

IEEE 802.3 BWA Part II Report D1.1 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 2 SC 2.1 P12 L1 # 1

Bruckman, Leon

Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

The sentence: Email - Inclusion of Mobile Network Data Submitted to the B10K Study Group [13], is missing the apostrophes.

SuggestedRemedy

Add the apostrophes to the sentece to make it similar to all other sentences.
Also, I would recommend to have the whole list of John's aontributions in the same page.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

1. Chage Email - Inclusion of Mobile Network Data Submitted to the B10K Study Group to
"Email - Inclusion of Mobile Network Data Submitted to the B10K Study Group"
2. adjust formatting to keep D'Ambrosia bullets together on the same page.

Cl 2 SC 2.2 P13 L30 # 2

Bruckman, Leon

Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

"data becoming dated" I suppose the intention is: data becoming outdated

SuggestedRemedy

Repalce: "data becoming dated", with: "data becoming outdated"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 3 SC 3.3.1 P20 L23 # 3

Bruckman, Leon

Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

What is Gb ? Giga bits ? Giga Bytes ?

SuggestedRemedy

- 1 - Replace "Gb" with "GB" two times in this table.
- 2 - Define the GB abbreviation (consistent with the fact that EB abbreviation was defined)).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

1. Replace 4 instances of "Gb" with "GB" in Table 5
2. In Section 1 add entry for "GB" - gigabyte

Cl 3 SC 3.3.1 P21 L4 # 4

Bruckman, Leon

Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

From Figure 7 the Average Hour Internet Traffic is shown to grow to slightly above 1 Pbbs by 2022, not to 6.3 Pbs

SuggestedRemedy

Replace: "is expect to grow from ~0.3 Pb/s to ~6.3 Pb/s." with: "is expect to grow from ~0.3 Pb/s to ~1 Pb/s."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 3 SC 3.3.1 P21 L14 # 5

Bruckman, Leon

Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Inconsisten abbreviation: Pbbs in the graph.

SuggestedRemedy

Repalce: "Pbbs" with : "Pb/s"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 3 SC 3.3.2 P21 L30 # 6

Bruckman, Leon

Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

"data rate" is indicated but it shows several rates.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace: "the following available data rate are " with: "the following available data rates are" or "the following available data rate is"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Replace: "the following available data rate are " with: "the following available data rates are"

IEEE 802.3 BWA Part II Report D1.1 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 3 SC 3.3.2.2 P24 L32 # 7

Bruckman, Leon Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status D

How do you see 122.1% CAGR from table 6 ? Table 6 shows the average rates, while figure 11 shows number of hot spots

SuggestedRemedy

Add some text to support the claim of 122.1% CAGR for Wi-Fi users

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See response to comment #67.

Cl 3 SC 3.3.2.3 P25 L14 # 8

Bruckman, Leon Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Missing word (period): "The average rates for the 2013 to 2017 ranged from 2.3 Mb/s to 10.7 Mb/s for a CAGR of 15 %."

SuggestedRemedy

Replace: "The average rates for the 2013 to 2017 ranged from 2.3 Mb/s to 10.7 Mb/s for a CAGR of 15 %." With: "The average rates for the 2013 to 2017 period ranged from 2.3 Mb/s to 10.7 Mb/s for a CAGR of 15 %."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See response to comment 52.

Cl 3 SC 3.3.2.3 P25 L24 # 9

Bruckman, Leon Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Missing word (period): "The average rates for the 2014 to 2016 ranged from 21.7 Mb/s to 49.0 Mb/s"

SuggestedRemedy

Replace: "The average rates for the 2014 to 2016 ranged from 21.7 Mb/s to 49.0 Mb/s"

With: "The average rates for the 2014 to 2016 period ranged from 21.7 Mb/s to 49.0 Mb/s"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See response to comment 28.

Cl 3 SC 3.3.2.3 P26 L4 # 10

Bruckman, Leon Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Inconsisten abbreviation: Mbps in the graph.

SuggestedRemedy

Repalce: "Mbps" with : "Mb/s"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 3 SC 3.3.2.3 P27 L5 # 11

Bruckman, Leon Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Inconsisten abbreviation: Mbps in the graph.

SuggestedRemedy

Repalce: "Mbps" with : "Mb/s"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 3 SC 3.3.2.3 P30 L51 # 12

Bruckman, Leon Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Fix text: "the ITU-R forecasted that the number of mobile subscriptions to grow from 10.7 billion to 17.1 billion for the 2020 to 2030 timeframe"

SuggestedRemedy

Replace: "to grow" with: "will grow" or "is to grow"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Replace "to grow" to "will grow"

IEEE 802.3 BWA Part II Report D1.1 2nd Task Force review comments

CI 3 SC 3.4.4 P33 L50 # 13
 Bruckman, Leon Huawei
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Text not clear: "the car-to-cloud connection is potentially a large bandwidth demand.". What does it mean that the connection is a "large BW demand" ?
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace: "the car-to-cloud connection is potentially a large bandwidth demand." With: "the car-to-cloud connection represents a potential large bandwidth demand."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See response to Comment #69

CI 3 SC 3.5.1 P36 L32 # 14
 Bruckman, Leon Huawei
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Missing word (period): "over the 2014 to 2023"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace: "over the 2014 to 2023" with: "over the 2014 to 2023 period"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Replace "over the 2014 to 2023" with "from 2014 to 2023".

CI 3 SC 3.5.1 P36 L32 # 15
 Bruckman, Leon Huawei
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Inconsistent text: "while 25 Gb to 50 Gb/s servers"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace: "while 25 Gb to 50 Gb/s servers" with: "while 25 to 50 Gb/s servers"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See response to comment 71.

CI 3 SC 3.5.1 P37 L3 # 16
 Bruckman, Leon Huawei
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Inconsisten abbreviation: Gbps in the graph.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Repalce: "Gbps" with : "Gb/s"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 3 SC 3.5.1 P37 L32 # 17
 Bruckman, Leon Huawei
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Inconsisten abbreviation: Gbps in the graph.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Repalce: "Gbps" with : "Gb/s"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 (Note - Figure 28)

CI 3 SC 3.5.1 P38 L26 # 18
 Bruckman, Leon Huawei
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Text not clear: "This data thought to be representative"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace: "This data thought to be representative" With: "This data is thought to be representative"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 (Note - Figure 29)

IEEE 802.3 BWA Part II Report D1.1 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 3 SC 3.5.3 P40 L26 # 19
 Bruckman, Leon Huawei
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 What is Gb ? Giga bits ? In Figure 33 it is indicated as GB (I assume Giga Bytes)
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "Gb" with "GB" two times in this sentence.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 3 SC 3.5.5 P44 L30 # 20
 Bruckman, Leon Huawei
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Inconsisten abbreviation: Tbit/s in the graph.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Repalce: "Tbit/s" with : "Tb/s"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 Figure 38 is an embedded figure from
http://www.ieee802.org/3/ad_hoc/bwa2/public/calls/19_0709/dietzel_bwa_01b_190709.pdf.
 Source data for graph was not provided, preventing editing figure.

Cl 3 SC 3.5.5 P45 L4 # 21
 Bruckman, Leon Huawei
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Inconsisten abbreviation: Tbit/s in the graph.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Repalce: "Tbit/s" with : "Tb/s"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 Figure 39 is an embedded figure from
http://www.ieee802.org/3/ad_hoc/bwa2/public/calls/19_0709/dietzel_bwa_01b_190709.pdf.
 Source data for graph was not provided, preventing editing figure.

Cl 3 SC 3.5.5 P45 L7 # 22
 Bruckman, Leon Huawei
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Inconsisten abbreviation: Tbits in the graph.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Repalce: "Tbits" with : "Tb/s"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.

Figure 39 is an embedded figure from
http://www.ieee802.org/3/ad_hoc/bwa2/public/calls/19_0709/dietzel_bwa_01b_190709.pdf.
 Source data for graph was not provided, preventing editing figure.

Cl 3 SC 3.5.5.1 P46 L29 # 23
 Bruckman, Leon Huawei
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Inconsisten abbreviation: Tbit/s in the graph.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Repalce: "Tbit/s" with : "Tb/s"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.

Figure 42 is an embedded figure from
http://www.ieee802.org/3/ad_hoc/bwa2/public/calls/19_0709/dietzel_bwa_01b_190709.pdf.
 Source data for graph was not provided, preventing editing figure.

Cl 3 SC 3.5.5.1 P47 L4 # 24
 Bruckman, Leon Huawei
 Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
 Inconsisten abbreviation: Tbit/s in the graph.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Repalce: "Tbit/s" with : "Tb/s"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.

Figure 43 is an embedded figure from
http://www.ieee802.org/3/ad_hoc/bwa2/public/calls/19_0709/dietzel_bwa_01b_190709.pdf.
 Source data for graph was not provided, preventing editing figure.

IEEE 802.3 BWA Part II Report D1.1 2nd Task Force review comments

CI 3 SC 3.5.5.1 P47 L4 # 25

Bruckman, Leon

Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Inconsisten abbreviation: Tbits in the graph.

SuggestedRemedy

Repalce: "Tbits" with : "Tb/s"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED REJECT.

Figure 43 is an embedded figure from
http://www.ieee802.org/3/ad_hoc/bwa2/public/calls/19_0709/dietzel_bwa_01b_190709.pdf.
Source data for graph was not provided, preventing editing figure.

CI 4 SC 4.5 P56 L21 # 26

Bruckman, Leon

Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Unecessary character: "the number #1", no need for # if you spell "number"

SuggestedRemedy

Replace: "the number #1" with : "the number 1"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 4 SC 4.5 P56 L26 # 27

Bruckman, Leon

Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Text fix: "4K TV set connections represents a 38 % CAGR over the 2017 to 2022 time period."

SuggestedRemedy

Replace: "4K TV set connections represents a 38 % CAGR over the 2017 to 2022 time period." With: "4K TV set connections present a 38 % CAGR over the 2017 to 2022 time period."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

The statement should be representative of the fact that this is a forecast.
Replace "4K TV set connections represents a 38 % CAGR over the 2017 to 2022 time period." with "From 2017 to 2022 the number of 4K TV set connections is forecasted to grow with a 38% CAGR."

CI 3 SC 3.3.2.3 P25 L24 # 28

Wienckowski, Natalie

General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Article without a noun. Just remove the unnecessary article.

SuggestedRemedy

Change: The average rates for the 2013 to 2017 ranged
To: The average rates for 2013 to 2017 ranged

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 3 SC 3.3.2.4 P27 L34 # 29

Wienckowski, Natalie

General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

SuggestedRemedy

Change: south east Asia
To: Southeast Asia

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 3 SC 3.4 P27 L43 # 30

Wienckowski, Natalie

General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Incorrect link

SuggestedRemedy

The cross reference on Equation (1) should be to the equation, not somewhere outside the presenation: <https://www.sandvine.com/hubfs/downloads/phenomena/2018-phenomena-report.pdf>. This link seems to be on most of the paragraph.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Ensure all hyperlinks are correct for the paragraph. Add new references for Sandvine reports.

IEEE 802.3 BWA Part II Report D1.1 2nd Task Force review comments

CI 3 SC 3.4.1 P31 L28 # 31

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

I don't think the word "exasperate" fits here as it means "irritate and frustrate (someone) intensely" according to oxford dictionaries. You can reword as suggested if this is what you were trying to get across or find a word that's a better fit.

SuggestedRemedy

Change: will only serve to further exasperate support of future bandwidth growth.
To: will only serve to further exasperate efforts to predict future bandwidth growth.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Replace "It is anticipated that in the future support of video beyond ultra-high definition, such as 8k/12k/16k, will only serve to further exasperate support of future bandwidth growth.." with
""It is anticipated that in the future, support for video beyond UHD, such as 8K/12K/16K, will further accelerate bandwidth growth.""

CI 3 SC 3.4.1 P31 L28 # 32

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

I think "video" is in the wrong spot.

SuggestedRemedy

Change: Figure 22 highlights the impact of definition on IP video growth.
To: Figure 22 highlights the impact of video definition on IP growth.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 3 SC 3.4.3 P33 L6 # 33

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Missing comma to separate phrase.

SuggestedRemedy

Change: From an Ethernet perspective, the wired network inside the car
To: From an Ethernet perspective, the wired network inside the car

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change existing wording "From an Ethernet perspective the wired network inside the car" to "From an Ethernet perspective, the wired network inside the car".

CI 3 SC 3.4.3 P33 L36 # 34

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Poor wording

SuggestedRemedy

Change: For year 2018 global automobile sales are around 80 million passenger cars (cars, light trucks, SUV).
To: In 2018, global automobile sales were around 80 million passenger cars (cars, light trucks, and SUVs).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 3 SC 3.4.3 P33 L46 # 35

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

verb tense

SuggestedRemedy

Change: which is assumed to be influence by some sort of video.
To: which is assumed to be influenced by some sort of video.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3 BWA Part II Report D1.1 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 3 SC 3.5.2 P38 L26 # 36
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
Poor wording
SuggestedRemedy
Change: This data thought to be representative of internal east-west traffic in the data centers themselves,
To: This data is thought to be representative of internal east-west traffic in the data centers themselves,
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See response to comment 18.

Cl 3 SC 3.5.4 P42 L48 # 37
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
Subject/verb agreement
SuggestedRemedy
Change: The negative numbers shown in Table 9 highlights that
To: The negative numbers shown in Table 9 highlight that
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 3 SC 3.5.5.2 P47 L35 # 38
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
The "#" doesn't seem to fit here.
SuggestedRemedy
Change "#3" to "three".
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 3 SC 3.5.5.2 P47 L35 # 39
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
Comment Type T Comment Status D
I think it's supposed to be 40%, not the number 40 as the previous paragraph is using percentage, also 40 out of te 10,000 plus would not be significant.
SuggestedRemedy
Change "~40" to "~40%".
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 1 SC 1 P1 L44 # 40
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
1.6TbE should be at the end of this list. If we look at the PHY lists in Clause 30, they go from slowest to fastest. If you do an alphabetical list, 1.6 would go between 1 and 10.
SuggestedRemedy
Move 1.6TbE to after 800GbE in the list.
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Sort the list based on the "definition sort order" in the IEEE 802.3 Working Group editorial guideline.

Cl 2 SC 2.2 P13 L26 # 41
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
Repeated text from the previous section.
SuggestedRemedy
Delete as the same text is at the end of the previous section: It should be noted that all submitted information should be considered a snapshot of the perceived bandwidth requirements at the time of submission to the NEA Ad Hoc or the publication of the referenced report.
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Delete duplicative wording "It should be noted that all submitted information should be considered a snapshot of the perceived bandwidth requirements at the time of submission to the NEA Ad Hoc or the publication of the referenced report" from 2.2.

IEEE 802.3 BWA Part II Report D1.1 2nd Task Force review comments

CI 3 SC 3.1 P14 L15 # 42
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

SuggestedRemedy

Make "Equation (1)" a cross reference here and throughout the document.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Ensure all the cross references to Equation (1) are correct.

CI FM SC FM P1 L55 # 43
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

The first pdf page should be page "1", not "i". The printed page number should match the pdf page number. It causes confusion as to which page is being referenced, the pdf page number or the number printed on the page. There is no way to comment on page "i" as this isn't allowed in this spreadsheet.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the numbering of the first page in the frontmatter to be "1", not "i".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Start the numbering at "1" on the first page of the document and continue consecutively through the rest of the document.

CI 3 SC 3.2 P14 L21 # 44
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Missing comma to separate phrase.

SuggestedRemedy

Change: When considering "Users" individuals To: When considering "Users", individuals

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 3 SC 3.2.1 P15 L7 # 45
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

The spacing of the numbers in Table 2, Column "Internet Growth 2000-2019" doesn't match the Style conventions in:
http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#numbers which says "In numbers of four digits, the space is not necessary, unless four-digit numbers are grouped in a column with numbers of five digits or more."

SuggestedRemedy

Add a space between the thousands and hundreds digit for all 4 digit numbers in the "Internet Growth 2000-2019" column as there are 5 digit numbers in this column.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 3 SC 3.2.1 P15 L24 # 46
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

The order of the countries in Table 2 seems to be based on the number of Internet Users 31/3/19. It appears that the number for Vietnam is incorrect at 64 000 when the country on either side is larger. Also, this is lower than 31/12/00 but the growth is listed as 31 900%.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the value for Vietnam for Internet Users 31/3/19 to 64 000 000 or whatever the correct value is.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change the value for Vietnam Internet Users 31/3/19 to the correct value of 64 000 000.

CI 3 SC 3.2.1 P15 L37 # 47
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

It appears this text is supposed to be a Note on the table, but it should be right below the table in this case and start with "Note-"

SuggestedRemedy

Move "Usage 2019 is the number of Internet users in 2019 divided by the estimated 2019 population." directly below the table with "Note -" right before it.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3 BWA Part II Report D1.1 2nd Task Force review comments

CI 3 SC 3.3.1 P21 L4 # 48
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
Grammar issue
SuggestedRemedy
Change: average hour Internet traffic is expect to grow
To: average hour Internet traffic is expected to grow
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 3 SC 3.3.2 P21 L37 # 49
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
2022 is not in the past so you shouldn't use "had". This word can just be deleted.
SuggestedRemedy
Change: For 2022 North America is expected to have the highest Wi-Fi data rate and had the second highest date rate for both Fixed Broadband and Cellular.
To: For 2022 North America is expected to have the highest Wi-Fi data rate and the second highest date rate for both Fixed Broadband and Cellular.
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 3 SC 3.3.2.3 P25 L7 # 50
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
Awkward wording
SuggestedRemedy
Change: As shown in Figure 12, the ITU-R forecasted that the number of mobile subscriptions to grow from
To: As shown in Figure 12, the ITU-R forecasted that the number of mobile subscriptions is expected to grow from
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See response to comment 12.

CI 3 SC 3.3.2.3 P25 L12 # 51
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
Missing "."
SuggestedRemedy
Change: upload)
To: upload.)
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 3 SC 3.3.2.3 P25 L14 # 52
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
Article without a noun. Just remove the unnecessary article.
SuggestedRemedy
Change: The average rates for the 2013 to 2017 ranged
To: The average rates for 2013 to 2017 ranged
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 4 SC 4.3 P55 L26 # 53
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
Should include the number of countries.
SuggestedRemedy
Change: the Top countries in the world
To: the Top 20 countries in the world
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3 BWA Part II Report D1.1 2nd Task Force review comments

CI 4 SC 4.3 P55 L43 # 54

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Subject/verb agreement

SuggestedRemedy

Change: While the number of personal vehicles being sold are understood (currently annual sales is 80 million vehicles)

To: While the number of personal vehicles being sold is understood (currently annual sales are 80 million vehicles)

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 4 SC 4.4 P56 L9 # 55

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

incorrect word

SuggestedRemedy

Change: different between

To: difference between

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 4 SC 4.4 P56 L11 # 56

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Poor wording

SuggestedRemedy

Change: broad variability in the speeds required by mobile networks to support.

To: broad variability in the speeds mobile networks are required to support.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Replace " broad variability in the speeds required by mobile networks to support." with "broad variability in the speeds required to support mobile networks."

CI 4 SC 4.5 P56 L22 # 57

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

redundant number & #

SuggestedRemedy

Change: number #1

To: number 1

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See response to comment 26.

CI 4 SC 4.5 P56 L27 # 58

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Subject/verb agreement

SuggestedRemedy

Change: connections represents

To: connections represent

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 4 SC 4.6 P56 L42 # 59

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Refer to the subclause, not the page number. The printed page number is not the pdf page number now so typing in "25" when viewing the pdf doesn't take you to the right page.

SuggestedRemedy

Change: review "Bandwidth Growth" on page 25

To: review "Bandwidth Growth", see 3.5,

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3 BWA Part II Report D1.1 2nd Task Force review comments

CI 4 SC 4.6 P56 L48 # 60

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

I believe the note is supposed to be on the Figure.

SuggestedRemedy

Move the Note to after Figure 51, in the Figure or attached at the end.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Move the note from before the figure to after the figure.

CI 00 SC 0 P59 L1 # 61

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Incorrect capitalization

SuggestedRemedy

Change: Furthermore, In
To: Furthermore, in

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI FM SC FM P0 L58 # 62

Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type ER Comment Status D bucket

IEEE 802.3 revision and amendments use continuous, arabic numbering throughout the document starting with page 1 on the front page. Note that it is not even possible to put the page numbers in this spreadsheet.

SuggestedRemedy

Start number from page 1 starting with the cover page.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See response to comment 43.

CI 00 SC 0 P0 L19 # 63

Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

It is now 2020.

SuggestedRemedy

For the copyright notices change the year from 2019 to 2020.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 00 SC 0 P0 L59 # 64

Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Throughout most of the document there is no footer like we have in the revision and amendments with copyright information. Also, we no longer print out documents so there's no need to put the page number on the outside of left and right pages.

SuggestedRemedy

Use the same footer as used for 802.3 revision and amendments with centered page number and with copyright information.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 00 SC 0 P1 L10 # 65

Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket

Throughout the document where a percentage is given, there is a space between the digits and the percent symbol. Note that the "%" is a symbol, not a unit; it is analogous to the exponential representation, where 0.01 or 1% is also represented by 1% and 1e-2. Nowhere in 802.3-2018 is there a space between the digits and the % sign.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove space between digits and % character.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3 BWA Part II Report D1.1 2nd Task Force review comments

CI 00 SC 0 P1 L23 # 66
Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
To represent the various Ethernet rates the abbreviations section conveniently defines acronyms <number>GbE or <number>TbE, with no space. Yet through the document the acronym is used, but with a space between <number> and GbE/TbE.
SuggestedRemedy
Remove the space between <number> and GbE/TbE throughout the document.
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 00 SC 0 P14 L31 # 67
Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada
Comment Type T Comment Status D
There reference to Table 6 giving 122.1% CAGR, but I don't see any information in Table 6 in that regard.
SuggestedRemedy
Please fix or explain.
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

It is agreed that the noted text does not align with the text in Table 6 and is incorrect. Replace "It is interesting to note that per Table 6 the number of Wi-Fi users globally is forecasted to increase by a CAGR of 122.1 %." with "It is interesting to note that per Table 6 the global average Wi-Fi speed will grow from 24.4 Mb/s to 54.2 Mb/s for a CAGR OF 17.3%."

CI 00 SC 0 P21 L27 # 68
Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
Throughout the document refer to 4K TV (with capital K). Reference to speculative higher resolution TV formats should use capital K too.
SuggestedRemedy
Change "8k/12k/16k" to "8K/12K/16K" here and anywhere else these occur.
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 00 SC 0 P23 L50 # 69
Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada
Comment Type T Comment Status D
I don't see how given no data we can extrapolate to "potentially a large bandwidth demand. "Given the forecasted number of passenger cars, the lack of information related to the types of applications and associated bandwidth demands, as well as the wireless connection, the car-to-cloud connection is potentially a large bandwidth demand."
SuggestedRemedy
Change to:
"Given the forecasted number of passenger cars, as well as the wireless connection, the car-to-cloud connection is potentially a large bandwidth demand, however an accurate estimate is not possible due to the lack of information related to the types of applications and associated bandwidth demands."
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 00 SC 0 P24 L40 # 70
Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada
Comment Type T Comment Status D
It is not clear what Figure 25 represents. Even the lead in sentence doesn't help. "Figure 25 is a forecast by application for global wireless traffic from 2011." This section is on automotive, but the descriptions sound more like mobile devices.
SuggestedRemedy
Provide a better explanation of what this represents.
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Figure 25 is a graphic found in a Technology Roadmap for Connecting Cars from February 2013. See https://www.gsma.com/iot/wp-content/uploads/2013/02/GSMA_mAutomotive_TechnologyRoadmap_v2.pdf. This figure is a forecast for global wireless traffic generated by embedded mobility in the automotive sector.

Replace "Figure 25 is a forecast by application for global wireless traffic from 2011." with "Figure 25 forecasts the amount of global wireless traffic generated by various embedded applications from 2010 to 2020 in automobiles."

IEEE 802.3 BWA Part II Report D1.1 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 00 SC 0 P26 L33 # 71
Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
Gb should be be Gb/s
SuggestedRemedy
Change "Gb" to "Gb/s"
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 00 SC 0 P29 L30 # 72
Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
abbreviation CDN never introduced in text
SuggestedRemedy
Add abbreviation "(CDN)" to section title.
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 00 SC 0 P34 L52 # 73
Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada
Comment Type T Comment Status D
The growth rate is in data rate (e.g., Gb/s per day) not data amount (e.g., Gb /d). The trendline is 12.2 Gb/s/day.
SuggestedRemedy
Change "12.2 Gb/d" to "12.2 Gb/s/day" here and in Figure 39.
Change "4.8 Gb/d" to "4.8 Gb/s/day" in Figure 39.
In Figure 43, change "Gb/d" to "Gb/s/day" in two places.
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

1. Figure 39 is an embedded figure from
http://www.ieee802.org/3/ad_hoc/bwa2/public/calls/19_0709/dietzel_bwa_01b_190709.pdf.
Source data for graph was not provided, preventing editing figure.
2. Replace "4.8 Gb/d curve, and then switched to a 12.2 Gb/d trendline." with "4.8 Gb/s/d curve, and then switched to a 12.2 Gb/s/d trendline."

Cl 00 SC 0 P37 L54 # 74
Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada
Comment Type T Comment Status D
Typically, consumed data is specified in bytes, not bits. Gb is gigabits. I'm guessing it was supposed to be GB (gigabytes).
SuggestedRemedy
Change "Gb" to "GB" in two places.
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

[Editor's note: It is assumed that the commenter is referring to PDF page 40 Line 24, based on reference to "consumed data".]

See response to comment 3.

Cl 00 SC 0 P46 L9 # 75
Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
spelling
SuggestedRemedy
change "different" to "difference"
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See response to comment 55.

Cl 00 SC 0 P47 L29 # 76
Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada
Comment Type E Comment Status D bucket
By convention notes have same character fonts as the other text. There are no brackets. The dash after "Note" there should be an EM dash with no space before or after.
SuggestedRemedy
Fix this note and all other notes to have format common with other 802.3 documents as described.
Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

IEEE 802.3 BWA Part II Report D1.1 2nd Task Force review comments

CI 00 SC 0 P48 L16 # 77

Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type T Comment Status D

I don't see how the curves for 800GBE and 1.6GbE were generated. I would expect a straight line from the same point where 400 GbE was standardized.

SuggestedRemedy

Please provide a better explanation for the generation of these curves.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Updated proposed text and graph to be provided at Feb 24 Teleconference call by D'Ambrosia