IEEE P802.11 – P802.15
Wireless LANs – Wireless PANs

Tentative Minutes of IEEE P802.11/P802.15 Joint Session

Hyatt Regency Hotel, Koloa, Kauai, HI

Wednesday, 10 November 1999 Joint Meeting of IEEE P802.11 and P802.15

Scheduled: 1:00pm – 3:00pm

1.   Opening
Meeting called to order by Vic Hayes at 1:05 PM and David Skellern, Secretary 802.11 was ready to take the meeting notes.

1.1   Roll call
All 54 people present at the start of the meeting introduced themselves.

1.2   Document list update
Vic Hayes and Bob Heile noted the following new documents were available to the WGs:
- doc.:802.11-99/261 is the latest one in dot11.
- doc.:802.15-99/128-142 added this meeting

1.3   Announcements

1.3.1   802.11b Issue

Vic Hayes reported on a solution to the MIB error problem reported at the opening 802 plenary.

1.3.2   Standards CD-ROM available

2   Approval of Minutes

Motion 99/59 P13 (125)	To approve the minutes of the previous joint meeting at Santa Rosa (802.11).
Moved Stuart Kerry	
Second Al Petrick	

Discussion: none
Motion Passes: 802.11 24-0-1

Motion 99/59P01 (126)	To approve the minutes of the previous joint meeting at Santa Rosa (802.15).
Moved Bruce Kraemer	
Second Ian Gifford	

Discussion: none
Motion Passes: 802.15 18-0-0.

There are no matters arising from the minutes

3   Approval of the Agenda

3.1   Agenda update
New items added were:
- 5   New Business
- ❑   Approval of Santa Rosa finances and disposition of the funds
- ❑   Voting Rule
- 4.5 SG Coexistence

Motion 99/59P14 (127)	To approve the agenda as proposed (802.11)
Moved Al Petrick	
Second Harry Worstel	

Discussion: none
Motion Passes: 802.11 30-0-0

Motion 99/59P02 (128)	To approve the agenda as proposed (802.15)
Moved Bruce Kraemer	
Second Mike McInnis	

Discussion: none
Motion Passes: 802.15 19-0-0.

4.   Old business

4.1   Liaison officers
Vic Hayes reported that Bruce Kraemer, Stuart Kerry and Peter Murray were appointed as 802.11 liaisons to 802.15 (motion 99/57P24 at the Montreal meeting).   Alan Heberling and Mike McInnis are the reverse liaisons.

4.2   Review 802.15 Call for Proposals/Participation submissions
Ian Gifford summarised doc.:802.15-99/124r0 WG Liaison Report. There is a new high-rate (up to 20 Mbit/s) submission from Kodak and three other companies. See convergence diagram in document. The 802.15 WG is moving ahead on schedule. A 30-day letter ballot is to be issued tomorrow on the Bluetooth-based (<1 Mbit/s) proposal. It was observed that there would be a single MAC running over the different PHY layers. There may be a low rate submission also. There is no update information on the ETSI-Bluetooth liaison.

Ian Gifford summarised doc.:802.15-99/123r0 TG1 Report. Draft released last week. The Santa Rosa mapping from Bluetooth to 802 was scrapped principally because of the delay it would cause in getting the draft out. The current draft reflects the input of about 300 comments.

Ian Gifford summarised doc.:802.15-99/122r0 Marketing Report. Working with IEEE-SA and IEEE Press to deliver Primer, Handbook, Companion and Pocket Guide.

4.3   Review Joint Regulatory activities
Dennis Kuwahara
- RF Lighting
  No new information.
  Question if this is ISM.
  No action at this time.
- Review of 2.4GHz NPRM Comments
  114 replies with 14 providing supporting information.
  No refuting data found.
  Prepared draft reply – in case.
  Dennis reviewed the proposed draft letter and received several inputs from the group.

  The closing date for reply comments is now 19 November. There is no decision date scheduled yet.
- UK-RA consult document on 5.1 and 5.4 GHz bands
  SG feels need for coexistence
  Recommended ETSI/IEEE coexistence meeting (IEEE 802.11a with HIPERLAN/1 and HIPERLAN/2)
  Reply to UK RA RFC series of five questions.
  Jim Carlo, Fred Lucas, Vic Hayes to discuss.
  Dennis reviewed the draft letter with the reply to the UK-RA.
- 5 GHz World Wide band allocation request
  SG is still in working
  US position to US SG8a/9b
  For submission to 2002

4.4   P802.15 Hosted Venue choices
- Mike McInnis spoke to doc.:802.15-99/097. May 8-12 Renaissance Madison Hotel; lunch provided. Planning for 70-75 people.   46 people in the room said they would attend.
- Moving forward with 18-22 September 2000 is FedEx in Memphis, Tennessee. The tentative venue is a hotel with a Conference Centre in walking distance. Straw poll showed 38 for Memphis and 6 ambivalent.
- 10-14 January Tel Aviv – 34 will go; 24 will not go; 6 ambivalent. 25 November is deadline for reservations.

4.5   802.15 Study Group Coexistence
Steve Shellhammer summarised the SG Report 802.15-99/121r1. There is a new Coexistence web site http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/15/SG. Aim is to develop a Coexistence Model for the 2.4 GHz ISM band.

Jim Carlo has asked how 802.11 and 802.15 can collaborate on the coexistence work. The proposal to achieve this is as follows:
– SG becomes TG in 802.15
– Liaisons from .11 would vote in TG
– Progress of TG would be given at Joint meetings.
– Draft Recommended Practice would be submitted to both 802.15 and 802.11 for separate letter ballot. To get to ExCom the letter ballots must pass in both groups
– The proposal is that attendance at the SG/TG will count for credit for 802.11 members.

802.15 SG had taken straw polls on the following questions, and 802.11 members were similarly polled, with the results shown:
– that SG becomes a TG in 802.15: 21-4-9 (802.15); 19-0-9 (802.11)
– that SG becomes a TAG – 3-21-11 (802.15); 0-16-7 (802.11)
– that attendance at TG count for 802.15 attendance - 31-0-7 (802.15); 25-0-6 (802.11)

Motion 99/59P15 (129)   to approve the separation of the subsequent letter ballot output from the 802.15 coexistence task group to both 802.11 and 802.15 voting members, and for both groups to agree before sending to ExCom (802.11).
Moved   Stuart Kerry
Second   Peter Murray

Discussion: none
Motion Passes: 802.11 21-0-6

Motion 99/59P03 (130)   to approve the separation of the subsequent letter ballot output from the 802.15 coexistence task group to both 802.11 and 802.15 voting members, and for both groups to agree before sending to ExCom (802.15).
Moved   Pat Kinney
Second   Peter Murray

Discussion: none
Motion passes: 802.15 14-0-1.

4.6   802.11 Study Group MAC Enhancements
John Fakatselis reported on SG deliberations. Eight papers were presented this week. Areas include:
– QoS – multimedia and VOIP
– Enhanced Security
– Inter Access Point Protocol
– Authentication
– Load balancing
– Add proprietary information without violating interoperability.

Looking for approval of TG status no later than March.

5.   New Business

5.1   Approval of Santa Rosa finance
Expenses $18936.70. 78 attendees at $265 yielded $20,670 income leaving a surplus of $1733.30

Motion 99/59P16 (131)   To approve the Santa Rosa finances (802.11)
Moved   Harry Worstel
Second   Stuart Kerry

Discussion: none
Motion passes: 802.11 23-0-2.

Motion 99/59P04 (132)   To approve the Santa Rosa finances (802.15)
Moved   Harry Worstel
Second   Mike McInnis

Discussion: none
Motion passes: 802.15 12-0-1.

Two flash cards were lost at that meeting. The cost of these was $986. This leaves a new balance of $747.30.   It is proposed to purchase 6 walkie-talkies for use by 802.11 and 802.15 officers to a maximum of $600. Al Petrick will purchase these.

Motion 99/59P17 (133)   To purchase from the interim Santa Rosa meeting surplus funds, 6 (total) walkie talkies for 802.11 and 802.15 use (802.11) Moved   Stuart Kerry Second   Harry Worstel

Discussion: none
Motion passes: 802.11 24-0-2.

Motion 99/59P05 (134)   To purchase from the interim Santa Rosa meeting surplus funds, 6 (total) walkie talkies for 802.11 and 802.15 use (802.11) Moved   Bruce Kraemer Second   Ian Gifford

Discussion: none
Motion passes: 802.15 9-0-2.

Motion 99/59P18 (135)   To combine the voting procedure for the joint 802.11 and 802.15 into one combined vote, providing a quorum is present for both groups, otherwise it is a recommendation back to each group. Those that are voting members of both groups may have only one vote once per motion (802.11) Moved   Stuart Kerry Second   Al Petrick

Discussion: Liaisons get a single vote – the motion was amended to include this. The quorum issue was also discussed and the motion was further amended. Several members spoke against the motion on the basis that it would not fairly represent one of other of the groups.
Motion fails: 802.11 6-12-13.

No motion was put from 802.15.

6.   Closure
The meeting closed at 1525.