

September 30th, 2002

8:30AM – Presentation by Mike T

Logistics for connection
server address 192.168.0.3
192.168.0.3/index.htm

8:54 AM – Approval of agenda, F: Bob L, S: Tom A, approved by acclaim

Motion: 2002-09-30-00		
Procedural	Mover: Bob Love	Second: Tom Alexander
Text: Move to approve the agenda for the 802.17 working group interim meeting in New Orleans		
For:	Against:	Abstain:
Result: Passes, unanimous		

8:57 AM – ITU SG17/X.msr update by Mike T

- Glen P and Mike T visited Oslo
- X,msr is defining both MAC layer and service layer
- Significant overlap between 802.17 and X.msr
- US companies submitted proposal to T1X1.5 in Ottawa to deny permission to X.msr for lack of coordination
- 802.17 next steps: Liason to SG17

9:14 AM – SEC rules for membership

- Currently membership cannot be lost for 16 months
- Mike's proposal : 4 meeting proposal
- Straw poll gives slight advantage for 3 meeting

9:26 AM – PAR for 802.17a

9:31 AM – RPR : A view from the market – Lauren S (RPR alliance)

9:41 AM – Chief Editor's report

- CRDs will be posted on the file server under directory "latest_CRD"

10:02 AM - Break

10:27 AM – BAH report (Marc H)

- Focus on packet reorder, duplication, loss reqts

10:52 AM – PAH report (Jim K)

11:07 AM – FAH report (Necdet U)

11:15 AM – Finite state machine for 802.17 topology (Kshitij K)

11:27 AM – Simulation results for enhanced vs basic bridging (Fredrik D)

11:47 AM – Lunch break

1:15 PM – The rice packet ring simulator: An open-source ns-2 simulator of the RPR fairness algorithm (Ping Yuan)

1:30 PM – Bridging proposal (Peter J)

1:58 PM – Updated proposal for RPR rate synchronization (Rhett B)

2:13 PM – IETF Liason report of the RPR MIB (Glenn P)

- 802.17 preference to publish the MIB as IEEE only
- Motion will be proposed on Thursday to send RPR Mib and draft to IETF for sanity check

2:22 PM – ITU Liason report (Glenn P)

2:25 PM – MIBs (David J)

2:30 PM – CRCs (David J)

2:37 PM – Topology frame format – PAH (Leon B)

2:50 PM - Break

3:16 PM – OAM-AH report (Leon B)

3:31 PM – Time of day synchronization (David J)

3:47 PM – Improving 802.17 delays using global coordination (Harmen V)

4:15 PM – Details of the IKN-Fairness mechanism : CQMA

4:44 PM – Spatial Fairness shaping (David J)

5:05 PM – Bandwidth Allocation (David J)

5:30 PM – Avoiding frame duplication and misordering in 802.17 (Anoop G)

5:45 PM – Flooding with context containment (Marc H)

5:55 PM – Overview of BAH proposal T (Mike T)

6:10 PM – Support for selective ordering/duplication preservation on 802.17 ring (Bob C)

October 3rd, 2002

8:21 AM – Approval of agenda

8:25 AM – ITU-SG 17 liason

- T1X1 position is to deny consent to X.msr
- US state department position is similar

8:28 AM – PAR for 802.17a

- Standard stating amendments to 802.1D-1998
- Will be submitted in Nov, 2002
- Plan to finish in one year

8:34 AM – Motion for approval of PAR for 802.17a

Motion: 2002-10-3-01		
Technical	Mover: Mike Takefman	Seconder: Constantinos Bassias
Text: Move to forward the PAR for 802.17a as written in 802.17a_par.pdf to 802 SEC and other		
For:	Against:	Abstain:
Result: Passes, unanimous		

8:42 AM – Undetected error analysis (Mike T on behalf of Nirmal S)

- HEC-16 vs HEC-32

9:00 AM – Editor's report (Tom A)

- Global section: 4 comments
- Intro section: 55 comments
- Clause 2,3,4 : 56 comments, 55 resolved
-
- D1.1 will be ready and posted on Oct 26
- Comment period runs from Oct 26-Nov 5

9:18 AM – Clause 0 report (Tom Alexander)

Motion: 2002-10-3-02			
Technical	Mover: Tom Alexander	Second: John Lemon	
Text: Move to adopt all resolutions to comments on section 0 (global comments), as resolved by comment resolution ad-hoc, including requests for contributions and requests to form ad-hoc groups as necessary.			
For:	Against:	Abstain:	Result:
Result: Passes, unanimous			

9:29AM – Clause 2,3,4 (Tom Alexander)

9:51 AM – Introduction D1.0 Clause #1 reports (David James)

Motion: 2002-10-3-03			
Technical	Mover: David James	Second: Tom Alexander	
Text: Move to adopt all resolutions to comments on Intro section(clauses 1,2,3,4), as resolved by comment resolution ad-hoc, including requests for contributions.			
For:	Against:	Abstain:	Result:
Result: Passes, unanimous			

10:04 AM Section 2 (MAC) CRG summary (John Lemon)

- All technical comments resolved (dealt with or deferred to WG)
- Discussion on comment #301

Motion: 2002-10-3-04			
Procedural	Mover: Bob Love	Second: Harmen VanAs	
Text: Move to defer discussion on comment #301 until after the bridging discussions have concluded.			
For:3	Against:21	Abstain:	Result: fails
Result: Fails			

- Discussion on comment #348

Motion: 2002-10-3-05			
Procedural	Mover: Bob Love	Second: Khaled Amer	
Text: Move to amend the agenda to include a 30min discussion on “Frame formats necessary to accommodate future bridging enhancements”			
For: 7	Against:17	Abstain:	Result: fails
Result: Fails			

12:05 PM – Lunch break

1:15 PM – Session resumes with the discussion of comments for clause 2 (John Lemon)

- Comment #360

Motion: 2002-10-3-06			
Technical	Mover: John Lemon	Second: Tom Alexander	
Text: Move to adopt all resolutions to comments on MAC section(clauses 5,6,8 annexes G,H,I) as resolved by comment resolution ad-hoc, including requests for contributions.			
For:	Against:	Abstain:	Result:
Result: Passes, unanimous			

2:32 PM – PHY comment report (Annexes B,C,D and clause 7) (Rhett B)

Motion: 2002-10-3-07			
Technical	Mover: Rhett Brikovis	Second: Tom Alexander	
Text: Move that the Tfadopt the RPR rate synchronization function described in rb.....			
For:	Against:	Abstain:	Result:
Result: Passes, unanimous			

Motion: 2002-10-3-08			
Technical	Mover: Rhett Brikovskis	Second: Peter Jones	
Text: Move to adopt all resolutions to comments on PHY section(clauses 7 and annex B,C,D) as resolved by comment resolution ad-hoc, including requests for contributions.			
For:	Against:	Abstain:	Result:
Result: Passes, unanimous			

3:10 PM – Break

3:30 PM – Session resumes with clause 9

3:34 PM – Summary of the comment resolution ad-hoc for clause 9 – MAC fairness of P802.17/D.1 (Anoop Ghanwani)

Motion: 2002-10-3-09			
Technical	Mover: Anoop Ghanwani	Second: Necdet Uzun	
Text: Move to adopt all resolutions to comments on the fairness section(clause 9) as resolved by comment resolution ad-hoc, including requests for contributions and requests to from ad-hocs as necessary, and to grant editorial license for all unresolved editorial comments if any.			
For:	Against:	Abstain:	Result:
Result: Passes, unanimous			

For:	Against:	Abstain:	Result:
Result: Passes, unanimous			

3:52 PM – Topology and Protection ad-hoc report (Jason Fan)

4:40 PM – Revised topology and protection clauses (Jim Kao)

Motion: 2002-10-3-10			
Technical	Mover: Jason Fan	Second: Jim Kao	
Text: Move to adopt all resolutions to comments on Topology/Protection section(clauses 10,11) as resolved by comment resolution ad-hoc, including requests for contributions and requests to form ad-hocs as necessary, and to grant editorial license for all unresolved editorial comments if any.			
For:	Against:	Abstain:	Result:
Result: Passes, unanimous			

4:54 PM – OAM D1.0 CRG report (Glenn Parsons)

Motion: 2002-10-3-11			
Technical	Mover: Glenn Parsons	Second: Peter Jones	
Text: Authorize 802.17 OAM editor to send the RPR MIB (text) and the RPR draft(as of 1 st WG ballot-PDF) to the IETF (OAM AD &IPoRPR WG) to review MIB after 802.17 authorizes first WG ballot.			
For:	Against:	Abstain:	Result:
Result: Passes, unanimous			

Motion: 2002-10-3-12			
Technical	Mover: Glenn Parsons	Second: Peter Jones	
Text: Move to adopt all resolutions to comments on OAM section(clauses 12,13 and annex E) as resolved by comment resolution ad-hoc.			
For:	Against:	Abstain:	Result:
Result: Passes, unanimous			

5:30 PM – Bridging CRG report (Marc Holness)

Motion: 2002-10-3-13			
Technical	Mover: Marc Holness	Second: John Lemon	
Text: Move to adopt all resolutions to comments on Bridging section(annex F) as resolved by comment resolution ad-hoc and to grant editorial license for all unresolved editorial comments if any.			
For:	Against:	Abstain:	Result:

Result: Passes, unanimous

6:00 PM – Drafting D1.1

Motion: 2002-10-3-14			
Technical	Mover: Tom Alexander	Seconded: John Lemon	
Text: Move to authorize chief editor and editors to create 802.17/D1.1 based on P802.17/D1.0 and the instructions within those comment resolutions and motions that are formally approved at the September 2002 meetings in New Orleans.			
For:	Against:	Abstain:	Result:
Result: Passes, unanimous			

6:03 PM – Bridging proposal (Marc Holness)

Motion: 2002-10-3-15			
Technical	Mover: Marc Holness	Seconded: Peter Jones	
Text: Move that the WG accept contribution draft text mh_flood_text_05.pdf. Editors of affected clauses (including clause 6,8,annex F etc) are instructed to review and use the draft contribution in mh_flood_text_05.pdf to update their clauses as appropriate.			
For:	Against:	Abstain:	Result:
Result: Motion tabled			

Subsidiary motion to move to table the motion 2002-10-3-15

Auxiliary Motion: 2002-10-3-15A			
Procedural	Mover: Marc Holness	Seconded: Tom Alexander	
Text: Move to table the motion 2002-10-3-15.			
For: 22	Against: 3	Abstain: 6	Result:
Result: Passes			

6:46 PM - Straw poll for bridging proposals

- In favor of H, For: 24, Against: 7
- In favor of Q, For: 7, Against: 23
- In favor of P, For: 6, Against: 23

6:50 PM - Subsidiary motion to move to untable the motion 2002-10-3-15

Auxiliary Motion: 2002-10-3-15B		
Procedural	Mover: Marc Holness	Seconded: Tom Alexander

Text: Move to untable the motion 2002-10-3-15.			
For: 27	Against: 2	Abstain:	Result:
Result: Passes			

6:52 PM – Discussion is back on motion 2002-10-3-15

Motion: 2002-10-3-15			
Technical	Mover: Marc Holness	Secunder: Peter Jones	
Text: Move that the WG accept contribution draft text mh_flood_text_05.pdf. Editors of affected clauses (including clause 6,8,annex F etc) are instructed to review and use the draft contribution in mh_flood_text_05.pdf to update their clauses as appropriate.			
For: 26	Against: 9	Abstain:	Result:
Result: Fails			

6:57 PM – Roll call for the motion 2002-10-3-15 is requested by Necdet Uzun

- Mike T goes thru the roll call

The result for motion 2002-10-3-15 after the roll call is reflected below

Motion: 2002-10-3-15			
Technical	Mover: Marc Holness	Secunder: Peter Jones	
Text: Move that the WG accept contribution draft text mh_flood_text_05.pdf. Editors of affected clauses (including clause 6,8,annex F etc) are instructed to review and use the draft contribution in mh_flood_text_05.pdf to update their clauses as appropriate.			
For: 26	Against: 9	Abstain: 1	Result:
Result: Fails			

7:06 PM – Further motion madness

Motion: 2002-10-3-16			
Technical	Mover: Jason Fan	Secunder: Jim Kao	
Text: Move to create informative Annex J entitled “Topology and protection scenarios”, in D1.1, based on the contents of an_j_top_prot.pdf., with editorial license to incorporate the results of comment resolution against D1.0 at the New Orleans 2002 meeting.			
For:	Against:	Abstain:	Result:
Result: passes, by unanimous acclaim			

Motion: 2002-10-3-17			
Technical	Mover: Jason Fan	Secunder: Jim Kao	

Text: Move to adopt changes in clause 10 and clause 11 as delineated in cls10_topology_crg.pdf and cls11_protection_crg.pdf in D1.1, with editorial license to incorporate the results of comment resolution against D1.0 at the New Orleans 2002 meeting.			
For:	Against:	Abstain:	Result:
Result: passes, by unanimous acclaim			

7:19 PM – Motion to move to adjourn

Motion: 2002-10-3-18			
Procedural	Mover: Yong Kim	Seconded: Mike Takefman	
Text: Move to adjourn			
For:	Against:	Abstain:	Result:
Result: passes, by unanimous acclaim			