

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf04/D4**Ballot Number: **18c**

Comment Date

Comment # **077**

Comment submitted by: Siavash

Alamouti

Member

Comment	Type	Technical, Binding	Starting Page #	Starting Line #	Fig/Table#	Section
---------	------	--------------------	-----------------	-----------------	------------	---------

[Identical comment submitted by Siavash Alamouti, Baraa Aldabagh, Dov Andelman, Yung Hahn, Atul Salvekar, [\[Jose Puthenkulam - A\]](#)]

This project duplicates a lot of work with the WiMAX Forum PICS development and also it is not aligned with real market requirements. Hence it is questionable whether there is significant value in this project.

Also the document is substantially incomplete. The SCa PHY PICS are missing. Also all the WirelessHUMAN PICS are missing.

Also while the 802.16-2004 standard is the basis of this PICS, this document does not highlight the fact that the PICS is for fixed systems.

Suggested Remedy

Complete the incomplete sections identified and also call out the fact this is for Fixed Systems only.

Proposed Resolution**Recommendation:****Recommendation by****Reason for Recommendation****Resolution of Group****Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified**

The Task Group is open to contributions for SCa and WirelessHUMAN OFDMA PICS. However, the document does include sections on OFDM and OFDMA and therefore the document has value in spite of the missing material.

The item regarding that PICS is for fixed Systems is addressed in comment 2 ([078 in the summary database](#))

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**Group's Notes****Group's Action Items****Editor's Notes****Editor's Actions****Editor's Questions and Concerns****Editor's Action Items**

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conf04/D4**Ballot Number: **18c**

Comment Date

Comment # **078**

Comment submitted by: Wonil

Roh

Member

Comment	Type Technical, Binding	Starting Page # 5	Starting Line # 17	Fig/Table#	Section 1
---------	--------------------------------	--------------------------	---------------------------	------------	------------------

[Identical comment submitted by Wonil Roh, Hyunjeong Kang, and Jaeweon Cho]

Some clarification is needed to ensure that this document applies only to the fixed broadband application.

Suggested Remedy

Add the following sentence at the end of Scope section:

Scope of this document is limited to Fixed Broadband Wireless Access Systems.

Proposed Resolution**Recommendation:****Recommendation by****Reason for Recommendation****Resolution of Group****Decision of Group: Accepted-Modified**

In the Scope statement replace "IEEE 802.16-2004 for frequencies below 11 GHz." with "IEEE 802.16-2004 (Air Interface for Fixed Broadband Wireless Access Systems) for frequencies below 11 GHz."

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**Group's Notes****Group's Action Items****Editor's Notes****Editor's Actions****Editor's Questions and Concerns****Editor's Action Items**