

Minutes of the Study Group (SG)
“Distinguished Minimum Latency Traffic in a Converged Traffic Environment” (DMLT)
2013-05-16, -17

Attendance

1 st Name	Name	Employer	Affiliation
Albert	Tretter	Siemens AG	Siemens AG
Arthur	Marris	Cadence	Cadence
Christian	Boiger	Deggendorf university	Hirschmann
Dan	Sexton	GE	GE
Dave	Dwellely	LTC	LTC
Geoff	Thomson	GraCoSi	Self
Glenn	Parson	Ericson	Ericson
Karl	Weber	Beckhoff Automation	Beckhoff Automation
Ludwig	Winkel	Siemens AG	Siemens AG
Marcel	Kießling	Siemens AG	Siemens AG
Pat	Thaler	Broadcom	Broadcom
Rodney	Cummings	National Instruments	National Instruments
Tony	Jeffree	Independent	Hp/Broadcom

1 Welcome and Introductions (room Buckingham)

Ludwig welcomes the audience at 8:00 am on Thursday. No introduction was done as all participants were well known.

Signup sheet passed around and all participants have to sign in with company name and the affiliation according to subclause 5.3.3.1 'Disclosure of affiliation'. The IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual states that 'The minutes of each working group or project meeting shall record a list of attendees and the disclosed affiliation of each attendee'.

While it would be possible to back annotate this information for an individual from the IMAT records, it is request that we ensure that any sign-up sheet that is circulated also contains space for a person to provide both their employer and their affiliation.

The SG-DMLT used at the beginning the room Buckingham instead of the assigned room Library because of the intended joint meeting of 802.3/DMLT with 802.1/TSN took place in their room at 9am on Thursday. The following sessions of SG-DMLT were held in room Library.

2 Appointment of Recording Secretary

Anatoly could not make it to participate this meeting, so Albert Tretter offered to act as recording secretary.

3 Approve Agenda

Ludwig presented the agenda.

1	Welcome and Introductions (room Buckingham)	1
2	Appointment of Recording Secretary	1
3	Approve Agenda	2
4	Approve MM March 2013	2
5	Reflector and Web.....	2
6	IEEE 802.3 templates and ground rules.....	2
7	Liaisons and Communications	3
8	Joint .1TSN/.3DMLT meeting (Thursday 9am, room Buckingham).....	3
8.1	Recap of the actual PAR, 5C and objectives (Ludwig).....	3
8.2	Presentations	3
8.2.1	Time Aware Shaper in combination with DMLT (Christian Boiger)	3
8.2.2	Support for DMLT Guard Band; A Technical Feasibility Presentation (Pat Thaler).....	3
8.2.3	DMLT Negotiation; A Technical Feasibility Presentation (Pat Thaler).....	3
8.2.4	Some Issues within "The 5 Criteria" (Geoff Thompson)	3
8.2.5	Technical Proposal for a Wire Compliant Solution (Geoff Thompson)	3
8.3	Preparing Tutorial for Geneva 2013 meeting.....	3
8.4	Adjournment of the joint meeting	4
9	PAR, 5C and objectives preparation.....	4
9.1	Preparatory work	4
9.2	Motion #1.....	4
9.3	Motion #2.....	4
9.4	Motion #3.....	5
9.5	Motion #4.....	5
9.6	Conclusions	5
10	Preparing .3/DMLT opening report	5
11	Next Steps.....	5

The agenda was approved with editorial improvements and reordering the presentations.

4 Approve MM March 2013

The MM of the Orlando March 2013 meeting was approved as drafted.

5 Reflector and Web

Presented as it is. No changes.

6 IEEE 802.3 templates and ground rules

Ludwig presented the boilerplate items like:

- Structure, Bylaws and Rules

- IEEE Standards Process
- Ground Rules

7 Liaisons and Communications

No Liaison outside IEEE 802 needed. Communications needed with IEEE 802.1.

8 Joint .1TSN/.3DMLT meeting (Thursday 9am, room Buckingham)

According to the Liaison report from DMLT to 802.1 closing plenary in Orlando it was proposed by DMLT to have a joint meeting with 802.1.

8.1 Recap of the actual PAR, 5C and objectives (Ludwig)

- PAR → no changes
- 5C → no changes
- Objectives → some changes, the changes marked accordingly.

8.2 Presentations

8.2.1 Time Aware Shaper in combination with DMLT (Christian Boiger)

- Discussion about the signaling between the 802.1 and 802.3 layer and the required behavior.

8.2.2 Support for DMLT Guard Band; A Technical Feasibility Presentation (Pat Thaler)

- Proposal for a control request at the MAC client service interface going via the MAC to the MAC Merge Sublayer.
- The delay of the proposed service in the MAC is an issue which has to be determined and specified.

8.2.3 DMLT Negotiation; A Technical Feasibility Presentation (Pat Thaler)

- Discussion about Pats proposal, if we really need a two way negotiation to enable the pre-emption mechanism on both sides of the link.
- The motivation for the two way negotiation from Path was based on concerns from .3 people.
- It may be sufficient that a pre-emption capable receiver informs the sender that the sender can activate pre-emption. The receiver is always active.

8.2.4 Some Issues within "The 5 Criteria" (Geoff Thompson)

- Discussion about the proposal using parallel links for the different traffic types.
- This proposal is not suitable for automotive and industrial applications. It was decided to cover this point in the planned tutorial.

8.2.5 Technical Proposal for a Wire Compliant Solution (Geoff Thompson)

- Discussion about the proposal of an end-to-end transmission of segmentation packets and the consequences.
- An additional objective is required that on a DMLT link a buffered repeater or a TPMR which receives and transmits own frames is not allowed.

8.3 Preparing Tutorial for Geneva 2013 meeting

- Ludwig led the drafting process for the Tutorial in Geneva.
- Discussion of the content of the Tutorial and Q&A
- Setup of the telcos for the preparations of the Tutorial

- The form “802_Tutorial_Request_Form_IET_Geneva_D3p1”, which was sent out in April 2013, was updated. Ludwig will forward this new revision to the .3 chair for approval.

8.4 Adjournment of the joint meeting

Ludwig expressed his appreciation to Michael and the attending .1 experts for their attention and especially for their constructive contributions.

The joint meeting between 802.1/TSN and 802.3/DMLT was adjourned at 3:30pm.

9 PAR, 5C and objectives preparation

9.1 Preparatory work

Ludwig led the drafting process for the PAR, 5C, and objectives. An updated revision was created and the SG DMLT intend to forward this to the .3 chair.

SG DMLT requested David Law, 802.3 WG chair, to pre-submit the PAR and 5C (and objectives) to the 802.3 WG and 802 EC prior to the Geneva 2013 meeting.

The designated project is IEEE P802.3br PAR – David Law, 802.3 chair, selected that designation, see <https://development.standards.ieee.org/P827400033/par-submit>.

The meeting was adjourned at 2013-05-16, 5:30pm.

The meeting was reconvened at 2013-05-17, 9:00am

The PAR copied from the IEEE web page contained a statement in 5.2.b. that was not visible within the editable web site. After filling in the content to the web page, then it was in alignment with the provided PAR and 5C.

Discussion about the objectives at the "Objectives - OPEN & Consideration" slide.

9.2 Motion #1

Moved by Young Kim, to move the points 14, 15, 16 and 17 from the "Objectives (3) - approved by SG" slide, to the " Objectives -OPEN & Consideration" slide.

There was no seconder, therefore the motion failed to become active.

9.3 Motion #2

Moved to move point 3 (Consider providing, ..., a primitive that holds the transmit path ...) from the slide "Objectives -OPEN & Consideration" to the slide "Objectives (3) - approved by SG".

- Moved by: Pat Thaler
- Seconded by: Ludwig Winkel
- Y: 5 N: 0 A: 1
- Passed $\geq 75\% Y/(Y+N)$

9.4 Motion #3

Moved to move point 1 ("M-Frame in the wild" ...) from the "Objectives -OPEN & Consideration" slide to the "Objectives (3) - approved by SG" slide

- Moved by: Pat Thaler
- Seconded by: Albert Tretter
- Y: 7 N: 1 A: 0
- Passed $\geq 75\% Y/(Y+N)$

9.5 Motion #4

Moved that,

- To approve final SG DMLT versions of PAR (see 8023-DMLT-SG-1305-Winkel-PAR-2013-05-17r01), 5C (8023-DMLT-SG-1305-Winkel-5C-2013-05-17r01) and objectives (see 8023-DMLT-SG-1305-Winkel-Objectives-2013-05-17r01) and
 - To request David Law, 802.3 WG chair, to pre-submit the PAR and 5C (and objectives) to the 802.3 WG and 802 EC
- Moved by: Ludwig Winkel
 - Seconded by: Albert Tretter
 - Y: 9 N: 0 A: 1
 - Passed $\geq 75\% Y/(Y+N)$

9.6 Conclusions

SG DMLT approved 18 objectives. Three potential objectives remain for further discussion during the Geneva meeting.

With motion #4 the work of the SG on PAR, 5C and objectives is completed for this interim meeting. The chair thanked the group for the support and contributions.

10 Preparing .3/DMLT opening report

Ludwig led the drafting process for the preparation of the .3/DMLT opening report in Geneva 2013-07-15. The agreed wording for the objective slides was added and editorial improvements integrated to the proposal presented by Ludwig.

11 Next Steps

- Ludwig will invite the presenters of the tutorial for TelCos starting 2013-05-29, then 2nd and 4th Wednesday of the month at 17:00 CEST = 08:00 PDT
- Ludwig will present the status and intension of SG-DMLT in Geneva, CH, at the ITU workshop by 2013-07-13
- 2013-07-15 IEEE802.3 plenary meeting in Geneva

Meeting was adjourned at 2013-05-17, 12:00am.