wanqun		WG802.1
Bialkowski	Jan		Infinera, Inc.
Boiger	Christian		University of Applied Sciences Deggendorf
Bond	David		University of New Hampshire InterOperability Laboratory
BONNAMY	Jean-Michel		Orange-France Telecom
Bottorff	Paul		Hewlett-Packard Company
Bragg	Nigel		Nortel
Brandner	Rudolf		Nokia Siemens Networks
Carlin	Timothy		University of New Hampshire InterOperability Laboratory
Carlson	Craig		QLogic Corporation
Congdon	Paul		HP - Hewlett-Packard Development Company, L.P.
Connor	Donald	O	Fujitsu
Dabagh	Alireza		WG802.1
DeSanti	Claudio		Cisco Systems, Inc.
Ding	Zhemin		Ericsson
Eastlake, 3rd	Donald		Stellar Switches
Eiriksson	Asgeir		WG802.1
Elzur	Uri		Broadcom Corporation
Farkas	Janos		Ericsson
Fedyk	Donald		Alcatel-Lucent
Finn	Norman		Cisco Systems, Inc.
Frazier	Robert		Ericcson
Fuller	John		Self Employed
Garner	Geoffrey		WG802.1
Ghanwani	Anoop		Brocade

Goetz	Franz		Siemens Corporation
Gravel	Mark		HP - Hewlett-Packard Development Company, L.P.
Gray	Eric		Ericsson
Gumaste	Ashwin		IIT Bombay
Gunther	Craig		HARMAN INTERNATIONAL INDUSTRIES, INCORPORATED
Hawkins	John		Ciena Corporation
Hazarika	Asif		IP INFUSION
Huang	Lu		China Mobile Limited
Jeffree	Anthony		HP, Broadcom
Jha	Pankaj	K	Brocade
Kamath	Daya		Blade Network Technologies
Karandikar	Abhay		IIT Bombay
Khan	Ali		Cadence Design Systems, Inc.
Kidambi	Jayakrishna		BLADE Network Technologies
Kilaru	Srikanth		WG802.1
Kim	Taeeun		Extreme Networks
Kim	Yongbum		Broadcom Corporation
Kjendal	David		WG802.1
Klein	Philippe		Broadcom Corporation
Kleineberg	Oliver		Hirschmann Automation & Control
Krause	Michael		HP - Hewlett-Packard Development Company, L.P.
Kumar	Vinod		Tejas Networks Ltd
kuwata	hitoshi		hitachi cable
Kwan	Bruce		Broadcom Corporation
Lackner	Hans		WG802.1
Lemon	John		ADTRAN Inc.
li	lin		ZTE Corporation
Lipshteyn	Marina		DCB
Luo	Yuanqiu		Huawei Technologies USA
Lynch	Jeff		IBM
Mack-Crane	Thomas		Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd.
Magee	Anthony		ADVA Optical Networking Ltd.
Menuchehry	Menu		Marvell
Messenger	John		ADVA Optical Networking Ltd.
Morris	John		Spirent Communications
Multanen	Eric		Intel Corporation
Obara	Satoshi		FUjitsu Limited
Olsen	David		HARMAN INTERNATIONAL INDUSTRIES, INCORPORATED
Pandey	Vijoy		Blade Network Technologies

Pannell	Donald		Marvell
Parsons	Glenn		Ericsson
Pearson	Mark		HP - Hewlett-Packard Development Company, L.P.
Pelissier	Joseph		Cisco Systems, Inc.
Raeber	Rene		Cisco Systems, Inc.
Roese	Josef		Deutsche Telekom AG
Romascanu	Dan		WG802.1
Rouyer	Jessy	V	Alcatel-Lucent
Salowey	Joseph		None Given
Saltsidis	Panagiotis		Ericsson
Scott	James		Vitesse Semiconductor Corporation
Seaman	Michael		Mick Seaman
Seto	Koichiro		Hitachi Cable
Sharma	Rakesh		WG802.1
Shimizu	Takeshi		FUJITSU
Stanton	Kevin	B	Intel Corporation
Teener	Michael	Johas	Broadcom Corporation
Thaler	Patricia		Broadcom Corporation
Ting	Ao		ZTE Corporation
Unbehagen	Paul		WG802.1
Wadekar	Manoj		QLogic Corporation
Winter	Robert		Dell Inc.
WU	CHIEN-HSIEN		Broadcom Corporation
Yan	Peter		Broadcom Corporation
Zarick	Ryan		UNH-IOL

Opening Plenary, 14 March, 2010

The Chair (Tony Jeffree) started the opening plenary promptly at 11 AM, and talked about the experimental nature of trying to have the opening plenary for IEEE 802.1 before breaking for lunch on the first day of the meeting. He then presented the following slides, during which other presentations were interspersed:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/minutes/2010-03-opening-plenary-slides.pdf

To help completing this part of the meeting as quickly as possible, Tony indicated that he plans to omit a lot of the slides that talk to those people who have never attended an IEEE meeting. He recommended that people who have not previously attended these meetings should look at http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/minutes/802-1-general-info.pdf.

The Chair then:
- talked about the IEEE 802.1 policy on recording meetings and reporting of attendance by press and others who publish meeting reports for public consumption;

     Note that at this point, John Messenger and Anthony Magee blog on standard's topics,

but not blow-by-blow.

- discussed general meeting guidelines (e.g. - wearing badges, personal resonsibility for personal belongings, complimentary LAN access, etc.)
- new attendance recording system at http://murphy.events.ieee.org/imat.
- listed IEEE officers, including
    - himself and Paul Congdon as chair and vice chair,
    - the IEEE 802.1 recording secretary (RS) - Eric Gray,
    - task group chairs (Michael, Pat, Stephen),
    - web support (John Messenger), etc. (see slides for a complete list)
- showed lists of –
    - current (as of last week) voting members,
    - people who have qualified and indicated intent to be voting members and
    - people who qualify and not (yet) indicated intent to become a voting member.
- went over (in detail) the IEEE 802.1 patent policy, including:
    - participants, patents and duty to inform
    - what personal awareness means
    - when these rules apply
    - no obligation or intent that attendees need to perform a patent search

The Chair then asked if there was anyone who wanted to make a statement on the call for patent information. There was no reponse and Tony asked the IEEE 802.1 RS to record the fact that the question had been asked and no response was given.

Tony reviewed the IEEE 802.1 policy on non-competitive behavior and obligations including the obligation for objections to be made formally and recorded by the IEEE 802.1 RS.

Tony then talked about future meetings and asked:
- Glenn Parsons to provide us with information on the joint IEEE/ITU interim meeting. <http:/ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2010/admin-parsons-geneva-meeting-0310.pdf>
- John Messenger to give us a presentation and update on the September interim in York.
- Donald Eastlake to give us an update on his proposal for the January interim in Hawaii. http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2010/admin-eastlake-jan11-kauai-proposal-0310-v2.ppt

Summary of future meetings:
- Future interim meetings:
    - May 24th-27th 2010 will be in Geneva with a workshop on the Friday. May 28th joint workshop including protection. This would be the week before an SG15 plenary meeting (May 31st - June 11th).
    - September 13th-16th 2010 is York.
    - Offer of Kauai in 10-13 Jan 2011 – cheap hotel rates and prices. Shuttle from nearby airport. There are political problems presented by this meeting host.
- Future plenary venues:

July 11-16, 2010	San Diego
November 7-12, 2010	Dallas
March 13-18 2011	Singapore
March 11-16 2012	Macao

- Non-North-American meetings: possibilities include March 2011 (Marina Bay Sands, Singapore), July 2013 (University of Twente, Enschede)

The Chair presented an Executive Comittee report.

- Highlights from the officer elections held this week:
    - People who want to apply themselves to the 802 chair position should notify James Gilb (recording secretary for IEEE 802).
    - LoE to James Gilb before the Friday EC meeting for WG chairs and vice-chairs.
    - PARs
    - The RAC chair position is open.
- Treasurer's report (current cash reserve ~$ 1.2 million)
- New-comer introduction coul be moved to earlier (currently 10-11 AM
- Standard sales channels have been extended to include Amazon
- Paul Nikolich is now chair of the strategic planning committee of the Standards Association
- 30-anniversary stuff
    - Facebook page: http://www.facebook.com/pages/IEEE-802-Standards-Development-Group-30th-Anniversary/350374283320
    - Tuesday discussion panel in Grand Sierra D

Liaisons:
- Joint meetings
    - Wednesday 9 AM Interworking/DCB
    - Thursday 8-10 joint AVB/802.11
- Others?

PARs and related activities this week:
- 802.1AXbk
- Other WG PARs http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/PARs.shtml
- 802.1AX interpretation request (http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2010/ax-interp-request-802-1ax-2008-0110.doc) - There was some uncertainty as to what the IR asks for; Tony asked if someone would come up with some sort of proposed response by Thursday for the closing plenary.
- 802.1D - last approved in 2004; if not re-affirmed then it will "die" in December. Pat and Mick seemed to advocate simply asking for a re-affirmation. Tony said that we will need to ask the EC for permission to do that, and start a ballot announcement.
- 802.1H - No Editor(s) assigned at this point, unclear what value there is in doing the work, so the probable outcome is that we will withdraw the PAR and let the standard lapse in due course. Pat suggested that we should let it go based on the fact that it doesn't serve any useful purpose not already addressed elsewhere.

Anyone editing any current work that refers to 802.2 should now refer to ISO/IEC 8802-2 as 802.2 will disappear in December.

Task Group plans/agendas:

- John Messenger is acting as "virtual Steve" for at least part of this meeting <http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2010/admin-interworking-agenda-0310-v2.pdf>
- Pat briefly discussed the DCB agenda for the week.

- Tony would be acting as "virtual Michael" for AVB.

802 participants can get drafts of other working groups' documents by asking for them.

Interworking Minutes

802.1 Interworking Task Group

Steve Haddock was unable to attend due to family illness so John Messenger chaired the session. Each morning, he presented the patent slides and made the call for patents. There were no responses.

802.1Qbc Remote Customer Service Interface

Comment resolution was performed.

802.1Q-Rev VLAN Bridging Revision

Tony performed ballot resolution on the recent working group ballot of 802.1Q.

802.1Qbe Multiple I-SID Registration Protocol – Norm Finn

This document has been out for working group ballot. The ballot passed and comment resolution was performed.

802.1aq Shortest path bridging – task group ballot review

Mick presented a paper which describes background work which will form the basis for forthcoming changes to 802.1aq.

802.1aq Shortest path bridging – draft update (Fedyk)

Don Fedyk talked about the status of the draft.

802.1Qbf PBB-TE Infrastructure Segment Protection (Mackcrane)

The editor (Bob Sultan) did not attend this meeting. Ben Mackrane made a presentation describing some management renaming which they intend to do.

The final agenda is available that should reflect the meeting activities (see http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2010/admin-interworking-agenda-0310-v7.pdf).

AVB Meeting Minutes

802.1 Audio Video Bridging Task Group Agenda   Presenter   Length
- Magic decoder ring
        Presenter: CG/Craig Gunther, GG/Geoff Garner, GV/Ganesh Venkatesan,

JP/Joe Pelissier, KS/Kevin Stanton, LH/Lu Huang, MJT/Michael Johas Teener, PK/Philippe Klein, Sc/Steve Carlson, TJ/Tony Jeffree, YK/Yongbum Kim, YL/Yuanqiu Luo, ??/everyone
Normal text: agenda items concluded as proposed.
Bold text: notes, action items, items not on agenda covered.
Italic text: agenda items not started due to time restrictions.

- Tue AM 9:00-12:00

- administrivia	MJT	30
Patent slides presented and call for patents – no one responded		
linteractions with SMPTE		
interactions with ITU-T		
Action item: MJT to get liaison information to GG		
- 802.1Qat	CG	150

- Tue PM 13:00-17:00

- 802.1Qat	CG	60
- G.hn and SRP	KS	60
- MSRPDU Addressing within the CSN	**PK**	
- 802.1BA	TJ	120

- Wed AM 8:00-12:00

- 802.3bf liaison (AVB comments + communication of accuracy bounds)	SC/etc.	60
- 802.1AS	GG	180
Clause 13 overview	**YL**	
Comment resolution	**GG**	

- Wed PM 13:00-17:00

- 802.1AS	GG	120
- 802.1Qat	**CG**	
- 802.1BA	**TJ**	
- Coordinating transmission selections streams (conflict between AVB and DCB)	JP	45
- Next steps	*MJT/etc*	*75*
- Requirement of automatic error compensation for asymmetry of physical line	LH	30
- 802.1AS++	*GG/etc*	*15*
- 802.1Qat++	*CG/etc*	*15*
- Communication of power mgt and other policy information	*??*	*15*

- Thu AM 08:00-12:00 Joint AVB/802.11aa

- Status of 802.1 AVB specifications	MJT/etc.	60
AVB WG Proposal: 802.1Qat on 802.11	**PK**	
- Status of 11aa	GV/etc.	180
MSPRDU Processing at the AP/DMN	**GV**	

DCB Meeting Minutes

DCB Minutes 3/15/2010

Meeting called to order by Pat Thaler at 14:30.
Agenda reviewed.
Pat showed patent slides and made call for patents. No response.
Antitrust and competition guidelines reviewed.
Claudio led comment resolution on 802.1Qbb.
Craig Carlson led discussion on 802.1Qaz comment resolutions.

> Joe Pelissier reviewed the DCB/AVB issue with configuring the traffic selection algorithm.

3/16/2010:
Meeting called to order by Pat at 9:10.
Pat reminded everyone about the patent policy and made call for patents. No response.
Craig Carlson led discussion on 802.1Qaz comment resolutions.
Group discussion on options to solving the DCB/AVB traffic selection configuration issue.
EVB Presentations:

> Paul Bottorf - EVB Architecture
>> Need to revisit issue of whether to require all frames to contain C-TAG and where to put PVIDs
>
> Paul Bottorf – Multichannel Discovery and Configuration
> Mike Krause – Proposed EVB TLV
> Rakesh Sharma– VSI Discovery and Configuration
> Renato Recio – Edge TLV Transport Protocol (ETTP)
> Joe Pelissier – Port Extender Control Overview

DCB / Internetworking joint meeting, 3/17/2010

Pat called meeting to order at 9:05am
Pat reviewed Agenda
Pat reminded everyone about the patent policy
Paul Bottorf – EVB Architecture
Joe Pelissier – Review of P802.1Qbh Draft 0.1 specification
Rakesh Sharma – VSI Discover and Configuration

> EVB and LInkagg Discussion
> - Which EVB LLDP parameters need to run on aggregated link and which on the physical link
> - Pat believes the communication for DCB parameters should clearly go on the physical link
> - -The DCBX info will be in the LLDP frame with the nearest bridge address

Manoj presented his ideas on PFC and what priorities to pay attention to in an EVB environment

- How to get the DCBX information up to the layers above the S-Component

- The DCBX stuff certainly runs at the physical layer
- There is little support for a remapping function between C-Tags and S-Tags for the priority field in this environment.
- Some question about how the DE bit will be used in this environment. The direction seems to be to make the priority value the same between the two tags.

DCB Meeting 3/18/2010
Pat called meeting to order at 9:05am
Pat reviewed Agenda
Pat reminded everyone about the patent policy
Pat led comment resolution on 802.3bd
Joe Pelissier led discussion on TSA TLV
Pat led discussion on motions and next steps

Closing Plenary, 19 March, 2010

The Chair presented the Closing Plenary slides located at:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/minutes/2010-03-closing-plenary-slides.pdf

Tony reviewed the IEEE 802 patent and anti-competition policies.

IEEE 802.1 Chair voting - only one candidate (incumbent Tony Jeffree)

Vice Chair voting -

3 candidates: Paul Congdon, Glenn Parsons, John Messenger
3 votes:
- best of 3 - Paul (12), Glenn (14), John (7)
- best of best 2 - Paul (17), Glenn (17)
- brought John back for another best of best 2 - Paul (16), Glenn (15)

Close, but Paul comes out in front.

Motions to recommend the EC confirm the Chair and Vice Chair

Tony Jeffree for Chair: 38 for, 0 against, 0 abstain
Paul Congdon for Vice Chair: 34 for, 0 against, 0 abstain

Kuai vs Bangalore

37   28   (would be prepared to go)

Clear preference for Kuai.

Task group reports:

John Messenger - Interworking: http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2010/admin-interworking-agenda-0310-v7.pdf

John Fuller - AVB: No slides, mostly from agenda
Pat Thaler - DCB: http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2010/admin-thaler-dcb-status-0310.pdf

(In) Sanity check on current project workload (see closing plenary slides):
16 projects listed

Motion to accept minutes from November 2009 and January 2010
Proposed Gray Seconded Fuller
Acclamation

Motion to have the 802.1 pre-meeting on Monday morning next
Plenary meeting
Acclamation

Clarification: will follow the same schedule as this meeting

Note: for authoritative voting results, see the [closing plenary slides](#).

Motion to hold January Interim in Kuai
For 22, Against 0, Abstain 6

802.1aq: Seaman/Fedyk   21/0/3
802.1Qbe: Messenger/ Finn   20/0/2
802.1Q-REV: Messenger/Seaman   27/0/1
802.1Qbf: Mac-Crane/Seaman   21/0/3
802.1Qbc: Messenger/Mack-Crane   26/0/2
802.1AC: Mack-Crane/Messenger   24/0/1
802.1Qbe (conditional approval for sponsor ballot): Finn/Messenger   27/0/3

Liaison letter to SG15/Q9 on Etherwire (response to 5 separate liaisons – authored by John Messenger):
Messenger/Seaman   25/0/1

MEF SOAM/FM (re: 802.1 MIB augmentation (authored by Glenn Parsons)
Parsons/Lemon   22/0/1

Interpretation Request on 802.1AX (LAG) (authored by Glenn Parsons)
Mack-Crane/Messenger   26/0/1

MEF (re: 802.1Qbc - RCSI)
Messenger/Mack-Crane   20/0/2

PAR 802.1AXbk
Mack-Crane/Messenger
25/0/2

Withdraw PAR for 802-1H
Messenger/Seaman
24/0/2

Re-affirmation 802.1D
Messenger/Seaman
26/0/3

Weekly AVB calls

Fuller/Garner
Acclamation

802.1AS to sponsor ballot
Garner/Fuller
24/0/2

802.1BA task group ballot
Fuller/Gunther
29/0/0

E-Mail ballot (of EC) 802.1Qat Sponsor re-circ
Gunther/Fuller
26/0/0

DCB weekly conference calls
Thaler/Gray
Acclamation

802.1Qau to RevCom (SB 64/0/4)
Thaler/Gray
27/0/0

802.1Qaz to WG re-circ and request, E-Mail ballot (of EC) 802.1Qaz to
Sponsor Ballot
Thaler/Gray
22/0/1

Conditional approval of the EC for sponsor ballot 802.1Qbb
Thaler/Gray
19/0/2

EC approval 802.3bd to sponsor ballot
Thaler/Gray
20/0/4

ballot comment resolution teleconference for 802.1Qbb
Thaler/Gray
Acclamation

802.1Qbg to task group ballot
Thaler/Gray
23/0/0

802.1Qbh to task group ballot
Thaler/Gray
25/0/1

Motion to adjourn
Congdon/Mack-Crane
Acclamation