

IEEE 802.3af Meeting Minutes

Jan 15, 2002:

The meeting was opened with a review of the agenda. The 802.3af Workgroup Jan Meeting would be devoted to resolution of comments on the Draft 3.0 received from the IEEE Body. The IEEE resolution tool was used to drive the Workgroup comment resolution. The comments were listed on the IEEE 802.3af Web site in pdf files.

The Workgroup received about 490 unique comments with about 400 of the comments categorized as simple editorial comments. It was agreed that the Workgroup would review by exception only the about 400 simple editorial comments. The remaining 90 or so editorial and technical comments would be reviewed individually.

The 90 or so editorial and technical were categorized into 17 categories. The Workgroup addressed the 17 categories in order of the Draft Table of Content and by quantity in the category. These minutes will highlight those editorial and technical comments of the 90 or so editorial and technical comments plus the vote for the about 400 simple editorial comments.

Comments 571, 466 and 397 in the MDI pin assignment 33.2.1 section, there were concerns of the exact (6.13mA) and low active current balancing value. The comment was taken out of the Workgroup to be resolved by an adhoc group of Hank Hinrichs and Steve Ellsworth. Hank and Steve presented a resolution to the workgroup that was accepted in a unanimous vote.

Comment #13 in the PSE MDI 33.2.1 section, there is a concern of redundant wording presented. The section was reworded by the group and resolved.

Comment #519 in the PSE Detection of PDs 33.2.5 section, there is a concern that the detection and rejection criteria are not clearly stated and sometimes contradictory.

Comment #172 is a proposition to increase the detection resistor minimum spec limit from 19k Ω . The comment resolution was assigned to Dave Dwelley and Yair Darshan to work a resolution. No vote was taken.

Comment #41 is on changing the wording of C and D in section 33.2.5.1. Mike McCormack agreed to reword the section.

Jan 16

Comment #563 is on changing to one classification method. The group voted and it was agreed not to change the Draft. The vote was; 14 for voltage and current, 3 for voltage only and 0 for current only.

Comment #646 is from Roger Karam to change the turn on power time from 400ms to 1s. A timing diagram was developed and reviewed by the group. Concerns were discussed of damaging equipment if a port was powering up and a person switched equipment in the port. Incompatible equipment

may be damaged. The 1-second would allow switching g equipment as the 400ms would likely not allow equipment switching. The comment was rejected in principle: Yes 6, No 13 and Abstain 1.

Comment #535 in the PSE power removal 33.2.10 section, there is a concern that the PD_DATA_LINK power removal was not robust and "breaks" the 802.3af Standard. The group discussed the concerns and agreed to remove PD_DATA_LINK power removal voting: Yes 21, No 5 and Abstain 2.

Jan 17

The group voted to accept Motion X that covered comments 308, 253, 560, 337, 335, 302, 668, 478, 645, 603, 559, 580, 110, 443 and all ER (editorial) comments. The vote was Yes 24, No 0, and Abstain 0

Comments #337 and 483 in the Mid-span PSE cabling 33.4.10 section, there is a concern that the section is not clear as in the sub sentence "configurations with one connector." David Pincu presented a rewrite of the section that was accepted by the Group. The TF vote was Yes 20, No 0 and Abstain 0.

Comments #164 in the Mid-span PSE cabling 33.2.8 section, there is a concern that Table 5 Item 5: output current spec in start-up and fault are too tight to meet the 450mA Max current with a 500PPM current sense resistor. The Group voted not to change the spec Yes 10, No 10 and Abstain 2.

Comments #165 in the Mid-span PSE cabling 33.2.8 section, there is a concern that the minimum current spec (10mA) for power removal was too tight for reliable disconnect detect using inexpensive components. The Group voted not to change the spec Yes 10, No 8 and Abstain 3 with an acclamation to investigate the minimum current spec proposal of 11mA. Action item for Yair Darshan and David Dwelley for the next meeting.

The meeting ended with an acceptance of the Nov 2001 Meeting minutes and the vote for Mike McCormack to proceed on the IEEE 802.3af Charter.