Tentative Minutes of the IEEE P802.11

Full Working Group
Plenary Meeting
Vancouver, Canada
November 11-14.1996

Monday 11-11-96

1.0 Opening
Meeting called to order by Vic Hayes at 3:30 in the Saturna Room of the Hotel Vancouver. Agenda of 37th session of 802.11 is in doc.:IEEE P802.11 11-96/131. Review of objectives if this meeting. New secretary, George Fishel will install later.

Objectives for this meeting, all groups
Process LMSC (Sponsor) ballot result
Prepare comments to Letter Ballot on CD 8802-11
Conformance testing
Future work

1.0 Secretary: Chair taking notes on PPT files and Bob O’Hara making notes.

1) The officers of the Working Group are:

Mr. VICTOR HAYES
Chairman IEEE P802.11
Lucent Technologies
Phone: +31 30 609 7528
Fax: +31 30 609 7498
E-Mail: v.hayes@ieee.org

Mr. STUART KERRY
Vice Chairman IEEE P802.11
Symbol Technologies Inc.
Phone: +1 408 369 2634
Fax: +1 408 446 4630
E-Mail: stuart@psd.symbol.com

Mr. DAVE BAGBY
Chair IEEE P802.11-MAC group
Advanced Micro Devices
Phone: +1 408 987 2423
Fax: +1 408 987 2800
E-Mail: david.bagby@amd.com

Mr. MR. GEORGE FISHEL
Secretary IEEE P802.11
AMP Inc.
Phone: +1 717 592 6161
Fax: +1 717 592 6179
E-Mail: grfishel@amp.com

Mr. Chris ZEGELIN
Vice Chairman IEEE P802.11
Symbol Technologies Inc.
Phone: +1 408 369 2667
Fax: +1 408 369 2740
E-Mail: chrisz@psd.symbol.com

Mr. DEANKAWAGUCHI
Chair IEEE P802.11-PHY group
Symbol Technologies Inc.
Phone: +1 408 369 2629
Fax: +1 408 369 2740
E-Mail: deank@psd.symbol.com

Mr. BOB O’HARA
Editor IEEE P802.11
Informed Technologies Inc.
Phone: +1212 645 4317
Fax: +1 212 645 6719
E-Mail: bob_ohara@informed-technologies.com

Mr. GREG ENNIS
Editor IEEE P802.11
Phone: +1 408 358 8991
E-Mail: gennis@netcom.com
1.1 Roll Call: People in the room were invited to introduce themselves. Moment of silence for the passing Chris Zegelin’s wife. Dean Kawaguchi had a card to send to Chris. Stuart Kerry indicated that it was Chris’ wish to replace a group collection by individual donation to local charities.

1.2 Voting rights:

Participation in debates, moving and seconding is only permitted by voting members, in all 802.11 meetings (at all levels). The subgroup chairs may permit observers to participate in debates.

Voting at the working group level is by voting members only. Chair may permit observers to participate in debate. To become a voting member:
- participate in at least 2 out of 4 consecutive plenary meetings. Voting rights start at third meeting
- participation in at least 75% in meetings, in the room
- one interim may be exchanged for a plenary
- Voting members will get a token to be used at votes

Voting rights can be maintained:
- by participation in 2 plenary meetings within 4 consecutive plenary meetings
- one interim may be substituted for a plenary

Voting rights may be lost:
- after failing to pay the conference fee
- after missing two out of three consecutive letter ballots

Current state of member status:

64 - Voting members
28 - Aspiring voting members
11 - Nearly voting members

1.3 Attendance list, Registration: The attendance list was circulated, Stuart Kerry supervising - 75% attendance according to the attendance list is required to qualify for attending the meeting as a whole, so make sure to sign the book. Copies of the attendance list are handed out before the end of each meeting.
- important for administration of voting rights that the attendance book is used properly.
- sign per meeting (morning, afternoon, evening). Do not sign ahead.
- place initials. Do not cross or underline.
- circle the letter corresponding to the meeting you attend when signing (F=full 802.11, P=PHY, M=MAC group).

Check e-mail addresses in the book:
- some addresses have been struck, or have a $-sign added to the right - those received complaints from the reflector
- please strike your e-mail address if you do not use it
- if you do not disagree to receiving very long files, mark bulk e-mail with yes

1.4 Logistics: Document distribution is done using pigeon holes - you will find your copies and messages in the referenced location in the expanding file folders in the slot in front of your name.

Document distribution:
- sign in for a slot, remember the letter and number
- pigeon holes are file folders with a letter id on each folder and a number on each slot
- in each folder are numbered slots, each of which is 'owned' by a person
- each person owns slot in front of number

Conference fee to be paid through registration office.
Coffee breaks at 10 AM and 3 PM. Noon to 1:00 PM lunch

1.5 IEEE Patent Policy
Vic Hayes explained the IEEE Patent Policy as per Clause 5 of the IEEE Standards By-Laws and per Clause 6.3 of the IEEE Standards Operations Manual. He specifically asked for notification from members of patents applicable to the draft standard and that patent holders submit the requested statement.

1.6 Other announcements

1.6.1 General information available on diskette
Vic Hayes provided a set of diskettes with general information, during the meeting kept by George Fishel. The diskettes containing:

1. July mailing
2. October mailing (and March 96 tutorials)
3. marked up sections of draft (from ballot)
4. files with report and comments from ballot
   also Part 15 of CFR 47 and spectrum inventory USA (downloaded by Ian Gifford)
5. General info, IEEE, 802, 802.11

1.6.2 Volunteers needed for Thursday evening to prepare mailing
Richard Payne, Roy Sebring, Johnny Zweig will help on Thursday night with paper work.

2. Approval of the minutes of previous meetings

2.1 Enschede meeting doc.:11-96/109

Motion #1 To approve the minutes 96/109

Motion made by Johnny Zweig
Second by Stuart Kerry

Vote 25-0-3

Motion #1 passes

3. Reports

3.1 the Executive Committee ExCom meeting report made by Vic Hayes.

Old USTAG to ISO/IEC JTC1/SC6 was dissolved and a proposal for a new tag was made. The expected cost for LMSC, US$ 10 000 will be deducted form the International Secretariatship Payment.

Reflector for 802 all E-mail will be set-up using the individual reflectors of the WGs.

The controversy about conditional approval to go to Sponsor Ballot or to Standards Board only met with disapprove votes during the e-mail ballot among the ExCom. Meetings will be held this week to resolve the issues.

Proposed rules for e-mail ballots among ExCom met with a lot of comments. Meetings will be held this week to resolve the issues.

Book distribution. Books will be sent directly to the eligible people; members need to sign up.

In a general rules change of the IEEE Standards Operating Manual, from now on all comments whether from “approve” voters or from coordination must be resolved equally well as on “do not approve” votes.
3.2 the editors
Report from the editors made by Bob O on revision 5.09 that will become 5.1

3.3 the LMSC (Sponsor) ballot on draft D5.0
Vic Hayes presented the results of the LMSC (Sponsor Ballot) on draft 5.0 as given in doc.: 11-96/135 part 1. The ballot closure was delayed by a week, the return rate was 77% and the approval rate was 86%. Main task is to resolve all comments See Document 11-96/135 (parts 1-6).

3.4 ISO/IEC JTC1/SC6 meeting 11-96/137
The work item for Wireless LANs was approved and our draft 5.0 was adopted as the Committee Document on 8802-11 on the subject. This will be the only document going for standard within this project. If ETSI would like to give an additional document, they have to apply for a new work item first. Vic Hayes was honoured with the project editorship.

3.5 the ITU-R Working party 8A meeting
Ian Gifford and Vic Hayes attended this meeting on mobile services except FPLMTS. Both US regulations as well as references to IEEE P802.11 and ISO CD 8802-11 were added to the draft recommendation. It is interesting to note that this Rec encourages further adoption of unlicensed spectrum in 2.4 and 5.2 GHz areas as well as for additional spectrum for public RLANs under licenses.

4. Review of document list by Vic H. IEEE 802.11-96/140 temp
Additional documents 142 by Naftali Chayat, replacement for rules for Regulatory Committee and 96/143 on time stamp Keith Amundson

5. Adoption of the Agenda 11-96/131. Vic presents a Rough Graphic of Outline

Motion #2 to approve the agenda with change to the start time for Wednesday Plenary to 3:30 PM.

made by Tom Siep
second Johnny Zweig

Vote: 26-0-4

Motion #2 passes

5 Unfinished Business

5.1 destiny of the Draft Standard
Heavy discussion followed on State Machines (MAC and PHY).

Motion #3 that 802.11 direct the MAC group to create a formal normative description of the MAC protocol operation for inclusion in the re-circulation ballot.

Motion made by Johnny Zweig
Second by Bob O’Hara
Discussion Followed

Motion #4 to postpone motion #3 Vote till Wednesday plenary.

Moved by Dean Kawaguchi
Second by Dave Bagby
Additional discussion

Question called by Dave Bagby second by Johnny Zweig

vote: 26-2-2 Question Called
November 1996

Meeting Minutes IEEE 802.11 page 5

George Fishel, AMP Incorporated

Vote:12-11-8

Motion #4 Passes Motion #3 postponed

6.2 **Rules for Reg Com**

At the last meeting the committee for interaction with regulatory bodies was dissolved. Naftali C presented document 96/142. Proposal made by Naftali C to accept document 96/142 with a change of voting rules to 25% response be a committee. Discussion follows. Discision made to come up with guide lines for proposal will be presented later.

7. New Business

7.1 **Nomination for New secretary**

Vic announced that George Fishel volunteered to become the secretary of 802.11.

**Motion 4A**

| to appoint George Fishel as the secretary of 802.11 |

Motion made by Dean Kawaguchi
Second by Stuart Kerry

George Fishel appointed as new secretary by acclamation.

7.2 **Preparation of Comment to LB on CD8802-11**

This item was left for future resolution.

7.3 **Future work**

Vic H opens the floor for proposal for new work items.

Need for a 10 and 20 Mb/s PHY
3 Mb/s FH PHY

**Motion # 5**

| to establish a study group to draft a PAR for a higher speed PHY in the 2.4 GHz band and PHYs operating in other bands |

Moved by Jan Boer
Second by Johnny Zweig
Naftali Chayat volunteered to be chair of the group.

Vote 26-2-3

Motion # 5 passes

Study group will meet from 8:00 to 10:00 this evening.

Discussion on a rugged future PHY William Rodgers from ITT will make future presentation.

8. Meeting adjourned at 7:00 PM.

**Wednesday 13-11-96**

Meeting reconvened at 3:30 PM on 11-13-96 and called to order by Vic Hayse.

9.1 **Roll Call**

9.2 **Document list update**
9.3 Agenda adjustments
No changes. Agenda was approved as is.

9.4 Announcements

9.4.1 Social tonight
with lots of food, meeting rooms available tonight

9.4.2 Study group future work
Tonight in Cortes at 8:00 h
MAC ad-hocs work
Tonight in Saturna at 7:30 h

9.4.3 process for getting changes from NO into YES
We need a written statement that the NO voter changed his vote on the LMSC ballot on IEEE 802.11 D5.0 from No into YES. Free format, and signed. Make a file with the dispositions to be sent to Griffioen and Phinney by e-mail, and printed for people present so they can decide

9.4.4 Dave Bagby offered disk of resolved MAC comments

9.5 Postponed motion
Motion #3 on state machine
Straw poll called by Vic on the following item:
“If time would be available, we support informative formal description”
Strawpoll 10-7-14

“If time would be available support normative formal description”
Strawpoll: 29-1-6

“I would approve a mandate to a group to add the normative formal description to draft D5.1” This question was debated at great length
Strawpoll: 12-10-14

to add “I would approve a 1 week e-mail ballot after a 1 week comment cycle for the normative formal description to draft D5.1”
Strawpoll: 10-3-23

“I would approve a 1 week mail in ballot after a 1 week comment cycle for the normative formal description to draft D5.1
Strawpoll: 8-15-12

Great deal of debate on this topic followed! Here is the postponed motion:

**Motion #3:** That 802.11 direct the MAC group to create a formal normative description of the MAC protocol operation for inclusion in the Re-circulation ballot

Motion made by: Jonny Zweig
Seconded by: Bob O’Hara.

Vote: 21-11-4

Technical motion fails by order of chair must pass by 75%.

**Appeal I:**
Appealed by Bob O’Hara
Seconded by: ?
November 1996

Vote 12 for the chair, 14 for appeal, 8 abstained

Ruling by the chair appealed

Motion #3 passes

Draft of document could be available by November 20th
Comment period closes November 30th
E-mail ballot December 10th only changes on D5.0

Great deal of debate on this topic followed!
Expert group to update formal description and give mandate to update the broken text
Chair determines if we need a second WG ballot before the Full LSMC Ballot

10. Cross group Issues

Motion #6 to reject Comment on Clause 12.3.3 made by: KC.

Motion made by: Wim Diepstraten
Seconded By: Anil Sanwalka

Question called by Tom Siep and Second by Darwin Engwer No Nos question is called

Vote: 20-0-7 motion #6 passes

Comment on Clause 12.3.5.1.2 made by: TLP.

Motion #7: Adopt XXh as format for hexadecimal numbers through this document.

Moved by: Carl Andren
Seconded By: Naftali Chayat

Vote: 14-3-13 Motion #7 passes

Comment on Clause 13 all by: TLP. To use SI units in all locations in this document

Motion #8 to continue to use K s rather than ms

Motion made by: Bob O’Hara
Seconded By: Jonny Zweig

Vote: Motion #8 passes with 1 opposing

Comment on Clause 13.1.2

Motion #9 to delete Annex D

Motion made by: Jonny Zweig
Seconded By: Michael Fischer

Vote: Motion #9 passes unanimously

Comment on Clause 14.8.2.1.2 By TLP

Motion #10 to change figure...
Motion made by: Dean Kawaguchi  
Seconded By: Carl  

Vote: 20-0-5  

Motion #10 passes

Comment on Clause 13.1.4.10 and 13.1.4.12  

Motion #11 to change as noted.

Motion made by: Dean Kawaguchi  
Seconded By: Jan Boer  

Vote:  

Motion #11 passes unanimously

General Comment by Mike Trompower on 1 µs propagation delay.  

Motion #12 to decline changes.

Motion made by: Dave Bagby  
Seconded By: Tim Zimmerman  

Vote: 21-2-6  

Motion #12 passes

11. PHY resolutions: nothing to add

12. MAC resolutions: nothing to add

13. Conformance Testing: nothing to add

14. Adjourn: Meeting adjourned at 6:00 PM.

Final Plenary of 802.11  
Thursday 11-14-96 at 1:15 PM.

Meeting called to order by Vic Hayes with about 25 members present

15. Opening:  

15.1 Announcements  

15.1.1 Kamerman changed to yes  

15.1.2 Housley and Putnins got notice  

15.1.3 12 person room with speakerphone available for calling voters  

15.2 Document list update  

15.3 Agenda adjustments
16. Reports

PHY group first to permit Dave to finalize his report

16.2 PHY group

Full PHY and FH group report by Dean Kawaguchi

Comment Processing

Addressed all comments on clause 14, FH PHY portions of annex. All text changes completed except correcting primitive names in figures and FH PICS proforma changes. This will be done after the meeting has concluded.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Accept</th>
<th>Reject</th>
<th>Withdrawn</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NO-vote comments</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Editorial</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>non-NO-vote comments</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Accept</th>
<th>Reject</th>
<th>Withdrawn</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Technical</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Editorial (1 open)</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

FH Motion: accept REVSEC11 text changes from TLP with the modifications as recorded in the minutes and the comments resolution file.

FH: Nathan/Naftali 6-0-0

Motion #13: Accept the changes to clause 14 and the FH portion of annex A of the D5 draft made by the FH PHY group at the November 96 meeting to resolve sponsor ballot comments.

FH: Carl/Ron 5-0-0
PHY: FH/Naftali 11-0-0

Moved by Dean Kawaguchi (PHY)
Seconded by Jan Boer

Vote: 21-0-0

Two NO votes:
- Ron Mahany - Accepts the changes to the FH section as resolution to his comments.
- Tom Phinney -

16.2 DS Report by Jan Boer

Agenda
- secretary - mike
- minutes of March meeting - approved
- comment processing
- technical comments all on DS channel allocation plan
- 2 technical NO comments
- conformance testing - no activity
- future work - deferred to PAR study group
DS MOTION#1
Move to accept document SEC12.DOC as distributed in the comments files as the baseline for starting DS phy edits for this meeting.
approved (6-0-0)

DS MOTION#2
Move to accept the changes in REVSEC12.DOC as distributed.
approved (6-0-0)

DS MOTION#3
Move to add all four additional channels to ETSI (and two for France) and all channels in each domain are mandatory to be supported.
approve (5-0-1)

discussion: a technical NO comment by AK would not be satisfied by this change. A phone call will be placed to him to explain the rationale and see if he would withdraw his comment. the tradeoffs of giving up the additional frequencies to gain a common product

DS MOTION#4
Move to approve the response to 2nd technical NO vote by AK which rejects the comment to make the first two ETSI channels optional.
approve (5-0-1)

DS MOTION#5
move to approve the response to 1s technical NO vote by AK which rejects the comment to reduce the number of channels
approve (6-0-0)

Jan Boer will contact AK to determine if he will withdraw his comment. Result: AK is convinced by our arguments and has changed his no vote into yes

DS MOTION#7
Move to approve the WD technical No comment in 7.2.3.9 response with only the text changes pertaining to the current BSS current channel number.

discussion: comment asks for DS Parameter Set information element within Beacon Frames and Probe response frames with elements to report current channel number and the list of channels used within a ESS. The list is regarded to be not essential to solve the problem and rejected.

approved (6-0-0)

WD has agreed that is sufficient to change his NO to a YES on this issue

PHY/Plenary motion

Motion #14 to accept to changes DS section as presented

Motion to accept: Jan Boer
Second Mike Trompower
16.2.2 IR Report by Francisco Lopez

Motion #15

to accept report with changes to clause 16 IR section

Motion made by: Francisco Lopez
Seconded by: Johnny Zweig

Vote: 23-0-4
Motion #15 passes

Dean Kawaguchi makes the point that the IR section is not in the same format as the FH and DS section. He advises an editorial job.

16.1 MAC group by David Bagby

Status report for the week
Clause 0 to 4

Motion #16

to make changes as presented clause 0 to 4. Changes editorial only.

Made by Dave Bagby
Seconded by Johnny Zweig

Vote: 25-0-2
Motion #16 passes

Clause 5

Motion #17
to accept changes to clause 5.

Made by Dave Bagby
Seconded by Anil Sankalka

Vote: 26-1-2
Motion #17 passes

Clause 6

Motion #18
to accept changes

Motion made by: Dave Bagby
Second by Jonny Zweig

Vote: 25-0-1
Motion #18 passes

Clause 7

Motion #19
to accept changes to clause 7.

Moved by David Bagby
Seconded by Jan Boer

Vote: 26-0-2
Motion #19 Passes
Clause 8

Motion #20 to accept changes to clause 8

Made by David Bagby
Seconded by Johnny Zweig

Vote: 26-0-2

Motion #20 Passes

Clause 9

Motion #21 to accept changes to Clause 9.

Made by David Bagby
Seconded by Michael Fischer

Vote: 27-0-0

Motion #21 passes

Clause 10

Motion #22 to accept changes to clause 11.

Made by Dave Bagby
Seconded by Johnny Zweig

Vote: 22-0-5

Motion #22 passes

Clause 11

Motion #23 to accept changes to Clause 11.

Made by David Bagby
Seconded by Simon Black

Vote: 27-0-3

Motion #23 passes

Changes to Annex

Clause A

Clause 9 changes impacts A4.5 PHY group, appears comment was handled. Also text edit text in clause 9

Motion #24 to accept changes as described

Moved by David Bagby

Seconded by Johnny Zweig

Vote: 26-0-2

Motion #24 passes

Clause G

Motion #25 to accept changes to Clause G

Moved by David Bagby
Seconded by Tom Siep

Vote: 25-0-2

motion #25 passes
Vic says he has on his agenda a process for contacting members with NO comments

16.3 Study group

by Naftali Chayat

Following the motion accepted on Monday to establish a study group to draft a PAR for a higher speed PHY in the 2.4 GHz band and PHYs operating in other bands and Naftali Chayat volunteered to be chair of the group, the group conducted two meetings during the week.

Two PARs are being developed:
- extension to 802.11 with higher speeds at 2.4 GHz
- a second PAR for even higher speeds at 5 GHz

Heavy discussion followed on this topic. Many members feel that the criteria for the PAR in not sufficiently defined to go to the ExCom. Vic encourages the Study Group to go out and develop additional criteria for this PAR.

Straw Poll by Naftali to take request for PAR to ExCom: Straw Poll result: 4-15-5

Motion #26

Seek approval for higher speed PHY SG and assuming that is approved: that the people interested in higher speed PHYs continue to work as a study group and as soon as they think they have a par that will be accepted by the ExCom and as soon as they have a par that would be accepted by the ExCom

Made by Dave Bagby
Seconded by Keith Amundsen

Vote: 21-0-3

motion #26 passes

Straw Poll by Naftali “Who supports PR statement” A lot opposed to sending a PR statement.

16.4 Assignments for contacting NO voters.

Tom Phinney: Dean will do the PHY portion
David will do the MAC portion

Housley: David

Putnins: Nein Wei

Seifert: Bob O’Hara

Wim Diepstraten: himself

Clemens: Johnny and Darwin

Giffioen: Wim

Kamerman: Changed already

Fischer: Simon

Mahany: Ron

Sanwalka: Anil

Ask all NO voters send a letter sent to IEEE with the following text: I change my negative vote on the IEEE P802.11 D5.0 LMSC ballot into a positive vote

Name:

sign:

date:
16.5 Regulatory Committee rules

Presentation by Naftali Chayat IEEE P802.11-96/142 Proposition for an IEEE P802.11 Intermeeting Committee on Regulatory Matters and proposed Operating Rules for it

---

**Motion #27**

*To establish a framework for processing regulatory matters in accordance with IEEE P802.11-96/142*

Moved by Naftali Chayat
Seconded by Johnny Zweig

**Motion #28**

*to amend Motion #27 by deleting last sentence of method of work*

Moved by Dean Kawaguchi
Seconded by Anil Sanwalka

Vote: 0-12-6

---

**Motion #29**

*Amendment to Motion #27 to change the requirements for valid ballot from 25% to 50%*

Motion by: Bob O’Hara
Second by: Dean Kawaguchi

Vote: 14-0-7

---

**Call The Question on motion #27 Dave Bagby, seconded by Simon Black/ no objection to call the question**

Vote: 11-6-8

---

Main motion #27 passes as amended by 29

---

17. Unfinished business

17.1 Recap of output documents

Ballot on Draft Standard

---

**Motion #30**

*To Give the mandate to teleconference on December 16 15:00 to 17:00h UTC for deciding what goes into the re-circulation ballot open meeting votes for 11 voters only*

Moved by Johnny Zweig
Seconded by Michael Fischer

Vote: 12-0-8

---

**Motion #31**

*To give the mandate to teleconference on February 3 15:00 - 17:00h UTC for Deciding if and what goes into the proposal to the Standards Board. Open meeting: votes for 11 voters only*
Moved by Johnny Zweig  
Seconded by Michael Fischer

---

Vote: 18-0-4

**Motion #31 passes**

If needed, however, Vic Hayes will call a comment resolution meeting in February

**Comments to ISO**

**Motion #32**  
*To empower the chair of 802.11 to prepare comments on the ISO/IEC JTC1/SC6 NB for CD 8802-11 to keep the document in line with IEEE P802.11*

Motion made by: Tom Siep  
Second by: Ravi Nalamati

---

Vote: 20-0-3

**Motion #32 passes**

17.3 **Next Meeting**

* Objectives for next meeting  
  process comments  
  high rate extensions  
  conformance testing  
  complete .11

* Mailing Dates: Nov 22

17.5 **Future Meetings** see list below

17.4 **Other Intermediate Meetings required** There was no interim meeting required

---

**It was agreed to hold the SDL tutorial after the closure of the plenary 802.11 meeting.**

**Motion to adjourn. Motion passes by general consent at time 4:30 PM**

Note: After the meeting Keith Amundsen indicated to the chair that he would like to withdraw Steve Washakowsky’s Raytheon submission 96/143 because of objections that TSE processing can already be done multiple ways with only one long division, because of objections that the submission contains PHY dependancies that should not be in the MAC, and because of objections hat the submission is too FH specific.

Meeting minutes respectfully submitted by

George R Fishel  
and extensively edited by Vic hayes, Chair

After the adjournment, Michael Fischer provided a tutorial on the tools he has for SDL
18. New business

18.1 Tutorial on SDL

19. Closure

5:00 pm

Tentative Meeting Schedule

A special Sponsor Ballot Comment Resolution meeting have been scheduled for January 13-15, 1997, close to Melbourne, FL.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Month</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Place</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Host</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11-14</td>
<td>March</td>
<td>1997</td>
<td>Irvine, CA</td>
<td>Plenary</td>
<td>Irvine Marriott</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-11</td>
<td>July</td>
<td>1997</td>
<td>Lahaina, HI</td>
<td>Plenary</td>
<td>Hyatt Regency Maui</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10-14</td>
<td>Nov</td>
<td>1997</td>
<td>Montreal, PQ</td>
<td>Plenary</td>
<td>Queen Elizabeth</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9-13</td>
<td>Mar</td>
<td>1998</td>
<td>Irvine, CA</td>
<td>Plenary</td>
<td>Hyatt Regency</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-10</td>
<td>Jul</td>
<td>1998</td>
<td>La Jolla, CA</td>
<td>Plenary</td>
<td>Hyatt Regency</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9-13</td>
<td>Nov</td>
<td>1998</td>
<td>Albuquerque, NM</td>
<td>Plenary</td>
<td>Hyatt Regency</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Appendix 1

### Attendance list (part 1)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Company/Address</th>
<th>Phone</th>
<th>Email Address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Keith B. Amundsen</td>
<td>Raytheon Company</td>
<td>+1 508 470 9483</td>
<td><a href="mailto:keith_b_amundsen@raytheon.com">keith_b_amundsen@raytheon.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Carl F. Andren</td>
<td>HARRIS Corporation</td>
<td>+1 407 724 7535</td>
<td><a href="mailto:candren@harris.com">candren@harris.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Ludger Arnoldi</td>
<td>Philips GmbH</td>
<td>+49 911 526 6843</td>
<td><a href="mailto:arnoldi.philips@t-online.de">arnoldi.philips@t-online.de</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. David Bagby</td>
<td>Advanced Micro Devices</td>
<td>+1 408 749 5425</td>
<td><a href="mailto:david.bagby@amd.com">david.bagby@amd.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Simon Black</td>
<td>Intalk +44 1223 421250</td>
<td>+31 30 609 7483</td>
<td><a href="mailto:simon@motix.demon.co.uk">simon@motix.demon.co.uk</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Jan Boer</td>
<td>Lucent Technologies WCND</td>
<td>+31 20 6222138</td>
<td><a href="mailto:janboer@lucent.com">janboer@lucent.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Ronald Brockmann</td>
<td>No Wires Needed B.V.</td>
<td>+31 30 609 7482</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ronald.brockmann@nwn.nl">ronald.brockmann@nwn.nl</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Naftali Chayat</td>
<td>BreezeCom</td>
<td>+972 3 645 8423</td>
<td><a href="mailto:naftalic@mail.breezecom.co.il">naftalic@mail.breezecom.co.il</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Wim Diepstraten</td>
<td>Lucent Technologies WCND</td>
<td>+31 30 609 7482</td>
<td><a href="mailto:wdiepstraten@lucent.com">wdiepstraten@lucent.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Waychi Doo</td>
<td>3Com Corporation</td>
<td>+1 408 764 6112</td>
<td><a href="mailto:waychi_doo@3mail.3com.com">waychi_doo@3mail.3com.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Peter Ecclesine</td>
<td>Cisco Systems Inc.</td>
<td>+1 408 527 0815</td>
<td><a href="mailto:petere@cisco.com">petere@cisco.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Darwin Engwer</td>
<td>Netwave Technologies Inc.</td>
<td>+1 415 691 2500</td>
<td><a href="mailto:dengwer@netwave-wireless.com">dengwer@netwave-wireless.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. John Fakatselis</td>
<td>HARRIS Corporation</td>
<td>+1 407 729 4733</td>
<td><a href="mailto:jfakat01@ccmail.mis.semi.harris.com">jfakat01@ccmail.mis.semi.harris.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Matthew Fischer</td>
<td>Advanced Micro Devices</td>
<td>+1 408 749 5403</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ablmatt@brahms.amd.com">ablmatt@brahms.amd.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Michael Fischer</td>
<td>Digital Ocean Inc.</td>
<td>+1 210 614 4096</td>
<td><a href="mailto:mfisher@child.com">mfisher@child.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. George Fishel</td>
<td>AMP Inc.</td>
<td>+1 717 592 6161</td>
<td><a href="mailto:grfishel@amp.com">grfishel@amp.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Raj Gawera</td>
<td>Symbionics</td>
<td>+44 1223 421025</td>
<td><a href="mailto:rsg@symbionics.co.uk">rsg@symbionics.co.uk</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Victor Hayes</td>
<td>Lucent Technologies WCND</td>
<td>+31 30 609 7528</td>
<td><a href="mailto:vichayes@lucent.com">vichayes@lucent.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Maarten Hoeben</td>
<td>No Wires Needed B.V.</td>
<td>+31 20 6222138</td>
<td><a href="mailto:maarten.hoeben@nwn.nl">maarten.hoeben@nwn.nl</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Dean M. Kawaguchi</td>
<td>Symbol Technologies Inc.</td>
<td>+1 408 369 2629</td>
<td><a href="mailto:deank@psd.symbol.com">deank@psd.symbol.com</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Appendix 1

#### Attendance list (part 2)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Role</th>
<th>Company/Details</th>
<th>Contact Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Joseph J. Kubler</td>
<td>voter</td>
<td>Norand Corporation</td>
<td>+1 303 442 1850 <a href="mailto:kubler@norand.com">kubler@norand.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Francisco J. Lopez-Hernandez</td>
<td>voter</td>
<td>E.T.S.I. Telecommunicacion <a href="mailto:dxtn@tfo.upm.es">dxtn@tfo.upm.es</a></td>
<td>+34 1 336 73 41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Ronald Mahany</td>
<td>voter</td>
<td>Norand Corporation</td>
<td>+1 319 369 3552 <a href="mailto:mahanyrl@norand.com">mahanyrl@norand.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Akira Miura</td>
<td>voter</td>
<td>Panasonic Technologies Inc. <a href="mailto:miura@tadw.research.panasonic.com">miura@tadw.research.panasonic.com</a></td>
<td>+1 415 858 1000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Ravi P. Nalamati</td>
<td>voter</td>
<td>Digital Equipment Corp. <a href="mailto:nalamati@irocz.enet.dec.com">nalamati@irocz.enet.dec.com</a></td>
<td>+1 508 486 5189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Bob O'Hara</td>
<td>voter</td>
<td>Advanced Micro Devices <a href="mailto:bob.ohara@amd.com">bob.ohara@amd.com</a></td>
<td>+1 408 749 4952</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Richard H. Paine</td>
<td>voter</td>
<td>The Boeing Company <a href="mailto:richard.paine@iss-rt.boeing.com">richard.paine@iss-rt.boeing.com</a></td>
<td>+1 206 865 4921</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Miri Ratner</td>
<td>voter</td>
<td>BreezeCom</td>
<td>+972 3 6459134 <a href="mailto:mirir@breezecom.co.il">mirir@breezecom.co.il</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. William Roberts</td>
<td>voter</td>
<td>American Microsystems Inc. <a href="mailto:wroberson@poci.amis.com">wroberson@poci.amis.com</a></td>
<td>+1 208 233 4690 x6514</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Anil K. Sanwalka</td>
<td>voter</td>
<td>Neesus Datacom Consultants <a href="mailto:anil@interlog.com">anil@interlog.com</a></td>
<td>+1 416 754 8007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Roy Sebring</td>
<td>voter</td>
<td>Intermec Corporation</td>
<td>+1 206 356 1740 <a href="mailto:rsebring@intermec.com">rsebring@intermec.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Toshio Shimizu</td>
<td></td>
<td>Japan Radio Co Ltd</td>
<td>+81 422 45 9231 <a href="mailto:shimizu@lab.nihonmusen.co.jp">shimizu@lab.nihonmusen.co.jp</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Thomas Slep</td>
<td></td>
<td>Texas Instruments <a href="mailto:slep@ti.com">slep@ti.com</a></td>
<td>+1 214 997 6479</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Mike Trompower</td>
<td>voter</td>
<td>Aironet Wireless Communications Inc. <a href="mailto:mtrom@aironet.com">mtrom@aironet.com</a></td>
<td>+1 330 664 7920</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Tom Tsouliogannis</td>
<td>voter</td>
<td>+1 416 299 1954 <a href="mailto:tomt@interlog.com">tomt@interlog.com</a></td>
<td>+1 408 369 2657</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Sarosh Vesuna</td>
<td>voter</td>
<td>Symbol Technologies Inc. <a href="mailto:saroshv@psd.symbol.com">saroshv@psd.symbol.com</a></td>
<td>+1 408 369 2657</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Nien C. Wei</td>
<td>voter</td>
<td>AT&amp;T Laboratories <a href="mailto:ncw@ustad.att.com">ncw@ustad.att.com</a></td>
<td>+1 201 386 2053</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Timothy M. Zimmerman</td>
<td>voter</td>
<td>Norand Corporation <a href="mailto:zimmermt@norand.com">zimmermt@norand.com</a></td>
<td>+1 319 369 3471</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Johnny Zweig</td>
<td>voter</td>
<td>Netwave Technologies Inc. <a href="mailto:zweig@netwave-wireless.com">zweig@netwave-wireless.com</a></td>
<td>+1 415 691 2500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Donna A. Woznicki</td>
<td>voter</td>
<td>Digital Equipment Corp. <a href="mailto:woznicki@kg.mts.dec.com">woznicki@kg.mts.dec.com</a></td>
<td>+1 508 486 5085</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Appendix 1
#### Attendance list (part 3)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Company/Contact Details</th>
<th>Phone/Email</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Greg Smith</td>
<td>voter</td>
<td>GEC Plessey Semiconductors Inc.</td>
<td>+44 1522 502476 <a href="mailto:greg.smith@gpsemi.com">greg.smith@gpsemi.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Dave Strohschein</td>
<td>voter</td>
<td>University of New Hampshire</td>
<td>+1 603 862 0203 <a href="mailto:das@ioi.unh.edu">das@ioi.unh.edu</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Stuart J. Kerry</td>
<td>voter</td>
<td>Symbol Technologies Inc.</td>
<td>+1 408 369 2634 <a href="mailto:stuart@psd.symbol.com">stuart@psd.symbol.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Ken Clements</td>
<td>voter</td>
<td>Innovation on Demand</td>
<td>+1 408 353 5027 <a href="mailto:Ken@InnovationOnDmnd.com">Ken@InnovationOnDmnd.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Masanori Shibayama</td>
<td>voter</td>
<td>NTT Corporation</td>
<td>+81 43 211 3352 <a href="mailto:shibayama.masanori@nsc-host.nsc.cae.ntt.jp">shibayama.masanori@nsc-host.nsc.cae.ntt.jp</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Steven Washakowski</td>
<td></td>
<td>Raytheon Company</td>
<td>+1 508 490 1915 <a href="mailto:steven_washakowski@ccmail.ed.ray.com">steven_washakowski@ccmail.ed.ray.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Nathan Silberman</td>
<td>voter</td>
<td>Philips Semiconductors</td>
<td>+1 408 991 4076 <a href="mailto:snathan@ix.netcom.com">snathan@ix.netcom.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. John Biddick</td>
<td>voter</td>
<td>Intermec Corporation</td>
<td>+1 206 348 2600 X6647 <a href="mailto:jbiddick@intermec.com">jbiddick@intermec.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. David Fischer</td>
<td></td>
<td>3Com Corp.</td>
<td>+1 408 764 7200 <a href="mailto:david-fischer@3mail.3com.com">david-fischer@3mail.3com.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Al Petrick</td>
<td>voter</td>
<td>HARRIS Semiconductor</td>
<td>+1 407 729 4944 <a href="mailto:apetrick@ccmail.mis.semi.harris.com">apetrick@ccmail.mis.semi.harris.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Hideyuki Arimoto</td>
<td></td>
<td>NTT Corporation</td>
<td>+81 43 211 3352 <a href="mailto:arimoto.hideyuki@nsc-host.nsc.ntt.jp">arimoto.hideyuki@nsc-host.nsc.ntt.jp</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Robert Rothenberg</td>
<td></td>
<td>C3 Wireless Corp.</td>
<td>+1 206 337 4604 <a href="mailto:c3wireless@aol.com">c3wireless@aol.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Rich Seifert</td>
<td></td>
<td>Networks and Communications Consulting</td>
<td>+1 408 395 5700 <a href="mailto:seifert@netcom.com">seifert@netcom.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Mack Sullivan</td>
<td>voter</td>
<td>Proxim Inc.</td>
<td>+1 415 526 3694 <a href="mailto:mack@proxim.com">mack@proxim.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. William E. Rodgers</td>
<td></td>
<td>ITT</td>
<td>+1 219 487 6252 <a href="mailto:werodger@itt.com">werodger@itt.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Paul Eastman</td>
<td></td>
<td>RF Networks</td>
<td>+1 602 861 3652 <a href="mailto:p.eastman@computer.org">p.eastman@computer.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Bong Hwan Lee</td>
<td></td>
<td>Taejon University</td>
<td>+82 42 280 2553 <a href="mailto:blee@ice.taejon.ac.kr">blee@ice.taejon.ac.kr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Robert L. Radkey</td>
<td></td>
<td>Image Systems Inc.</td>
<td>+1 415 368 7436 <a href="mailto:rradkey@ix.netcom.com">rradkey@ix.netcom.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Greg Wang</td>
<td></td>
<td>Delta Products Corporation</td>
<td>+1 510 770 0660 X108 <a href="mailto:dpc-greg@deltaca.com">dpc-greg@deltaca.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Ran-Fun Chiu</td>
<td></td>
<td>Hewlett Packard</td>
<td>+1 415 857 7406</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Daniel Sze</td>
<td></td>
<td>California Solution Networks Corporation</td>
<td>+1 619 646 6800 dsze@csnetworks Corporation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>