| Seq. # | Section number | your ini-tials | Cmnt type E, e, T, t | Part of NO vote | Corrected Text/Comment | Rationale | Disposition/Rebuttal |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|

# IEEE 802.11
# Wireless Access Method and Physical Specification

Title: **Clause 10 Comments Resolution**

Date: January 11, 1996

Author: Dean Kawaguchi

Symbol Technologies, Inc.
2145 Hamilton Ave
San Jose, CA. 95125
Telephone: (408)369-2629
FAX: (408)369-2737
email: DeanK@psd.symbol.com

| Seq. # | Section number | your ini-tials | Cmnt type E, e, T, t | Part of NO vote | Corrected Text/Comment | Rationale | Disposition/Rebuttal |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|

## Section 10 comments from Ballot on Draft Standard D2 (Vic Hayes, Chair, AT&T WCND)

| Seq. # | Section number | your ini-tials | Cmnt type E, e, T, t | Part of NO vote | Corrected Text/Comment | Rationale | Disposition/Rebuttal |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | **10** | **DW** | **T** | | **How are parameters like SIFS and Slot time specified, who do depend on both MAC and PHY parameters. It could be a PHY specification, which should include fixed MAC_processing_time values.** | | **Defined in parameter aSIFS_Time.** |
| | 10 | BTh | E | N | **add...** aDwell_Offset | Used in section8.1.5; I can't find its definition | Not applicable. Deleted in 8.1.5. |
| | **10** | **DW** | **T** | **Y** | **A parameter is needed that specifies the total PHY overhead of PLCP preamble and Header. So anything that determines the total duration occupied on the medium. Also needed is a factor with which the MPDU duration can be calculated by the MAC.** | **The MAC needs this to calculate the Duration fields in Control and Dataframes. This does specifically apply to the Fhopper, who apparently adds one bit for every 32 bits.** | **Accept comment and will add new parameters: aPreamble_Lngth, aPLCP_Hdr_Lngth, aMPDU_Duratn_Factr PHY group unanimous.** |
| | 10.1 | D | e | | Change numbering to remove single | If there is only one | |

| Seq. # | Section number | your ini-tials | Cmnt type E, e, T, t | Part of NO vote | Corrected Text/Comment | Rationale | Disposition/Rebuttal |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | M | | | subsections. There should always be more than 1 subsection. | subsection then the subsection should become a section of the next higher level. The purpose of a subsection is to break a section down into more parts. If there is only one part then it doesn't warrant a subsection. | |
| | 10.1 | W R | e | | Combine all MIB information into a single clause. | There is overlap between 8.4 and 10.1. All MIB information should be in its own clause | |
| | **10.1.2** | **KD** | **E** | | **Replace aMPDU_Max_Lngth_1M and aMPDU_Max_Lngth_2M with MPDU_Max_Lngth and Pref_MPDU_Max_Frgmnt_Lngth. Both new parameters are GET parameters only.** | **The _1M and _2M parameters were voted down by the previous letter ballot.** | |
| | **10.1.2** | **KD** | **E** | | **Add aCurrent_Pwr_State as a Get-Replace parameter.** | **The acceptance of the new layer management primitives eliminated the PLME_POWER primitive which turned the FH PHY on/off. This function must now be controlled for power management by a** | |

| Seq. # | Section number | your ini-tials | Cmnt type E, e, T, t | Part of NO vote | Corrected Text/Comment | Rationale | Disposition/Rebuttal |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | | | | **PHY MIB parameter.** | |
| | **10.1.2** | **D W** | **T** | | **-aTxRx_Turnaround_time spec is required. Tx and Rx delay figures are needed to allow a MAC to asses proper SIFS timing.** | **I would expect that aTxRx_Turnaround_time is intended here. The MAC needs to know the difference between the actual and standard specified numbers, to assure proper IFS timing.** | **Rejected because SIFS is defined. PHY group unanimous.** |
| | 10.1.3.1 | HC | e | | aSlot_Ttime, aCCA_Asmnt_Time, aRxTx_Turnaround_Time, aTx_PLCP_Delay, aRxTx_Switch_Time, aTxRamp_On_Ttime, | spelling | |
| | 10.1.4 | KJ | E | | All final level numbers should be renumbered since many have been deleted and others added with duplicate levels | | |
| | 10.1.4.10 10.1.4.12 | FM i | t | N | The time units for each of these attributes should be microseconds, based on the adoption of the time unit unification decision at the July, 1995 | The intervals calculated using these delays are all in microseconds. The units of the values summed to | Accepted. PHY group unanimous. |

| Seq. # | Section number | your ini-tials | Cmnt type E, e, T, t | Part of NO vote | Corrected Text/Comment | Rationale | Disposition/Rebuttal |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | 10.1.4.13<br>10.1.4.15 | | | | meeting. If there is a reason for some of the delays to be in units smaller than one microsecond, a binary divisor should be used, such as units of 1/16 microsecond or 1/128 microsecond. | calculate the intervals should be in microseconds, or in units which can be scaled to microseconds by shifting. | |
| | 10.1.4.14 | FMi | T | N | The behavior should be defined as:<br><br>"The nominal time in miroseconds between the them the MAC entity receives a PHY_RXEND.indicate primitive at the end of a successful MPDU reception and the time the MAC entity issues the PHY_TXSTART.request primitive to send an acknowledgement~~uses to process a frame and prepare a response to the frame~~"; | This attribute is either improperly described or misplaced. A MAC processing time does not belong in the PHY MIB. Since this attribute is used in the SIFS calculation, probably the behaviour is described improperly, and a definition of the relevant MAC behavior is provided in this comment. | Accept text. PHY group unanimous. |
| | 10.1.4.4 | HC | T | N | aSlot_Time is dependent on Air_Propagation_Time, which this section says is equal to 1 usec. WHY? | Why is this a fixed value and where does it come from? I don't know what it should be, just wonder why it is what it is. | By vote of the full WG, the delay is 1 usec. |
| | 10.1.4.6 | HC | T | N | " The maximum time in nano~~mirco~~seconds the PHY requires to change from receive to transmiting the | Units mismatch - aTx_RF_Delay (10.1.4.10) is defined in units of | Fixed by accepting comment by FMi to use 1 usec as basic unit of |

| Seq. # | Section number | your ini-tials | Cmnt type E, e, T, t | Part of NO vote | Corrected Text/Comment | Rationale | Disposition/Rebuttal |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | | | start of the first symbol out on the air. The following equation is used to derive the RxTx_Turnaround_Time: aTx_PLCP_Delay + aRxTx_Switch_Time + aTxRamp_On_Time + aTx_RF_Delay. "; | nonoseconds. | time. |
| | 10.3.2.3 | D M | t | | Need a means to disable the whitener on a per frame basis. | Japan call sign id requirements specify that the call sign id be transmitted in the clear with no scrambling or whitening. This means the 802.11 standard needs to define a mechanism which allows the data to be sent in this format. | |

| Seq. # | Section number | your ini-tials | Cmnt type E, e, T, t | Part of NO vote | Corrected Text/Comment | Rationale | Disposition/Rebuttal |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|

| Seq. # | Section number | your ini-tials | Cmnt type E, e, T, t | Part of NO vote | Corrected Text/Comment | Rationale | Disposition/Rebuttal |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|