

IEEE 802.3 BWA Part II Report D1.1 2nd Task Force review comments

CI 2 SC 2.1 P12 L1 # 1

Bruckman, Leon Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status X

The sentence: Email - Inclusion of Mobile Network Data Submitted to the B10K Study Group [13], is missing the apostrophes.

SuggestedRemedy

Add the apostrophes to the sentece to make it similar to all other sentences.
Also, I would recommend to have the whole list of John's aontributions in the same page.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 2 SC 2.2 P13 L30 # 2

Bruckman, Leon Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status X

"data becoming dated" I suppose the intention is: data becoming outdated

SuggestedRemedy

Repalce: "data becoming dated", with: "data becoming outdated"

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 3 SC 3.3.1 P20 L23 # 3

Bruckman, Leon Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status X

What is Gb ? Giga bits ? Giga Bytes ?

SuggestedRemedy

- 1 - Replace "Gb" with "GB" two times in this table.
- 2 - Define the GB abbreviation (consistent with the fact that EB abbreviation was defined)).

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 3 SC 3.3.1 P21 L4 # 4

Bruckman, Leon Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status X

From Figure 7 the Average Hour Internet Traffic is shown to grow to slightly above 1 Pbps by 2022, not to 6.3 Pbs

SuggestedRemedy

Replace: "is expect to grow from ~0.3 Pb/s to ~6.3 Pb/s." with: "is expect to grow from ~0.3 Pb/s to ~1 Pb/s."

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 3 SC 3.3.1 P21 L14 # 5

Bruckman, Leon Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Inconsisten abbreviation: Pbps in the graph.

SuggestedRemedy

Repalce: "Pbps" with : "Pb/s"

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 3 SC 3.3.2 P21 L30 # 6

Bruckman, Leon Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status X

"data rate" is indicated but it shows several rates.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace: "the following available data rate are " with: "the following available data rates are" or "the following available data rate is"

Proposed Response Response Status O

IEEE 802.3 BWA Part II Report D1.1 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 3 SC 3.3.2.2 P24 L32 # 7

Bruckman, Leon Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status X

How do you see 122.1% CAGR from table 6 ? Table 6 shows the average rates, while figure 11 shows number of hot spots

SuggestedRemedy

Add some text to support the claim of 122.1% CAGR for Wi-Fi users

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 3 SC 3.3.2.3 P25 L14 # 8

Bruckman, Leon Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Missing word (period): "The average rates for the 2013 to 2017 ranged from 2.3 Mb/s to 10.7 Mb/s for a CAGR of 15 %."

SuggestedRemedy

Replace: "The average rates for the 2013 to 2017 ranged from 2.3 Mb/s to 10.7 Mb/s for a CAGR of 15 %." With: "The average rates for the 2013 to 2017 period ranged from 2.3 Mb/s to 10.7 Mb/s for a CAGR of 15 %."

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 3 SC 3.3.2.3 P25 L24 # 9

Bruckman, Leon Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Missing word (period): "The average rates for the 2014 to 2016 ranged from 21.7 Mb/s to 49.0 Mb/s"

SuggestedRemedy

Replace: "The average rates for the 2014 to 2016 ranged from 21.7 Mb/s to 49.0 Mb/s" With: "The average rates for the 2014 to 2016 period ranged from 21.7 Mb/s to 49.0 Mb/s"

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 3 SC 3.3.2.3 P26 L4 # 10

Bruckman, Leon Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Inconsisten abbreviation: Mbps in the graph.

SuggestedRemedy

Repalce: "Mbps" with : "Mb/s"

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 3 SC 3.3.2.3 P27 L5 # 11

Bruckman, Leon Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Inconsisten abbreviation: Mbps in the graph.

SuggestedRemedy

Repalce: "Mbps" with : "Mb/s"

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 3 SC 3.3.2.3 P30 L51 # 12

Bruckman, Leon Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Fix text: "the ITU-R forecasted that the number of mobile subscriptions to grow from 10.7 billion to 17.1 billion for the 2020 to 2030 timeframe"

SuggestedRemedy

Replace: "to grow" with: "will grow" or "is to grow"

Proposed Response Response Status O

IEEE 802.3 BWA Part II Report D1.1 2nd Task Force review comments

CI 3 SC 3.4.4 P33 L50 # 13

Bruckman, Leon Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Text not clear: "the car-to-cloud connection is potentially a large bandwidth demand.". What does it mean that the connection is a "large BW demand" ?

SuggestedRemedy

Replace: "the car-to-cloud connection is potentially a large bandwidth demand." With: "the car-to-cloud connection represents a potential large bandwidth demand."

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 16 SC 3.5.1 P36 L32 # 14

Bruckman, Leon Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Missing word (period): "over the 2014 to 2023"

SuggestedRemedy

Replace: "over the 2014 to 2023" with: "over the 2014 to 2023 period"

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 3 SC 3.5.1 P36 L32 # 15

Bruckman, Leon Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Inconsistent text: "while 25 Gb to 50 Gb/s servers"

SuggestedRemedy

Replace: "while 25 Gb to 50 Gb/s servers" with: "while 25 to 50 Gb/s servers"

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 3 SC 3.5.1 P37 L3 # 16

Bruckman, Leon Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Inconsisten abbreviation: Gbps in the graph.

SuggestedRemedy

Repalce: "Gbps" with : "Gb/s"

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 3 SC 3.5.1 P37 L32 # 17

Bruckman, Leon Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Inconsisten abbreviation: Gbps in the graph.

SuggestedRemedy

Repalce: "Gbps" with : "Gb/s"

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 3 SC 3.5.1 P38 L26 # 18

Bruckman, Leon Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Text not clear: "This data thought to be representative"

SuggestedRemedy

Replace: "This data thought to be representative" With: "This data is thought to be representative"

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 3 SC 3.5.3 P40 L26 # 19

Bruckman, Leon Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status X

What is Gb ? Giga bits ? In Figure 33 it is indicated as GB (I assume Giga Bytes)

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "Gb" with "GB" two times in this sentence.

Proposed Response Response Status O

IEEE 802.3 BWA Part II Report D1.1 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 3 SC 3.5.5 P44 L30 # 20
 Bruckman, Leon Huawei
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Inconsisten abbreviation: Tbit/s in the graph.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Repalce: "Tbit/s" with : "Tb/s"
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 3 SC 3.5.5 P45 L4 # 21
 Bruckman, Leon Huawei
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Inconsisten abbreviation: Tbit/s in the graph.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Repalce: "Tbit/s" with : "Tb/s"
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 3 SC 3.5.5 P45 L7 # 22
 Bruckman, Leon Huawei
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Inconsisten abbreviation: Tbits in the graph.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Repalce: "Tbits" with : "Tb/s"
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 3 SC 3.5.5.1 P46 L29 # 23
 Bruckman, Leon Huawei
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Inconsisten abbreviation: Tbit/s in the graph.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Repalce: "Tbit/s" with : "Tb/s"
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 3 SC 3.5.5.1 P47 L4 # 24
 Bruckman, Leon Huawei
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Inconsisten abbreviation: Tbit/s in the graph.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Repalce: "Tbit/s" with : "Tb/s"
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 3 SC 3.5.5.1 P47 L4 # 25
 Bruckman, Leon Huawei
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Inconsisten abbreviation: Tbits in the graph.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Repalce: "Tbits" with : "Tb/s"
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 4 SC 4.5 P56 L21 # 26
 Bruckman, Leon Huawei
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Unnecessary character: "the number #1", no need for # if you spell "number"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace: "the number #1" with : "the number 1"
 Proposed Response Response Status O

IEEE 802.3 BWA Part II Report D1.1 2nd Task Force review comments

CI 4 SC 4.5 P56 L26 # 27

Bruckman, Leon

Huawei

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Text fix: "4K TV set connections represents a 38 % CAGR over the 2017 to 2022 time period."

SuggestedRemedy

Replace: "4K TV set connections represents a 38 % CAGR over the 2017 to 2022 time period." With: "4K TV set connections present a 38 % CAGR over the 2017 to 2022 time period."

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 3 SC 3.3.2.3 P25 L24 # 28

Wienckowski, Natalie

General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Article without a noun. Just remove the unnecessary article.

SuggestedRemedy

Change: The average rates for the 2013 to 2017 ranged
To: The average rates for 2013 to 2017 ranged

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 3 SC 3.3.2.4 P27 L34 # 29

Wienckowski, Natalie

General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

SuggestedRemedy

Change: south east Asia
To: Southeast Asia

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 3 SC 3.4 P27 L43 # 30

Wienckowski, Natalie

General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Incorrect link

SuggestedRemedy

The cross reference on Equation (1) should be to the equation, not somewhere outside the presentation: <https://www.sandvine.com/hubfs/downloads/phenomena/2018-phenomena-report.pdf>. This link seems to be on most of the paragraph.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 3 SC 3.4.1 P31 L28 # 31

Wienckowski, Natalie

General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

I don't think the word "exasperate" fits here as it means "irritate and frustrate (someone) intensely" according to oxford dictionaries. You can reword as suggested if this is what you were trying to get across or find a word that's a better fit.

SuggestedRemedy

Change: will only serve to further exasperate support of future bandwidth growth.
To: will only serve to further exasperate efforts to predict future bandwidth growth.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 3 SC 3.4.1 P31 L28 # 32

Wienckowski, Natalie

General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

I think "video" is in the wrong spot.

SuggestedRemedy

Change: Figure 22 highlights the impact of definition on IP video growth.
To: Figure 22 highlights the impact of video definition on IP growth.

Proposed Response Response Status O

IEEE 802.3 BWA Part II Report D1.1 2nd Task Force review comments

CI 3 SC 3.4.3 P33 L6 # 33

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Missing comma to separate phrase.

SuggestedRemedy

Change: From an Ethernet perspective, the wired network inside the car
To: From an Ethernet perspective, the wired network inside the car

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 3 SC 3.4.3 P33 L36 # 34

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Poor wording

SuggestedRemedy

Change: For year 2018 global automobile sales are around 80 million passenger cars (cars, light trucks, SUV).
To: In 2018, global automobile sales were around 80 million passenger cars (cars, light trucks, and SUVs).

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 3 SC 3.4.3 P33 L46 # 35

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

verb tense

SuggestedRemedy

Change: which is assumed to be influence by some sort of video.
To: which is assumed to be influenced by some sort of video.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 3 SC 3.5.2 P38 L26 # 36

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Poor wording

SuggestedRemedy

Change: This data thought to be representative of internal east-west traffic in the data centers themselves,
To: This data is thought to be representative of internal east-west traffic in the data centers themselves,

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 3 SC 3.5.4 P42 L48 # 37

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Subject/verb agreement

SuggestedRemedy

Change: The negative numbers shown in Table 9 highlights that
To: The negative numbers shown in Table 9 highlight that

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 3 SC 3.5.5.2 P47 L35 # 38

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

The "#" doesn't seem to fit here.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "#3" to "three".

Proposed Response Response Status O

IEEE 802.3 BWA Part II Report D1.1 2nd Task Force review comments

CI 3 SC 3.5.5.2 P47 L35 # 39

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type T Comment Status X

I think it's supposed to be 40%, not the number 40 as the previous paragraph is using percentage, also 40 out of te 10,000 plus would not be significant.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "~40" to "~40%".

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 1 SC 1 P1 L44 # 40

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

1.6TbE should be at the end of this list. If we look at the PHY lists in Clause 30, they go from slowest to fastest. If you do an alphabetical list, 1.6 would go between 1 and 10.

SuggestedRemedy

Move 1.6TbE to after 800GbE in the list.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 2 SC 2.2 P13 L26 # 41

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Repeated text from the previous section.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete as the same text is at the end of the previous section: It should be noted that all submitted information should be considered a snapshot of the perceived bandwidth requirements at the time of submission to the NEA Ad Hoc or the publication of the referenced report.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 3 SC 3.1 P14 L15 # 42

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

SuggestedRemedy

Make "Equation (1)" a cross reference here and throughout the document.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI FM SC FM P1 L55 # 43

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

The first pdf page should be page "1", not "i". The printed page number should match the pdf page number. It causes confusion as to which page is being referenced, the pdf page number or the number printed on the page. There is no way to comment on page "i" as this isn't allowed in this spreadsheet.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the numbering of the first page in the frontmatter to be "1", not "i".

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 3 SC 3.2 P14 L21 # 44

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Missing comma to separate phrase.

SuggestedRemedy

Change: When considering "Users" individuals To: When considering "Users", individuals

Proposed Response Response Status O

IEEE 802.3 BWA Part II Report D1.1 2nd Task Force review comments

CI 3 SC 3.2.1 P15 L7 # 45

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

The spacing of the numbers in Table 2, Column "Internet Growth 2000-2019" doesn't match the Style conventions in:
http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html#numbers which says "In numbers of four digits, the space is not necessary, unless four-digit numbers are grouped in a column with numbers of five digits or more."

SuggestedRemedy

Add a space between the thousands and hundreds digit for all 4 digit numbers in the "Internet Growth 2000-2019" column as there are 5 digit numbers in this column.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 3 SC 3.2.1 P15 L24 # 46

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

The order of the countries in Table 2 seems to be based on the number of Internet Users 31/3/19. It appears that the number for Vietnam is incorrect at 64 000 when the country on either side is larger. Also, this is lower than 31/12/00 but the growth is listed as 31 900%.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the value for Vietnam for Internet Users 31/3/19 to 64 000 000 or whatever the correct value is.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 3 SC 3.2.1 P15 L37 # 47

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

It appears this text is supposed to be a Note on the table, but it should be right below the table in this case and start with "Note-"

SuggestedRemedy

Move "Usage 2019 is the number of Internet users in 2019 divided by the estimated 2019 population." directly below the table with "Note -" right before it.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 3 SC 3.3.1 P21 L4 # 48

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Grammar issue

SuggestedRemedy

Change: average hour Internet traffic is expect to grow
 To: average hour Internet traffic is expected to grow

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 3 SC 3.3.2 P21 L37 # 49

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

2022 is not in the past so you shouldn't use "had". This word can just be deleted.

SuggestedRemedy

Change: For 2022 North America is expected to have the highest Wi-Fi data rate and had the second highest date rate for both Fixed Broadband and Cellular.
 To: For 2022 North America is expected to have the highest Wi-Fi data rate and the second highest date rate for both Fixed Broadband and Cellular.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 3 SC 3.3.2.3 P25 L7 # 50

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Awkward wording

SuggestedRemedy

Change: As shown in Figure 12, the ITU-R forecasted that the number of mobile subscriptions to grow from
 To: As shown in Figure 12, the ITU-R forecasted that the number of mobile subscriptions is expected to grow from

Proposed Response Response Status O

IEEE 802.3 BWA Part II Report D1.1 2nd Task Force review comments

CI 3 SC 3.3.2.3 P25 L12 # 51

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Missing "."

SuggestedRemedy

Change: upload)

To: upload.)

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 3 SC 3.3.2.3 P25 L14 # 52

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Article without a noun. Just remove the unnecessary article.

SuggestedRemedy

Change: The average rates for the 2013 to 2017 ranged

To: The average rates for 2013 to 2017 ranged

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 4 SC 4.3 P55 L26 # 53

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Should include the number of countries.

SuggestedRemedy

Change: the Top countries in the world

To: the Top 20 countries in the world

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 4 SC 4.3 P55 L43 # 54

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Subject/verb agreement

SuggestedRemedy

Change: While the number of personal vehicles being sold are understood (currently annual sales is 80 million vehicles)

To: While the number of personal vehicles being sold is understood (currently annual sales are 80 million vehicles)

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 4 SC 4.4 P56 L9 # 55

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

incorrect word

SuggestedRemedy

Change: different between

To: difference between

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 4 SC 4.4 P56 L11 # 56

Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Poor wording

SuggestedRemedy

Change: broad variability in the speeds required by mobile networks to support.

To: broad variability in the speeds mobile networks are required to support.

Proposed Response Response Status O

IEEE 802.3 BWA Part II Report D1.1 2nd Task Force review comments

CI 4 SC 4.5 P56 L22 # 57
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
Comment Type E Comment Status X
redundant number & #
SuggestedRemedy
Change: number #1
To: number 1
Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 4 SC 4.5 P56 L27 # 58
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
Comment Type E Comment Status X
Subject/verb agreement
SuggestedRemedy
Change: connections represents
To: connections represent
Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 4 SC 4.6 P56 L42 # 59
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
Comment Type E Comment Status X
Refer to the subclause, not the page number. The printed page number is not the pdf page number now so typing in "25" when viewing the pdf doesn't take you to the right page.
SuggestedRemedy
Change: review "Bandwidth Growth" on page 25
To: review "Bandwidth Growth", see 3.5,
Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 4 SC 4.6 P56 L48 # 60
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
Comment Type E Comment Status X
I believe the note is supposed to be on the Figure.
SuggestedRemedy
Move the Note to after Figure 51, in the Figure or attached at the end.
Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 00 SC 0 P59 L1 # 61
Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
Comment Type E Comment Status X
Incorrect capitalization
SuggestedRemedy
Change: Furthermore, In
To: Furthermore, in
Proposed Response Response Status O

CI FM SC FM P0 L58 # 62
Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada
Comment Type ER Comment Status X
IEEE 802.3 revision and amendments use continuous, arabic numbering throughout the document starting with page 1 on the front page. Note that it is not even possible to put the page numbers in this spreadshett.
SuggestedRemedy
Start number from page 1 starting with the cover page.
Proposed Response Response Status O

IEEE 802.3 BWA Part II Report D1.1 2nd Task Force review comments

CI 00 SC 0 P0 L19 # 63

Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type E Comment Status X

It is now 2020.

SuggestedRemedy

For the copyright notices change the year from 2019 to 2020.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 00 SC 0 P0 L59 # 64

Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Throughout most of the document there is no footer like we have in the revision and amendments with copyright information. Also, we no longer print out documents so there's no need to put the page number on the outside of left and right pages.

SuggestedRemedy

Use the same footer as used for 802.3 revision and amendments with centered page number and with copyright information.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 00 SC 0 P1 L10 # 65

Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Throughout the document where a percentage is given, there is a space between the digits and the percent symbol. Note that the "%" is a symbol, not a unit; it is analogous to the exponential representation, where 0.01 or 1% is also represented by 1% and 1e-2. Nowhere in 802.3-2018 is there a space between the digits and the % sign.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove space between digits and % character.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 00 SC 0 P1 L23 # 66

Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type E Comment Status X

To represent the various Ethernet rates the abbreviations section conveniently defines acronyms <number>GbE or <number>TbE, with no space. Yet through the document the acronym is used, but with a space between <number> and GbE/TbE.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the space between <number> and GbE/TbE throughout the document.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 00 SC 0 P14 L31 # 67

Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type T Comment Status X

There reference to Table 6 giving 122.1% CAGR, but I don't see any information in Table 6 in that regard.

SuggestedRemedy

Please fix or explain.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 00 SC 0 P21 L27 # 68

Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Throughout the document refer to 4K TV (with capital K). Reference to speculative higher resolution TV formats should use capital K too.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "8k/12k/16k" to "8K/12K/16K" here and anywhere else these occur.

Proposed Response Response Status O

IEEE 802.3 BWA Part II Report D1.1 2nd Task Force review comments

CI 00 SC 0 P23 L50 # 69

Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type T Comment Status X

I don't see how given no data we can extrapolate to "potentially a large bandwidth demand." "Given the forecasted number of passenger cars, the lack of information related to the types of applications and associated bandwidth demands, as well as the wireless connection, the car-to-cloud connection is potentially a large bandwidth demand."

SuggestedRemedy

Change to:
"Given the forecasted number of passenger cars, as well as the wireless connection, the car-to-cloud connection is potentially a large bandwidth demand, however an accurate estimate is not possible due to the lack of information related to the types of applications and associated bandwidth demands."

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 00 SC 0 P24 L40 # 70

Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type T Comment Status X

It is not clear what Figure 25 represents. Even the lead in sentence doesn't help. "Figure 25 is a forecast by application for global wireless traffic from 2011." This section is on automotive, but the descriptions sound more like mobile devices.

SuggestedRemedy

Provide a better explanation of what this represents.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 00 SC 0 P26 L33 # 71

Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Gb should be be Gb/s

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Gb" to "Gb/s"

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 00 SC 0 P29 L30 # 72

Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type E Comment Status X

abbreviation CDN never introduced in text

SuggestedRemedy

Add abbreviation "(CDN)" to section title.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 00 SC 0 P34 L52 # 73

Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type T Comment Status X

The growth rate is in data rate (e.g., Gb/s per day) not data amount (e.g., Gb /d). The trendline is 12.2 Gb/s/day.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "12.2 Gb/d" to "12.2 Gb/s/day" here and in Figure 39.
Change "4.8 Gb/d" to "4.8 Gb/s/day" in Figure 39.
In Figure 43, change "Gb/d" to "Gb/s/day" in two places.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 00 SC 0 P37 L54 # 74

Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type T Comment Status X

Typically, consumed data is specified in bytes, not bits. Gb is gigabits. I'm guessing it was supposed to be GB (gigabytes).

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Gb" to "GB" in two places.

Proposed Response Response Status O

IEEE 802.3 BWA Part II Report D1.1 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 00 *SC* 0 *P*46 *L*9 # 75

Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X**

spelling

SuggestedRemedy

change "different" to "difference"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl 00 *SC* 0 *P*47 *L*29 # 76

Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X**

By convention notes have same character fonts as the other text. There are no brackets.
The dash after "Note" there should be an EM dash with no space before or after.

SuggestedRemedy

Fix this note and all other notes to have format common with other 802.3 documents as described.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl 00 *SC* 0 *P*48 *L*16 # 77

Brown, Matt Huawei Technologies Canada

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **X**

I don't see how the curves for 800GBE and 1.6GbE were generated. I would expect a straight line from the same point where 400 GbE was standardized.

SuggestedRemedy

Please provide a better explanation for the generation of these curves.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**
