IEEE 802 Interim Meeting
January 2011, Kauai, Hawaii, USA
802.1 Meeting Minutes, 10-14 January 2011

Attendees

Last Name	First Name	Middle Name	Affiliation
Allan	David		Ericsson
Alon	Zehavit		Nokia Siemens Networks
An	Yafan		Juniper Networks, Inc.
Ashwood-Smith	Peter		Huawei Technologies Co. Ltd
Boiger	Christian		Hochschule Deggendorf University
Bond	David		University of New Hampshire InterOperability Laboratory (UNH-IOL)
Bragg	Nigel		Ciena Corporation
Carlson	Craig		QLogic Corporation
Cheng	Weiying		Tellabs
Chiabaut	Jerome		Nortel Networks
Congdon	Paul		Hewlett-Packard Development Company, L.P.
Connor	Donald	O	FUJITSU
Crupnicoff	Diego		Mellanox Technologies
Dabagh	Alireza		WG802.1
DeSanti	Claudio		Cisco Systems, Inc.
Ding	Zhemin		Ericsson AB
Eastlake, 3rd	Donald		Huawei Technologies Co. Ltd
Farkas	Janos		Ericsson
Fedyk	Donald		ALCATEL-LUCENT
Finn	Norman		Cisco Systems, Inc.
Garner	Geoffrey		Samsung
Ghanwani	Anoop		Brocade
Goetz	Franz		Siemens
Gray	Eric		Ericsson AB
GU	Yingjie		Huawei Technologies Co. Ltd
Gunther	Craig		HARMAN INTERNATIONAL INDUSTRIES, INCORPORATED
Haddock	Stephen		Extreme Networks
Jeffree	Anthony		Broadcom, HP
Jones	Girault		Apple Computer, Inc.
Keesara	Srikanth		Avaya Inc.
Kim	Yongbum		Broadcom Corporation
Klein	Philippe		Broadcom Corporation
Krause	Michael		Procurve Networking by HP
Kumar	Vinod		Tejas Networks Ltd
Lemon	John		ADTRAN Inc.
li	lin		ZTE Corporation

Li	Yizhou		Huawei Technologies Co. Ltd
Lynch	Jeff		IBM
Mack-Crane	Thomas		Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd.
Martin	David	0	Ciena Corporation
Messenger	John		ADVA Optical Networking Ltd.
Moldovansky	Anatoly		Rockwell Automation, Inc.
Mora	Matthew		Apple Computer, Inc.
Multanen	Eric		Intel Corporation
Nakamura	Masafumi		Envital
Olsen	David		HARMAN INTERNATIONAL INDUSTRIES, INCORPORATED
Pannell	Donald		Marvell Semiconductor, Inc.
Parsons	Glenn		Ericsson AB
Pearson	Mark		Hewlett-Packard Development Company, L.P.
Pelissier	Joseph		Cisco Systems, Inc.
Raeber	Rene		Cisco Systems
Rouyer	Jessy		ALCATEL-LUCENT
Sajassi	Ali		Cisco Systems
Saltsidis	Panagiotis		Ericsson AB
Seaman	Michael		Mick Seaman
Shao	Hong		ZTE Corporation
Stanton	Kevin	B	Intel Corporation
Sultan	Robert		Huawei Technologies Co. Ltd
Teener	Michael	Johas	Broadcom Corporation
Thaler	Patricia		Broadcom Corporation
Ting	Ao		ZTE Corporation
Unbehagen	Paul		ALCATEL-LUCENT
Wei	Yuehua		ZTE Corporation

Interworking Minutes

Monday, January 10

AM

Meeting called to order at 9:00 AM.

Stephen Haddock presented patent policy slides. No response to the call for patents.

Stephen Haddock presented the preliminary agenda for the week (see http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/admin-interworking-agenda-0111-v0.pdf).

Ben Mack-Crane gave a presentation on an offer by Huawei to host a September interim meeting in Nanjing. See:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/admin-mackcrane-sep11-nanjing-meeting-0111.pdf
802.1Q-REV VLANs: Tony Jeffree conducted comment resolution of 802.1Q-REV-d1.3 Virtual Bridged LAN sponsor ballot. See:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/q-rev-drafts/d1/802-1Q-REV-d1-3-sponsor-pdis.pdf

Break for Lunch at 12:20 PM.

PM

Resumed at 1:40pm.

802.1Qbf SegProt: Bob Sultan presented an editor's update and conducted comment resolution of 802.1Qbf-d1.1 PBB-TE Infrastructure Segment Protection working group recirculation ballot.   There were no new disapprove ballots, however there were some comments that will generate changes to the draft, so another recirculation is planned. Comment dispositions are available in the bf-drafts folder on the web site. See:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/bf-sultan-editors-report-01-11-v00.pdf
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/bf-drafts/d1/802-1bf-d1-1-dis-v0.pdf
New Work: Presentation on Resilient Network Interconnect from Janos Farkas. Following the meeting Janos uploaded an updated version:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/new-farkas-RNI-data-plane-0111.pdf
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/new-farkas-RNI-data-plane-0111-v02.pdf

Adjourned at 3:30 PM.

Tuesday, January 11

Meeting called to order at 9:00 AM.

Presented patent policy slides. No response to the call for patents.

New Work: Presentations on Resilient Network Interconnect from Vinod Kumar, Zehavit Alon, and Norm Finn:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/new-vinod-NNI-Req-PBBTE-0111-v04.pptx
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/new-alon-NNI-protection-architecture-01-11-v01.pdf
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2010/new-nfinn-LACP-vs-buffer-networks-1110-v1.pdf

Break for Lunch at 12:20 AM.

PM

Resumed at 1:40 PM.

New Work: Presentations on Resilient Network Interconnect from Norm Finn, Stephen Haddock, and Ben Mack-Crane:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/new-nfinn-why-LACP-for-NNIl-0111-v01.pdf
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/new-haddock-RNNI-why-use-LAG-0111-v1.pdf
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/new-mackcrane-NNI-portal-protocol-0111-v01.pdf

The chair asked whether there would be any objections to using Link Aggregation as the base for developing a Resilient Network Interconnect standard proceeding with drafting a PAR for an amendment to 802.1AX-2008 Link Aggregation. There were no objections.

Norm Finn presented a draft for a PAR and 5 criteria, which was then modified in discussion. The resulting text can be found at:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/new-nfinn-nni-par-1110-v03.txt
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/new-nfinn-nni-5c-1110-v3.pdf

Adjourn at 5:40 PM.

Wednesday, January 12

AM

A joint meeting was held with Data Center Bridging task group. See DCB minutes below for details.

Broke for Lunch at 12:20 AM.

PM

Joint meeting resumed at 1:30 PM.

New Work: Norm Finn presented the PAR and 5 criteria for a resilient network interconnect based on Link Aggregation. The name of the PAR was modified to Distributed Resilient Network Interconnect (DRNI):
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/new-nfinn-nni-par-1110-v04.txt
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/new-nfinn-nni-5c-1110-v4.pdf

Peter Ashwood-Smith gave an over view of the goals of the ECMP project proposal being developed in Interworking, followed by presentations on ECMP by Peter and David Allan:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/new-ashwood-ecmp-alg-0111-v01.ppt
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/new-allan-load-spreading-0111-v2.ppt

Adjourn at 5:00 PM.

Thursday, January 13

AM

Meeting called to order at 9:00 AM.

Presented patent policy slides. No response to the call for patents.

New Work: Presentations on Equal Cost Multi-Path enhancements for SPBM by Ali Sajassi and Ben Mack-Crane:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/new-sajassi-ecmp-bridge-model-0111-v01.pdf
http://ieee802.org/1/private/contrib/new-mackcrane-hash-ECMP-tags-0111-v01.pdf

Adjourned at 12:25 PM.

AVB Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, January 11

Patent slides shown.

Call for potentially essential patents. None were disclosed.

Discussed January 802.1AS RevCom review

802.1AS Gen-2 PAR & 5C by Geoff Garner. See presentations at:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/as-garner-802-1AS-v2-draft-par.pdf
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/as-garner-802-1AS-v2-draft-5-Criteria.pdf

Wednesday, January 12

More discussion on 802.1AS RevCom review by Geoff Garner

802.1BA Work Group ballot review by Tony Jeffree. See the document, proposed and final comment dispositions at:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/ba-drafts/d2/802-1ba-d2-2.pdf
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/ba-drafts/d2/802-1BA-d2-2-pdis.pdf
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/ba-drafts/d2/802-1BA-d2-2-pdis-v2.pdf
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/ba-drafts/d2/802-1BA-d2-2-dis.pdf

Thursday, January 13

Latency calculations by Christian Boiger –
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/ba-boiger-class-a-latency-issues-0111.pdf

Low latency industrial control by Franz Goetz –
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/new-goetz-avb-ext-industrcom-0113-v01.pdf

Reviewed potential 802.1AS D7.8 recirculation document (if required) by Geoff Garner –
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/as-garner-802-1AS-v2-draft-5-Criteria.pdf

AVB Gen-2 Assumptions by Don Pannell. See presentation at:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2010/avb-pannell-gen2-assumptions-1110-v2.pdf

Meeting adjourned

DCB Meeting Minutes

Monday, 10 January

AM

We had a combined meeting in the morning during which the usual policies and announcements were made.

Read the patent policy and made the call for patents – no responses.

The Chair reminded folks to record their attendance.

PM

In the Afternoon, we were reminded of the policies and asked again if anyone wanted to make a patent announcement. Again, there was no response.

We went through 802.1Qaz comment resolution.

See the documents (with and without changebars), MIB(s) and proposed comment dispositions at:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/az-drafts/d2/802-1az-d2-3.pdf
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/az-drafts/d2/802-1az-d2-3-cb.pdf
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/az-drafts/d2/802-1az-d2-3.mib
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/az-drafts/d2/802-1az-d2-3-pdis-v1.pdf

See also the final comment dispositions at:
 http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/az-drafts/d2/802-1az-d2-3-dis.pdf

We started EVB (802.1Qbg) comment resolution.

See document, MIB(s) and proposed comment dispositions at:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/bg-drafts/d1/802-1qbg-d1-3.pdf
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/bg-drafts/d1/802-1qbg-d1-3-mibs.zip
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/bg-drafts/d1/802-1Qbg-D1-3-pdis-v1.pdf

Tuesday, 11 January

AM

Pat Thaler reviewed IEEE 802 policies and asked if there was anyone who wished to make a patent announcement. No one responded.

The Chair reminded folks to record their attendance.

We continued EVB comment resolution.

PM

In the afternoon, there was a presentation in support of one of Bob Sultan's comments. See:

http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/bg-gu-pcp-in-vdp-rsp-0111-v02.ppt

Wednesday, 12 January

AM – Joint Interworking/DCB

Pat Thaler called for patents. No response to the call for patents.

Pat also reminded folks to record their attendance.

802.1Qbh BPE: Joe Pelissier presented a proposed modification to the p802.1Qbh PAR.

See the PAR modification presentation at:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/bh-pelissier-PARModification-0111-v02.pdf

Joe also walked through a tutorial on current theory of operations for the project (and technology) associated with P802.1Qbh (based largely on an in-depth description of Figure 44-4 of the draft located at:

http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/bh-drafts/d1/802-1qbh-d1-0.pdf

Joe then conducted comment resolution on the task group ballot of 802.1Qbh-d1.0 See the document (with and without change bars), MIB(s) and proposed comment dispositions at:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/bh-drafts/d1/802-1qbh-d1-0.pdf
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/bh-drafts/d1/802-1qbh-d1-0-cb.pdf
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/bh-drafts/d1/802-1qbh-d1-0PE.mib
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/bh-drafts/d1/802-1qbh-d1-0lldp.mib
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/bh-drafts/d1/802-1bh-d1-0-pds.pdf

Part of the discussion was on the topic of whether or not to do a substantial re-write to eliminate the idea that an E-Channel is the same as a VLAN. Joe wanted to get a sense of whether or not he would be likely to be asked to undo the change.

The conclusion was that people wanted this to happen. There was no sense that people were committing to not asking to have it undone at a later time.

Break for Lunch at 12:20 PM.

PM

Joint meeting resumed at 1:30 PM.

802.1Qbh BPE: Joe Pelissier concluded comment resolution on the task group ballot of 802.1Qbh-d1.0.

Norm discussed a PAR proposal for network interconnect resiliency. See his presentation(s) at:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/new-nfinn-nni-par-1110-v04.txt
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/new-nfinn-nni-5c-1110-v4.pdf

After the afternoon break we discussed several presentations on load spreading or ECMP.

Peter Ashwood-Smith gave a presentation on controlling MAC-in-MAC Hash/TTL. See the presentation at:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/new-ashwood-ecmp-alg-0111-v01.ppt

David Allan gave a presentation on load spreading that was an update of the posted version. The new presentation is at:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/new-allan-load-spreading-0111-v2.ppt

Thursday, 13 January

AM

Pat made the usual policy announcements and a call for patents – no responses. Pat also reminded folks to record their attendance.

Tony continued with 802.1Qbg comment resolution.

PM

Tony completed 802.1Qbg comment resolution about an hour after lunch. See the final comment dispositions at:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/bg-drafts/d1/802-1Qbg-D1-3-dis-v1.pdf

Then we proceded with a presentation by Yizhou. See:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/bg-yizhou-migration-indicator-0114-v01.pps

Finally, Joe presented a few slides on issues with EVB (802.1Qb). See:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2011/bg-pelissier-extendeder-0111.pdf

Meeting was adjourned