IEEE 802.17 (Plenary), Kauai

Notes

- The agenda for the meeting is posted on the web at
  http://www.ieee802.org/17/documents/presentations/nov2002/nov_agenda_03b.xls
- All the presentation materials for the meeting are located at the following URL
  http://www.ieee802.org/17/documents/presentations/nov2002/index.htm
- The minutes do not have details of the motions. However, the motion number and the result of the voting on the motion is captured in the minutes. For details about the motion, please refer to
  http://www.ieee802.org/17/documents/presentations/nov2002/Nov2002Motionsv0.pdf
- The list of attendees is documented in the following location
  http://www.ieee802.org/17/documents/presentations/nov2002/nov_attendees.txt

Meeting minutes 11/11/02 (Monday)

1:00 PM – Introduction (Bob Love)
- Slots allocated for Nirmal Saxena, David James and Harry Peng

1:10 PM – Welcome slides and approval of agenda (Mike Takefman)
- 141 voters at the beginning of the meeting
- Patent policy
- 361 comments
- 1.5 days of comment resolution
- Jan 2003 in Atlanta
- March in Dallas Fort Worth
- July in San Francisco

M: Bob Love, S: Tom A, Approval of Agenda 2002-11-11-01, Unanimous

1:30 PM – Approval of agenda (Mike Takefman)
- Approval of minutes for July and September
M: Bob Love, S: John Lemon, Approval of meeting minutes for July and September, 2002-11-11-02, Unanimous

1:32 PM – SEC business (Mike Takefman)
- Steve Wood attended on behalf of SEC business
- Recommended to use 2**10 and 2**20 instead of using K and M (SI recommends using KIBE for 1024)

1:43 PM – Request for voting rights (Mike Takefman)
- J P Agrawal
- Babu Chilukuri
- Chi-Ping Fu

- Henry Hsiaw
- Sue Hui
- Michael Kelsen
- Li Mo
- Jie Pan
- Diane Patton
- Uttam Reddi
- Alan Wesissberger
- Steve Yang
- Daniel Zhu
- Kshitij Kumar and couple of others have not been listed, chair will figure out the problem

1:45 PM – Editors report (Tom Alexander)
- D1.1 created and posted in Oct 26
- Annex B removed
- Annexes J and K added
- Editorial roster has not changed (Rhett B is not attending this meeting)
- 347 valid comments and 25 carryovers
- 130 technical, 82 technical-binding
- Fariness section – 113 comments
- Mac section – 77 comments

2:00 PM – Protection Ad Hoc report (Jim Kao)

2:16 PM – Bridging Ad Hoc report (Marc Holness)
- Basic bridging compliance
- Frame transmission adherence to 802.1
- Frame structure

2:25 PM – Basic bridging compliance requirements for D1.2 (Bob Castalleno)
- Flooding indicator in the RPR control header
- Modify mac Tx/Rx rules for hosts and bridges

2:50 PM – 20 min break

3:12 PM – AD Flooding proposal (David James)
- Unidirectional flooding
- Bi-directional flooding

3:45 PM – RPR frame transmission proposal (Marc Holness)
- Strict
- Relaxed

4:15 PM – WH proposal (Bob Castalleno)

4:45 PM – Liaison to ITU-T and status of X.msr (Mike Takefman)
- 802.17lite without fairness, A0 and other simplifications etc..
- Meeting at 8pm to define 802.17lite

5:25 PM – When to start WG ballot
5:36 PM – Recess

Meeting minutes 11/12/02 (Tuesday)

8:00 AM – Seating, approval of agenda
M:Bob Love, S: John Lemon, Motion 2002-11-12-03 to approve agenda, passes unanimously

8::11 AM – OAM – AH (Leon Bruckman)

8:21 AM – State table Ad Hoc conclusions (Bob Love)

8:51 AM – RPR priority issues (Jon Schuringa)

9:21 AM – Observations on fairness mechanisms specified in draft 1.1

10:04 AM – RPR simulator

10:36 AM – Bit error analysis (Nirmal Saxena)

10:49 AM – PHY section Annex D (Harry Peng)

10:55 AM – Clause 9 proposal (Bob Sultan)

11:04 AM – Class A shapers/RPR discovery (David James)

11:27 AM – RPR bandwidth allocations (David James)

11:38 AM – RPR time synchronization (David James)

11:48 AM – Chair's comments
- BAH and PAH ad hoc met last night
- Update on the 802.17lite meeting held last night
  - Most of the attendees agreed to scope of 802.17lite
  - Will be posted on web by tomorrow

Meeting minutes 11/13/02 (Wednesday)

The WG group split up into sub-groups to resolve comments.

The output of those subgroups is recorded in the comment resolution database called: FullCRD_19Nov2002.zip, located in the members' only area of the website at http://www.ieee802.org/17/member/draftballots/d1_1/index.htm.

Meeting minutes 11/14/02 (Thursday)

8:00 AM – Seating and agenda scrub (Bob Love)
- Mike Takefman would not be here for the first hour attending the SEC meeting
- Bob Love is acting chair
- No discussion of the bridging before 9AM
- Agenda agreed by unanimous consent

8:12 AM – Bridging discussion (Marc Holness)

8:15 AM – Bridging commonalities (David James)

8:25 AM – Duplication/Misordering prevention with station bypass (Bob Castellano)

8:38AM – 802.1 Duplication/Misordering compliance using existing D1.1 frame format (WH proposal)

8:50 AM – AD proposal (David James)

9:02 AM – MM proposal (Marc Holness)

9:18 AM – Panel session discussion
- Panel consisting of Marc Holness, David James and Bob Castalleno

9:38 AM – Voting for three proposals
- Chicago rules: open to voting members, vote as many of the proposals
- 75% of yes and no votes only
- The proposals getting 75% will be considered
- Motion 2002-11-14-4
  - Roll call vote called and straw vote defeats call for roll call vote
  - MM – Y: 42, N:12, A:4 (77.8%)
  - AD – Y: 12, N: 41, A:4 (22.6%)
  - WH – Y:12, N: 42, A: 5 (22.2%)

9:56 AM – ITU SG 17 liaison letter and call for interest in X.msr
- 802.17 would create a simpler MAC profile to support X.msr
- Options:
  - 1. Create study group
  - 2a. Inform Q7/17 willingness to work – no ad-hoc
  - 2b. Inform Q7/17 willingness to work – ad-hoc

- o 3. Do nothing
- Chicago style with straw vote seems to indicate preference for 2a
- Motion 2002-11-14-5, passes unanimously
- Motion 2002-11-14-6, passes unanimously
- Motion 2002-11-14-7, passes unanimously
- Motion 2002-11-14-8, passes unanimously

11:20 AM – 802.17a PAR
- Motion 2002-11-14-9, passes unanimously

11:32 AM – Chief editors closing report (Tom Alexander)
- Comment period from Dec 10th to Jan 8th

11:40 AM – WG ballot process (Tom Alexander)

12:14 PM – Sponsor ballot introduction (Angela Ortiz)
- A.Ortiz@ieee.org
- Ph No: 732-562-3809

12:45 PM – 1:20 PM lunch break

1:20 PM – Clause 0 comments
- 2002-11-14-10, passes unanimously

1:24 PM – Clause 1,2,3,4 and Annex A comments
- Comment 12, Chicago style voting for three resolutions
  - o Resolution 1: fails
  - o Resolution 2: fails
  - o Resolution 3: fails
  - o All of them fail, comment is carried
- Comment 7, rejected
- Motion 2002-11-14-11, passes unanimously

2:00 PM – Clause 5, 6, 8, G, H, I
- Comment 55
  - o Resolution 1, rejected
  - o Resolution 2, passes
  - o Resolution 3, fails
- Comment 70, CRG resolution accept modified passes
- Comment 71, withdrawn
- Comment 73, accept duplicate of 70
- Comment 75, accept modified
- Comment 78
  - o Resolution 1, passes
  - o Resolution 2, fails

- Comment 86, accept duplicate 70
- Comment 106, accept modified based on the frame format adopted by motion 2002-11-14-4
- Comment 109,
  - Resolution 1: frame format adopted by motion 2002-11-14-4, passes
  - Resolution 2: fails
- Comment 1392
  - Resolution 1: passes
  - Resolution 2: fails
- Comment 3469
  - Resolution 1:passes
  - Resolution 2: fails
- Motion 2002-11-14-12, passes unanimously

3:17 PM – break

3:30 PM – PHY CRG summary
- Comment 3646
- Comment 107
- Comment 102, carried
  - Resolution 1: fails
  - Resolution 2: fails
- Comment 103, carried
  - Resolution 1: fails
  - Resolution 2: fails
  - Resolution 3: fails
- Comment 107
  - Resolution 1: passes
  - Resolution 2: fails
- Comment 304, withdrawn
- Motion 2002-11-14-13, passes unanimously

4:53 PM – Clause 9 summary
- Comment 174
  - Resolution 1: passes
  - Resolution 2: fails
- Comment 179
- Comment 187, duplicate of 179
- Comment 183, duplicate of 179
- Comment 182
- Comment 177
- Comment 167
  - Resolution 1: fails
  - Resolution 2: passes
- Motion 2002-11-14-14, passes unanimously

5:33 PM – Topology/Protection comment resolution summary
- Motion 2002-11-14-15, passes unanimously

6:01 PM – OAM
- Motion 2002-11-14-16, passes unanimously

6:33 PM – Bridging section summary
- Motion 2002-11-14-17, passes unanimously

6:47 PM – To consider all comments for resolution for the WG draft
- Motion 2002-11-14-18, passes

7:15 PM – Authorize electronic WG ballot of P802.17 standard
- Motion 2002-11-14-19, passes unanimously

7:16 PM – Authorize draft 2.0 of P802.17 standard
- Motion 2002-11-14-20, passes unanimously

7:17 PM – Bob Sultan wants to withdraw all his 5 motions

7:18 PM –Motions on how to progress the draft
- Motion 2002-11-14-21 fails
- Motion 2002-11-14-22 fails
- Motion 2002-11-14-23 fails

7:45 PM – Request for UPI codes for RPR types in GFP from ANSI T1X1
- Motion 2002-11-14-24, passes unanimously

7:48 PM – Bob Castellano motions
- Motion 2002-11-14-25, tabled
- Motion 2002-11-14-25a, passes

7:58 PM – Preauthorize 802.17 to progress the draft at the January interim meeting
- Motion 2002-11-14-26

8:04 PM – Secretary
- Motion 2002-11-14-27, passes unanimously

8:07 PM – Adjourn
- Motion 2002-11-14-28, passed unanimously