Jan '96 MAC group Report

- LLC
- MAC
- PHY

Jan '96 for Mar '96 mtg

- We had one goal - Process D3 LB comments and forward D3.1 for sponsor ballot.
- We didn't make it, but we made a lot of progress.
Clause 2

- Completed
- All comments accepted
- All resolutions edited into draft text.
- MAC approval vote: 12, 0, 1
- Plenary Vote: 24, 0, 0

Clause 3

- Completed
- One editorial comment referred to editors for style correction (c# 4 resolution in blue in file)
- All other resolutions edited into draft text.
- MAC approval vote: 12, 0, 2
- Plenary Vote: 24, 0, 0
Clause 4

- Completed
- All comments accepted
- All resolutions edited into draft text.
- MAC approval vote: 14, 0, 3
- Plenary Vote: 25, 0, 0

Clause 5

- One comment (C#27) declined re deleting the fractal picture - author not present, ok.
  reaction anticipated.
- C#57 declined - requested change based on Data frame assumption re WEP MIB variables.
- All other comments either adopted or problem identified resolved with alternative solution requested by other reviewers.
- MAC approval vote: 12, 0, 4
- Plenary Vote: 24,0,1
Clause 6

- Completed
- All comments accepted
- All edited into draft text
- For comments not exactly as author requested, author has agreed to delta.
- MAC approval vote: 15, 0, 2
- Plenary Vote: 24, 0, 1

Clause 7

- Approx 112 comments completed
  - C#64 re cap bits
  - Separated overloaded essid field used for both ess-id and ibss-id.
- Handled in Plenary
  - C#68: Arch comment re FH impact on MAC
    » Closed in plenary wed - declined, 24, 2, 11
Clause 7

- 8 comments declined
  - C#23,25: info elements word aligned in mgt frames
    » rec: leave as is, no pad - wed eve decision
    » One author accepts resolution, the other was not available at time of recommendation.
  - C#48: tolerance on duration field (maf) to compensate for FH bit stuffing.
    » author reaction not known.
  - C#78 suggests collapsing assoc and reassoc responses into single frame
  - C#75 CFP dur remaining def proposed change - author consents
  - C#60, 63, 65 WEP supported bits in CAP field, authors consent

- 3 open comments
  - C#72,74 supported rates - tired to multi rate comments as sub-subject
    » plenary issue
  - C#101: needs work to supply missing Challenge text element, will work on for May.
  - C#34 dependent on reference to C11 portion of comment
  - clause 7 still needs text change if C11 recomendation is adopted.

• MAC approval vote: 17, 0, 2
• Plenary Vote: 26, 0, 0
Clause 8

- All Comments processed
- Comments declined:
  - WEP capability bits comments declined, commentors all accept resolution.
- Comments referred:
  - One request for editorial text referred to commentor and editors.
    » Bit order picture in WEP PDU diagram, info is uniquely specified, but an additional picture here would be convenient.
- All other comments accepted.
- Clause 8 text edited.
- MAC approval vote: 17, 0, 2
- Plenary Vote: 25, 0, 1

Clause 9

- Approx 133 comments processed
- Open comments
  - About 29 comments not looked at yet.
  - C#21: multi-cast reliability from Jan (multiple comments)
  - C#37,38 can one process multiple msdu's on xmit at same time
  - c# 102, 103: remove PS-Poll/data/ack frame sequence comment.
- Deferred comments:
  - C#9: multi-rate
    » dependent on evening M-R group outcome.
Clause 9

- Accepted:
  - C#6: frag bcast or not? rec = not to fragment. comment accepted.
  - #simultain msdus 6 -> 3
  - CFP duration and CF-end - exact changes declined, alternative text used instead - O'lapping BSSs CFPs may be coordinated.
  - CWMIN became dynamic.
- MAC approval vote: 7, 0, 5
- Plenary Vote: 13, 8, 9

cw min fallback motion

- mac motion 12: moved to adopt dynamic mech per text in edited sec6.doc.
  - MAC vote: 12, 5, 3
  - assuming this flys in plenary, need text in C11 to match, if not fly need to back out both C9 and C11 text.
- motion for if prev motion (mac motion 12) not adopted in plenary, then do this: adopt static value on per phy basis the FH = 15, DS=31, IR=63
  - MAC vote: 16, 0, 0
  - Plenary Vote: 18, 3, 6
Clause 10

- All processed, all accepted, draft edited.
- MAC approval vote: 18, 0, 1
- Plenary Vote: 26, 0, 0

Clause 11

- All comments processed
- 90 Accepted
- Open comment:
  - Clause 7 C#35: when valid to change MIB entries?
  - C#15: re bcast reliability & 96/15
  - C#17: re randomization of beacons at TBTT
  - bcast reliability C# 14,44,59
  - 6 re multi-rate 4=TT 67,92,100,102, 98, 99
  - C#43, 42 re clairification of PSP - must get, or can get data from AP
Clause 11

- 7 Declined:
  - C# 111, 115, 120 re rename of attributes
  - C#26: delete ACK timeout attrib - expected to be moot by C#138 in clause 9
- Deferred:
  - C#67, 91, 92: re multi-rate issues
- MAC approval vote: 7,0,0
- Plenary Vote: 24, 0, 4

General & Annex

- 128 comments
- huge portion handled by Plenary motion 8
- Approx 28 other comments.
- Open Comments:
  - Patents
    - open as 802.11 has not heard from Apple re RTS/CTS.
  - Multi-rate
    - Depends on results of Wed eve M-R group.
- Other comments open as not looked at yet.
  - A few technical comments re PICs
  - Most editorial in nature that Editors need to look at (comments from IEEE editor etc).
- MAC approval vote: N/A
Major anticipated contributions for May

• Simon: PICS updated to match D3.1 (96/1R2)
• MIF: updated annex state machine to match D3.1 (96/2)
• MAC group will send out a request for all mac members to tell us if they believe we have made a net gain in satisfaction with the D3.1 work (i.e. an informal confirmation ballot) - this will be done via email (MAC chair to email)

Goals for May 96

• Complete processing D3 LB comments.
MAC group report

• That’s all for now...
in case c9 fails...

Recover C9 work

- Moved: to adopt all the recommendations from the MAC group re clause 9 except for those from C#78 from C9 table (Dynamic CWmin).
- Plenary Vote: 27,0,1