

MAC CRG Summary

John Lemon

Summary

- 147 comments for Clauses 5, 6, 8, F, G, H, I, J

Clause	Editorial	Technical, Non-binding	Technical, Binding	Total
5	11	2	1	14
6	35	52	26	113
8	2	5	0	7
F	1	0	0	1
G	4	0	2	6
H	1	0	0	1
I	4	0	0	4
J	1	0	0	1
	59	59	29	147

- 4 comments rejected
- 10 comments deferred to WG
- Editorial license granted on editorial comments

Changes Approved – Clause 5

- MA_CONTROL.indication with opcode SINGLE_CHOKE_IND is not triggered by the receipt of an SCFF, but at each expiration of agingInterval

Changes Approved — Clause 6

- Correct definition and use of passA0, passA1, and sendA
- Correct ConsistentHopCount()
- Shaper clarifications
- Wrapping peculiarities clarifications
- Clarifications and corrections to Tables 6.20, 6.22, 6.23, 6.24, and 6.29

Changes Approved — Clause 8

- Complete listing of control frame constraints
- Allow we in idle frames to be 0 or 1

Changes Approved — Annexes F, G, H, I, J

- None

Rejected Technicals

- 120: Don't count badFCS frames not passed up to client
 - Need to count these
- 136: Define an expression for myEdgeRinglet()
 - Text sufficiently clear
- 168: Add control frame transmission to transmit state machines
 - Already added via stage queue
- 182: Constrain control frames to $fe == 0$
 - Some control frames are FE

Comments Deferred

- 62: Interaction of steering and wrapping
- 91: Whether to count contained frames in Q_TX_SS
- 105: Whether to allow reception of expired fairness frames
- 127: Ctrl versus Control
- 128: Counter or discard invalid control frames
- 135: "otherRi" versus "!ringlet_id"
- 138: Testing whether optional MA_DATA.request parameters were provided in ringlet selection state machine
- 147: How to deal with destination_address_extended being required when source_address_extended is provided
- 164: Whether to state that classA access delay default (Equation 6.15) is not accurate
- 515: Whether to state that sizeSTQ and addRateA1 equations are accurate