P802.16/Conformance04 to RevCom:
Conditional Approval

10 March 2006

Rules

Motions requesting conditional approval to forward where the prior ballot has closed shall be accompanied by:

- Date the ballot closed
- Vote tally including Approve, Disapprove and Abstain votes
- Comments that support the remaining disapprove votes and Working Group responses.
- Schedule for confirmation ballot and resolution meeting.

Date the ballot closed:
8 March 2006

Stage	Open	Close	
Sponsor Ballot	3 Feb	**8 Mar**	**2006**

Vote tally including Approve, Disapprove and Abstain votes

- 113   Approve   96%
-    5   Disapprove
-   10   Abstain   8%

- However:
  - 2 of the Disapproves converted to Approve following comment resolution (97.5%)
  - The other 3 Disapprove voters are not at this session and have not responded yet.

Comment resolution

- Total 89 comments resolved
  - Editorial: 62
  - Technical: 27
- All 25 Disapprove comments were positively resolved; 24 by "Agree", 1 by "Principle" ("agree" with minor modifications)

Comments that support the remaining disapprove votes and Working Group responses

- attached

Schedule for confirmation ballot and resolution meeting

- Mar 31:   Issue D7

- Apr 7-22:   recirculation

- May 8-11:   comment resolution at
                   802.16 Session #43, if
                   necessary

802.16 WG Motions

802.16 Closing Plenary: 9 March 2006

Motion: Request conditional approval to forward P802.16-Conformance04/D7 to RevCom pending successful recirculation

- Proposed: Gordon Antonello
- Seconded: Brian Kiernan
- Approved 63-0-0.

Motion

To grant conditional approval, under Clause 20, to forward P802.16/Conformance04 to RevCom

Moved: Marks

Seconded:

Approve:

Disapprove:

Abstain:

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conformanc**   Ballot Number: Comment Date

Comment # **10**   **Comment submitted by:**   SRINIVASAN, MANIKANTAN

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 15   **Starting Line #** 15   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** A.5.2.2

Sentence "Prerequsite &" seems to be central alinged. Needs to be left aligned

Suggested Remedy

Sentence (Line) to be left aligned

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Yes

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Agree**

We instruct the editor to left-align the sentence on Page 15, line 15, which reads
"Prerequisite: A.3/1-- PMP topology. This prerequisite applies throughout this subclause A.5.2.2"

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conformanc**   Ballot Number: Comment Date

Comment # **11**   **Comment submitted by:**   SRINIVASAN, MANIKANTAN

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 16   **Starting Line #** 48   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** A.5.2.3

Sentence "Prerequsite &" seems to be central alinged. Needs to be left aligned

Suggested Remedy

Sentence (Line) to be left aligned

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Yes

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Agree**

Page 16, line 48
Left align the sentence below
"Prerequisite: A.3/1-- PMP topology."

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conformanc**   Ballot Number: Comment Date

Comment # 21   **Comment submitted by:**   SRINIVASAN, MANIKANTAN

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 25   **Starting Line #** 52   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** A.5.2.3.2.6

Sentence "Refer&" seems to be right alinged. Needs to be left aligned

Suggested Remedy

Sentence (Line) to be left aligned

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Yes

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** Agree

Left Justify Page 25, line 52, after modifying as described in Comment 22

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**
Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conformanc**   Ballot Number: Comment Date

Comment # **2 4**   **Comment submitted by:**   SRINIVASAN, MANIKANTAN

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 26   **Starting Line #** 55   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** A.5.2.3.2.8.1

Rows in Table A.32 are right aligned. They need to be left aligned.

Suggested Remedy

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   Recommendation by

Yes

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Agree**

Page 26, line 55
Left align all fields in Table A.32

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conformanc**   Ballot Number: Comment Date

Comment # **25**   **Comment submitted by:**   SRINIVASAN, MANIKANTAN

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 27   **Starting Line #** 12   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** A.5.2.3.2.8.2

Rows in Table A.32 are right aligned. They need to be left aligned.

Suggested Remedy

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Yes

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Agree**

Page 27, line 10
Left align all fields in Table A.33

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**
Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conformanc**   Ballot Number: Comment Date

Comment # **2 6**   Comment submitted by: SRINIVASAN, MANIKANTAN

Comment   Type Editorial   Starting Page # 28   Starting Line # 18   Fig/Table#   Section A.5.2.3.2.8.5

Sentence "See&" seems to be right alinged. Needs to be left aligned

Suggested Remedy

Sentence (Line) to be left aligned

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: Recommendation by

Yes

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   Decision of Group: **Agree**

Page 28, line 18
Right align sentence at page 28, line 18

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   Editor's Actions

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conformanc**   Ballot Number: Comment Date

Comment # **4 1**   **Comment submitted by:**   SRINIVASAN, MANIKANTAN

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 46   **Starting Line #** 54   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** A.5.3.3.2.6

Sentence "Refer&" seems to be right alinged. Needs to be left aligned

Suggested Remedy

Sentence (Line) to be left aligned

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Yes

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Agree**

Page 46, line 54
left align the sentence.

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conformanc**   Ballot Number: **Comment Date**

Comment # 4 2   **Comment submitted by:**   SRINIVASAN, MANIKANTAN

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 48   **Starting Line #** 55   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** A.5.3.3.2.8.5

Sentence "See&" seems to be right alinged. Needs to be left aligned

Suggested Remedy

Sentence (Line) to be left aligned

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Yes

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Agree**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conformanc**   Ballot Number: Comment Date

Comment # 43   **Comment submitted by:**   SRINIVASAN, MANIKANTAN

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 54   **Starting Line #** 27   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** A.5.4

Paragraph "In the following&" seems to be right alinged. Needs to be left aligned

Suggested Remedy

Paragraph (Lines) to be left aligned

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Yes

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Agree**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conformanc**   **Ballot Number:**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **4 4**   **Comment submitted by:**   SRINIVASAN, MANIKANTAN

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 55   **Starting Line #** 46   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** A.5.4.2.1.1

Sentence "Note&" seems to be right alinged. Needs to be left aligned

Suggested Remedy

Sentence (Line) to be left aligned

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Yes

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Agree**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conformanc**   **Ballot Number:**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **4 5**   **Comment submitted by:**   SRINIVASAN, MANIKANTAN

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 56   **Starting Line #** 38   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** A.5.4.2.1.3

Sentence "or&" seems to be right alinged. Needs to be left/center aligned

Suggested Remedy

Sentence (Line) to be left/center aligned

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Yes

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Agree**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conformanc**   Ballot Number: Comment Date

Comment # **4 6**   **Comment submitted by:**   SRINIVASAN, MANIKANTAN

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 61   **Starting Line #** 50   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** A.5.5.2.1.3

"Comments" - Placed for the first time, if they are to be placed before all the comments in the document, they are to be added, or this heading needs to be removed. (Also noticed in Page 64, Line 33, Sec A.5.5.2.1.5 Page 81, L 60)

Suggested Remedy

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Yes

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Agree**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conformanc**   Ballot Number: Comment Date

Comment # **47**   **Comment submitted by:**   SRINIVASAN, MANIKANTAN

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 61   **Starting Line #** 52   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** A.5.5.2.1.3

These comments are not applicable to the above table, hence to be removed

Suggested Remedy

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Yes

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Agree**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conformanc**   Ballot Number: Comment Date

Comment # **5 1**   **Comment submitted by:**   SRINIVASAN, MANIKANTAN

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 66   **Starting Line #** 59   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** A.5.5.2.1.7

Paragraph "Comments&" seems to be right alinged. Needs to be left aligned

Suggested Remedy

Paragraph (Lines) to be left aligned

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Yes

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Agree**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conformanc**   Ballot Number: Comment Date

Comment # **5 2**   **Comment submitted by:**   SRINIVASAN, MANIKANTAN

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 66   **Starting Line #** 63   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** A.5.5.2.1.8

Paragraph "Comments&" seems to be right alinged. Needs to be left aligned

Suggested Remedy

Paragraph (Lines) to be left aligned

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Yes

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Agree**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conformanc**   **Ballot Number:**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **53**   **Comment submitted by:**   **SRINIVASAN, MANIKANTAN**

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 67   **Starting Line #** 4   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** A.5.5.2.1.9

Sentence "or&" seems to be right alinged. Needs to be left/center aligned

Suggested Remedy

Sentence (Line) to be left/center aligned

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Yes

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Agree**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conformanc**   **Ballot Number:**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **5 5**   **Comment submitted by:**   **SRINIVASAN, MANIKANTAN**

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 72   **Starting Line #** 55   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** A.5.5.2.1.17

Sentence "or&" seems to be right alinged. Needs to be left/center aligned

Suggested Remedy

Sentence (Line) to be left/center aligned

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Yes

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Agree**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conformanc**   Ballot Number: Comment Date

Comment # 5 6   **Comment submitted by:**   SRINIVASAN, MANIKANTAN

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 73   **Starting Line #** 36   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** A.5.5.2.1.17

Sentence "Comments&" seems to be right alinged. Needs to be left aligned

Suggested Remedy

Sentence to be left aligned

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Yes

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Agree**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conformanc**   **Ballot Number:**   **Comment Date**

Comment # **5 7**   **Comment submitted by:**   SRINIVASAN, MANIKANTAN

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 73   **Starting Line #** 41   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** A.5.5.2.1.18

Sentence(s) "or&" seems to be right alinged. Needs to be left/center aligned

Suggested Remedy

Sentence (Line) to be left/center aligned

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Yes

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Agree**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes
Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: P802.16/Conformanc   Ballot Number: Comment Date

Comment # 5 8   **Comment submitted by:**   SRINIVASAN, MANIKANTAN

Comment   **Type** Editorial   **Starting Page #** 74   **Starting Line #** 60   **Fig/Table#**   **Section** A.5.5.2.1.19

Sentence "Comments&" seems to be right alinged. Needs to be left aligned

Suggested Remedy

Sentence to be left aligned

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Yes

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Agree**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conformanc**   Ballot Number: Comment Date

Comment # **6 2**   Comment submitted by: SRINIVASAN, MANIKANTAN

Comment   Type Editorial   Starting Page # 87   Starting Line # 37   Fig/Table#   Section A.5.6

Needs edit to remove the additional tab space

Suggested Remedy

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: Recommendation by

Yes

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   Decision of Group: **Agree**

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   Editor's Actions

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conformanc**   **Ballot Number:**   **Comment Date**

Comment # 7   **Comment submitted by:**   ULLMANN, RAINER T

Comment   Type Technical   **Starting Page #** 25   **Starting Line #** 6   **Fig/Table#**   **Section**

The tables A.28 and A.72 indicate that all 4 QoS services of 802.16-2004 are supported. However, section 12.4.2.1 Baisc Packet PMP profile (OFDMA_ProfM1) only requires support of BE and nrtPS. rtPS and UGS not required and hence optional only. This is true for both SS and BS. PICS and should be corrected for both.

Suggested Remedy

Change in table A.28 status for item 1 and 2 from "m" to "o". Change in table A.72 status for item 1 and 2 from "m" to "o"

Proposed Resolution   Recommendation: **Recommendation by**

Yes

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Principle**

Page 25, line 6
Table A.28 items 1-4
Change Status from "m" to "o"

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items

Document under Review: **P802.16/Conformanc**   Ballot Number: Comment Date

Comment # **8**   **Comment submitted by:**   ULLMANN, RAINER T

Comment **Type** Technical   **Starting Page #** 86   **Starting Line #** 32   **Fig/Table#**   **Section**

T19 (item 13) has a "?" for the allowed range. the corresponfding table 342 in 802.16-2004 shows no value. I guess anything would pass the "?" requirement - or would nothing pass? P802.16_Cor1/D5 removes this entry completely from the global paramter table....

Suggested Remedy

Remove item 13 (T19) from Table 181

Proposed Resolution   **Recommendation:**   **Recommendation by**

Yes

Reason for Recommendation

Resolution of Group   **Decision of Group:** **Agree**

Page 86, line 32 Table A.181
Remove item 13

Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution

Group's Notes

Group's Action Items

Editor's Notes   **Editor's Actions**

Editor's Questions and Concerns

Editor's Action Items