Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # 001   **Comment submitted by:** Michelle   Turner   Member   2003/08/14

Comment	**Type** Coordination	**Starting Page #**	**Starting Line #**	**Fig/Table#**	**Section**

MEMO:
FROM: Michelle Turner
Date: 14 August 2003
Re: Editorial Review of P802.16/Conformance02-D3

Upon editorial review of IEEE P802.16/Conformance02.

For further guidance in preparing an IEEE Standard, here's the URL for access to the on-line version of the IEEE

1) In some of the tables 1802.16.1 is used. Please change to the correct designation. IEEE Std 802.16/Conformance01-2003.

Note also this followup:

Michelle,

We'll address Point (1). Did you mean to include a Point (2)?

Roger

No, sorry about that. I should have just left the one comment unnumbered.
Thanks.

Michelle Turner

Suggested Remedy

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

   Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:**   **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **002**   **Comment submitted by:**   Roger   Marks   Member   2003/09/02

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** i   **Starting Line #** 5   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** Title

Title should be modified to parallel that of IEEE Std 802.16/Conformance01, which was modified by editorially staff.

Suggested Remedy

Change title to: "IEEE Standard for Conformance to IEEE 802.16[TM]

Part 2: Test Suite Structure and Test Purposes for 10-66 GHz WirelessMAN–SC^{TM} Air Interface"

Make change on Pages i and 1.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **003**   **Comment submitted by:**   Roger   Marks   Member   2003/09/02

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** vii   **Starting Line #** 10   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** Participants

Ken Stanwood is now the WG Vice Chair.

Suggested Remedy

On line 10, change WG Vice Chair to Kenneth Stanwood.

At line 13, add:

Carl Eklund served as Working Group Vice Chair during Working Group Letter Ballot.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **004**   **Comment submitted by:** Roger   Marks   Member   2003/09/02

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** i   **Starting Line #** 13   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** Title

In the title, "10-66" should use an n-dash and "WirelessMAN–SC" a hyphen, as in IEEE Std 802.16/Conformance01.

Suggested Remedy

In the title, make sure that "10-66" uses an n-dash and "WirelessMAN–SC" a hyphen.

Make change on Pages i and 1.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: P802.16/Conf02/D3   **Ballot Number:** 0000505   Comment Date

Comment # 005   **Comment submitted by:** Roger   Marks   Member   2003/09/02

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** i   **Starting Line #** 65   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** Title

Copyright notice should be moved into source files, not just be pasted in as a comment.

Suggested Remedy

Move Copyright notice into source file, and modify to:
"IEEE and 802 are registered trademarks in the U.S. Patent & Trademark Office, owned by the Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Incorporated.

WirelessMAN and WirelessMAN-SC are trademarks owned by the Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Incorporated."

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   Editor's Actions f) pass off to other editor

IEEE Staff editor

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **006**   **Comment submitted by:**   Roger   Marks   Member   2003/09/02

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 2   **Starting Line #** 9   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 2

Titles of some references are incorrect.

Suggested Remedy

Change Ref. 1 to: IEEE Std 802.16-2001, IEEE Standard for Local and metropolitan area networks—Part 16: Air Interface for Fixed Broadband Wireless Access Systems.

Change Ref. 6 to: IEEE Std 802.16c-2002, IEEE Standard for Local and metropolitan area networks—Part 16: Air Interface for Fixed Broadband Wireless Access Systems—Amendment 1: Detailed System Profiles for 10–66 GHz.

Change Ref. 7 to: IEEE Std 802.16a-2003, IEEE Standard for Local and metropolitan area networks—Part 16: Air Interface for Fixed Broadband Wireless Access Systems—Amendment 2: Medium Access Control Modifications and Additional Physical Layer Specifications for 2–11 GHz.

Change Ref. 8 to: IEEE Draft P802.16d/D3-2003: "Draft Amendment to IEEE Standard for Local and Metropolitan Area Networks – Part 16: Air Interface for Broadband Fixed Wireless Access Systems – Detailed System profiles for 2-11 GHz"

Change Ref. 9 to: "IEEE Standard for Conformance to IEEE 802.16 — Part 1: Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement (PICS) Proforma for 10–66 GHz WirelessMAN-SCTM Air Interface"

Reorder the references so that IEEE standards and drafts are together, followed by ISO/IEC standards.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: P802.16/Conf02/D3   **Ballot Number: 0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # 007   **Comment submitted by:** Roger   Marks   Member   2003/09/02

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 2   **Starting Line #** 9   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 2

In IEEE editorial style, references are not numbered.

Suggested Remedy

Delete reference numbers.

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified**

Need to also delete section 6.1.3 on page 13.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   f) pass off to other editor

Section 6.1.3 deleted. IEEE staff editor will deal with rest.

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **008**   **Comment submitted by:** Roger   Marks   Member   2003/09/02

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 2   **Starting Line #** 9   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 2

Opening of References should be parallel to that of IEEE Std 802.16/Conformance01.

Suggested Remedy

Replace entire opening of Clause 2 (everything before the references themselves) with:

"The following documents contain provisions which, through reference in this text, constitute provisions of the present document. References are either specific (identified by date of publication, edition number, version number, etc.) or non-specific. For a specific reference, subsequent revisions do not apply. For a nonspecific reference, the latest version applies."

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   Decision of Group: **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**　　　**Ballot Number:** **0000505**　　　　　　　　　**Comment Date**

Comment # **009**　　　　**Comment submitted by:**　Kenneth　　　Stanwood　　　　　　　　Member　　　　2003/08/19

Comment　　**Type** Editorial　　　　**Starting Page #** 2　　**Starting Line #** 36　　**Fig/Table#**　　**Section** 3

The reference to the TGd document assumed an accepted amendment. Currently, it's not accepted, and it may become a revision instead.

Suggested Remedy

We need to figure out what this reference should be.

Proposed Resolution　　**Recommendation:**　　　　　　　**Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group　　　　　**Decision of Group:** **Accepted-Modified**

Refer to "IEEE P802.16d/D3-2003" Put "Draft" as first word in title. Capitalize "Profiles"

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes　　　　　**Editor's Actions**　　k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: P802.16/Conf02/D3   **Ballot Number: 0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # 010   **Comment submitted by:**   Roger   Marks   Member   2003/09/02

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 2   **Starting Line #** 47   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 3.1

Definitions statement should be parallel to that of IEEE Std 802.16/Conformance01

Suggested Remedy

Change the contents of 3.1 to: "For the purposes of the present document, the following terms and definitions apply in conjunction with the terms defined in IEEE 802.16."

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified**

Refers to Section 4.1. Change the contents of 4.1 to: "For the purposes of the present document, the definitions in IEEE 802.16, as well as those in ISO/IEC 9646-1, ISO/IEC 9646-2, ISO/IEC 9646-6, and ISO/IEC 9646-7, apply."

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **011**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 2   **Starting Line #** 50   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 4.1

missing spaces

Suggested Remedy

Change "[6],[7],and [8]apply" to "[6], [7], and [8] apply"
On line 51 change "[2],[3], [4],and" to "[2], [3], [4], and"
On line 57 change "[6],[7],and [8]apply" to "[6], [7], and [8] apply"
On line 58 change "[2],[3], [4],and" to "[2], [3], [4], and"

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Superceded**

See comment 010

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **012**   **Comment submitted by:** Roger   Marks   Member   2003/09/02

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 2   **Starting Line #** 54   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 3.2

Abbreviations statement should be parallel to that of IEEE Std 802.16/Conformance01

Suggested Remedy

Change the title of 3.2 to: "Abbreviations".

Change lines 56-61 of 3.2 to: "For the purposes of the present document, the following abbreviations apply in conjunction with the abbreviations defined in IEEE 802.16."

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted-Modified**

Change the title of 4.2 to: "Abbreviations".

Change lines 56-61 of 4.2 to: "For the purposes of the present document, the following abbreviations apply in conjunction with tthose defined in IEEE 802.16 as well as those in ISO/IEC 9646-1, ISO/IEC 9646-2, ISO/IEC 9646-6, and ISO/IEC 9646-7.""

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **013**   **Comment submitted by:**   Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 3   **Starting Line #** 24   **Fig/Table#** 1   **Section** 5.1

The "X"'s in table 1 aren't filled in.

Suggested Remedy

I can fill them in if I have a FrameMaker 6 version, but I don't want to recreate the entire table in Word just to provide the input.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

.

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **014**   **Comment submitted by:**   Mark   Tillinghast   Member   2003/09/03

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 3   **Starting Line #** 53   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 3.1.18

Is InterCell Link the same as repeater station?

Suggested Remedy

If so get rid of one in favor of the other. It is not clear from Figure 1 that the definition of intercell link applies to BS.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Rejected**

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # **015**   **Comment submitted by:** Roger   Marks   Member   2003/09/02

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 4   **Starting Line #** 1   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** Patents

Patent section is inappropriate since no claims have been made. Should instead use the Patent clause from IEEE Std 802.16/Conformance01.

Suggested Remedy

Replace Patent clause with:
"Attention is called to the possibility that implementation of this standard may require use of subject matter covered by patent rights. By publication of this standard, no position is taken with respect to the existence or validity of any patent rights in connection therewith. The IEEE shall not be responsible for identifying patents for which a license may be required by an IEEE standard or for conducting inquiries into the legal validity or scope of those patents that are brought to its attention."

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # **016**   **Comment submitted by:**   Roger   Marks   Member   2003/09/02

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** vi   **Starting Line #** 20   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** Conformance test

Conformance test methodology should match that of IEEE Std 802.16/Conformance01.

Suggested Remedy

Replace Conformance test methodology clause with:
The multipart conformance test documents for IEEE Standard 802.16 are identified by "IEEE Standard 802.16/ConformanceXX". For example, the first part of the conformance specification for IEEE 802.16 is designated "IEEE Standard 802.16/Conformance01.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Changed the page number from 4 to vi to reference the ecorrect section.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # 017   **Comment submitted by:** Tillinghast   Member   2003/09/03

Comment   Type Technical   **Starting Page #** 5   **Starting Line #** 10   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 3.1.36

Missing Characterization

Suggested Remedy

add the following text:"The two most important characteristics of which are level crossing rate and average fade duration."

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** Rejected

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: P802.16/Conf02/D3   **Ballot Number:** 0000505   Comment Date

Comment # 018   **Comment submitted by:** Mark   Tillinghast   Member   2003/09/03

Comment   **Type** Technical   **Starting Page #** 5   **Starting Line #** 10   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 3.1.36

replace "A propagation phenomenon caused by the reception of a large number of reflected"

Suggested Remedy

replace with "A channel characterization where the received signal is composed of waves with random amplitudes, angles of arrival and phases and the absence of a non fading signal."

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** Rejected

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: P802.16/Conf02/D3		**Ballot Number:** 0000505	**Comment Date**
Comment # 019	**Comment submitted by:** Mark Tillinghast	Member	2003/09/03

Comment   Type Technical   **Starting Page #** 5   **Starting Line #** 10   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 3.1.36

propagation phenomenon similar to that for Rayleigh fading, except that a strong

Suggested Remedy

replace with "A channel characterization where the received signal is composed of waves with random amplitudes, angles of arrival and phases and the presence of a non fading signal. As the presence of the non fading component goes to zero, the Ricean Distribution approaches the Rayleigh distribution."

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   Decision of Group: **Rejected**

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   Editor's Actions   l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **020**   **Comment submitted by:**   Mark   Tillinghast   Member   2003/09/03

Comment   **Type** Technical   **Starting Page #** 6   **Starting Line #** 10   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 3.2

Add AGL

Suggested Remedy

It appears in Table 9—Horizon range for different radio heights AGL (in km)

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Rejected**

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # 021   **Comment submitted by:** Mark   Tillinghast   Member   2003/09/03

Comment   Type Technical   **Starting Page #** 6   **Starting Line #** 10   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 3.2

Add X-Pol and C-Pol and H-POL

Suggested Remedy

It appears in Table 14,15

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Rejected**

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **022**   **Comment submitted by:** Mark   Tillinghast   Member   2003/09/03

Comment   **Type** Technical   **Starting Page #** 6   **Starting Line #** 10   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 3.1

Add definition for dynamic range

Suggested Remedy

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Rejected**

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **023**   **Comment submitted by:** Mark   Tillinghast   Member   2003/09/03

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 6   **Starting Line #** 53   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 3.1

define in 3.1 dBi and dBd

Suggested Remedy

dBi for isotropic dBd for dipole

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Rejected**

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **024**   **Comment submitted by:** Nikolai   Malykh   Member   2003/08/07

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 8   **Starting Line #** 42   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 5.3.3.1

Incorrect protocol name - Internet Time. Accordind RFC 1305 time synchoronization protocol name is Network Time Protocol (NTP)

Suggested Remedy

Tests for verifying DHCP, Network Time Protocol (NTP) and TFTP related functions.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **025**   **Comment submitted by:** Christina   Lim   Member   2003/09/02

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 9   **Starting Line #** 44   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 5.3.6.1

There is an additional "to verify" phrase in the sentence "Tests to verify to verify the request/grant protocol".

Suggested Remedy

Remove the additional "to verify" in that sentence

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**　　　**Ballot Number:** **0000505**　　　　　　　　　　**Comment Date**

Comment # **026**　　　　**Comment submitted by:** Nikolai　　　　Malykh　　　　　　　　　Member　　　　2003/08/07

Comment　　**Type** Editorial　　　　　　**Starting Page #** 9　　**Starting Line #** 44　　**Fig/Table#**　　**Section** 5.3.6.1

Tests to verify to verify the request/grant protocol.

Suggested Remedy

Tests to verify the request/grant protocol.

Proposed Resolution　　**Recommendation:**　　　　　　**Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group　　　　**Decision of Group:** **Accepted-Duplicate**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes　　　　　**Editor's Actions**　　k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # **027**   **Comment submitted by:** Nikolai   Malykh   Member   2003/08/07

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 9   **Starting Line #** 49   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 5.3.6.2

Mistyped 'procedured' instead 'procedures'.

Suggested Remedy

Tests of the procedures for adding and removing an SS to/from a multicast polling group.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **028**   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 11   **Starting Line #** 59   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.1.1

Reference:' not 'Reference.' '.' instead of ':' appears throughout the document.

Suggested Remedy

Change 'Reference.' to 'Reference:' where appropriate.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **029**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 11   **Starting Line #** 59   **Fig/Table#** 2   **Section** 6.1.1

Throughout the document, sometimes a period, ".", is used after Reference, Initial Condition, Stimulus, or Expected Behavior. We should do a global change to a colon, ":", instead.

Suggested Remedy

Replace the periods with colons in the test purpose descriptions.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **030**   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   Type Technical   **Starting Page #** 12   **Starting Line #** 9   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.1.1

The reference *must* contain ...

Suggested Remedy

Change 'should' to 'must'.

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted-Modified**

change "should contain" to "contains".

Additionally, split table 2 into two tables. The first row should be a standalone table titled "Test Purpose Description Structure". Remove the words "IEEE P802.16/Conformance01-2003, Table A3/3" from the first row since they are an example, not part of the structure.

Additionally, change the text in the TP Id row from "The TP Id is a unique identifier it shall be specified" to "The TP Id is a unique identifier specified".

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **031**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 12   **Starting Line #** 35   **Fig/Table#** 3   **Section** 6.1.2

We don't use "protocol group" followed by "protocol subgroup", but instead use "test suite group" followed by "protocol group".

Suggested Remedy

Change "TP/<st>/<pg>/<sg>/<x>-<nnn>" to "TP/<st>/<tg>/<pg>/<x>-<nnn>".
Insert a new row before line 45: "<tg> = test suite group | See Table 1"
Delete the row on lines 48-49.
On page 13, line 5 change "Addition protocol subgroup of the Dynamic Services protocol group" to "Addition protocol group of the Dynamic Services test suite group"

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   Editor's Actions   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: P802.16/Conf02/D3   **Ballot Number: 0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # 032   **Comment submitted by:** Nikolai   Malykh   Member   2003/08/07

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 12   **Starting Line #** 51   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.1.2

According acronim definitions (4.2) CA, BV etc. named 'test category'

Suggested Remedy

<x> = test category

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   Editor's Actions   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **033**   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 13   **Starting Line #** 46   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.1.1.2

"Small gap above section number, huge gap below section number."

Suggested Remedy

Adjust formatting. Check also elsewhere.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted-Clarified**

Need to verify if this is a heading style issue or whether there are extra blank lines after headers.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   f) pass off to other editor

IEEE staff editor will deal with style issues.

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **034**   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 13   **Starting Line #** 54   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.1.1.2

"Stimulus:' not 'Stimulus.' '.' instead of ':' appears throughout the document. The same applies to 'Expected behavior', etc."

Suggested Remedy
Change 'Stimulus.' to 'Stimulus:' where appropriate.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted-Duplicate**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done
Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **035**   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   **Type** Technical   **Starting Page #** 13   **Starting Line #** 58   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.1.1.2

"No reference given. Applies to entire Table 5. Each case requires a reference or a reason. Same for Table 6, 7, etc."

Suggested Remedy

Provide Reference or reason.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Provide references where there are none. Additionally, validate existing references.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # 036   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 15   **Starting Line #** 44   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.1.1.4

The wording is kind of bland and implies we may have just not gotten around to defining tests.

Suggested Remedy

Change the wording of section 6.2.1.1.4, 6.2.1.2.2, 6.2.1.2.3, and 6.2.1.2.4 to use wording like in section 6.2.7.2 on page 51.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **037**   **Comment submitted by:**   Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 17   **Starting Line #** 43   **Fig/Table#** 10   **Section** 6.2.1.3.1

The base station should never be provoked...

Suggested Remedy

Change "provoked" to "stimulated"
Same change on page 18, line 7.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **038**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 17   **Starting Line #** 60   **Fig/Table#** 10   **Section** 6.2.1.3.1

extra period after "Count"

Suggested Remedy

Change "UCD Count." to "UCD Count".
Make the same change on page 18, line 6.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **039**   **Comment submitted by:**   Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 18   **Starting Line #** 14   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.1.3.2

Insufficient wording

Suggested Remedy

Word sections 6.2.1.3.2, 6.2.1.3.3, 6.2.1.3.4, and 6.2.1.3.5 like section 6.2.7.2 on page 51.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   Ballot Number: **0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # **040**   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   **Type** Technical   **Starting Page #** 18   **Starting Line #** 34   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.1.3.6

"Very vague statement. Also, specify a test fixed and 'random' test message to ensure coverage."

Suggested Remedy

Provide reference to where such is specified.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted-Modified**

Per the suggested remedy, add to the end of the sentence "per Clause 12 of IEEE 802.16".

The tests referenced in this section should be changed to "TP/SS/CDM/CDC".   Also the references in the similar section 6.2.1.2.6 on page 17, line 27 needs fixed. All similar sections should be reviewed for correctness.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **041**   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   **Type** Technical   **Starting Page #** 20   **Starting Line #** 55   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.2.1.6

"Very vague statement. It makes little sense to state this, as otherwise an incorrect test method would result, invalidating the test. This statement has little to do with 'Message Formats'."

Suggested Remedy

"Remove comment, mark as comment, or include a subclause entitled 'Comments' (which may be a good idea)."

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted-Duplicate**

The resolution of this comment is described and covered by the resolution of comment 40.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   l) none needed
Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # **042**   **Comment submitted by:** Nikolai   Malykh   Member   2003/08/07

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 27   **Starting Line #** 45   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.3.1.2

Incorrect DHCP message naming. According RFC 1541 this message name is DHCPDISCOVER

Suggested Remedy

IUT send DHCPDISCOVER on said connection

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted-Clarified**

Actually on page 27, not page 21 - changed page number above to allow ordering comments by page number.

Appears on page 27, line 28 also.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **043**   **Comment submitted by:** Mark   Tillinghast   Member   2003/09/03

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 22   **Starting Line #** 15   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 5.5.1.1

Line 18 of clause 5.5.1.1 defines equivalent isotropically radiated power (EIRP). But Clause 3.2 defines it as EIRP effective isotropic radiated power

Suggested Remedy

I believe Clause 3.2 should replace what appears in 5.5.1.1

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Rejected**

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **044**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 22   **Starting Line #** 21   **Fig/Table#** 17   **Section** 6.2.2.2.2

extra period

Suggested Remedy
Change "limit.." to "limit."

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done
Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **045**   **Comment submitted by:** Mark   Tillinghast   Member   2003/09/03

Comment   **Type** Technical   **Starting Page #** 24   **Starting Line #** 56   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 5.5.1.3

ICL is it Interference coupling loss or interference coupling level

Suggested Remedy

3.2 Has it as interference coupling loss, but 5.5.1.3 has it as coupling level

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Rejected**

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **046**   **Comment submitted by:** Mark   Tillinghast   Member   2003/09/03

Comment   **Type** Technical   **Starting Page #** 24   **Starting Line #** 59   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 5.5.1.3

OOB is it out of band or out of block

Suggested Remedy

3.2 has it as out of block, but 5.5.1.3 has it as out of band.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Rejected**

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: P802.16/Conf02/D3   **Ballot Number:** 0000505   **Comment Date**

Comment # 047   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 28   **Starting Line #** 24   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.3.1.4

insufficient wording

Suggested Remedy

Change the contents of sections 6.2.3.1.4, 6.2.3.2.2, 6.2.3.2.3, and 6.2.3.2.4 to read like section 6.2.7.2 on page 51.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **048**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 29   **Starting Line #** 33   **Fig/Table#** 34   **Section** 6.2.3.2.1

spelling

Suggested Remedy

change "reveives" to "receives"

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **049**   **Comment submitted by:** Mark   Tillinghast   Member   2003/09/03

Comment   **Type** Technical   **Starting Page #** 29   **Starting Line #** 59   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 5.5.2.2.1.1

Figure 11 Add note

Suggested Remedy

Note: for values 0-90, class 1 and class 2 are colinear.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** Rejected

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # **050**   **Comment submitted by:**   Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 29   **Starting Line #** 63   **Fig/Table#** 35   **Section** 6.2.3.2.5

extra space

Suggested Remedy

change "TFTP-CPLT ." to "TFTP-CPLT."

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **051**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 30   **Starting Line #** 29   **Fig/Table#** 36   **Section** 6.2.4.1.1

missing space

Suggested Remedy

change "condition:Basic" to "condition: Basic"

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **052**   **Comment submitted by:** Mark   Tillinghast   Member   2003/09/03

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 31   **Starting Line #** 48   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 5.5.2.3

Change " of the SS antenna is a factor in determining intersystem"

Suggested Remedy

Change to " of the SS antenna is a palpable factor in determining intersystem"

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Rejected**

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: P802.16/Conf02/D3   **Ballot Number:** 0000505   Comment Date

Comment # 053   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 33   **Starting Line #** 46   **Fig/Table#** 41   **Section** 6.2.4.2.1

The references list is unnecessarily broken in the middle

Suggested Remedy

Remove the extra carriage return.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **054**   **Comment submitted by:**   Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 34   **Starting Line #** 3   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.4.2.2

iinsufficient wording

Suggested Remedy

Change sections 6.2.4.2.2, 6.2.4.3.2, 6.2.4.3.3, and 6.2.4.3.4 to read like section 6.2.7.2 on page 51.
Do the same for sections 6.2.4.4.2, 6.2.4.4.3, 6.2.4.4.4, and 6.2.4.4.5.

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # **055**   **Comment submitted by:** Mark   Tillinghast   Member   2003/09/03

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 34   **Starting Line #** 42   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 5.5.2.4.7

Delete

Suggested Remedy

Merge into section 5.4.2.4.1

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** Rejected

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **056**   **Comment submitted by:**   Mark   Tillinghast   Member   2003/09/03

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 35   **Starting Line #** 34   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 5.5.3.1.3

replace 4-QAM

Suggested Remedy

QPSK or alternatively define 4-QAM in the definitions 3.1

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Rejected**

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**　　　　**Ballot Number:** **0000505**　　　　Comment Date

Comment # **057**　　　**Comment submitted by:** Kenneth　　Stanwood　　　　　Member　　　2003/08/19

Comment　　**Type** Editorial　　　**Starting Page #** 36　　**Starting Line #** 16　　**Fig/Table#** 47　　**Section** 6.2.4.4.1

missing spaces

Suggested Remedy

Change "Reference:IEEE" to "Reference: IEEE"
On line 17, change "condition:IUT" to "condition: IUT"
On line 27, change "condition:IUT" to "condition: IUT"

Proposed Resolution　　**Recommendation:**　　　　　**Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group　　　　**Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes　　　　　**Editor's Actions**　　k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **058**   **Comment submitted by:** Mark   Tillinghast   Member   2003/09/03

Comment   **Type** Technical   **Starting Page #** 37   **Starting Line #** 1   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 5.5.3.2.1.2

replace Second Adjacent

Suggested Remedy

with alternate. If channel 13, 14, and 15 are specified channel 13 is channel 15's lower alternate channel should be defined in 3.1

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** Rejected

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **059**   **Comment submitted by:** Mark   Tillinghast   Member   2003/09/03

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 37   **Starting Line #** 1   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 5.5.3.2.1.2

Should be stated in clause 1: NOTE—National regulation and/or international agreements may impose tighter limits than the following and shall take precedence in this case.

Suggested Remedy

Move statement to clause 1.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Rejected**

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: P802.16/Conf02/D3   **Ballot Number:** 0000505   Comment Date

Comment # 060   **Comment submitted by:** Mark   Tillinghast   Member   2003/09/03

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 37   **Starting Line #** 46   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 5.6.1.2.

Replace: The operators are encouraged to arrive at mutually acceptable sharing agreements that would allow for the provision of service by each licensee within its service area to the maximum extent possible.

Suggested Remedy

Replace with: "The operators are encouraged to use principled negotiations arrive at mutually acceptable sharing agreements that would allow for the provision of service by each licensee within its service area to the maximum extent possible."
See for example:http://www.colorado.edu/conflict/peace/treatment/pricneg.htm

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** Rejected

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **061**   **Comment submitted by:**   Mark   Tillinghast   Member   2003/09/03

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 37   **Starting Line #** 57   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 5.6.1.2.

Replace "good engineering practices"

Suggested Remedy

Replace with more specific recommendation, perhaps a reference to another IEEE standard

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** Rejected

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **062**   **Comment submitted by:**   Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   Type Technical   **Starting Page #** 39   **Starting Line #** 26   **Fig/Table#** 50   **Section** 6.2.5.1.3

Incorrect references to other tests

Suggested Remedy

Change "BV-003" to "BI-002"
On line 48, change "BV-005" to "BI-004"

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **063**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 44   **Starting Line #** 17   **Fig/Table#** 56   **Section** 6.2.5.2.4

Duplicate word

Suggested Remedy

On lines 17, 24, and 34, change "has has" to "has"

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **064**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 46   **Starting Line #** 61   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.5.3.5

insufficient text

Suggested Remedy

Change section 6.2.5.3.5 to read like section 6.2.7.2 on page 51.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **065**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 48   **Starting Line #** 6   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.6.1.3

insufficient text

Suggested Remedy

Change sections 6.2.6.1.3, 6.2.6.1.4, and 6.2.6.1.5 to read like section 6.2.7.2 on page 51.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # **066**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 48   **Starting Line #** 32   **Fig/Table#** 64   **Section** 6.2.6.2.1
missing space

Suggested Remedy
On lines 32 and 41, change "Reference:IEEE" to "Reference: IEEE"

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done
Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **067**   **Comment submitted by:**   Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 49   **Starting Line #** 17   **Fig/Table#** 65   **Section** 6.2.6.2.2

missing colon

Suggested Remedy

Change "Reference" to "Reference:"

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **068**   **Comment submitted by:**   Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 49   **Starting Line #** 24   **Fig/Table#** 65   **Section** 6.2.6.2.2

missing space

Suggested Remedy

Change "Reference:IEEE" to "Reference: IEEE"

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **069**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 50   **Starting Line #** 32   **Fig/Table#** 67   **Section** 6.2.4.2.4

missing colon

Suggested Remedy

Change "Reference" to "Reference:"

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **070**   **Comment submitted by:**   Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 50   **Starting Line #** 44   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.6.2.5

insufficient text

Suggested Remedy

change section 6.2.6.2.5 to read like section 6.2.7.2 on page 52.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # **071**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 52   **Starting Line #** 57   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.8.2
missing space

Suggested Remedy
change "Comparisonat" to "Comparison at"

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done
Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # **072**   **Comment submitted by:**   Mark   Tillinghast   Member   2003/09/03

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 53   **Starting Line #** 38   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.3.3

Nyquist filter alpha is not a percentage

Suggested Remedy

It is a measure of excess bandwith respect to brick wall filter. Replace 25% rolloff with alpha =0.25

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Rejected**

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # **073**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 54   **Starting Line #** 10   **Fig/Table#** 74   **Section** 6.2.9.1

missing space

Suggested Remedy

Change "Reference:IEEE" to "Reference: IEEE"

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: P802.16/Conf02/D3   **Ballot Number: 0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # 074   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 55   **Starting Line #** 63   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.9.4

insufficient text

Suggested Remedy

Change sections 6.2.9.4 and 6.2.9.5 to read like section 6.2.7.2 on page 51.

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group: Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   Editor's Actions k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **075**   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 67   **Starting Line #** 52   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.12.7.1

kHz' not 'KHz'

Suggested Remedy

Drop case of capital K.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **076**   **Comment submitted by:**   Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 69   **Starting Line #** 20   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.12.10.1

The '-' in front of '-80' is a bit small compared to the '+' in front of numbers later.

Suggested Remedy

"More prominent '-'. Perhaps increase font by 1 point, or change to bold?"

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted-Clarified**

Fix the minus sign in the manner most appropriate for the editor.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **077**   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 69   **Starting Line #** 45   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.12.11.1

"Throughout the table and the document, full stops are missing at the end of several sentences."

Suggested Remedy
Place full stops where necessary.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done
Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: P802.16/Conf02/D3   **Ballot Number:** 0000505   Comment Date

Comment # 078   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   **Type** Technical   **Starting Page #** 69   **Starting Line #** 51   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.12.11.1

"Define 'modulation accuracy', state equation, or provide a reference for its definition for clarity. Perhaps in section 4."

Suggested Remedy

"Define 'modulation accuracy', state equation, or provide a reference for its definition for clarity. Perhaps in section 4."

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group: Accepted-Clarified**

At the start of subclause 6.2.12.11 add:

"Modulation accuracy is expressed in error vector magnitude (EVM), as defined in IEEE 802.16 for WirelessMAN-SC."

Do the same for subclause 6.3.12.8 for the BS.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**　　　**Ballot Number:** **0000505**　　　　　　Comment Date

Comment # **079**　　　　**Comment submitted by:**　Ingolf　　　　　Meier　　　　　　　　　　　Member　　　　2003/08/10

Comment　　**Type** Technical　　　　　**Starting Page #** 70　　**Starting Line #** 62　　**Fig/Table#**　　　**Section** 6.2.12.12

What is meant by 'according to the transmitter characteristics'?

Suggested Remedy

More specific. Perhaps an example might help.

Proposed Resolution　　**Recommendation:**　　　　　　**Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group　　　　　**Decision of Group:** **Accepted-Modified**

Delete the second sentence of 6.2.12.12.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes　　　　　**Editor's Actions**　　k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **080**   **Comment submitted by:**   Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 71   **Starting Line #** 20   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.12.12.1

"On my screen and printout, the '-' in front of '-94' appears significantly fainter then the '+'."

Suggested Remedy

"More prominent '-'. Perhaps increase font by 1 point, or change to bold?"

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Changed whole expression into FM Equation

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **081**   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   **Type** Technical   **Starting Page #** 71   **Starting Line #** 20   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.12.12.1

MBaud. Please verify if 'MBaud' can not be written as 'Mbit/s'.

Suggested Remedy

Verify if comment is appropriate to ensure use of consistent units.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted-Modified**

Change "MBaud" to "Msymbols/s"

Do same change other places where MBaud refers to the symbol rate.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

In this context, MBaud is referring to "mega symbols per second" for QPSK the actual Mbits/s would be double the MBaud referred to here.

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # **082**   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 72   **Starting Line #** 51   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.12.13.1

2 μs' and '20 μs'. Use small Greek mu 'μ' instead 'u'.

Suggested Remedy

Change 'u' to 'μ' where appropriate.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Potentially dangerous edit. The character 'μ' is acheived by changing the font of that character to 'Symbol' . If paragraph definition is updated and overrides are removed it might revert to a 'm' wreaking havoc in the specifications.

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # **083**   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 73   **Starting Line #** 53   **Fig/Table#**   Section 6.2.12.14.1

"Consistency. In line 39 '1st', where ^ indicates superscript, is used. Here, however, 1st without superscript appears. This applies to the remainder of the document too. E.g. Tables 107, 216, 217, etc. The Table caption uses 1st."

Suggested Remedy

"Choose a consistent format throughout the document. Suggested to use 1st, 2nd, that is with superscript."

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # 084   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 79   **Starting Line #** 22   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.12.15.1

It appears as if the line spacing increases between the line on which superscript is used and the line above it. Word processor?

Suggested Remedy

Maintain consistent format and in this case line spacing.

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Rejected**

Agree, in principle, but can't do much about it. See reason below.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

This is a word processor issue. The only way to change it would be to deviate from standard IEEE styles.

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # **085**   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 81   **Starting Line #** 61   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.13.2

Use non-breaking hyphen between 49 and byte to keep them together.

Suggested Remedy

Use non-breaking hyphen between 49 and byte to keep them together.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Is this possible in FM?

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   f) pass off to other editor

IEEE staff editor will handle this

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **086**   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 82   **Starting Line #** 23   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.13.2

Use non-breaking hyphen between 51 and byte to keep them together.

Suggested Remedy

Use non-breaking hyphen between 51 and byte to keep them together.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Is this possible in FM?

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   f) pass off to other editor

IEEE Staff editor

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # **087**   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   **Type** Technical   **Starting Page #** 84   **Starting Line #** 21   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.14.1.1

Reference and/or reason missing. Applies to remainder of this table and subsequent tables.

Suggested Remedy

Include appropriate reference and/or reason.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **088**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 85   **Starting Line #** 24   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.14.1.2

insufficient text

Suggested Remedy

Change sections 6.2.14.1.2, 6.2.14.1.3, 6.2.14.1.4, and 6.2.14.1.5 to read like section 6.2.7.2 on page 51.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: P802.16/Conf02/D3   **Ballot Number:** 0000505   Comment Date

Comment # 089   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 90   **Starting Line #** 4394   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.14.2.4

insufficient text

Suggested Remedy

Change sections 6.2.14.2.4.and 6.2.14.2.5 to read like section 6.2.7.2 on page 51.
Do the same for sections 6.2.14.3.2 and 6.2.14.3.3.
Do the same for sections 6.2.14.4.3 and 6.2.14.4.5

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   Decision of Group: Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   Editor's Actions   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **090**   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   Type Technical   **Starting Page #** 93   **Starting Line #** 31   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.14.4.1

"This line is 'language' specific. For clarity please word, with this line as example. Said applies below too."

Suggested Remedy

"For clarity please word, with this line as example. "

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted-Clarified**

Rewrite in a non-language specific manner.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Rewrote the equation using the mathematical operator for exclusive and a single equality sign.

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # **091**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 95   **Starting Line #** 3   **Fig/Table#** 121   **Section** 6.2.14.4.4

missing colon

Suggested Remedy

change "Reference" to "Reference:"

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **092**   **Comment submitted by:**   Mark   Tillinghast   Member   2003/09/03

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 95   **Starting Line #** 21   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 7.8.1

Adaptive Antennas is listed page 6 line 10 as advanced antennas

Suggested Remedy

Pick one and get rid of the other.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Rejected**

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **093**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 95   **Starting Line #** 40   **Fig/Table#** 122   **Section** 6.3.1.1.1

missing space

Suggested Remedy

Change "Reference:IEEE" to "Reference: IEEE"
Do the same on page 96, line 7 and page 96, line 17

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **094**   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 95   **Starting Line #** 54   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.3.1.1.1

Use non-breaking hyphen between DL and MAP.

Suggested Remedy

Use non-breaking hyphen between DL and MAP.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Is this possible in FM?

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Added carriage return to keep DL-MAP together.

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **095**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 96   **Starting Line #** 35   **Fig/Table#** 123   **Section** 6.3.1.1.2

missing colon

Suggested Remedy

Change "Reference" to "Reference:"

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **096**   **Comment submitted by:**   Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 96   **Starting Line #** 61   **Fig/Table#** 123   **Section** 6.3.1.1.2

inconsistent text

Suggested Remedy

Change "Expected results" to "Expected behavior"
Do the same on page 97, line 9

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: P802.16/Conf02/D3   **Ballot Number: 0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # 097   **Comment submitted by:**   Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 97   **Starting Line #** 24   **Fig/Table#** 123   **Section** 6.3.1.1.2

Brittish spelling

Suggested Remedy

Change "behaviour" to "behavior"

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group: Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **098**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 97   **Starting Line #** 53   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.3.1.1.4

insufficient text

Suggested Remedy

Change sections 6.3.1.1.4 and 6.3.1.1.5 to read like section 6.2.7.2 on page 51.
Do the same for sections 6.3.1.2.2, 6.3.1.2.3, 6.3.1.2.4, and 6.3.1.2.5.
Do the same for sections 6.3.1.3.2, 6.3.1.3.3, 6.3.1.3.4, and 6.3.1.3.5

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **099**   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 102   **Starting Line #** 63   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.3.2.1.4

Two full stops.

Suggested Remedy

"Remove one full stop, leave the other."

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # 100   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   Type Technical   **Starting Page #** 104   **Starting Line #** 13   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.3.2.2.2

Ranging Status bit set to 4'? A standard bit can only take on two options. Perhaps 'bits'?

Suggested Remedy

Please clarify and make appropriate changes if necessary.

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted-Modified**

change "Ranging Status bit" to "Ranging Status"

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Ranging Status is a defined field of the message. The word "bit" is a typo.

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: P802.16/Conf02/D3   **Ballot Number: 0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # 101   **Comment submitted by:** Mark   Tillinghast   Member   2003/09/03

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 104   **Starting Line #** 28   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 2.1

Spectral power flux density does not match the acronym psfd

Suggested Remedy

change Spectral power flux density to power spectral flux density

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** Rejected

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **102**   **Comment submitted by:**   Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 108   **Starting Line #** 55   **Fig/Table#** 144   **Section** 6.3.3.1.1

Colon where there should be a period.

Suggested Remedy

Change "CID:" to "CID."

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **103**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 110   **Starting Line #** 3   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.3.3.1.5

insufficient text

Suggested Remedy

change sections 6.3.3.1.5 and 6.3.3.2.2 to read like section 6.2.7.2 on page 51.
Do the same for section 6.3.4.1.5.
Do the same for sections 6.3.4.2.3, 6.3.4.2.4, and 6.3.4.2.5.
Do the same for sections 6.3.4.3.3, 6.3.4.3.4, and 6.3.4.3.5.
Do the same for sections 6.3.4.4.4 and 6.3.4.4.5

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **104**   **Comment submitted by:** Nikolai   Malykh   Member   2003/08/07

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 110   **Starting Line #** 23   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.3.3.2.1

Incorrect DHCP message naming. According RFC 1541 this message name is DHCPDISCOVER

Suggested Remedy

SS sends DHCPDISCOVER on Secondary Management Connection

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # **105**   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   **Type** Technical   **Starting Page #** 111   **Starting Line #** 47   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.3.3.2.5

"Is 'min' a valid unit? 'min' is also used in the sense of 'minimum'. If it is, then there should be a gap between the numeral and the unit. If it is not, then change to appropriate unit. Suggested to express time in seconds."

Suggested Remedy

"Verify if 'min' is a valid unit. If it is, then there should be a gap between the numeral and the unit. If it is not, then change to appropriate unit. Suggested to express time in seconds, that is '900 s'."

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted-Clarified**

"min" referred to minutes. Determine valid abbreviation "min" or "m" and use that. If the appropriate abbreviation cannot be determined, replace "15min" with "15 minutes"

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done
The abbreviation is for minutes is min. Space added between numeral and unit.
Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # 106   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 112   **Starting Line #** 10   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.3.4.1.1
Consistency. A change in font size by about 1 point occurred compared to above. The 1 point larger font is more pleasing to the eye.

Suggested Remedy
Ensure consistency throughout the document.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **107**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 120   **Starting Line #** 37   **Fig/Table#** 163   **Section** 6.3.5.1.2

missing space

Suggested Remedy

Change "Reference:IEEE" to "Reference: IEEE"

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **108**   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 121   **Starting Line #** 58   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.3.5.1.2

timer T8 at maximum value' instead of 'timer T8 max value'.

Suggested Remedy

timer T8 at maximum value' instead of 'timer T8 max value'.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: P802.16/Conf02/D3   **Ballot Number: 0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # 109   **Comment submitted by:**   Tillinghast   Member   2003/09/03
Mark

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 123   **Starting Line #** 53   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** B.4.3

http://www.rabc.ottawa.on.ca/english/pubs.cfm is a dead link

Suggested Remedy

remove or provide alternative for the derivation that can be accessed

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Rejected**

This comment refers to IEEE Draft P802.16.2a/D6, which is not the subject of this ballot. The comment will be referred to the ballot group for
that draft.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   l) none needed

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **110**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 123   **Starting Line #** 58   **Fig/Table#** 167   **Section** 6.3.5.2.1

missing space

Suggested Remedy
Change "2,3" to "2, 3"

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # 111   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 124   **Starting Line #** 55   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.3.5.2.2

"110%' is philosophically arguable. Perhaps write '..., within a time of below 10% above the maximum value of timer T8'."

Suggested Remedy

"Perhaps write '..., within a time of below 10% above the maximum value of timer T8'."

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted-Modified**

Rewrite as 1.10*Maximum value of T8.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: P802.16/Conf02/D3   **Ballot Number:** 0000505   **Comment Date**

Comment # 112   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Technical   **Starting Page #** 131 **Starting Line #** 14   **Fig/Table#** 177   **Section** 6.3.6.1.1

No stimulus in test purpose

Suggested Remedy

Add "Stimulus: Passage of time."

Add the sam estimulus to the next two test purposes (lines 19 and 25).

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** Accepted

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # **113**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 131   **Starting Line #** 53   **Fig/Table#** 177   **Section** 6.3.6.1.1

missing space

Suggested Remedy
Change "Reference:IEEE" to "Reference: IEEE"
Do the same on page 132, lines 3 and 11.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done
Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **114**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 132   **Starting Line #** 38   **Fig/Table#** 177   **Section** 6.3.6.1.1

run together lines

Suggested Remedy

Insert a carriage return before "Initial Condition"

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # **115**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Technical   **Starting Page #** 132   **Starting Line #** 55   **Fig/Table#** 178   **Section** 6.3.6.1.2

missing stimulus

Suggested Remedy

Add "Stimulus: IUT receives a MAC PDU on the UGS connection with the PM bit set."

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**　　　　**Ballot Number:** **0000505**　　　　**Comment Date**

Comment # **116**　　　**Comment submitted by:** Kenneth　　　Stanwood　　　　　　Member　　　2003/08/19

Comment　**Type** Technical　　　　　**Starting Page #** 132　**Starting Line #** 62　　**Fig/Table#** 178　**Section** 6.3.6.1.2

missing stimulus

Suggested Remedy

Add "Stimulus: IUT receives a MAC PDU on the UGS connection with the PM bit set."

Proposed Resolution　　**Recommendation:**　　　　　　**Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group　　　　**Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes　　　　　**Editor's Actions**　　k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # 117   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   Type Technical   **Starting Page #** 133   **Starting Line #** 5   **Fig/Table#** 178   **Section** 6.3.6.1.2

missing stimulus

Suggested Remedy

Insert "Stimulus: IUT receives a MAC PDU on the UGS connection with the SI bit set."

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   Editor's Actions   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **118**   **Comment submitted by:**   Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 133   **Starting Line #** 38   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.3.6.1.3

insufficient text

Suggested Remedy

Change sections 6.3.6.1.3, 6.3.6.1.4, and 6.3.6.1.5 to read like section 6.2.7.2 on page 51.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **119**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 134   **Starting Line #** 41   **Fig/Table#** 180   **Section** 6.3.6.2.2

missing colon

Suggested Remedy

Change "Reference" to "Reference:"

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **120**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   Type Technical   **Starting Page #** 134   **Starting Line #** 43   **Fig/Table#** 180   **Section** 6.3.6.2.2

missing stimulus

Suggested Remedy

Add "Stimulus: Refer to PIXIT for information regarding conditions under which BS may create Multicat Polling groups."

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **121**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 135   **Starting Line #** 7   **Fig/Table#** 181   **Section** 6.3.6.2.3

missing colon

Suggested Remedy

Change "Reference" to "Reference:"
Do also on lines 23, 30, and 46.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: P802.16/Conf02/D3   **Ballot Number: 0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # 122   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 135   **Starting Line #** 48   **Fig/Table#** 183   **Section** 6.3.6.2.5

missing space

Suggested Remedy

Change "Stimulus:Timer" to "Stimulus: Timer"

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group: Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**　　　　**Ballot Number:** **0000505**　　　　　Comment Date

Comment # **123**　　　　**Comment submitted by:** Kenneth　　　Stanwood　　　　　　　Member　　　2003/08/19

Comment　　**Type** Editorial　　　　　　　Starting Page # 140　　Starting Line # 6　　　Fig/Table#　　　Section 6.3.9.4

In sufficient text

Suggested Remedy

Change sections 6.3.9.4 and 6.3.9.5 to read like section 6.2.7.2 on page 51.

Proposed Resolution　　**Recommendation:**　　　　　**Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group　　　　**Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes　　　　**Editor's Actions** k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **124**   **Comment submitted by:** Nikolai   Malykh   Member   2003/08/07

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 142   **Starting Line #** 12   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.3.10.5.1

Omitted table name

Suggested Remedy

Table 193 - Burst Preamble

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # **125**   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   Type Technical   **Starting Page #** 148 **Starting Line #** 46   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.3.12.1.1

...which are integer multiples of ...' instead of '...which are multiples of ...'

Suggested Remedy

Verify if wording should not be as follows: '...which are integer multiples of ...' instead of '...which are multiples of ...'.

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted-Modified**

Change "The BS is able to generate frequencies which are multiples of 250 kHz" to "For each supported band, the BS is able to generate all in-band frequencies which are higher than the lower edge of the band by positive integer multiples of 250 kHz."

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **126**   **Comment submitted by:**   Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 149   **Starting Line #** 20   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.3.12.2.1

"Consistency. Here the unit 'sec' is used. Above, however, 's' was encountered already. ISO units are suggested."

Suggested Remedy

Ensure consistent use of units. ISO units are suggested.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted-Clarified**

either use "2s" or "2 second"

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # **127**   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 151   **Starting Line #** 32   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.3.12.6.1

Is there supposed to be a comma between the numerals -2 and 5 or should this form the number -2.5?

Suggested Remedy

Please see if comma between -2 and 5 is appropriate.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted-Clarified**

Change "-2,5" to "-2.5"

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **1 2 8**   **Comment submitted by:** Ed   Callaway   Member   2003/08/06

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 152   **Starting Line #**   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.3.12 (.8 to .12.1)

There are several blank pages between pp. 152-169, leading the reader (and reviewer) to wonder if something is missing.

Suggested Remedy

Remove the blank pages.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted-Clarified**

Remove the extra blank space, not all the pages are totally blank.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **129**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 152   **Starting Line #** 32   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.3.12.8

lots of extra white space

Suggested Remedy

eliminate extra white space on pages 152, 153, 154, 157, 158, 159, 161, 162, 163, 167, 168, and 169

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted-Duplicate**

See Comment 128

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # 130   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 153   **Starting Line #** 2   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.3.12.8.1

"Pages 153 and 154 are empty. Why? Same applies to sections 6.3.12.10.1, 6.3.12.11.1, etc."

Suggested Remedy

Remove of fill empty pages. Correct formatting.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted-Duplicate**

Comment 128

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # 131   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 156   **Starting Line #** 15   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.3.12.8.1

<= and >= and = and == are in frequent use in this document.

Suggested Remedy

"It may be better to replace these with wordings such as larger then, smaller then, etc."

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted-Modified**

For "<=" or ">=" try to use appropriate symbol. "==" has a special meaning and should be retained.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Appropriate mathematical symbols used. '==' is language specific, more specifically it is used for 'equals' where '=' implies a substitution. There is no possibility for confusion in this specification, thus a single '=' is used.

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **132**   **Comment submitted by:** Ingolf   Meier   Member   2003/08/10

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 160   **Starting Line #** 13   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.3.12.10.1

"Particularly here, at line breaks, it makes sense to use the worded meaning of <= and >= and = and ==."

Suggested Remedy

Use worded meaning of '<='.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted-Duplicate**

Comment 131

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Replaced <= with the appropriate symbol

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # 133   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 175   **Starting Line #** 16   **Fig/Table#** 219   **Section** 6.3.13.2

unresolved and incorrect reference to another test

Suggested Remedy

Change "TP/BS/xxx/xxx/xx-008" to "TP/BS/ACS/ATM/BV-007"

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **134**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 175   **Starting Line #** 22   **Fig/Table#** 219   **Section** 6.3.13.2

two digit test number

Suggested Remedy

Change "09" to "009"

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # **135**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 175   **Starting Line #** 25   **Fig/Table#** 219   **Section** 6.3.13.2

unresolved and incorrect reference to another test

Suggested Remedy

Change "TP/BS/xxx/xxx/xx-008" to "TP/BS/ACS/ATM/BV-007"

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # **136**   **Comment submitted by:** Kenneth   Stanwood   Member   2003/08/19

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 177   **Starting Line #** 33   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.3.14.2.2

insufficient text

Suggested Remedy

Change sections 6.3.14.2.2, 6.3.14.2.3, and 6.3.14.2.4 to read like section 6.2.7.2 on page 51.
Do the same for sections 6.3.14.3.2, 6.3.14.3.3, and 6.3.14.3.5.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: P802.16/Conf02/D3   **Ballot Number: 0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # 137   **Comment submitted by:** Roger   Marks   Member   2003/09/10

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 13   **Starting Line #** 15   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.1

spelling error

Suggested Remedy

change "Descriptos" to "Descriptors"

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group: Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   Editor's Actions

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **138**   **Comment submitted by:** Roger   Marks   Member

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 93   **Starting Line #** 8   **Fig/Table#** 119   **Section** 6.2.14.4.1

unused footnote symbol in table title

Suggested Remedy

delete the footnote symbol

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: Recommendation by

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   Decision of Group: **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

**Editor's Notes   Editor's Actions   ** k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # 139   **Comment submitted by:** Roger   Marks   Member   2003/09/10

Comment   Type Editorial   **Starting Page #** 94   **Starting Line #** 4   **Fig/Table#** 119   **Section** 6.2.14.4.1

duplicate test ID

Suggested Remedy

change "003" to "004"

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   Comment Date

Comment # **140**   **Comment submitted by:** Roger   Marks   Member   2003/09/10

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 11   **Starting Line #** 59   **Fig/Table#** 2   **Section** 6.1.1

Abbreviation for Identifier has incorrect case.

Suggested Remedy

change "Id" to "ID"
Also on page 12, line 4 (2 places).

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **141**   **Comment submitted by:** Roger   Marks   Member   2003/09/10

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 65   **Starting Line #** 47   **Fig/Table#** 97   **Section** 6.2.12.4.1

Stimulus and expected behavior are unclear.

Suggested Remedy

Chage
"Stimulus: The test BS commands the SS to adjust its power level with step size +(-) [0.5 − 2] dB
Expected behavior: The power is measured and the change in power shall be monotonically positive (negative)"
to
"Stimulus: The test BS commands the SS to adjust its power level with step size in the range 0.5 to 2 dB, inclusive.
Expected behavior: The power is measured and the change in power shall be non-negative.

The test shall be rerun with the following conditions:
Stimulus: The test BS commands the SS to adjust its power level with step size in the range -0.5 to -2 dB, inclusive.
Expected behavior: The power is measured and the change in power shall be non-positive."

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Split into two test purposes. Used standard mathematical notation instead of 'range of ... inclusive'.

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **142**   **Comment submitted by:**   Roger   Marks   Member   2003/09/10

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 65   **Starting Line #** 59   **Fig/Table#** 97   **Section** 6.2.12.4.1

Stimulus is unclear.

Suggested   Remedy

Chage
"Stimulus: The test BS commands the SS to adjust its power level with step size +/- [2 - 5] dB
Expected behavior: The power is measured and the change in power shall be accurate to within +/- 2 dB of the requested change."
to
"Stimulus: The test BS commands the SS to adjust its power level with step size in the range 2 to 5 dB, inclusive.
Expected behavior: The power is measured and the change in power shall be accurate to within 2 dB of the requested change.

The test shall be rerun with the following conditions:
Stimulus: The test BS commands the SS to adjust its power level with step size in the range -2 to -5 dB, inclusive.
Expected behavior: The power is measured and the change in power shall be accurate to within 2 dB of the requested change."

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Split into two TPs. Used mathematical notation for range.

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **143**   **Comment submitted by:** Roger   Marks   Member   2003/09/10

Comment   **Type** Technical, Non-binding   **Starting Page #** 178   **Starting Line #** 14   **Fig/Table#** 222   **Section** 6.4.14.3.1

First test case of table is unclear.

Suggested Remedy

Explain with less terse notation how the multiple PHS rules are being applied.

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Originally submitted as editorial.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Extensive rewrite of the TP.

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **144**   **Comment submitted by:** Ken   Stanwood

Comment   Type Technical, Non-binding   **Starting Page #**   **Starting Line #**   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.9

Last sentence incorrect in TP/SS/MAC/PDU/BV-002.

Suggested Remedy

Change to read "Verify the SS properly checks CRC on data received from BS."

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **145**   **Comment submitted by:** Ken   Stanwood

Comment   **Type** Technical, Non-binding   **Starting Page #**   **Starting Line #**   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** 6.2.13

TP/SS/ACS/ATM/BI tests refer to incorrect message.

Suggested Remedy

Change DSA-REQ to DSC-REQ and DSA-RSP to DSC-RSP in TP/SS/ACS/ATM/BI-000 to TP/SS/ACS/ATM/BI-005

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf02/D3**   **Ballot Number:** **0000505**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **146**   **Comment submitted by:**

Comment   Type Technical, Non-binding   **Starting Page #**   **Starting Line #**   **Fig/Table#**   **Section**

TP/SS/INI/IPC/TI-001 initial condition incorrect (cut and paste error from previous TP).

Suggested   Remedy

Change to "Initial condition: SS awaiting TFTP-RSP, retries exhausted."

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: **Recommendation by**

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Accepted**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**   k) done

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items