C/ 00 SC 0 P L # 23

Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type T Comment Status X

Since the revision of 802.3.1 is to include changes due to the various amendments to 802.3, the references from 802.3.1 to 802.3 should align with the clause numbers in the revision of 802.3.

Consequently, references that do not align with 802.3 Revision D3.0 are proposed to be changed.

SuggestedRemedy

Page 71, line 35, "30.3.61.14" should be "30.3.6.1.14" Page 71, line 53, "30.3.61.14" should be "30.3.6.1.14" Page 176, line 39, "30.5.1.1.12" should be "30.5.1.1.14" Page 176, line 41, "30.5.1.1.13" should be "30.5.1.1.15" Page 176, line 44, "30.5.1.1.14" should be "30.5.1.1.16" Page 176, line 46, "30.5.1.1.15" should be "30.5.1.1.17" Page 176, line 48, "30.5.1.1.16" should be "30.5.1.1.18" Page 197, line 12, "30.5.1.1.12" should be "30.5.1.1.14" Page 197, line 50, "30.5.1.1.13" should be "30.5.1.1.15" Page 198, line 38, "30.5.1.1.14" should be "30.5.1.1.16" Page 198, line 61, "30.5.1.1.15" should be "30.5.1.1.17" Page 199, line 18, "30.5.1.1.16" should be "30.5.1.1.18" Page 252, lines 38 and 55 "22.7a" should be "22.7" Page 252, lines 39 and 56 "35.4a" should be "35.4" Page 252, lines 39 and 56 "46.4a" should be "46.4" Page 253, lines 11 and 30 "22.7a" should be "22.7" Page 253, lines 11 and 30 "35.4a" should be "35.4" Page 253, lines 11 and 30 "46.4a" should be "46.4" Page 265, line 43, "45.2.3.20" should be "45.2.3.27" Page 265, line 48, "45.2.3.21" should be "45.2.3.28" Page 281, line 49, "45.2.3.18.3" should be "45.2.3.26.3" Page 286, line 38, "45.2.3.17.1" should be "45.2.3.25.1" Page 286, line 65, "45.2.3.17.2" should be "45.2.3.25.2" Page 289, line 62, "45.2.3.21" should be "45.2.3.29" Page 290, line 22, "45.2.3.22" should be "45.2.3.30" Page 290, line 47, "45.2.3.23" should be "45.2.3.31" Page 291, line 9, "45.2.3.25" should be "45.2.3.33" Page 291, line 35, "45.2.3.26" should be "45.2.3.34" Page 291, line 61, "45.2.3.27" should be "45.2.3.35" Page 292, line 21, "45.2.3.28" should be "45.2.3.36" Page 292, line 45, "45.2.3.24" should be "45.2.3.32" Page 295, line 63, "45.2.1.11.4" should be "45.2.1.14.4" Page 295. line 63. "45.2.1.11.7" should be "45.2.1.14.7" Page 297, line 50, "45.2.1.36" should be "45.2.1.23" Page 298, line 14, "45.2.1.36" should be "45.2.1.23" Page 300, line 25, "45,2,1,4,1" should be "45,2,1,4,7" Page 300, line 25, "45.2.1.4.2" should be "45.2.1.4.8" Page 300, line 25, "45.2.1.12.2" should be "45.2.1.15.2" Page 300, line 26, "45,2,1,12,3" should be "45,2,1,15,3" Page 301, line 47, "45.2.1.12.4" should be "45.2.1.15.4" Page 302, line 49, "45.2.1.38" should be "45.2.1.41" Page 302, line 50, "45.2.1.39" should be "45.2.1.42" Page 302, line 50, "45,2,1,54" should be "45,2,1,57" Page 303, line 17, "45.2.1.11.4" should be "45.2.1.14.4" Page 303, line 17, "45.2.1.11.7" should be "45.2.1.14.7" Page 303, line 17, "45.2.1.12.4" should be "45.2.1.15.4" Page 303, line 63, "45.2.1.16" should be "45.2.1.19" Page 304, line 21, "45.2.1.17" should be "45.2.1.20" Page 304, line 39, "45.2.1.18" should be "45.2.1.21" Page 304. line 62. "45.2.1.19" should be "45.2.1.22" Page 305, line 22, "45.2.1.21" should be "45.2.1.29" Page 308, line 26, "45.2.1.42" should be "45.2.1.45" Page 309, line 23, "45.2.1.43" should be "45.2.1.46" Page 309, line 56, "45.2.1.43" should be "45.2.1.46" Page 310, line 12, "45.2.1.43" should be "45.2.1.46" Page 310, line 42, "45.2.1.43" should be "45.2.1.46" Page 321. line 65. "45.2.1.22" should be "45.2.1.25" Page 322, line 25, "45.2.1.23" should be "45.2.1.26" Page 369, line 34, "30.5.1.1.12" should be "30.5.1.1.14" Page 369, line 55, "30.5.1.1.13" should be "30.5.1.1.15" Page 370, lines 16 and 18, see seperate comment Page 370, line 19, "30.5.1.1.14" should be "30.5.1.1.16" Page 370, line 41, "45.2.7.5" should be "45.2.8.5" Page 370, line 41, "45.2.1.86" should be "45.2.1.91" Page 370, line 42, "30.5.1.1.15" should be "30.5.1.1.17" Page 371, line 2, "45.2.7.6" should be "45.2.8.6" Page 371, line 3, "45.2.1.87" should be "45.2.1.92" Page 371. line 4. "30.5.1.1.16" should be "30.5.1.1.18" Page 371, line 19, "45.2.1.63" should be "45.2.1.65" Page 371, line 20, "30.5.1.1.17" should be "30.5.1.1.19" Page 371, line 34, "45.2.1.64" should be "45.2.1.66" Page 371, line 35, "30.5.1.1.18" should be "30.5.1.1.20" Page 371, line 50, "45.2.1.65" should be "45.2.1.67" Page 371, line 51, "30.5.1.1.19" should be "30.5.1.1.21" Page 371, line 65, "45.2.1.66" should be "45.2.1.68" Page 372, line 1, "30.5.1.1.20" should be "30.5.1.1.22" Page 372, line 12, "30.5.1.1.21" should be "30.5.1.1.23" Page 372, line 23, "45.2.1.76a.2" should be "45.2.1.78.2" Page 372. line 35. "45.2.1.76a.2" should be "45.2.1.78.1" Page 372, line 64, "30.5.1.1.XX" should be "30.5.1.1.11" Page 373, line 19, "30.5.1.1.XX" should be "30.5.1.1.12" Page 431, line 23, "30.5.1.1.11" should be "30.5.1.1.13" Page 431, line 38, "30.5.1.1.17" should be "30.5.1.1.19" Page 431, line 52, "30.5.1.1.18" should be "30.5.1.1.20" Page 432, line 3, "30.5.1.1.19" should be "30.5.1.1.21" Page 432, line 17, "30.5.1.1.20" should be "30.5.1.1.22" Page 432. line 32. "30.5.1.1.12" should be "30.5.1.1.14" Page 432, line 46, "30.5.1.1.13" should be "30.5.1.1.15"

0.5.1.1.22" 0.5.1.1.14" 0.5.1.1.15" CI 00 Page 1 of 8 SC 0 1/20/2012 10:19:02 AM Page 432, line 61, "30.5.1.1.14" should be "30.5.1.1.16" Page 433, line 13, "30.5.1.1.15" should be "30.5.1.1.17" Page 433, line 27, "30.5.1.1.16" should be "30.5.1.1.18" Page 448, line 28, "30.8.1.1.2" should be "30.9.1.1.2" Page 448, line 44, "30.8.1.1.3" should be "30.9.1.1.3" Page 448, line 59, "30.8.1.1.4" should be "30.9.1.1.4" Page 449, line 10, "30.8.1.1.11" should be "30.9.1.1.5" Page 449, line 38, "30.8.1.1.5" should be "30.9.1.1.7"

Proposed Response

Response Status 0

C/ 00 SC 0 P64 L 28 # 20 Anslow, Peter Ciena Comment Type Comment Status X Page 64 line 28 says "(reflected in the aOAMLocalFlagsField of 30.3.6.1.10)", but 30.3.6.1.10 is in IEEE Std 802.3 so the reference should be prefaced by this. Same issue on page 64, line 40 for 30.3.6.1.11 and for other references on subsequent pages. SuggestedRemedy Change to "(reflected in the aOAMLocalFlagsField of IEEE Std 802.3 30.3.6.1.10)" Make equivalent change on: Page 64. line 40 for 30.3.6.1.11 Page 65, line 21 for 30.3.6.1.12 Page 69, line 32 for 30.3.6.1.7 Page 175, line 1 for 30.3.5 Page 176, line 1 for 30.3.7 Page 176, line 34 for 30.5.1 Page 305, line 41 for 45.2.6.12 Page 305, line 59 for 61.3.3.3 and Figure 61-19 Page 306, line 2 for 45.2.6.11 Page 370, line 4 for 65.2 and Clause 74 Page 371, line 19 for 45.2.1.63 (another comment corrects reference) Page 371, line 34 for 45.2.1.64 (another comment corrects reference) Page 371, line 50 for 45.2.1.65 (another comment corrects reference) Page 371, line 65 for 45.2.1.66 (another comment corrects reference) Page 372, line 58 (802.3 missing) Page 400, line 9 for 30.3.1.1.31 Page 400, line 54 for 30.3.1.1.33 Page 401, line 3 for 30.3.1.1.34 Page 401, line 63 for 30.3.1.2.4 Page 403, line 42 for 30.3.2.1.2 Page 403, line 57 for 30.3.2.1.3 Page 404, line 22 for 30.3.2.1.5 Page 404. line 56 for 30.3.2.1.7 Page 408, line 49 for 30.3.5.1.1 Page 408, line 63 for 30.3.5.1.2 From Page 409, line 13 to Page 414 line 6 there are 23 instances of 'See "BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS" in' that should be followed by "IEEE Std 802.3" Page 429, line 18 for 30.5.1.1.2 Page 429, line 49 for 30.5.1.1.4 Page 430, line 13 for 30.5.1.1.6 From Page 431, line 37 to Page 433 line 28 there are 9 instances of 'See "BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS" in' that should be followed by "IEEE Std 802.3" From Page 440, line 18 to Page 474 line 18 there are 124 instances of 'See "BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS" in' that should be followed by "IEEE Std 802.3"

Proposed Response Status O

Working Group 2.3.1a D1.0 Management Information Base (MIB) definitions for Ethernet Initial Working Group ballot com SC 7.3 C/ 02 SC 2 P21 L 20 C/ 07 Barrass, Hugh Cisco Anslow, Peter Comment Type Comment Status X Ε Comment Type Nelacktworks SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy Networks Proposed Response Response Status O Proposed Response C/ 02 SC 2 P22 L36 # 2 C/ 07 SC 7.3 Barrass, Hugh Cisco Anslow. Peter Comment Type E Comment Status X Comment Type Very high speed should be hyphenated, also fix capitals & add abbreviation SuggestedRemedy ITU-T Recommendation G.993.1, 2004—Very-high-speed Digital Subscriber Line (VDSL) transceivers. SuggestedRemedy Proposed Response Response Status O SC 5.4 C/ 05 P52 L 24 # 22 Proposed Response Anslow, Peter Ciena Comment Type Comment Status X CI 08 SC 8.5 This says "This object maps to the variable LocRxSystemValueEcho ...", but that is the Anslow, Peter same as for IldpV2Xdot3LocRxTwSysEcho earlier. Shouldn't this one be

RemRxSystemValueEcho rather than LocRxSystemValueEcho?

SuggestedRemedy

Change LocRxSystemValueEcho to RemRxSystemValueEcho

Proposed Response Response Status 0 P102 L 50 # 19

Ciena

Comment Status X

REFERENCE "IEEE 802.3 Mgt, 30.4.2.1.2, aGroupPortCapacity." should say "IEEE Std 802.3," rather than "IEEE 802.3 Mgt,"

Change "IEEE 802.3 Mgt," to "IEEE Std 802.3,"

Response Status O

P110 L61 Ciena

Comment Status X

This says "... less than or equal to maxFrameSize (See IEEE Std 802.3 4.4.2.1).", but 4.4.2.1 does not exist and 4.4.2 does not contain a maxFrameSize.

Same issue on page 111 lines 23 and 48

Correct this reference here and on page 111 lines 23 and 48. Should this point to 4.4.2 as this contains maxBasicFrameSize and maxEnvelopeFrameSize or is there a better reference?

Response Status O

P148 L19 # 25

Ciena

Comment Status X Comment Type

This says "... greater than tlim max (see IEEE Std 802.3 Table 33-5).", but Table 33-5 doesn't have anything to do with times.

SugaestedRemedy

Correct the reference. Should this be Table 33-11?

Proposed Response Response Status O ballot comments

2.3.1a D1.0 Management Information Base (MIB) definitions for Ethernet Initial Working Group ballot com

ballot comments

 CI 09
 SC 9.6
 P181
 L1
 # 31

 Haiduczenia, Marek
 ZTE Corporation

Comment Type T Comment Status X

Object aMPCPAdminState (30.3.5.1.2) was modified by 802.3av, but changes in the text are not reflected in dot3MpcpOperStatus in 802.3.1a

SuggestedRemedy

Change "IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 64." to "IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 64 and Clause 77.

Proposed Response Status O

Comment Type T Comment Status X

Object aMPCPMode (30.3.5.1.3) was modified by 802.3av, but changes in the text are not reflected in dot3MpcpMode in 802.3.1a

SuggestedRemedy

Change "IEEE Std 802.3. Clause 64." to "IEEE Std 802.3. Clause 64 and Clause 77.

Proposed Response Status O

C/ 09 SC 9.6 P182 L25 # 33

Hajduczenia, Marek ZTE Corporation

Comment Type T Comment Status X

Object aMPCPLinkID (30.3.5.1.4) was modified by 802.3av, but changes in the text are not reflected in dot3MpcpLinkID in 802.3.1a

SuggestedRemedy

Change "as specified in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.2.2" to "as specified in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.2.2 or 76.2.6.1.3.2, as appropriate"

Proposed Response Status O

Cl 09 SC 9.6 P191 L21 # 34

Hajduczenia, Marek ZTE Corporation

Comment Type T Comment Status X

Object aOMPEmulationType (30.3.7.1.2) was modified by 802.3av, but changes in the text are not reflected in dot3OmpEmulationType in 802.3.1a

SuggestedRemedy

Change "see IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1" to "see IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1 or 76.2, as appropriate"

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 09 SC 9.6 P192 L 33 # 35
Haiduczenia, Marek ZTE Corporation

Comment Type T Comment Status X

Object aSLDErrors (30.3.7.1.3) was modified by 802.3av, but changes in the text are not reflected in dot3OmpEmulationSLDErrors in 802.3.1a

SuggestedRemedy

Change "as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.1" to "as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.1 or 76.2.6.1.3.1, as appropriate.".

Proposed Response Status O

Cl 09 SC 9.6 P192 L52 # 36

Hajduczenia, Marek ZTE Corporation

Comment Type T Comment Status X

Object aCRC8Errors (30.3.7.1.4) was modified by 802.3av, but changes in the text are not reflected in dot3OmpEmulationCRC8Errors in 802.3.1a

SuggestedRemedy

Change "as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.1" to "as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.1 or 76.2.6.1.3.1, as appropriate".

Change "as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.3" to "as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.3 or 76.2.6.1.3.3. as appropriate".

Proposed Response Response Status O

2.3.1a D1.0 Management Information Base (MIB) definitions for Ethernet Initial Working Group ballot com

ballot comments

C/ 09 SC 9.6 P193

37

Haiduczenia. Marek

ZTE Corporation

Comment Type T Comment Status X

Object aGoodLLID (30.3.7.1.5) was modified by 802.3av, but changes in the text are not reflected in dot3OmpEmulationGoodLLID in 802.3.1a

SuggestedRemedy

Change "as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.1" to "as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.1 or 76.2.6.1.3.1, as appropriate".

Change "as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.3" to "as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.3 or 76.2.6.1.3.3, as appropriate".

Proposed Response

Response Status 0

C/ 09 SC 9.6 P193

L 54

L 33

38

Hajduczenia, Marek ZTE Corporation

Comment Type T Comment Status X

Object aONUPONcastLLID (30.3.7.1.6) was modified by 802.3av, but changes in the text are not reflected in dot3OmpEmulationOnuPonCastLLID in 802.3.1a

SuggestedRemedy

Change "A count of frames received that contain a valid SLD field, as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.1, pass the CRC-8 check, as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.3, and meet the rules of acceptance for an ONU defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.2." to "A count of frames received that: 1) contain a valid SLD field in an ONU. 2) meet the rules for frame acceptance, and 3) pass the CRC-8 check. The SLD is defined in 65.1.3.3.1 or 76.2.6.1.3.1, as appropriate. The rules for LLID acceptance are defined in 65.1.3.3.2 or 76.2.6.1.3.2, as appropriate. The CRC-8 check is defined in 65.1.3.3.3 or 76.2.6.1.3.3, as appropriate."

Proposed Response

Response Status O

C/ 09 SC 9.6 Haiduczenia, Marek

P193

L9

40

ZTE Corporation

Comment Type T Comment Status X

Object aBadLLID (30.3.7.1.8) was modified by 802.3av, but changes in the text are not reflected in dot3OmpEmulationBadLLID in 802.3.1a

SuggestedRemedy

Change "A count of frames received that contain a valid SLD field, as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.1, and pass the CRC-8 check, as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.3. but are discarded due to the LLID check as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3,3.2." to read "A count of frames received that contain a valid SLD field in an OLT, and pass the CRC-8 check, but are discarded due to the LLID check. The SLD is defined in 65.1.3.3.1 or 76.2.6.1.3.1, as appropriate. The CRC-8 check is defined in 65.1.3.3.3 or 76.2.6.1.3.3, as appropriate. The LLID check is defined in 65.1.3.3.2 or 76.2.6.1.3.2, as appropriate."

Proposed Response

Response Status O

CI 09 SC 9.6 P194

L13

39

Hajduczenia, Marek

ZTE Corporation

Comment Type T Comment Status X

Object aOLTPONcastLLID (30.3.7.1.7) was modified by 802.3av, but changes in the text are not reflected in dot3OmpEmulationOltPonCastLLID in 802.3.1a

SuggestedRemedy

Change "A count of frames received that contain a valid SLD field, as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1,3,3,1, pass the CRC-8 check, as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1,3,3,3, and meet the rules of acceptance for an OLT defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.2." to read "A count of frames received that contain a valid SLD field, as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.1 or 76.2.6.1.3.1, as appropriate, pass the CRC-8 check, as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.3 or 76.2.6.1.3.3, as appropriate, and meet the rules of acceptance for an OLT defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.2 or 76.2.6.1.3.2, as appropriate."

Proposed Response

Response Status 0

2.3.1a D1.0 Management Information Base (MIB) definitions for Ethernet Initial Working Group ballot com

ballot comments

 CI 09
 SC 9.6
 P198
 L 48
 # 41

 Haiduczenia, Marek
 ZTE Corporation

Comment Type T Comment Status X

Object aFECCorrectedBlocks (30.5.1.1.15) was modified by 802.3av, but changes in the text are not reflected in dot3EponFecCorrectedBlocks in 802.3.1a

SuggestedRemedy

Change "For 1000BASE-PX, 10GBASE-R, 10GBASE-PR or 10/1GBASE-PRX PHYs, it is a count of corrected FEC blocks" to read "For 10PASS-TS, 2BASE-TL, and 1000BASE-PX PHYs. it is a count of corrected FEC blocks"

Proposed Response Response Status O

 CI 09
 SC 9.6
 P199
 L 6
 # 42

 Hajduczenia, Marek
 ZTE Corporation

Comment Type T Comment Status X

Object aFECUncorrectableBlocks (30.5.1.1.16) was modified by 802.3av, but changes in the text are not reflected in dot3EponFecUncorrectableBlocks in 802.3.1a

SuggestedRemedy

Change "For 1000BASE-PX, 10GBASE-R, 10GBASE-PR or 10/1GBASE-PRX PHYs, it is a count of corrected FEC blocks" to read "For 10PASS-TS, 2BASE-TL, and 1000BASE-PX PHYs, it is a count of corrected FEC blocks"

Proposed Response Response Status 0

C/ 11 SC 11.5 P292 L12 # 26
Anslow Peter Ciena

Comment Type T Comment Status X

In the efmCuPAFInLostEnds OBJECT-TYPE the description says:

"If a Clause 45 MDIO Interface to the PCS is present, then this object maps to the 10P/2B PAF lost start of fragment register." but this should be the "PAF lost ends of fragments register"

SuggestedRemedy

Change:

"then this object maps to the 10P/2B PAF lost start of fragment register." to: "then this object maps to the 10P/2B PAF lost ends of fragments register."

Proposed Response Status O

Cl 11 SC 11.5 P297 L19 # [15

Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status X

This reference is ""IEEE Std 802.3, 61.2.2.8.4, 45.2.6.6-45.2.6.8"

However, in section 14.2 of the IEEE Standards Style Manual (2009) it says that for ranges:

"Dashes should never be used because they can be misconstrued for subtraction signs"

SuggestedRemedy

Change:

"45.2.6.6-45.2.6.8" to: "45.2.6.6 to 45.2.6.8"

Proposed Response Status O

Cl 11 SC 11.5 P306 L26 # 16

Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status X

This refers to 802.3ah which has been superceeded by 802.3 Replace with a reference to 802.3.

Same issue on Page 315, line 12

SuggestedRemedy

Change "802.3ah" to "IEEE Std 802.3"

Page 315, line 12 change "802.3ah" to "IEEE Std 802.3"

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 12A SC 12A P349 L10 # 17

Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status X

space missing in "specified in IEEE Std 802.345.2.2"

SuggestedRemedy

Insert the space to give "specified in IEEE Std 802.3 45.2.2"

Proposed Response Response Status O

2.3.1a D1.0 Management Information Base (MIB) definitions for Ethernet Initial Working Group ballot com

ballot comments

C/ 13 SC 13.5 P370 L16 # 21 Anslow. Peter Ciena Comment Status X Comment Type Т This says "this object will map to the FEC controlregister (see 45.2.7.3) for 1000BASE-PX or FEC enable bit in 10GBASE-R FEC control register (see 45.2.1.85)." 1) Space missing in "controlregister" 2) The references to Clause 45 should be prefaced by "IEEE Std 802.3" 3) The "FEC control register" for 1000BASE-PX is in 45.2.8.3 not 45.2.7.3 4) The "10GBASE-R FEC control register" has been re-named to "BASE-R FEC control register" 5) The "BASE-R FEC control register" is in 45.2.1.90 not 45.2.1.85 SuggestedRemedy Change to: "this object will map to the FEC control register (see IEEE Std 802.3 45.2.8.3) for 1000BASE-PX or FEC enable bit in the BASE-R FEC control register (see IEEE Std 802.3 45.2.1.90)." Proposed Response Response Status O Р C/ 99 SC Annex 1 # 44 Hamano, Hiroshi Fuiitsu Labs. Ltd. Comment Type E Comment Status X Annex number indications are preferable at PDF file Chapter markers. SuggestedRemedy So as in 802.3.1-2011. Proposed Response Response Status O CI B SC B.1.1 L 46 # 27 P391 Law, David HP Ltd

C/ B SC B.16.1 P457 L34 # 30

Law, David HP Ltd

Comment Type T Comment Status X

Since we no longer include the oAggregator object within the GDMO module shouldn't we get rid of this name binding. This however brought to my attention there was no name binding for oOAM to be the top level object. I believe that this is an error as stated in IEEE std 802.3 subclause 30.2.2.1 'Text description of managed objects', 'Otherwise, if implemented, oOAM becomes the top-most managed object class of the DTE containment tree shown in Figure 30-3.'.

SuggestedRemedy

- [1] Delete the name binding nbOAM-aggregator
- [2] Add the name binding nbOAMName as follows:

nbOAMName NAME BINDING SUBORDINATE OBJECT CLASS oOAM; NAMED BY SUPERIOR OBJECT CLASS "ISO/IEC 10165-2":system AND SUBCLASSES; WITH ATTRIBUTE aOAMID;

REGISTERED AS (iso(1) std(0) iso8802(8802) csma(3) csmacdmgt(30) nameBinding(6) oAMName(??));

Proposed Response Status O

C/ B SC B.16.2 P461 L33 # 18

Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Tab missing in front of "BEHAVIOUR"

SuggestedRemedy

Replace space with a tab

Proposed Response Status O

SuggestedRemedy

Delete name bir

Comment Type T

Delete name binding nbMAC-Aggregator.

get rid of this name binding.

Comment Status X

Since we no longer include the oAggregator object within the GDMO module shouldn't we

Proposed Response Response Status O

2.3.1a D1.0 Management Information Base (MIB) definitions for Ethernet Initial Working Group ballot com

ballot comments

45

C/ B SC B.3.1

P405 HP Ltd # 28

29

Law, David

TII LIG

Comment Type T Comment Status X

Since we no longer include the oAggregator object within the GDMO module shouldn't we get rid of this name binding.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete name binding nbMACControl-Aggregator.

Proposed Response

Response Status O

C/ B SC B.4.1

P410

L**5**

L 56

Law. David HP Ltd

Comment Type E Comment Status X

There appears to be a missing space in the text

bMPCPMACCtrlFramesTransmittedBEHAVIOUR. While this may be a formatting issue, there may be a space or a tab but it isn't displayed due to the length of the names, the lack of a space causes a compiler error.

The same issue also occurs on:

Page 410, line 19.

Page 427, line 58.

Page 434, line 35.

Page 434, line 36.

SuggestedRemedy

Add missing space.

Proposed Response

Response Status O

C/ C NoName

Comment Type E

Comment Status X

From Geoff Thompson

SC C.2

The text: "802.9a (99) --see IEEE Std 802.3, IEEE Std 802.9"

needs work. There are 2 issues.

Issue #1: The standard 802.9 has been withdrawn.

Issue #2: I don't believe that the text "see IEEE Std 802.3, IEEE Std 802.9"

P487

makes any sense.

(As closely as I can tell, 802.9a was never revised into the base standard.

It looks like all the pieces of 802.9 were withdrawn rather than merged.)

SuggestedRemedy

Revise the text to read:

"802.9a (99) --see IEEE Std 802.3, IEEE Std 802.9a Clause 12

(withdrawn)"

Proposed Response

Response Status O

P**487**

L18

L18

43

Hamano, Hiroshi

C/ C

Fujitsu Labs. Ltd.

Comment Type E Comment Status X

SC C.2

Newly added PMD names may be necessary.

SuggestedRemedy

Reflect PMD names which appear on page.3 in

http://www.ieee802.org/3/minutes/nov11/1111_1a_close_report.pdf

Proposed Response

Response Status O

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

CI C SC C.2 Page 8 of 8 1/20/2012 10:19:04 AM