

IEEEP802.3.1a D1.1 MIB definitions for Ethernet 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

comments

CI 00 SC 0 P L # 1
 Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Changes made to Clause 30 of the draft revision of 802.3 (in D3.1) mean that some of the references to objects need to be modified.

SuggestedRemedy

Page 252, line 45, 30.3.1.1.38 (aTransmitLPIMicroseconds) should be 30.3.2.1.8
 Page 252, line 61, 30.3.1.1.39 (aReceiveLPIMicroseconds) should be 30.3.2.1.9
 Page 253, line 19, 30.3.1.1.40 (aTransmitLPITransitions) should be 30.3.2.1.10
 Page 253, line 37, 30.3.1.1.41 (aReceiveLPITransitions) should be 30.3.2.1.11
 Page 253, line 50, 30.3.1.1.44 (aSlowProtocolFrameLimit) should be 30.3.1.1.38
 Page 375, line 2, 30.3.1.1.42 (aLDFastRetrainCount) should be 30.5.1.1.24
 Page 375, line 15, 30.3.1.1.43 (aLPFastRetrainCount) should be 30.5.1.1.25

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 00 SC 0 P L # 2
 Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status X

References to IEEE Std 802.3 from 802.3.1 need to be prefaced by "IEEE Std 802.3".
 Many instances of this were inserted via comment #20 against D1.0, but at least two instances were missed by the previous comment.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert "IEEE Std 802.3" before:
 Page 369, line 54 "45.2.8.2"
 Page 489, line 21 "30.2.5"

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 13 SC 13.5 P369 L4 # 3
 Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Space missing in "IEEE Std 802.3Clause 74"
 Also, on Page 371, line 26, space missing in "IEEE Std 802.345.2.1.65"

SuggestedRemedy

Page 369, line 4, insert a space to give "IEEE Std 802.3 Clause 74"
 Page 371, line 26, insert a space to give "IEEE Std 802.3 45.2.1.65"

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 13 SC 13.5 P370 L45 # 4
 Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Comment 23 against D1.0 corrected a large number of cross-references to IEEE Std 802.3, however, not all of the corrections were made correctly.

SuggestedRemedy

Page 370, line 45, "45.2.1.9" should be "45.2.1.91"
 Page 374, line 22, "30.5.1.1.1" should be "30.5.1.1.11"
 Page 375, line 13, "45.2.1.78.2" should be "45.2.1.78.1"

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 07 SC 7.3 P111 L22 # 5
 Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type T Comment Status X

Comment 24 against D1.0 pointed out three instances of references to "4.4.2.1" in 802.3, which does not exist.

The first instance was corrected by changing:
 "less than or equal to maxFrameSize (See IEEE Std 802.3 4.4.2.1)" to:
 "less than or equal to maxFrameSizeLimit (See IEEE Std 802.3 4.2.7.1)"
 but the two other instances were not corrected.

SuggestedRemedy

On page 111 at line 22 and also at line 47, change:
 "maxFrameSize (See IEEE Std 802.3 4.4.2.1)" to:
 "maxFrameSizeLimit (See IEEE Std 802.3 4.2.7.1)"
 i.e. make this substitution in two places on this page.

Proposed Response Response Status O

IEEEP802.3.1a D1.1 MIB definitions for Ethernet 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

comments

CI 00 SC 0 P L # 6
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type T Comment Status X

There should be an item in 802.3.1 for all of the managed objects in Clause 30 of 802.3 (except for the deprecated Link Aggregation objects).
Add the objects in 802.3 that aren't referenced in 802.3.1

SuggestedRemedy

Add support for:
30.3.5.1.25 aMPCPRecognizedMulticastIDs
to Dot3MpcpControlEntry as a table of Unsigned32

30.3.8.3 aEXTENSIONMACCtrlStatus
to dot3ExtensionEntry

30.9.1.1.12 aPSEActualPower
30.9.1.1.13 aPSEPowerAccuracy
30.9.1.1.14 aPSECumulativeEnergy
to PSEPortEntry

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI B SC P391 L1 # 11
Frazier, Howard

Comment Type T Comment Status X

Submitted on behalf of Geoff Thompson.
Revise the GDMO to strip out everything except the values and their specific names.
Reformulate the material into a table
Add the missing parameters to the new table
Table is to be reviewed for:
- Format
- Completeness (of both old values and new entries w/ their names)
during this ballot.

SuggestedRemedy

New leaf values are to be filled in during Sponsor Ballot.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 99 SC P5 L1 # 46
Ganga, Ilango Intel

Comment Type ER Comment Status A

Update the introduction to include list of additions to 802.3.1-2011 covered by this revision.

SuggestedRemedy

Update introduction to include list of additions covered by this revision as stated in the project objectives.

Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Add a paragraph that describes the amendments pulled in to this revision.

CI 13 SC 13.5 P370 L18 # 47
Ganga, Ilango Intel

Comment Type TR Comment Status A

Update ifMauFECMode object description as per changes specified in 30.5.1.1.14 (see 802.3ba).

For example change "10GBASE-R FEC control register" to "BASE-R FEC control register"

SuggestedRemedy

As per comment

Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See response to comment # 21.

CI 00 SC 0 P L # 48
Ganga, Ilango Intel

Comment Type TR Comment Status A

The references to 802.3 document is based on IEEE Std 802.3-2008. Should the document be aligned to the revised references as per the 802.3REV project that is already in sponsor ballot.

For example, see the following reference in 13.5 ifMauFECmode object, REFERENCE "IEEE Std 802.3. 30.5.1.1.14 aFECMode." However this reference has been changed to 30.5.1.1.16 in 802.3 Revision.

SuggestedRemedy

Align this document references to 802.3REV project that is already in sponsor ballot.

Response Response Status U

ACCEPT.
See details in response to comment # 23.

CI 13 SC 13.5 P370 L 23 # 49
Ganga, Ilango Intel

Comment Type TR Comment Status A

Update ifMauFECCorrectedBlocks object description as per changes specified in 30.5.1.15 (see 802.3ba). This is an array of counters for 40 and 100 GbE.

Update ifMauFECUnCorrectableBlocks object description as per changes specified in 30.5.1.16 (see 802.3ba). This is an array of counters for 40 and 100 GbE.

SuggestedRemedy

As per comment

Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Update ifMauFECCorrectedBlocks:

Change object type to an array.

Change reference to 30.5.1.17 (already addressed in comment #23)

Change description to read:

For 1000BASE-PX, 10/40/100GBASE-R PHYs, an array of corrected FEC block counters. The counters will not increment for other PHY types. The indices of this array (0 to N-1) denote the PCS lane number where N is the number of PCS lanes in use. The number of PCS lanes in use is set to one for PHYs that do not use PCS lanes. Each element of this array contains a count of corrected FEC blocks for that PCS lane.

Update ifMauFECUnCorrectableBlocks:

Change object type to an array.

Change reference to 30.5.1.18 (already addressed in comment #23)

Change description to read:

For 1000BASE-PX PHYs or 10/40/100GBASE-R PHYs, an array of uncorrectable FEC block counters. The counters will not increment for other PHY types. The indices of this array (0 to N-1) denote the PCS lane number where N is the number of PCS lanes in use. The number of PCS lanes in use is set to one for PHYs that do not use PCS lanes. Each element of this array contains a count of uncorrectable FEC blocks for that PCS lane.

CI 13 SC 13.5 P239 L 3 # 50
Ganga, Ilango Intel

Comment Type TR Comment Status A

Update dot3StatsSymbolErrors object description as per changes specified in 30.3.2.1.5 aSymbolErrorDuringCarrier(see 802.3ba).

SuggestedRemedy

As per comment

Response

Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Add the following text:

For operation at 10 Gb/s, 40 Gb/s, and 100 Gb/s, it is a count of the number of times the receiving media is non-idle (the time between the Start of Packet Delimiter and the End of Packet Delimiter) for a period of time equal to or greater than minFrameSize, and during which there was at least one occurrence of an event that causes the PHY to indicate "Receive Error" on the XGMII, the XLGMII, or the CGMII.