

This document includes all comments submitted during the first Sponsor Ballot, along with both the Editor's Recommendations and the Task Force's Resolution for each, as determined during the January 2000 Interim Meeting in Dallas.

CommentNumber = 1

Name = John L Messenger

Email = John.Messenger@8025.org

Phone = +44-1904-693409

Fax = +44-1904-693067

Org = Madge Networks

Page = 0

Line = 0

Subclause = 0

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = All my comments are intended to improve the readability of the document. I do not consider any of them to require a recirculation of the document. I will be at the interim meeting to discuss them if required.

SuggestedRemedy =

EditorsRecommendation:

No action required. Each of the comments can be considered individually.

Resolution:

Withdrawn.

CommentNumber = 2

Name = Geoff Thompson

Email = gthompso@nortelnetworks.com

Phone = (408) 495-1339

Fax = (408) 988-5525

Org = Nortel Networks

Page = 0

Line = 0

Subclause = 0

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = Editorial changes need to be made to the master spreadsheet for 802.3 Management to fully integrate Link Aggregation objects, attributes, notifications, actions, packages and capabilities.

The master spreadsheet is available on the web and is intended to be the controlling document for 802.3 Management.

Dave Law and I will be happy to work with the editors during the Dallas meeting to complete this task.

SuggestedRemedy =

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept the gracious donation by Mr. Thompson of Mr. Law's time and effort in Dallas (along with his own).

Resolution:

Spreadsheet will be updated appropriately, offline. No change required to the draft.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

CommentNumber = 3
Name = John L Messenger
Email = John.Messenger@8025.org
Phone = +44-1904-693409
Fax = +44-1904-693067
Org = Madge Networks
Page = 1
Line = 41-42
Subclause =
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = Copyright address has changed.
SuggestedRemedy = Change the copyright address to "3 Park Avenue, New York, NY 10016-5997"

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept. Will be automatically corrected by the IEEE Editor in any case.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 4
Name = John L Messenger
Email = John.Messenger@8025.org
Phone = +44-1904-693409
Fax = +44-1904-693067
Org = Madge Networks
Page = 4
Line = 6
Subclause = 1.1
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = The sentence to be added ends with a comma, ...
SuggestedRemedy = ...whereas it should end with a full-stop.

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 5
Name = John L Messenger
Email = John.Messenger@8025.org
Phone = +44-1904-693409
Fax = +44-1904-693067
Org = Madge Networks
Page = 4
Line = 16
Subclause = 1.1
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = The RFCs listed on pages 4 and 5 have the list of authors followed by a list of organisation names. This presentation format does not make sense.
SuggestedRemedy = Either omit the affiliations, or list each author's affiliation immediately following his or her name.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

EditorsRecommendation:
Omit the affiliations.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 6
Name = Stephen Haddock
Email = shaddock@extremenetworks.com
Phone = (408) 579-2812
Fax = (408) 579-3000
Org = Extreme Networks
Page = 5
Line = 34
Subclause = 1.4
CommentType = Editorial
Comment =
 The term "Aggregate Conversation" is not used in the document.
SuggestedRemedy =
 Delete the definition.

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 7
Name = Stephen Haddock
Email = shaddock@extremenetworks.com
Phone = (408) 579-2812
Fax = (408) 579-3000
Org = Extreme Networks
Page = 5
Line = 44
Subclause = 1.4
CommentType = Editorial
Comment =
 The term "Bridged Local Area Network" is not used in the document.
SuggestedRemedy =
 Delete the definition.

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

CommentNumber = 8
Name = Stephen Haddock
Email = shaddock@extremenetworks.com
Phone = (408) 579-2812
Fax = (408) 579-3000
Org = Extreme Networks
Page = 6
Line = 1
Subclause = 1.4
CommentType = Editorial
Comment =
 The term "Aggregate Conversation Rule" is not used in the document.
SuggestedRemedy =
 Delete the definition.

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept in principle. The definition to be removed is "Conversation Aggregation Rule".

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 9
Name = John L Messenger
Email = John.Messenger@8025.org
Phone = +44-1904-693409
Fax = +44-1904-693067
Org = Madge Networks
Page = 6
Line = 6
Subclause = 1.1
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = The text states that a MAC bridge is not an end station. This is not strictly the case. The elements of a MAC bridge which act as an end station (e.g., management, and those that speak spanning tree and GARP) might sensibly treat a set of aggregated ports as a single bridge port.
SuggestedRemedy = Perhaps the contradiction could be removed by restating the offending text as "A MAC Bridge, in its role of forwarding MAC frames from one LAN to another, is not an end station."

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept (with appropriate wordsmithing of the proposed change).

Resolution:

Accept.

CommentNumber = 10
Name = Stephen Haddock
Email = shaddock@extremenetworks.com
Phone = (408) 579-2812
Fax = (408) 579-3000
Org = Extreme Networks
Page = 6
Line = 8
Subclause = 1.4
CommentType = Editorial

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

Comment =

Although the term "Key" could have multiple uses, it is defined exclusively in a Link Aggregation context. In the case of Port and Link we defined terms "Aggregation Port" and "Aggregation Link" in subclause 1.4, and in clause 43 stated that within the clause these would be abbreviated to "port" and "link." The same approach should be used with "Key." It could also be extended to "System", "Actor", and "Partner."

SuggestedRemedy =

Change "Key" to "Aggregation Key".

Consider analogous change for "System", "Actor", and "Partner."

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept the change for Key and System. (Note that 43.1.1 already anticipates this usage in Clause 43. Some changes may be required to Clause 30 if this change is made, however.) Discuss the need to make this change with respect to Actor and Partner; these seem to be less "generic" terms.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 11

Name = Stephen Haddock

Email = shaddock@extremenetworks.com

Phone = (408) 579-2812

Fax = (408) 579-3000

Org = Extreme Networks

Page = 6

Line = 32

Subclause = 1.5

CommentType = Editorial

Comment =

There should not be a space in "LAGID".

SuggestedRemedy =

Delete the space.

EditorsRecommendation:

Reject. The usage elsewhere in the document is consistent with the abbreviation definition as it stands. (Alternative solution - delete this line and add an abbreviation def for ID?)

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 12

Name = Satoshi Obara

Email = oba@lantc.cs.fujitsu.co.jp

Phone = +81-45-474-1936

Fax = +81-45-470-1050

Org = Fujitsu Limited

Page = 6

Line = 36

Subclause = 1.5

CommentType = Technical

Comment = Abbreviation of "TLV" is needed.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

SuggestedRemedy = Add Abbreviation of "TLV" as follows;

TLV Type/Length/Value

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 13

Name = Howard M. Frazier, Jr.

Email = hfrazier@cisco.com

Phone = 408-527-7607

Fax = 408-527-8254

Org = Cisco Systems, Inc.

Page = 8

Line = 18

Subclause = 2.3.1.2

CommentType = Technical Required

Comment = I understand the reason for adding source_address and frame_check_sequence to the MA_DATA.request primitive.

It appears that source_address is necessary for the LACP, but I do not believe that frame_check_sequence is. Rather, frame_check_sequence was added to harmonize dot3 and dot1.

The problem is that the MAC defined in clause 4 has no facility for sending a frame without calculating and appending the FCS. Furthermore, while the TransmitFrame function has a parameter for the source address (sourceParam), it has no parameter for the frame check sequence.

So 802.3 is now significantly internally inconsistent, and this is the basis for my negative ballot.

SuggestedRemedy = Modify TransmitFrame in 4.2.8 to add parameter called fcsParam.

This parameter will be of type fcsValue, and is 33 bits wide.

The MSB of this parameter indicates whether the fcsParam is valid or not. So when TransmitFrame calls TransmitDataEncap, the procedure calculates and appends a new FCS if the MSB of fcsParam is "0" (zero), or simply uses the 32 LSBs of fcsParam if the MSB of fcsParam is "1" (one).

For the sake of completeness, fcsParam should also be added to the parameter list for ReceiveFrame in 4.2.9

EditorsRecommendation:

Reject. There has always been an inconsistency between the MA_UNITDATA-style ISO primitives as used in Clause 2 and the TransmitFrame/ReceiveFrame primitives used in Clause 4 (that were inherited from the original DIX Ethernet Specification). The changes to Clause 2 in this draft only serve to allow the use of the ISO primitives as required by Link Aggregation, and to improve the relationship between the ISO primitives in 802.3 and those in 802.1. While admittedly, there is still an inconsistency with respect to Clause 4, this is not new, and nothing is made worse by P802.3ad.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

Implementing the changes proposed by the commenter simply moves the inconsistency; the TransmitFrame/ReceiveFrame functions would then be inconsistent with the Pascal code. While changes could be made to the Pascal to implement the indicated functions (e.g., testing the bits of the fcsParam and conditionally generating the FCS), this is considered beyond the scope of P802.3ad.

Resolution:

Leave the SA change, but back out the fcs addition to the primitive. Make appropriate changes to Clause 43 for all uses and references to the fcs parameter.

CommentNumber = 14

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 11

Line = 41 & 48

Subclause = 30.2.1

CommentType = Technical

Comment = The object names "oLACPStatistics" and "oLACPDebugInformation" do not match the object names shown in Table 30-2, nor subclauses 30.7.3 and 30.7.4 to which the text refers.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the two instances of "oLACPStatistics" are changed to read "oAggPortStats" and the two instances of "oLACPDebugInformation" are changed to read "oAggPortDebugInformation".

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept. This correction is needed also in Figure 30-3.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 15

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 11

Line = 41 to 46

Subclause = 30.2.1

CommentType = Technical

Comment = The description of this managed object class seems to be out of date as Marker statistics are included as well as LACP statistics.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text "... additional statistics related to LACP activity on an instance of an Aggregation Port that is involved in Link Aggregation." is changed to read "... additional statistics related to LACP and Marker protocol activity on an instance of an Aggregation Port that is involved in Link Aggregation."

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 16

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 12

Line = 49

Subclause = 30.2.5

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = Typo.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text ".. specified in Table 2." should read ".. specified in Table 30-2."

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 17

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 13

Line = 11

Subclause = 30.2.5

CommentType = Technical

Comment = The object names shown for subclauses 30.7.3 and 30.7.4 do not match the object names shown in Table 30-2, nor in subclauses 30.7.3 and 30.7.4.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text "oLACPStatistics" is changed to read "oAggPortStats" and "oLACPDebugInformation" to read "oAggPortDebugInformation".

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 18

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 13

Line = 16 to 19

Subclause = 30.2.5

CommentType = Technical

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

Comment = The relationship between oMACControlEntity and oMACControlFunctionEntity was formally a one-to-many, it is now a one-to-one. I believe the one-to-many relationship was a provision for multiple MAC Control functions only one was defined at the time.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest that the relationship is restored to a one-to-many.

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 19

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 14

Line = 4 to 15

Subclause = 30.2.5

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = Suggest that the name of the package be changed from "LACP Statistics" to be "Aggregation Port Statistics" to match the package description in 30A.13.1 (Page 59).

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the column heading "LACP Statistics" should read "Aggregation Port Statistics" in this table and its continuation.

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 20

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 14

Line = 4 to 15

Subclause = 30.2.5

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = Suggest that the name of the package be changed from "LACP Debug Information" to be "Aggregation Port Debug Information" to match the package description in 30A.14.1 (Page 62).

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the column heading "LACP Debug Information" should read "Aggregation Port Debug Information" in this table and its continuation.

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 21

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 14

Line = 17

Subclause = 30.2.5

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = Add a cross reference to the oAggregator related subclause as is done in similar instances in Table 30-1.

SuggestedRemedy = Change the text "oAggregator" to read "oAggregator (30.7.1)".

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 22

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 14

Line = 44 to 49

Subclause = 30.2.5

CommentType = Technical

Comment = I am not sure why the 4 Attributes in the Optional Package column are marked "O" rather than "X" as is normal, even for Attributes in Optional Packages in Table 30-1.

SuggestedRemedy = Change the four instances of the text "O" to "X" in the Optional Package column of Table 30-2.

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

CommentNumber = 23
Name = David Law
Email = davel@pdd.3com.com
Phone = +44 1442 438060
Fax = +44 1442 438333
Org = 3Com
Page = 15
Line = 26
Subclause = 30.2.5
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = Add a cross reference to the oAggregationPort related subclause as is done in similar instances in Table 30-1.
SuggestedRemedy = Change the text "oAggregationPort" to read "oAggregationPort (30.7.2)".

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 24
Name = David Law
Email = davel@pdd.3com.com
Phone = +44 1442 438060
Fax = +44 1442 438333
Org = 3Com
Page = 16
Line = 22 & 35
Subclause = 30.2.5
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = Add a cross reference to the oAggPortStats and oAggPortDebugInformation related subclauses as is done in similar instances in Table 30-1.
SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text "oAggPortStats" is changed to read "oAggPortStats (30.7.3)" and Change the text "oAggPortDebugInformation" to read "oAggPortDebugInformation (30.7.4)".

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 25
Name = David Law
Email = davel@pdd.3com.com
Phone = +44 1442 438060
Fax = +44 1442 438333
Org = 3Com
Page = 17
Line = 30
Subclause = 30.2.5
CommentType = Technical

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

Comment = Doesn't the "Common Attributes Template" and the attribute "aCMCounter" lines have to be added to the bottom of Table 30-2 and "X" added to each package column where a counter is used.

SuggestedRemedy = Add the "Common Attributes Template" and the attribute "aCMCounter" lines to the bottom of Table 30-2 and add an "X" to each package column where a counter is used. See page 758 of IEEE 802.3-1998.

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 26

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 17

Line = 36

Subclause = 30.7.1

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = There are no actions for the oAggregator.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text ".. managed object class, attributes, actions and notifications." is changed to read ".. managed object class attributes and notifications."

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 27

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 18

Line = 15

Subclause = 30.7.1.1

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = Subclause 30.7.1.1 should be titled "Aggregator Attributes" and all the following attributes should go down a level, i.e. aAggID should be 30.7.1.1.1. There then should be a separate subclause titled 30.7.1.2

"Aggregator notifications" and the notifications should be a level under this.

For an example of this in the existing document have a look at 30.3.1.1 and 30.3.1.1.1 on Page 759 of IEEE 802.3-1998. This renumber, if accepted, would have to be carried out throughout this clause.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the subclauses be renumber as described in the comment.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 28

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 18

Line = 26

Subclause = 30.7.1.1

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = The semicolon should be at the end of the NOTE, not at the end of the behaviour description.

SuggestedRemedy = Move the semicolon to the end of the Note so it reads "..

ifIndex - see 30C.4.2.;"

EditorsRecommendation:

Reject. The NOTE is just that - a note to the reader for clarification, not a part of the behaviour description of the attribute.

Resolution:

Accept.

CommentNumber = 29

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 19

Line = 15 & 22

Subclause = 30.7.1.4

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = The semicolon should be at the end of the NOTE, not at the end of the behaviour description.

SuggestedRemedy = Move the semicolon to the end of the Note so it reads "..

aggregation capability (see 43.6).;"

EditorsRecommendation:

See Comment 28.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

CommentNumber = 30

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 21

Line = 40 & 41

Subclause = 30.7.1.13

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = It is normal practice within Clause 30 to capitalise GET and SET when referencing operations, see 30.3.1.1.16 on page 762 of IEEE802.3-1998 for an example.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text "A Get operation returns the current administrative state. A Set operation changes the administrative state to a .." should read "A GET operation returns the current administrative state. A SET operation changes the administrative state to a ..".

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 31

Name = John L Messenger

Email = John.Messenger@8025.org

Phone = +44-1904-693409

Fax = +44-1904-693067

Org = Madge Networks

Page = 22

Line = 48

Subclause = 30.7.1.17

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = The sentences in the APPROPRIATE SYNTAX sections of this and following objects do not end with punctuation, even where there are multiple sentences.

SuggestedRemedy = Add appropriate punctuation, for example full-stops at the end.

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 32

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 22

Line = 47

Subclause = 30.7.1.17

CommentType = Editorial

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

Comment = The term counts per second is usually used within Clause 30.
SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text ".. rate of 1 230 000 per second .." should read ".. rate of 1 230 000 counts per second ..". If this change is accepted it should be performed globally within Clause 30.

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 33
Name = David Law
Email = davel@pdd.3com.com
Phone = +44 1442 438060
Fax = +44 1442 438333
Org = 3Com
Page = 23
Line = 1
Subclause = 30.7.1.17
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = Strictly speaking I believe the semicolon within the text will be seen as the end of the behaviour definition.
SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text ".. 30.7.3.8, 30.7.3.9); however, it .." should read ".. 30.7.3.8, 30.7.3.9), however, it ..". If this change is accepted it should also be performed on subclause 30.7.1.19, 30.7.1.21 and 30.7.1.23

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 34
Name = David Law
Email = davel@pdd.3com.com
Phone = +44 1442 438060
Fax = +44 1442 438333
Org = 3Com
Page = 27
Line = 11
Subclause = 30.7.1.31
CommentType = Technical
Comment = aLinkUpDownNotificationEnable as referenced by this attribute does not exist, suggest this should be aAggLinkUpDownNotificationEnable
SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text "When aLinkUpDownNotificationEnable is .." should read "When aAggLinkUpDownNotificationEnable is ..". If this change is accepted it should also be performed on Line 12, 26 and 27 of this page.

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 35

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 27

Line = 11

Subclause = 30.7.1.31

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = Generally in Clause 30 when states are mentioned they are in all lower case and within quotes, for example Enabled would read "enabled". See 30.3.1.1.16 on page 762 of IEEE802.3-1998 for an example.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text '.. is set to Enabled, a Link Up ..' should read '.. is set to "enabled", a Link Up ..'. If this change is accepted this formatting change should be performed globally throughout the new Clause 30 contents within 802.3ad.

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 36

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 28

Line = 23

Subclause = 30.7.2.1

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = The semicolon should be at the end of the NOTE, not at the end of the behaviour description.

SuggestedRemedy = Move the semicolon to the end of the Note so it reads ".. see 30C.4.4.;"

EditorsRecommendation:

See Comment 28.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

CommentNumber = 37

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 28

Line = 4

Subclause = 30.7.1.34

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = Suggest a more direct pointer would be 43.2.3.1.1 rather than 43.2.3.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text "see 43.2.3" should read "43.2.3.1.1".

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 38

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 28

Line = 9

Subclause = 30.7.2

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = There are no actions nor notifications for the oAggregationPort.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text ".. managed object class, attributes, actions and notifications." is changed to read ".. managed object class attributes."

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 39

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 34

Line = 36

Subclause = 30.7.3

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = There are no actions nor notifications for the oAggPortStats.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text ".. managed object class, attributes, actions and notifications." is changed to read ".. managed object class attributes."

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 40

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 34

Line = 47

Subclause = 30.7.3.1

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = This subclause is the Aggregation Port Statistics managed object class yet the identifier refers to it as a LACP Statistics object.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text ".. identifies an LACP Statistics object instance .." is changed to read ".. identifies an Aggregation Port Statistics object instance .."

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 41

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 35

Line = 50

Subclause = 30.7.3.5

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = Suggest a cross reference be added to subclause 30.7.3.5 and 30.7.3.6 for Slow Protocols Ethernet Type value, Slow Protocols group MAC Address and Protocol Subtype.

SuggestedRemedy = See comment.

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

CommentNumber = 42
Name = David Law
Email = davel@pdd.3com.com
Phone = +44 1442 438060
Fax = +44 1442 438333
Org = 3Com
Page = 43
Line = 16
Subclause = 30A.11.1
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = Clause 30A usually uses GET-SET rather than GET-REPLACE.
SuggestedRemedy = Suggest that "GET-REPLACE" is globally replaced with "GET-SET".

EditorsRecommendation:

Reject. Correct usage in GDMO is GET-REPLACE (see the definition of the PACKAGE template in ISO/IEC 10165-4). The rest of Clause 30A does appear to use GET-SET, however, this is not acceptable GDMO (any legitimate GDMO syntax checker or compiler will reject it). We should issue a defect report on 802.3-1998, rather than perpetuate the error.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 43
Name = David Law
Email = davel@pdd.3com.com
Phone = +44 1442 438060
Fax = +44 1442 438333
Org = 3Com
Page = 43
Line = 20
Subclause = 30A.11.1
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = Comma missing after GET.
SuggestedRemedy = Suggest text "aAggAggregateOrIndividual GET" should read "aAggAggregateOrIndividual GET,"

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 44
Name = David Law
Email = davel@pdd.3com.com
Phone = +44 1442 438060
Fax = +44 1442 438333
Org = 3Com
Page = 44
Line = 28
Subclause = 30A.11.2
CommentType = Editorial

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

Comment = Addition space in behaviour label.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest that "b AggID" should read "bAggID".

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 45

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 47

Line = 52

Subclause = 30A.11.2

CommentType = Technical

Comment = The single line with "INTEGER" seem to be incorrect.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest single line that reads "INTEGER" should be deleted.

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 46

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 48

Line = 52 & 53

Subclause = 30A.11.2

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = The text on these lines should removed, the description of the counter is unnecessary and the maximum increment rate is correctly contained in a note further on in this attributes definition.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text "Generalized nonresettable counter. This counter has a maximum increment rate of 16 000 per second at 10 Mb/s" should be deleted.

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

CommentNumber = 47

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 49

Line = 15 & 16

Subclause = 30A.11.2

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = The text on these lines should removed, the description of the counter is unnecessary and the maximum increment rate is correctly contained in a note further on in this attributes definition.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text "Generalized nonresettable counter. This counter has a maximum increment rate of 16 000 per second at 10 Mb/s" should be deleted.

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 48

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 53

Line = 21

Subclause = 30A.12.1

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = There appears to be a missing "," after the GET on the line for the attribute "aAggPortPartnerOperState".

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text "aAggPortPartnerOperState GET" should read "aAggPortPartnerOperState GET,".

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 49

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 53

Line = 35

Subclause = 30A.12.1

CommentType = Editorial

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

Comment = There appears to be a missing ";" after the instance of the attribute name "aAggPortID".

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text "WITH ATTRIBUTE aAggPortID" should read "WITH ATTRIBUTE aAggPortID;".

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 50

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 59

Line = 40

Subclause = 30A.13.1

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = There appears to be a missing ";" after the instance of the attribute name "aAggPortStatsID".

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text "WITH ATTRIBUTE aAggPortStatsID" should read "WITH ATTRIBUTE aAggPortStatsID;"

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 51

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 67

Line = 13 to 54

Subclause = 30B.2

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = In the past we have no space between the "--" and the text of comments.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest that the space after the "--" of all comments is removed.

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

CommentNumber = 52
Name = David Law
Email = davel@pdd.3com.com
Phone = +44 1442 438060
Fax = +44 1442 438333
Org = 3Com
Page = 67
Line = 15
Subclause = 30B.2
CommentType = Technical
Comment = The range of integer should be included in the definition as has been done in the past, see OneOfName on page 1201 of IEEE 802.3-1998.
SuggestedRemedy = Change "INTEGER" to read "INTEGER (0..2³² - 1)". If accepted this should also be done for AggID, AggPortID, CollectorMaxDelay, Integer32, KeyValue, PortNumber and PriorityValue.

EditorsRecommendation:

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. The Editors assume that it is not the intent of this comment that all of these attributes should be 32 bit. Key, port number & port priority are all 16 bit unsigned integers in the PDU definition; we should not re-define these as 32 bit for management purposes.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 53
Name = David Law
Email = davel@pdd.3com.com
Phone = +44 1442 438060
Fax = +44 1442 438333
Org = 3Com
Page = 67
Line = 30
Subclause = 30B.2
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = Typo
SuggestedRemedy = change "BITSTRING" to read "BIT STRING"

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 54
Name = David Law
Email = davel@pdd.3com.com
Phone = +44 1442 438060
Fax = +44 1442 438333
Org = 3Com
Page = 67
Line = 30
Subclause = 30B.2
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = Typo.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text "PrintableString (SIZE 90..255)" should read "PrintableString (SIZE (0..255))".

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 55

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 67

Line = 44

Subclause = 30B.2

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = Typo, there should be no comma after the last item in the list.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text "matched (1)," should read "matched (1)".

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 56

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 69

Line = 13

Subclause = 30C.1

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = Typo.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text "This clause .." should read "This annex ..".

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

CommentNumber = 57
Name = Bob O'Hara
Email = bob@informed-technology.com
Phone = 408-986-9596
Fax = 408-727-2654
Org = Informed Technology, Inc.
Page = 70
Line = 2
Subclause = 30c.3
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = remove "even then". It is redundant with the clause at the beginning of the sentence.
SuggestedRemedy =

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 58
Name = Bob O'Hara
Email = bob@informed-technology.com
Phone = 408-986-9596
Fax = 408-727-2654
Org = Informed Technology, Inc.
Page = 70
Line = 8
Subclause = 30c.3
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = remove the comma from this line. It is grammatically incorrect.
SuggestedRemedy =

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 59
Name = Bob O'Hara
Email = bob@informed-technology.com
Phone = 408-986-9596
Fax = 408-727-2654
Org = Informed Technology, Inc.
Page = 70
Line = 9
Subclause = 30c.3
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = What does "indeed read-only" mean?
SuggestedRemedy = This sentence has something important to say. But I think that it can be better worded.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

EditorsRecommendation:

Change this sentence to read:

“It then becomes a user responsibility to ensure that the SNMP entity giving access to an instance of this MIB is properly configured to give access only to those principals (users) that have legitimate rights to read and/or SET (change/create/delete) them, as appropriate.”

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 60

Name = John L Messenger

Email = John.Messenger@8025.org

Phone = +44-1904-693409

Fax = +44-1904-693067

Org = Madge Networks

Page = 105

Line = 26

Subclause = 43.1.3

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = The data link layer is shown as excluding the MAC client. Generic 802 networks use LLC (and 802.3 can too). LLC is part of the data link layer.

SuggestedRemedy = Adjust diagram to show this.

EditorsRecommendation:

The MAC Client may be either within the Data Link (e.g., LLC or a Bridge Relay Entity) or above it (e.g., an IP entity). Discuss whether it is important to present this distinction, and how to do so if desired.

Resolution:

Accept.

CommentNumber = 61

Name = John L Messenger

Email = John.Messenger@8025.org

Phone = +44-1904-693409

Fax = +44-1904-693067

Org = Madge Networks

Page = 105

Line = 0

Subclause = 43.1.2

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = The top line of the page is very much too high, so that the reader can easily miss it. It is well above line 1.

SuggestedRemedy = Fix.

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

CommentNumber = 62
Name = David Law
Email = davel@pdd.3com.com
Phone = +44 1442 438060
Fax = +44 1442 438333
Org = 3Com
Page = 105
Line = 24 to 26
Subclause = 43.1.3
CommentType = Technical
Comment = Figure 43-1. The MAC Client, for example the LLC, is part of the Data Link layer.
SuggestedRemedy = Suggest that in Figure 43-1 the dotted line from the top of the Data Link layer to the top of the Link Aggregation sublayer should be from the top of the Data Link layer to the top of the MAC Client sublayer.

EditorsRecommendation:
See comment 60.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 63
Name = David Law
Email = davel@pdd.3com.com
Phone = +44 1442 438060
Fax = +44 1442 438333
Org = 3Com
Page = 105
Line = 25
Subclause = 43.1.3
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = Figure 43-1. Suggest that the usual examples of MAC Client be added to the MAC Client sublayer.
SuggestedRemedy = Suggest that the text "MAC CLIENT" should read "MAC CLIENT (BRIDGE RELAY ENTITY, LLC, etc.)".

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept. See also Comment 60.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 64
Name = John L Messenger
Email = John.Messenger@8025.org
Phone = +44-1904-693409
Fax = +44-1904-693067
Org = Madge Networks
Page = 106
Line = 51
Subclause = 43.2
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = Comma before "and 43.5".

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

SuggestedRemedy = Remove the comma.

EditorsRecommendation:

Reject. The format is correct as is. (Note: This is the accepted usage in 802 standards, and will be corrected to the current form as a matter of course by the IEEE editors prior to publication, regardless of what we decide to do in the draft.)

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 65
Name = John L Messenger
Email = John.Messenger@8025.org
Phone = +44-1904-693409
Fax = +44-1904-693067
Org = Madge Networks
Page = 107
Line = 41
Subclause = 43.2
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = Comma before "and monitoring".
SuggestedRemedy = Remove the comma.

EditorsRecommendation:

See comment 64.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 66
Name = John L Messenger
Email = John.Messenger@8025.org
Phone = +44-1904-693409
Fax = +44-1904-693067
Org = Madge Networks
Page = 107
Line = 43
Subclause = 43.2
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = On line 43, is it necessary to use the word "aggregatability"? "Aggregation" already exists and seems to fit the bill.
SuggestedRemedy = Use "aggregation" unless you don't want to!

EditorsRecommendation:

"Aggregatability" seems correct here. LACP is not just determining the level of aggregation, but that level that may be achievable (aggregatability vs. aggregation).

Resolution:

Change "aggregatability" to "aggregation capability" (two places, and global check)

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

CommentNumber = 67
Name = John L Messenger
Email = John.Messenger@8025.org
Phone = +44-1904-693409
Fax = +44-1904-693067
Org = Madge Networks
Page = 107
Line = 46
Subclause = 43.2
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = Missing closing parenthesis after "1.4".
SuggestedRemedy = Add ")".

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 68
Name = David Law
Email = davel@pdd.3com.com
Phone = +44 1442 438060
Fax = +44 1442 438333
Org = 3Com
Page = 107
Line = 46
Subclause = 43.2.1
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = Typo, missing close brackets.
SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text "(known as conversations, see 1.4." should read "(known as conversations, see 1.4)."

EditorsRecommendation:
See comment 67.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 69
Name = John L Messenger
Email = John.Messenger@8025.org
Phone = +44-1904-693409
Fax = +44-1904-693067
Org = Madge Networks
Page = 108
Line = 15
Subclause = 43.2
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = Bad line break between "Clause" and "2".
SuggestedRemedy = Make unbreakable.

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 70

Name = John L Messenger

Email = John.Messenger@8025.org

Phone = +44-1904-693409

Fax = +44-1904-693067

Org = Madge Networks

Page = 108

Line = 18

Subclause = 43.2

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = The text says that there is internal communication between <something> and the LACP. You can't communicate to a protocol.

SuggestedRemedy = Say "Link Aggregation Control" (the entity) instead of LACP.

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 71

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 110

Line = 4

Subclause = 43.2.3.1.4

CommentType = Technical

Comment = Need to show a condition for the open arrow entry into the WAIT FOR RECEIVE state.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest that "BEGIN" should read "BEGIN = TRUE" as in Figure 43-10 (Page 140).

EditorsRecommendation:

Reject. Both conventions are used within 802.3. BEGIN is present in the variable lists for these state machines and is defined to be a Boolean variable. Given that the exit conditions from states in these diagrams are defined to be Boolean expressions, with the branch being taken if the expression evaluates to TRUE, then "BEGIN" and "BEGIN = TRUE" are exactly equivalent Boolean expressions and therefore both are legitimate usage.

Resolution:

Withdrawn.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

CommentNumber = 72
Name = David Law
Email = davel@pdd.3com.com
Phone = +44 1442 438060
Fax = +44 1442 438333
Org = 3Com
Page = 111
Line = 33
Subclause = 43.2.4.1.3
CommentType = Technical
Comment = Need to show a condition for the open arrow entry into the WAIT FOR TRANSMIT state.
SuggestedRemedy = Suggest that "BEGIN" should read "BEGIN = TRUE" as in Figure 43-10 (Page 140).

EditorsRecommendation:
See comment 71.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 73
Name = John L Messenger
Email = John.Messenger@8025.org
Phone = +44-1904-693409
Fax = +44-1904-693067
Org = Madge Networks
Page = 111
Line = 51
Subclause = 43.2.4.1.3
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = The Note is formatted incorrectly.
SuggestedRemedy = Use "Note-blah", where the "-" is an em-dash.

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 74
Name = John L Messenger
Email = John.Messenger@8025.org
Phone = +44-1904-693409
Fax = +44-1904-693067
Org = Madge Networks
Page = 111
Line = 51
Subclause = 43.2.4.1.3
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = MA_DATA.request() is not the way you've usually notated this.
SuggestedRemedy = Remove the "()" after MA_DATA.request.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

EditorsRecommendation:

Reject. The “()” notation is intended to reflect that the primitive normally takes a set of parameters; it’s just that the exact parameter values are irrelevant for the purpose of the Note.

Resolution:

Accept.

CommentNumber = 75

Name = John L Messenger

Email = John.Messenger@8025.org

Phone = +44-1904-693409

Fax = +44-1904-693067

Org = Madge Networks

Page = 112

Line = 41

Subclause = 43.2.7.1.1

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = "see table 43B-1" is not a sentence.

SuggestedRemedy = Reformat like in line 44, with a capital letter and a full-stop.

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 76

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 114

Line = 4

Subclause = 43.2.7.1.4

CommentType = Technical

Comment = Need to show a condition for the open arrow entry into the WAIT FOR RECEIVE state.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest that "BEGIN" should read "BEGIN = TRUE" as in Figure 43-10 (Page 140).

EditorsRecommendation:

See comment 71.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

CommentNumber = 77
Name = Stephen Haddock
Email = shaddock@extremenetworks.com
Phone = (408) 579-2812
Fax = (408) 579-3000
Org = Extreme Networks
Page = 114
Line = 35
Subclause = 43.2.7.1
CommentType = Editorial
Comment =

The note on Figure 43-5 has the last character of each line clipped (a missing "t" on "port" and a missing period following "discarded"). May be a .pdf distiller artifact.

SuggestedRemedy =
Insert the missing characters.

EditorsRecommendation:

This appears to be a pdf READER artifact; my copy does not exhibit this problem. No action required.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 78
Name = John L Messenger
Email = John.Messenger@8025.org
Phone = +44-1904-693409
Fax = +44-1904-693067
Org = Madge Networks
Page = 115
Line = 27
Subclause = 43.2.9.1.1
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = "see table 43B-1" is not a sentence.
SuggestedRemedy = Reformat like in line 31, with a capital letter and a full-stop.

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 79
Name = David Law
Email = davel@pdd.3com.com
Phone = +44 1442 438060
Fax = +44 1442 438333
Org = 3Com
Page = 115
Line = 30
Subclause = 43.2.9.1.1
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = Suggest a better reference for the Slow Protocol Length/Type field would be Table 43B-2.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text "(See Annex 43B.)" should read "(See Table 43B-2.)"

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 80

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 115

Line = 33

Subclause = 43.2.9.1.1

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = Suggest a better reference for the Subtype field would be Table 43B-3.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text "(See 43.4.2.)" should read "(See Table 43B-3.)"

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 81

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 116

Line = 16

Subclause = 43.2.9.1.4

CommentType = Technical

Comment = Need to show a condition for the open arrow entry into the WAIT FOR RECEIVE state.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest that "BEGIN" should read "BEGIN = TRUE" as in Figure 43-10 (Page 140).

EditorsRecommendation:

See comment 71.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

CommentNumber = 82
Name = David Law
Email = davel@pdd.3com.com
Phone = +44 1442 438060
Fax = +44 1442 438333
Org = 3Com
Page = 116
Line = 52
Subclause = 43.2.10
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = Typo.
SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text ".. the globally_unique individual.." should read ".. the globally-unique individual ..".

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 83
Name = John L Messenger
Email = John.Messenger@8025.org
Phone = +44-1904-693409
Fax = +44-1904-693067
Org = Madge Networks
Page = 116
Line = 52
Subclause = 43.2.10
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = "globally_unique" has a typo.
SuggestedRemedy = Use a hyphen, not an underscore.

EditorsRecommendation:
See comment 83.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 84
Name = John L Messenger
Email = John.Messenger@8025.org
Phone = +44-1904-693409
Fax = +44-1904-693067
Org = Madge Networks
Page = 117
Line = 15
Subclause = 43.3
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = "LACP" has already been introduced, so I think it's not helpful to specify the abbreviation here.
SuggestedRemedy = Suggest removing "(LACP)".

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept in principle. As we have already introduced the abbreviation earlier in the text, the appropriate thing to do is to use the abbreviation & remove the expansion. If we don't do this ourselves, it will be done by the IEEE editor prior to publication.

Resolution:

Accept, recognizing that the IEEE Editor may change the presentation later.

CommentNumber = 85

Name = John L Messenger

Email = John.Messenger@8025.org

Phone = +44-1904-693409

Fax = +44-1904-693067

Org = Madge Networks

Page = 117

Line = 30

Subclause = 43.3

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = Partner system: this has previously been termed "Partner System", referring to the term defined in 1.4.

SuggestedRemedy = Use consistent capitalisation. (802.5's obsession with capitalisation is destined to migrate.)

EditorsRecommendation:

Do whatever is necessary to prevent the migration of 802.5's obsessions.

Resolution:

Consistently Capitalize.

CommentNumber = 86

Name = John L Messenger

Email = John.Messenger@8025.org

Phone = +44-1904-693409

Fax = +44-1904-693067

Org = Madge Networks

Page = 117

Line = 36

Subclause = 43.3

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = This is point (e), but it is in a different list, so it should start again as point (a). This point is not part of what LAC does for each aggregatable port.

SuggestedRemedy = Make this point (a) again.

EditorsRecommendation:

The form as shown is correct per IEEE standards practices. List elements must be unique within a subclause.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

CommentNumber = 87
Name = John L Messenger
Email = John.Messenger@8025.org
Phone = +44-1904-693409
Fax = +44-1904-693067
Org = Madge Networks
Page = 117
Line = 40
Subclause = 43.3
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = The other points refer to "monitoring", "checking" and "controlling" but (h) says "removal" (twice).
SuggestedRemedy = Change "removal" to "removing".

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 88
Name = John L Messenger
Email = John.Messenger@8025.org
Phone = +44-1904-693409
Fax = +44-1904-693067
Org = Madge Networks
Page = 117
Line = 47
Subclause = 43.3
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = Should "System" be capitalised to be consistent with earlier usage and to indicate a reference to the term defined in 1.4? (Also line 50).
SuggestedRemedy = Use consistent capitalisation.

EditorsRecommendation:
See comment 85.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 89
Name = John L Messenger
Email = John.Messenger@8025.org
Phone = +44-1904-693409
Fax = +44-1904-693067
Org = Madge Networks
Page = 119
Line = 17
Subclause = 43.3.4
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = "within the constraint that ..." sounds false.
SuggestedRemedy = Suggest "with the constraint that".

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

EditorsRecommendation:

Change to:

“Port Numbers (and hence, Port Identifiers) shall be uniquely assigned within a system. Port Number 0 shall not be assigned to any port.”

Also, remove the second comma from the prior sentence.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation, but leave the comma.

CommentNumber = 90

Name = John L Messenger

Email = John.Messenger@8025.org

Phone = +44-1904-693409

Fax = +44-1904-693067

Org = Madge Networks

Page = 119

Line = 33

Subclause = 43.3.4

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = "duplexity" is not a word.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest avoiding too many made-up words!

EditorsRecommendation:

Reject. Duplexity IS a word, and is used correctly here. (This issue was similarly raised and resolved during WG ballot.)

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 91

Name = John L Messenger

Email = John.Messenger@8025.org

Phone = +44-1904-693409

Fax = +44-1904-693067

Org = Madge Networks

Page = 119

Line = 51

Subclause = 43.3.5

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = In this sentence, the "i.e." doesn't read cleanly. "A given Key value is meaningful only in the context of the system that allocates it, i.e. there is no global significance to Key values."

SuggestedRemedy = My preference would be either to replace the ", i.e." with an em-dash, or to simply make the two halved separate sentences and drop the "i.e.".

EditorsRecommendation:

While the sentence as it stands reads cleanly to this editor, the suggested remedy would not make it catastrophically worse.

Resolution:

Replace “, i.e. “ with a semicolon.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

CommentNumber = 92
Name = John L Messenger
Email = John.Messenger@8025.org
Phone = +44-1904-693409
Fax = +44-1904-693067
Org = Madge Networks
Page = 120
Line = 12
Subclause = 43.3.5
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = The "i.e." clause is not the only possible reason that the link might be catagorised as individual. Alternatively it could be management or the fact that there are no other links to the same Partner. Thus this is an example.
SuggestedRemedy = Say "e.g." instead of "i.e.".

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept in principle. Suggest re-wording of the second sentence as follows:

A system may declare a link to be Individual if the inherent properties of the link allow its use as part of an aggregation, but the system is aware of no other links that are capable of aggregating with this link (e.g., the system has allocated a unique operational Key value to the link).

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 93
Name = Stephen Haddock
Email = shaddock@extremenetworks.com
Phone = (408) 579-2812
Fax = (408) 579-3000
Org = Extreme Networks
Page = 120
Line = 29
Subclause = 43.3.5
CommentType = Editorial
Comment =
 No hyphen in the split of "individual" across lines.
SuggestedRemedy =
 Split "individual" properly.

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept. Disable automatic hyphenation for this word.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 94
Name = John L Messenger
Email = John.Messenger@8025.org
Phone = +44-1904-693409
Fax = +44-1904-693067
Org = Madge Networks
Page = 122
Line = 50
Subclause = 43.3.9

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

CommentType = Editorial
Comment = Format of Note is wrong.
SuggestedRemedy = Use an em-dash not a hyphen after "Note".

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 95
Name = John L Messenger
Email = John.Messenger@8025.org
Phone = +44-1904-693409
Fax = +44-1904-693067
Org = Madge Networks
Page = 123
Line = 27
Subclause = 43.3.10
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = Marker Protocol is over-capitalised.
SuggestedRemedy = Say "Marker protocol" for consistency with usage elsewhere in the document.

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 96
Name = John L Messenger
Email = John.Messenger@8025.org
Phone = +44-1904-693409
Fax = +44-1904-693067
Org = Madge Networks
Page = 123
Line = 40
Subclause = 43.3.10
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = Format of Note is wrong.
SuggestedRemedy = Use an em-dash after "Note".

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

CommentNumber = 97

Name = John L Messenger

Email = John.Messenger@8025.org

Phone = +44-1904-693409

Fax = +44-1904-693067

Org = Madge Networks

Page = 128

Line = 20

Subclause = 43.4.2.2

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = This note is numbered NOTE 1, and there are subsequent notes numbered 2 and 3. I can't see a justification for numbering these notes, as other notes in surrounding subclauses are not numbered.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest removing the numbers.

EditorsRecommendation:

Reject. IEEE standards practice requires the numbering of Notes when there are more than one in a given subclause.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 98

Name = John L Messenger

Email = John.Messenger@8025.org

Phone = +44-1904-693409

Fax = +44-1904-693067

Org = Madge Networks

Page = 129

Line = 19

Subclause = 43.4.2

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = In this note, there is a space missing in "TheReserved".

SuggestedRemedy = Add a space between "The" and "Reserved".

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 99

Name = John L Messenger

Email = John.Messenger@8025.org

Phone = +44-1904-693409

Fax = +44-1904-693067

Org = Madge Networks

Page = 129

Line = 37

Subclause = 43.4.3

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = This notation "blah - clause-no" used in 37, 42 and on page 130 in lines 1 and 4, is unattractive and inconsistent with notation used earlier in the document. This clause has the feel of being written by someone other than Tony.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

SuggestedRemedy = Correct this oversight :). Use a consistent style for references. Hyphens are not good.

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept in principle. Change notation style to be consistent. Adjust Tony's medication to deal with his multiple-personality disorder.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 100

Name = John L Messenger

Email = John.Messenger@8025.org

Phone = +44-1904-693409

Fax = +44-1904-693067

Org = Madge Networks

Page = 130

Line = 1

Subclause = 43.4.3

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = Title of this bullet point is not italicised.

SuggestedRemedy = Italicise it for consistency with the surrounding ones.

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 101

Name = Stephen Haddock

Email = shaddock@extremenetworks.com

Phone = (408) 579-2812

Fax = (408) 579-3000

Org = Extreme Networks

Page = 133

Line = 54

Subclause = 43.4.7

CommentType = Editorial

Comment =

The list of variables in the Actor_Admin_Port_State is almost, but not quite, in the same order as the corresponding bits when transmitted in a LACPDU. Lacking any reason for the difference, might as well make the order the same. Same case for Actor_Oper_Port_State, Partner_Admin_Port_State, and Partner_Oper_Port_State.

SuggestedRemedy =

Swap "Expired" and "Defaulted" in the list(s).

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

CommentNumber = 102

Name = John L Messenger

Email = John.Messenger@8025.org

Phone = +44-1904-693409

Fax = +44-1904-693067

Org = Madge Networks

Page = 136

Line = 1

Subclause = 43.4.7

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = "Implementation-dependent". I am not familiar with 802.3 usage of this term. I didn't think we spoke about implementations that much. My preference is to say "not specified".

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest saying "is not specified by this standard".

EditorsRecommendation:

Reject. This is the proper use of "implementation dependent" within 802.3.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 103

Name = Peter M. Kelly

Email = bjkelly@dc.infi.net

Phone = 703-276-8882

Fax = 703-276-8883

Org = Independent Consultant

Page = 137

Line = 25

Subclause = 43.4.9

CommentType = Technical

Comment = The sentence with reference to parameters deleted for clarity now reads:

"This function records the parameter values for the Actor carried in a received LACPDU as the current Partner operational parameter values and sets Actor_Oper_Port_State_Defaulted to FALSE."

SuggestedRemedy = The sentence with reference to parameters deleted for clarity should read:

"This function records the parameter values for the Actor carried in a received LACPDU as the current Partner operational parameter values and sets Partner_Oper_Port_State_Defaulted to FALSE."

EditorsRecommendation:

Reject. The current text is correct. The sense of this is that if a PDU has been received (by the Actor), then the Actor is not using default values for the Partner's parameters, and therefore signals as such in any subsequent outgoing PDU. The change as proposed would not convey the right information to the Partner - effectively the Actor would be saying "I think you are using defaulted information", which is a judgement that it cannot make. Take a look at the definition of this bit in the PDU (page 128 lines 12-15).

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

CommentNumber = 104
Name = Stephen Haddock
Email = shaddock@extremenetworks.com
Phone = (408) 579-2812
Fax = (408) 579-3000
Org = Extreme Networks
Page = 137
Line = 36
Subclause = 43.4.9
CommentType = Technical
Comment =

For expected operation of the Mux Machine when the Receive Machine is in the DEFAULTED or LACP_DISABLED states, the Partner_Oper_Port_State.Collecting bit needs to be TRUE.

SuggestedRemedy =

Any of:

- a) Add "and sets Partner_Oper_Port_State.Collecting to TRUE" to the end of the recordDefault function, or
- b) Add "Partner_Oper_Port_State.Collecting <= TRUE" to the DEFAULTED and LACP_DISABLED states of the Receive Machine in Figure 43-10 page 140, or
- c) Require that the value of Partner_Admin_Port_State.Collecting always be TRUE.

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept - prefer a) or b), as c) is more obscure.

Resolution:

AIP. Add a statement to p135 line 30 that the value of Collecting shall be set the same as the value of Synchronization.

CommentNumber = 105
Name = Peter M. Kelly
Email = bjkelly@dc.infi.net
Phone = 703-276-8882
Fax = 703-276-8883
Org = Independent Consultant
Page = 137
Line = 37
Subclause = 43.4.9
CommentType = Technical
Comment = The sentence with reference to parameters deleted for clarity reads:

"This function records the default parameter values for the Partner carried in Partner Admin parameters as the current Partner operational values and sets Actor_Oper_Port_State_Defaulted to TRUE."

SuggestedRemedy = Corrected the sentence with references deleted for clarity should read:

"This function records the default parameter values for the Partner carried in Partner Admin parameters as the current Partner operational parameter values and sets Partner_Oper_Port_State_Defaulted to TRUE."

EditorsRecommendation:

Reject. See comment 103 - this is the reverse case, where the Actor needs to signal that it is using defaulted Partner information.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 106
Name = Stephen Haddock
Email = shaddock@extremenetworks.com
Phone = (408) 579-2812
Fax = (408) 579-3000
Org = Extreme Networks
Page = 140
Line = 24
Subclause = 43.4.12
CommentType = Technical
Comment =

In the EXPIRED state the current_while_timer is started with the Short_Timeout value, but the Actor_Oper_Port_State.LACP_Timeout bit is not set to Short_Timeout. This means that the Partner is not aware that the Actor is using the Short_Timeout value, so the Partner may not use the Fast_Periodic transmission rate. The text on page 141 line 26 states that the Actor's LACP_Timeout variable is set to Short_Timeout.

SuggestedRemedy =

Add "Actor_Oper_Port_State.LACP_Timeout <= Short_Timeout" to the EXPIRED state.

Add "Actor_Oper_Port_State.LACP_Timeout <= Actor_Admin_Port_State.LACP_Timeout" to the CURRENT state.

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Reject in principle. Change p 141 l26 to delete "Actor's and" and l27 change "are" to "is", and other singularities.

CommentNumber = 107
Name = Stephen Haddock
Email = shaddock@extremenetworks.com
Phone = (408) 579-2812
Fax = (408) 579-3000
Org = Extreme Networks
Page = 140
Line = 22
Subclause = 43.4.12
CommentType = Technical Required
Comment =

There are several places in the Receive Machine where the value of the Matched variable is changed without updating the value of the Partner_Oper_Port_State.Synchronization bit. The Matched variable is intended to be used as a qualifier on the synchronization state advertised by the Partner. As the Matched variable is a local variable in the Receive Machine, it can be eliminated by having the state machine manipulate the Partner_Oper_Port_State.Synchronization bit directly.

SuggestedRemedy =

Delete the Matched variable definition in 43.4.8 page 136 lines 43-46.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

Replace Matched <= TRUE with Partner_Oper_Port_State.Synchronization <= TRUE in the LACP_DISABLED and DEFAULTED states of the Receive Machine in Figure 43-10 page 140.

Replace Matched <= FALSE with Partner_Oper_Port_State.Synchronization <= FALSE in the PORT_DISABLED and EXPIRED states of the Receive Machine in Figure 43-10 page 140.

Partner_Oper_Port_State.Synchronization should be initialized to FALSE in the INITIALIZE state, either explicitly or by requiring that Partner_Admin_Port_State.Synchronization always be set FALSE so that recordDefault properly initializes the variable.

In the choose_Matched function on page 138, replace all instance "Matched" with "Partner_Oper_Port_State.Synchronization". (Because of the state machine conventions that say all actions are executed sequentially but take zero time, this could result in an infinitely short glitch on Partner_Oper_Port_State.Synchronization which could then ripple through the Mux Machine. This is probably and non-problem, but a possible alternate remedy is to eliminate the choose_Matched function and move all of it's text into the recordPDU function.)

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept.

Resolution:

Accept in principle.

Delete the Matched variable definition in 43.4.8 page 136 lines 43-46.

Delete Matched <= TRUE in the LACP_DISABLED and DEFAULTED states of the Receive Machine in Figure 43-10 page 140.

Replace Matched <= FALSE with Partner_Oper_Port_State.Synchronization <= FALSE in the PORT_DISABLED and EXPIRED states of the Receive Machine in Figure 43-10 page 140.

In the choose_Matched function on page 138, replace all instance "Matched" with "Partner_Oper_Port_State.Synchronization". Within the recordPDU function, record the partnerOperPortStateVariables WITH THE EXCEPTION of synchronization. Replace the last sentence of recordPDU with the entire chooseMatched function text, and eliminate the chooseMatched function from the function list and state machine.

CommentNumber = 108
Name = John L Messenger
Email = John.Messenger@8025.org
Phone = +44-1904-693409
Fax = +44-1904-693067
Org = Madge Networks
Page = 141
Line = 12
Subclause = 43.4.12

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = Here's another "NOTE 1", also other numbered notes. There are at least two Note 1s in this document.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest removing the numbers.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

EditorsRecommendation:
See comment 97.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 109
Name = John L Messenger
Email = John.Messenger@8025.org
Phone = +44-1904-693409
Fax = +44-1904-693067
Org = Madge Networks
Page = 141
Line = 8
Subclause = 43.4.12
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = Use of "TRUE" and "FALSE". Earlier in the document, "True" and "False" were used instead and I find these easier to read.
There's also the question of whether so many upper-case terms like "SELECTED" are appropriate in the text. One might consider using "Selected" in the text and "SELECTED" in the diagram??
SuggestedRemedy = Think about it, but be consistent.

EditorsRecommendation:
After accepting the first part of the suggested remedy (i.e., thinking about it), it seems clear that in order to accept the second part of the suggested remedy (i.e., being consistent) one must use the same case for the same terms whether used in the text or in a state diagram. Since the diagram convention calls for upper-case, the use of upper-case for the text seems appropriate.

Resolution:

Accept. Use all caps for descriptions of specific states of specific variables. Global check for consistency.

CommentNumber = 110
Name = John L Messenger
Email = John.Messenger@8025.org
Phone = +44-1904-693409
Fax = +44-1904-693067
Org = Madge Networks
Page = 142
Line = 45
Subclause = 43.4.12
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = Titles of these list items. Previously such things have been italicised.
SuggestedRemedy = My preference is to italicise the terms NO_PERIODIC, FAST_PERIODIC, etc., appearing as the titles of the list items.

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept and italicize.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

CommentNumber = 111
Name = John L Messenger
Email = John.Messenger@8025.org
Phone = +44-1904-693409
Fax = +44-1904-693067
Org = Madge Networks
Page = 143
Line = 16
Subclause = 43.4.14
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = More numbered notes.
SuggestedRemedy = Get rid of the numbers.

EditorsRecommendation:
See comment 97.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 112
Name = Stephen Haddock
Email = shaddock@extremenetworks.com
Phone = (408) 579-2812
Fax = (408) 579-3000
Org = Extreme Networks
Page = 143
Line = 17
Subclause = 43.4.14
CommentType = Editorial
Comment =
 No hyphen in the split of "aggregation" across lines.
SuggestedRemedy =
 Split "aggregation" properly.

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept. Turn off automatic hyphenation for this word.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 113
Name = John L Messenger
Email = John.Messenger@8025.org
Phone = +44-1904-693409
Fax = +44-1904-693067
Org = Madge Networks
Page = 146
Line = 27
Subclause = 43.4.15
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = Missing space.
SuggestedRemedy = Repace "stateand" with "state and".

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 114

Name = Stephen Haddock

Email = shaddock@extremenetworks.com

Phone = (408) 579-2812

Fax = (408) 579-3000

Org = Extreme Networks

Page = 146

Line = 27

Subclause = 43.4.15

CommentType = Editorial

Comment =

Missing space in "stateand".

SuggestedRemedy =

Insert a space.

EditorsRecommendation:

See comment 113.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 115

Name = John L Messenger

Email = John.Messenger@8025.org

Phone = +44-1904-693409

Fax = +44-1904-693067

Org = Madge Networks

Page = 146

Line = 46

Subclause = 43.4.15

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = This numbered note is the only one in its subclause.

SuggestedRemedy = Get rid of the number.

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

CommentNumber = 116
Name = John L Messenger
Email = John.Messenger@8025.org
Phone = +44-1904-693409
Fax = +44-1904-693067
Org = Madge Networks
Page = 146
Line = 46
Subclause = 43.4.17
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = " - " would be better as an em-dash, or as a comma.
SuggestedRemedy = Suggest changing as above.

EditorsRecommendation:
I cannot find the item to which the commenter is referring.

Resolution:

AIP. Global search for "space-hyphen-space" and correct as needed.

CommentNumber = 117
Name = Stephen Haddock
Email = shaddock@extremenetworks.com
Phone = (408) 579-2812
Fax = (408) 579-3000
Org = Extreme Networks
Page = 147
Line = 48
Subclause = 43.4.15
CommentType = Editorial
Comment =
 Extra period in ".state".
SuggestedRemedy =
 Delete the period.

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 118
Name = Tony Jeffree
Email = tony@jeffree.co.uk
Phone = +44-161-973-4278
Fax = +44-161-973-6534
Org = Independent consultant
Page = 147, 149
Line =
Subclause = Figures 43-13 and 43-14
CommentType = Technical Required
Comment = As indicated in the Errata published with the draft, corrections are needed to these state machines.
SuggestedRemedy = Replace the state machine diagrams Figure 43-13 ad Figure 43-14 with the corrected versions that were published as Errata sheets accompanying Draft 3.0.

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 119

Name = Stephen Haddock

Email = shaddock@extremenetworks.com

Phone = (408) 579-2812

Fax = (408) 579-3000

Org = Extreme Networks

Page = 148

Line = 1

Subclause = 43.4.15

CommentType = Editorial

Comment =

Strictly speaking, a "change in the value" of

Partner_Oper_Port_State.Synchronization is not required to transition to the COLLECTING state. The only requirement is that the value is TRUE.

SuggestedRemedy =

Replace "change in the value of

Partner_Oper_Port_State.Synchronization to TRUE" with "a TRUE value for Partner_Oper_Port_State.Synchronization".

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 120

Name = Stephen Haddock

Email = shaddock@extremenetworks.com

Phone = (408) 579-2812

Fax = (408) 579-3000

Org = Extreme Networks

Page = 149

Line = 1

Subclause = 43.4.15

CommentType = Editorial

Comment =

Figure 43-14 is awkwardly placed because it appears after the beginning of the next subclause.

SuggestedRemedy =

Try to position Figure 43-14 on page 148.

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

CommentNumber = 121
Name = David Law
Email = davel@pdd.3com.com
Phone = +44 1442 438060
Fax = +44 1442 438333
Org = 3Com
Page = 150
Line = 5
Subclause = 43.4.17
CommentType = Technical
Comment = This paragraph refers to "LACP Monitoring package" however page 62 refers to the "Aggregation Port Debug Information package", suggest this text should match the name found on page 62.
SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text ".. functionality (the LACP Monitoring package) is .." should read ".. functionality (the Aggregation Port Debug Information package) is ..".

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 122
Name = David Law
Email = davel@pdd.3com.com
Phone = +44 1442 438060
Fax = +44 1442 438333
Org = 3Com
Page = 151
Line = 27
Subclause = 43.5.1
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = Link Aggregation is the sublayer, not Link Aggregation Control which seems to be a function within the sublayer.
SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text ".. Actor's Link Aggregation Control sublayer .." should read ".. Actor's Link Aggregation sublayer ..".

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 123
Name = Stephen Haddock
Email = shaddock@extremenetworks.com
Phone = (408) 579-2812
Fax = (408) 579-3000
Org = Extreme Networks
Page = 151
Line = 44
Subclause = 43.5.1

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

CommentType = Editorial

Comment =

The Mux states associated with a port are "Collecting" and "Distributing".

SuggestedRemedy =

Replace "collector and distributor" with "Collecting and Distributing".

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 124

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 153

Line = 33

Subclause = 43.5.3.1

CommentType = Technical

Comment = The shall statement with regards to the Source address here seems to be redundant as there is already a shall statement that applies to the entire itemised list on Page 152, Line 40 above. Removing this shall will allow the removal of the related PICS item, FP8 (Page 167, line 22). If not I believe that item FP8 needs to be split into two items, one for a Marker PDU and one for Marker Response PDU.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text ".. Marker Response PDUs shall carry the individual MAC .." should read ".. Marker Response PDUs is the individual MAC .."

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 125

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 155

Line = 9

Subclause = 43.5.4.2.1

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = Suggest a better reference for the Slow reserved multicast address would be Table 43B-1.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text "(See Annex 43B.)" should read "(See Table 43B-1.)"

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 126

Name = Stephen Haddock

Email = shaddock@extremenetworks.com

Phone = (408) 579-2812

Fax = (408) 579-3000

Org = Extreme Networks

Page = 156

Line = 26

Subclause = 43.6.1

CommentType = Editorial

Comment =

Actor_Port_Priority is a 16 bit integer. This makes the Port Aggregation Priority a four octet binary number.

SuggestedRemedy =

Replace "is a three octet binary number" with "is a four octet binary number", and replace "the most significant octet" with "the two most significant octets".

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 127

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 160

Line = 8 to 10

Subclause = 43.7.3

CommentType = Technical

Comment = The value/comment field has an if statement within it. This item, CM, should be split into two. In addition I believe that the churn state machine is mandatory of the management package is supported and optional otherwise (see 43.4.17). The PICS needs to be corrected to take this into account.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest that item CM should be split into two. First new item,

Item: AM, Feature: Aggregation Port Debug Information package support,

Subclause: 30.7, Status: O, Support: Yes[] No[]. Second new Item, Item: CM,

Feature: Churn detection machine, Subclause: 43.4.17, Status: AM:M !AM:O,

Support: N/A[] M:Yes[] Yes[] No[].

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 128

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 160

Line = 8 to 10

Subclause = 43.7.3

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = This item refers to "LACP Monitoring package" however page 62 refers to the "Aggregation Port Debug Information package", suggest this text should match the name found on page 62.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text ".. if LACP Monitoring package .." should read ".. if Aggregation Port Debug Information package ..".

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 129

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 160

Line = 19

Subclause = 43.7.3

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = Typo.

SuggestedRemedy = ".. Diagramshown .." should read ".. Diagram shown ..".

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 130

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 160

Line = 24

Subclause = 43.7.3

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = The Value/Comment field does not require a repeat of the subclause reference in the subclause column.

SuggestedRemedy = Suggest the text ".. frames within CollectorMaxDelay, ans specified in 43.2.3.1.4" should read ".. .. frames within CollectorMaxDelay."

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 131

Name = Stephen Haddock

Email = shaddock@extremenetworks.com

Phone = (408) 579-2812

Fax = (408) 579-3000

Org = Extreme Networks

Page = 176

Line = 51

Subclause = 43B.5

CommentType = Technical

Comment =

Bullet a) imposes a requirement that any Slow Protocol frames with an illegal Protocol Subtype shall be discarded and explicitly not passed to the MAC Client. The Aggregator Parser state machine in Figure 43-5 on page 114 show such frames being passed to the Frame Collector, and the requirements for the Frame Collector is that these frames be passed to the MAC Client.

SuggestedRemedy =

Reconcile the Aggregator Parser and the Slow Protocol requirements, either by removing the Slow Protocol requirement that frames with illegal Protocol Subtypes be discarded, or by modifying the Aggregator Parser to detect and discard such frames.

EditorsRecommendation:

Discuss.

Resolution:

Accept. Add another state and exit arc from the PARSE state in the Aggregator Parser that looks for slow-protocols frames with illegal subtypes and discards them. Name the state DISCARD FRAME, have no operation in the state, and go back to the top.

CommentNumber = 132

Name = Stephen Haddock

Email = shaddock@extremenetworks.com

Phone = (408) 579-2812

Fax = (408) 579-3000

Org = Extreme Networks

Page = 182

Line = 41

Subclause = 43C.4

CommentType = Editorial

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

Comment =

The note includes a sentence that "addition of a 'standby link' status bit to the protocol would remove any uncertainty as to why the link was OUT_OF_SYNC." This sounds like a flag to the committee of a possible work item, but any questions of adding bits to the protocol should be decided prior to approving the standard.

SuggestedRemedy =

Delete all of Note 2. A possible alternative remedy would be to replace one of the Port_State bits (perhaps the "Defaulted" or "Expired" bit) with a "Standby" bit, but that would convert this to a Technical comment.

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept. Delete the Note. Also, change "NOTE 1" to simply "NOTE".

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 133

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 184

Line = 21

Subclause = 43C.6

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = Typo.

SuggestedRemedy = Figure C-1 should read Figure 43C-1.

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 134

Name = David Law

Email = davel@pdd.3com.com

Phone = +44 1442 438060

Fax = +44 1442 438333

Org = 3Com

Page = 185

Line = 19

Subclause = 43C.7

CommentType = Editorial

Comment = Typo.

SuggestedRemedy = Figure C-2 should read Figure 43C-2.

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

CommentNumber = 135
Name = David Law
Email = davel@pdd.3com.com
Phone = +44 1442 438060
Fax = +44 1442 438333
Org = 3Com
Page = 185
Line = 39
Subclause = 43C.7
CommentType = Editorial
Comment = Typo.
SuggestedRemedy = Figure C-3 should read Figure 43C-3.

EditorsRecommendation:
Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

The following comment was received after the close of the Sponsor Ballot.

CommentNumber = 136
Name = Ben Schultz
Email = schultz@mars.iol.unh.edu
Phone =
Fax =
Org = University of New Hampshire
Page = 155
Line = 54
Subclause = 43.5.4.2.3
CommentType =
Comment =

I have one additional thing that was vague. In sub-clause 43.5.4.2.3 on page 155, line 54 the following sentence appears:

"A Marker Responder may validate the Length field."

I interpret this as the Marker_Information_Length field, however there are several other "length" fields including the Terminator_Length, each of the TLV_type and the Length/Type field.

SuggestedRemedy =

Change this to read:

"A Marker Responder may validate the Marker_Information_Length field."

P802.3ad Sponsor Ballot Comment Database, Revision 2.0

EditorsRecommendation:

Accept.

Resolution:

Follow Editor's Recommendation.

After extensive discussion, it was agreed that the SNMP MIB definitions for P802.3 should have as their Root OID:

iso (1) member-body (2) us (840) 802dot3 (10006) snmpmibs (300) linkagg (43)