

P802.3ak Draft 5.0 Comments

Cl 00 SC P L # 168

Turner, Michelle

Comment Type E Comment Status A E168

At the time of RevCom submittal please remember to supply a separate electronic file for each graphic in TIFF, GIF, EPS, or WMF formats. At this same time, please be sure to supply a list of names and addresses for all members of the working group. This will ensure that each member gets a complimentary copy of the standard upon publication.

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

All graphics will be in an approved format.

Cl 00 SC P L # 167

Turner, Michelle

Comment Type E Comment Status A E167

I noticed on pages 9, 24, 27, 30-33, 35, 37, and 38, there are tables/ and or figures marked as informative in the normative part of the document. In the future, it is preferred that the informative part of the document be moved to an Annex and marked informative.

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

We acknowledge your point and in any future work we will create informative annexes.

Cl 00 SC P 1 L 30 # 214

Law, David

3Com

Comment Type E Comment Status A E214

At a minimum please include an expiration date for the draft, some introductory text would also be useful. Please see a IEEE P802.3ah draft for an example of this text.

SuggestedRemedy

See comment.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Editor will add

"This is the text proposed by the IEEE 802.3ak Task Force editor as draft D5.1 of an amendment to IEEE Std 802.3™-2002 as amended by IEEE Std 802.3-2002ae, IEEE Std 802.3af-2003 and IEEE Std 802.3aj-2003. This draft is being distributed for ballot, as the first recirculation ballot, by the IEEE-SA Balloting Center. The draft has no special status, and THE ENTIRE DRAFT IS SUBJECT TO CHANGE. The formal expiration date of this draft is October 17, 2003." to the bottom of page 1.

Cl 00 SC P 1 L 5 # 218

Law, David

3Com

Comment Type E Comment Status A E218

I believe the text 'Draft amendment to IEEE Standard for' should precede this text.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the text 'Information technology—' to read 'Draft Amendment to IEEE Standard for Information technology—'

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

add line

"Draft Amendment to IEEE Standard for"

above

"Information technology"

P802.3ak Draft 5.0 Comments

Cl 00 SC P2 L15 # 216

Law, David 3Com

Comment Type E Comment Status A E216

Duplicate text. Line 15 states 'Editorial notes will not be carried over into future editions.' then line 17 states 'Editorial notes will not be carried over into future editions because the changes will be incorporated into the base standard.'

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest that the boilerplate text from the style guide be used here, see Clause 21 [<http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/1057/2000Style.pdf#page=27>].

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 00 SC P2 L2 # 217

Law, David 3Com

Comment Type E Comment Status A E217

Please correct title, IEEE Std 802.3-2002 is now ammended by IEEE Std 802.3ae-2003, IEEE STd 802.3af-2003 and IEEE Std 802.3aj-2003.

SuggestedRemedy

See comemnt.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 00 SC P2 L8 # 133

Grow, Robert Intel

Comment Type E Comment Status A E164

Add helpful information to EDITORIAL NOTE.

SuggestedRemedy

At end of first paragraph, insert: (This amendment does not modify any text of IEEE Std 802.3af-2003 or IEEE Std 802.3aj-2003.)

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment #164

Cl 00 SC P3 L1 # 215

Law, David 3Com

Comment Type E Comment Status A E215

Please add the 'special symbols' page, this can be copied from IEEE P802.3ah.

SuggestedRemedy

See comment.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 00 SC 0 P1 L17 # 126

Grow, Robert Intel

Comment Type E Comment Status A E126

Title should not have line break at hyphen

SuggestedRemedy

Insert line feed before ""Type"".

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 00 SC 0 P1 L17 # 75

Dawe, Piers Agilent

Comment Type E Comment Status A E126

Split-up type name

SuggestedRemedy

Can you use a non-breaking hyphen in '10GBASE-CX4' ?

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

See comment #126

Cl 00 SC 0 P2 L1 # 76

Dawe, Piers Agilent

Comment Type E Comment Status A E76

Admendment (in header)

SuggestedRemedy

Amendment

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

P802.3ak Draft 5.0 Comments

CI 00 SC 0 P2 L1 # 77

Dawe, Piers Agilent

Comment Type E Comment Status A E77

More capitalisation than necessary p2 line 1 Amended p20 line 3 Transmit, Receive p20 line 38 Lane p22 line 37 Loopback (several times) p24 line 22 Informative p26 line 15 Signal Shield p30 line 6 Informative p31 line 18 Informative p38 line 52 Clause p39 line 1 Clause

SuggestedRemedy

I believe these should be lower case.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

All to be change to lower case except:

p26, line 15 "Signal Shield" because that is the exact proper name given in Figure 54-3 on page 25.

And

p38 line 52 "Clause" because that comes from a cross reference to the header for clause 54 on page 17.

This is all subject to final editing by the publications editor.

CI 00 SC 0 P2 L1 # 137

Grow, Robert Intel

Comment Type E Comment Status A E137

""Amended"" should be lower case.

SuggestedRemedy

Amended -> amended

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 00 SC FM P2 L6 # 164

Thompson, Geoff

Comment Type E Comment Status A E164

The text: EDITORIAL NOTE?This amendment is based on the current edition of IEEE Std 802.3-2002 plus changes incorporated by IEEE 802.3ae-2002 is incorrect as this amendment needs to be based on all approved corrigenda and amendments to 802.3. This is particularly true for the numbering of items to be folded into Cl. 1

SuggestedRemedy

Change to: EDITORIAL NOTE?This amendment is based on the current edition of IEEE Std 802.3-2002 plus changes incorporated by all approved corrigenda and amendments (IEEE Std 802.3ae-2002, IEEE Std 802.3af-2003, IEEE Std 802.3aj-2003) AND make all appropriate textual changes to the document so that the above is true.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 00 SC General P L # 132

Grow, Robert Intel

Comment Type E Comment Status A E132

Font/style problems. Many of the titles (section and table) are in a serif font, when the IEEE style is sans serif. Because of different fonts, it is impossible to tell if font size is also a problem. Page 10, line 1 Page 11, lines 6, 20, 28 page 12, lines 1, 14 page 13, line 1 page 14, line 50 page 15, lines 8, 19 page 16, lines 1, 3 page 40, line 3

SuggestedRemedy

Check and apply correct style.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 00 SC General P4 L3 # 130

Grow, Robert Intel

Comment Type E Comment Status A E130

Improve editing instructions for material modified by amendments.

SuggestedRemedy

page 4, line 3 -- Change 30.5.1.1.2 as modified by IEEE Std 802.3ae-2002, as follows:
page 6, line 3 -- Change 30B.2 as modified by IEEE Std 802.3ae-2002, as follows:

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Will use:

page 4, line 3: "Change 30.5.1.1.2 as amended by IEEE Std 802.3ae-2002, as follows"
and
page 6 line 3: "Change 30B.2 as amended by IEEE Std 802.3ae-2002, as follows:"

P802.3ak Draft 5.0 Comments

Cl 00 SC General P5 L3 # 127

Grow, Robert

Intel

Comment Type E Comment Status A E127

Change instructions should reference the source amendment as an aid to the reader. Though as new clauses in 802.3ae, these proposed identifications are of significantly less value than the Std 802.3-2002 clauses modified by 802.3ae.

SuggestedRemedy

Consider inserting ""(IEEE Std 802.3ae-2002) following the subclause number in editing instructions at: page 8, lines 3, 11, 27 page 9, lines 4, 20, 47 page 10, lines 12, 34, 48 (insert after ""sections"" page 11, lines 8, 22, 30, 40, 46, 54 page 12, line 12 page 13, line 44 page 14, lines 3, 13, 44, 52 page 15, lines 11, 20, 31 page 16, line 5

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 00 SC many P5 L9 # 79

Dawe, Piers

Agilent

Comment Type E Comment Status A E79

100-Ohm, 100 ohms, 100Omega, 100 Omega, 100 Ohm, 100 ohm

SuggestedRemedy

Pick one. I suggest 100 Omega (using the Greek capital letter).

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Will use 100 ohms, but will only change that which is explicitly written for 10GBASE-CX4 (e.g. will not change 150-ohm for 1000BASE-CX on page 4 line 51).

Cl 01 SC 01.3 P3 L9 # 1

Brown, Benjamin

Independent

Comment Type E Comment Status A E1

Incorrect editing instruction per the header text on page 2

SuggestedRemedy

Replace ""Add"" with ""Insert"" here and page 10, line 48 page 11, line 46

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment #129 for page 3, line 9. page 10, line 48 page 11, line 46 per suggested remedy

Cl 01 SC 1.3 P3 L3 # 128

Grow, Robert

Intel

Comment Type E Comment Status A E128

Improper editing instruction

SuggestedRemedy

Replace editing instruction with: ""Insert the following paragraph in 1.3 in alphanumeric order.""

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 01 SC 1.3 P3 L6 # 78

Dawe, Piers

Agilent

Comment Type E Comment Status A E78

Punctuation

SuggestedRemedy

Change '113 .Connectors' to '113, Connectors'

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 01 SC 1.4 P3 L6 # 165

Thompson, Geoff

Comment Type E Comment Status A E165

Missing heading text: Lines after line 5 are not references.

SuggestedRemedy

Put in missing heading for definitions.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Will add heading for line 9. Paragraph starting at line 5 is under heading 1.3.

Cl 01 SC 1.4 P3 L8 # 129

Grow, Robert

Intel

Comment Type E Comment Status A E129

Missing section title, and improper editing instruction. 1.4.276 is not the right number after applying 802.3ae delete and inserts.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert: 1.4 Definitions Replace editing instruction with: Insert the following alphabetically into 1.4. Renummer as required. 1.4.xxx Twinaxial cable: ...""

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

P802.3ak Draft 5.0 Comments

CI 30B SC 30B.2 P 6 L 1 # 131
 Grow, Robert Intel
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E131
 Annexes are after clauses even in change pages.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Move to end of change section., before annex 48B change instruction.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 44 SC 44.3 P 9 L 17 # 80
 Dawe, Piers Agilent
 Comment Type E Comment Status R E80
 We don't want to tamper with 802.3ae but as this sentence doesn't affect compliance, we might as well fix it: The sentence 'The speed of light in a vacuum is $c = 3 \times 10^8$ m/s.' is written as a statement of fact and is not quite true.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to 'is nearly' or 'is approximately' or maybe better, 'is very close to'.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 REJECT.
 C is specified correctly for the level of precision offered (i.e. one significant digit).

CI 44 SC 44.3 P 9 L 44 # 138
 Grow, Robert Intel
 Comment Type E Comment Status R E138
 The new material should probably be added to the LX4 line.
 SuggestedRemedy
 With appropriate change marking make single table row read: Multi-lane PMD | 512 | 1 | LX4 PMD includes 2 meters of fiber, see 53.2. CX4 PMD, see 54.3.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 REJECT.
 Since CX4 does not contain fiber it should be kept separate.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.10 P 11 L 46 # 139
 Grow, Robert Intel
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E139
 Add is not one of the four defined change instructions.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Ewplace instruction with: Insert the following before 45.2.1.10 (IEEE Std 802.3ae).
 Renumber current 45.2.1.10, renumber current Tables 45-11 through 45-65. Delete the editing instruction on line 54.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.10 P 11 L 50 # 82
 Dawe, Piers Agilent
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E82
 Grammar
 SuggestedRemedy
 The assignment ... is shown ...
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.6.1 P 10 L 28 # 134
 Grow, Robert Intel
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E134
 Incomplete marking of changes.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Need a line in strikethrough (or ""Reserved"" in strikethrough) 0 0 0= Reserved
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.7 P 10 L 34 # 135
 Grow, Robert Intel
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E135
 Confusing change instruction, only one bit is being modified.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete ""(s)"".
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

P802.3ak Draft 5.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.7 P 10 L 48 # 136

Grow, Robert

Intel

Comment Type E Comment Status A E136

Add is not one of the four defined change instructions.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace instruction with: Insert the following before 45.2.1.7.6 (IEEE Std 802.3ae).
Renumber current 45.2.17.6 through 45.2.1.7.14.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.3 P 12 L 44 # 140

Grow, Robert

Intel

Comment Type E Comment Status A E140

The PICS items are now out of section order. The intent of not changing the PICS number is laudable, but with inserts we usually go to a letter suffix.

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest changing the editing instructions to: Change PICS item MM43 in 45.5.5.3 (IEEE Std 802.3-2002) as follows: Then move current MM44 above current newly modified MM43 and renumber MM43a and MM43b.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC Table 45-7 P 10 L 28 # 2

Brown, Benjamin

Independent

Comment Type E Comment Status A E134

Missing deletion

SuggestedRemedy

When assigning the value 10GBASE-CX4 to 000, you deleted the word Reserved. This word should still appear with strikethrough.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

See comment #134

Cl 45 SC Table 45-8 P 10 L 39 # 3

Brown, Benjamin

Independent

Comment Type E Comment Status A E3

I believe it is typical to reproduce the entire table when a change is made to it, as was done to 45-7. At least, that's what I've been TR'ed on in EFM.

SuggestedRemedy

Reproduce the entire Table 45-8.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 48 SC 48.1.2 P 14 L 13 # 219

Law, David

3Com

Comment Type E Comment Status A E219

The editorial instruction should be replace, not change. If change is being used the changes need to be shown in underscore and strikethrough

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest that the text 'Change Figure 48-1 as follows (added 10GBASE-CX4 below 10GBASE-LX4):' should read 'Replace Figure 48-1 with the following (added 10GBASE-CX4 below 10GBASE-LX4):'.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

According to the editorial instructions "change" is used when small changes are being made and "replace" is used when large sections of text are being used. Will add underline to "10GBASE-CX4"

Cl 48 SC Figure 48-1 P 14 L 19 # 84

Dawe, Piers

Agilent

Comment Type E Comment Status A E84

Obsolete style of diagram refers to ""LLC - LOGICAL LINK CONTROL"" as the exclusive MAC CLIENT for 802.3.

SuggestedRemedy

See fig 40-1 and e.g. 802.3ah D2.0 comment 989.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Will use Figure 40-1 wording

P802.3ak Draft 5.0 Comments

Cl 48 SC Figure 48-1 P14 L19 # 83

Dawe, Piers Agilent

Comment Type E Comment Status A E83

Some of the dashed lines didn't print out and appear to be in grey in the pdf.

SuggestedRemedy

Change them to black. Also if convenient, change the grey fill to hatching per published 802.3ae.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Will consult with other framemaker experts to resolve this printout issue.

Cl 48 SC Figure 48-1 P14 L37 # 85

Dawe, Piers Agilent

Comment Type E Comment Status R E85

10GIGABIT

SuggestedRemedy

10 GIGABIT

Proposed Response Response Status C

REJECT.

This is a comment against how the text is in 802.3ae. We are not fixing anything in 802.3ae, this should be done through a maintenance request.

Cl 54 SC 12.3.1 P40 L8 # 12

Brown, Benjamin Independent

Comment Type E Comment Status A E12

There is a PICs item, CC1, without a corresponding shall

SuggestedRemedy

Each shall needs exactly 1 PICS item

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Will change text of 10.1 to "The data pattern for jitter measurements shall be the CJPAT ..."

Cl 54 SC 54.1 P19 L1 # 221

Law, David 3Com

Comment Type E Comment Status A E221

Suggest the text '.. of the PMD and ..' should be changed to read '.. of the 10GBASE-CX4 PMD and ..'.

SuggestedRemedy

See comment.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.1 P19 L16 # 18

Dove, Daniel HP ProCurve Networki

Comment Type E Comment Status A E18

In figure 54-1, the box containing the words ""10GBASE-X PCS"" needs to be sized up a bit to contain the words completely. Right now the final ""S"" is covered by the line.

SuggestedRemedy

Resize the boxes containing PCS, PMA and PMD.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.1.2 P19 L30 # 171

Dawe, Piers Agilent

Comment Type E Comment Status R E171

Bearing in mind that: This addition may be published separately; Even if not, 802.3 is split into separate pdf files; and PMD clause readers often have more expertise in the matter in hand than in Ethernet generally; in EFM we have found it helpful to give guidance to the reader so that he can find the support material elsewhere in 802.3

SuggestedRemedy

Add a new subclause 54.1.3 Terminology and conventions. The following list contains references to terminology and conventions used in this clause: Basic terminology and conventions, see Clause 1.1 and Clause 1.2. Normative references, see Clause 1.3. Definitions, see Clause 1.4. Abbreviations, see Clause 1.5. Informative references, see Annex A. Introduction to 10 Gb/s baseband network, see Clause 44.

Proposed Response Response Status C

REJECT.

This comment will be referred to the publications editor.

P802.3ak Draft 5.0 Comments

Cl 54 SC 54.10 P 38 L 39 # 42

Baumer, Howard Broadcom Corp

Comment Type E Comment Status A E42

This sub-clause only has one sub section. Standard outlining practices have 2 or more sub sections. This section does not explicitly call out which patterns and procedures of Annex 48A are to be used.

SuggestedRemedy

Move this sub-clause to after 54.7.3.8 numbering it 54.7.3.9 and renumber all following sections accordingly. Change: "... the CJPAT pattern defined in Annex 48A" to "... the CJPAT pattern defined in Annex 48A.5"

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.12 P 39 L 2 # 124

Dawe, Piers Agilent

Comment Type E Comment Status A E124

Punctuation

SuggestedRemedy

Change 54., to 54,

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.12.2 P 42 L 7 # 69

Bradshaw, Peter BitBlitz Communicatio

Comment Type E Comment Status A TR54

MF1: Global_PMD_Disable is optional (see 54.5.6, line 10), but the PICS treats it as mandatory.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the MF1 'Status' to MD:O, and allow a 'No []' Support value

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment \$54

Cl 54 SC 54.12.2.1 P 39 L 53 # 74

Bradshaw, Peter BitBlitz Communicatio

Comment Type E Comment Status A E74

The Copyright release for PICS proforma uses 'in this annex'; it should be 'in this subclause' (as for 8.8.3.1, 14.10.1.4, 15.8.3.1, 17.5, 22.7.2.3, 45.5.4.2, ... & many more) (there is a use of 'in this clause' in 16.6.3.1, 18.5.2.2) In 802.3-2002, 'Annex' only appears in the PICS for Annex 31B & Annex 43B (correctly) and (incorrectly) in 43.7.2.1, whence it appears to have been copied into much of 802.3ae-2002.

SuggestedRemedy

Change 'in this annex' to 'in this subclause'

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.12.3.1 P 40 L 3 # 43

Baumer, Howard Broadcom Corp

Comment Type E Comment Status A E43

There is only one sub-clause item, there should be 2 or more to have sub-clause items

SuggestedRemedy

Remove sub-clause 54.12.3.1 heading, leaving the table and its text under sub-clause 54.12.3

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.12.3.1 P 40 L 8 # 44

Baumer, Howard Broadcom Corp

Comment Type E Comment Status A E44

Pics item CC1 is placed in the wrong section.

SuggestedRemedy

Move CC1 to 54.12.4.3 and place after DS14 renumber DS15 and up accordingly.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

P802.3ak Draft 5.0 Comments

Cl 54 SC 54.12.4 P 40 L 18 # 159
 Grow, Robert Intel
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E159
 The XGE major option is confusing because of the use of ""compatibility"".
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove ""compatibility"" in both Feature and Value columns.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.12.4 P 40 L 21 # 45
 Baumer, Howard Broadcom Corp
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E45
 Feature entry says ""XAU / XGXS"" which is not what is in 54.1 Table 54-1
 SuggestedRemedy
 Changed ""XAU / XGXS"" to ""XGXS and XAU"" so it matches what is in Table 54-1
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.12.4 P 40 L 30 # 47
 Baumer, Howard Broadcom Corp
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E47
 What is the purpose of the """" in front of ""MD""?
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change ""*MD"" to ""MD""
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.12.4.1 P 41 L 16 # 161
 Grow, Robert Intel
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E161
 Typo.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change ""SL0<p>/1"" to ""SL0<p>/<n>"".
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.12.4.1 P 41 L 20 # 162
 Grow, Robert Intel
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E162
 Incorrect language for the referenced shall. The first paragraph is about converting the electrical signals to PMD_UNITDATA.indicate signals.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change ""Convey"" to ""Convert"".
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.12.4.1 P 41 L 30 # 163
 Grow, Robert Intel
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E163
 Improve the Comment.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Chante to read: ""Report state via PMD_SIGNAL.indicate(SIGNAL_DETECT)""
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.12.4.1 P 41 L 35 # 49
 Baumer, Howard Broadcom Corp
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E49
 PF11-18 numbering is not sequentially numbered from PF1-8.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Renumber PF11+ to be sequential starting with PF9
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.12.4.1 P 41 L 39 # 51
 Baumer, Howard Broadcom Corp
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E51
 Value / Comment field is incomplete and doesn't match the text of 54.5.4
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change: ""... at least 1 UI"" to ""... at least 1 UI on each of the 4 lanes""
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

P802.3ak Draft 5.0 Comments

Cl 54 SC 54.12.4.1 P 41 L 44 # 52

Baumer, Howard Broadcom Corp

Comment Type E Comment Status A E52

Value / Comment field is incomplete and doesn't match the text of 54.5.4

SuggestedRemedy

Change: "... 250ms to 500ms" to "... 250ms to 500ms on any lane"

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change: "... 250us to 500us" to "... 250us to 500us on any of the 4 lanes"

Cl 54 SC 54.12.4.1 P 41 L 47 # 13

Brown, Benjamin Independent

Comment Type E Comment Status A TR53

Missing predicate on PICs item, PF16

SuggestedRemedy

Replace Status "M" with "MD:M"

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment #53

Cl 54 SC 54.12.4.1 P 41 L 5 # 28

Dove, Daniel HP ProCurve Networki

Comment Type E Comment Status A E28

The word Support should be corrected to "Support"

SuggestedRemedy

Resize table to get Support into a single line.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.12.4.1 P 41 L 7 # 160

Grow, Robert Intel

Comment Type E Comment Status A E160

Incorrect language for the referenced shall. The first paragraph is about converting the PMD_UNITDATA.request signals to electrical signals.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Convey" to "Convert".

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.12.4.2 P 42 L 29 # 71

Bradshaw, Peter BitBlitz Communicatio

Comment Type E Comment Status A E71

MF8: the 'PMD_Transmit_fault_n' bits are described as dependant on 'transmit path x'. The use of 'n' and 'x' is confusing, and apparently incorrect. The ending '_n' seems to imply a lane-by-lane function, and the 'x' to imply a similar meaning. But the functions described in 802.3akD5P0 54.5.10 and 802.3ae 53.4.10 and 45.2.1.7.4 are all one bit functions. It appears that the text was copied from 802.3ae 53.15.4.3 MR6, which also appears similarly confused (like MR7, which uses '_x' in place of '_n').

SuggestedRemedy

Remove both the '_n' and the 'x', so that it reads 'Sets PMD_Transmit_fault to a logical 1 if any local fault is detected on the transmit path, otherwise set to 0'

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.12.4.2 P 42 L 33 # 72

Bradshaw, Peter BitBlitz Communicatio

Comment Type E Comment Status A E72

MF9: the 'PMD_Receive_fault_n' bits are described as dependant on 'receive path x'. The use of 'n' and 'x' is confusing, and apparently incorrect. The ending '_n' seems to imply a lane-by-lane function, and the 'x' to imply a similar meaning. But the functions described in 802.3akD5P0 54.5.11 and 802.3ae 53.4.11 and 45.2.1.7.5 are all one bit functions. It appears that the text was copied from 802.3ae 53.15.4.3 MR6 and 7, which also appear similarly confused (MR7 uses '_x' in place of '_n').

SuggestedRemedy

Remove both the '_n' and the 'x', so that it reads 'Sets PMD_Receive_fault to a logical 1 if any local fault is detected on the receive path, otherwise set to 0'

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.12.4.2 P 42 L 7 # 68

Bradshaw, Peter BitBlitz Communicatio

Comment Type E Comment Status A E68

The 'Not Applicable' designation in this subclause uses 'NA' All other PICS tables I can find (certainly all in 802.3ae) use 'N/A' for not applicable items, and section 8.8.3.4 of 802.3-2002 also calls for this usage. Conformance enhances the user's ability to scan long documents for such a category of PICS items.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace 'NA' by 'N/A' throughout

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

P802.3ak Draft 5.0 Comments

CI 54 SC 54.12.4.2 P 42 L 9 # 14
 Brown, Benjamin Independent
 Comment Type E Comment Status A TR55
 This PICs item, MF2, is optional, not mandatory, just like MF3
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace Status ""MD:M"" with ""MD:O""
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #55

CI 54 SC 54.12.4.3 P 43 L 14 # 61
 Baumer, Howard Broadcom Corp
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E61
 ""Feature"" and ""Value / comment"" fields are not consistent with text.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change: ""Maximum transmitter output amplitude"" to ""Maximum transmitter differential peak-to-peak output amplitude"" Change: ""... mVppd"" to ""... mVpp""
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change: ""Maximum transmitter output amplitude"" to ""Maximum transmitter differential peak-to-peak output amplitude"" Change: ""... mVppd"" to ""... mV""

CI 54 SC 54.12.4.3 P 43 L 34 # 16
 Brown, Benjamin Independent
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E16
 There is a PICs item, DS14, without a corresponding shall
 SuggestedRemedy
 Each shall needs exactly 1 PICS item
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 The shall is in 54.7.3.8, will change subclause entry to 54.7.3.8

CI 54 SC 54.2 P 19 L 34 # 222
 Law, David 3Com
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E222
 Suggest this paragraph be change to read: The 10GBASE-CX4 PMD utilizes the PMD service interface defined in 53.1.1. The PMD service interface is summarized below:
 PMD_UNITDATA.request PMD_UNITDATA.indicate PMD_SIGNAL.indicate
 SuggestedRemedy
 See comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 54 SC 54.3 P 19 L 46 # 92
 Dawe, Piers Agilent
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E92
 Broken quantity
 SuggestedRemedy
 Use nonbreaking space in '512 BT'. Also p29 line 34, '0.270 UI' (where can prune a trailing 0).
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 54 SC 54.3 P 19 L 47 # 91
 Dawe, Piers Agilent
 Comment Type E Comment Status R E91
 Please add cross reference as service to the reader to explain terminology and give associated information.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add new sentence: 'See 44.3.'
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 REJECT.
 This would cause a circular cross reference as 44.3 references 54.3.

P802.3ak Draft 5.0 Comments

CI 54 SC 54.4 P 19 L 51 # 93
 Dawe, Piers Agilent
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E93
 as ... as needs a comma
 SuggestedRemedy
 ... 10GBASE-LX4, as defined ...
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 54 SC 54.5 P 20 L 3 # 225
 Law, David 3Com
 Comment Type E Comment Status R E225
 The text states '.. Transmit and Receive functions which convey data between the PMD service interface and the MDI ..' however it is the transmit that conveys data from PMD service interface to the MDI, the receive function conveys data from the MDI to the PMD service interface.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Reword as required.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 REJECT.
 It is the transmit that conveys data from the PMD to the MDI and it is the receive that conveys data from the MDI to the PMD, however, when both transmit and receive functions are taken together they convey data between the PMD and the MDI or it could be reworded as they convey data between the MDI and the PMD. The "between" implies data is being conveyed in both directions.

CI 54 SC 54.5 P 20 L 4 # 172
 Bill Quackenbush Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E172
 The text would be clearer if "plus various management functions" was changed to "and provides various management functions".
 SuggestedRemedy
 See comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.
 Will change:
 "... MDI plus various management functions ..."
 to
 "... MDI, and provides various management functions ..."

CI 54 SC 54.5.1 P 20 L 26 # 141
 Grow, Robert Intel
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E141
 I think all text in figures is supposed to be Helvetica, (though rummored to be changing to Arial).
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change font style to sans serif. Correct note style ""NOTE--""
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 54 SC 54.5.1 P 20 L 9-41 # 175
 Bill Quackenbush Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status A T223
 Figure 54-2 is not a block diagram of the PMD, it is a block diagram of a one side of a CX4 link, as the title of the figure states, and the PMD portion of the diagram is NOT specifically identified. The text in lines 9-15 deals with link issues, not with the PMD.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change the title of the subsection to "Link Block Diagram" and change the text of the first sentence accordingly. Specifically indicate the blocks in the diagram that are portions on of the PMD.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.
 See comment #223
 UI has already been defined by 802.3ae.

CI 54 SC 54.5.2 P 20 L 52 # 94
 Dawe, Piers Agilent
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E94
 Broken quantity
 SuggestedRemedy
 Ask EFM or staff editor whether template can be fixed to stop line breaks at / as in:
 SL2<p>/ <n>
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

P802.3ak Draft 5.0 Comments

CI 54 SC 54.5.3 P21 L 4 # 95
 Dawe, Piers Agilent
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E95
 Broken quantity
 SuggestedRemedy
 Try removing the space in 'PMD_UNITDATA.indicate (rx_bit<0:3>)' or using nonbreaking space. If the result looks bad, forget it!
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 The result looks bad if the space is removed.

CI 54 SC 54.5.4 P21 L 14 # 96
 Dawe, Piers Agilent
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E142
 font size
 SuggestedRemedy
 ... of Global_PMD_signal_detect. Also p42 line 12, Global_PMD_transmit_disable (in value/comment column) and line 22, PMD_transmit_disable_n
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 54 SC 54.5.4 P21 L 14 # 4
 Brown, Benjamin Independent
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E142
 Wrong size font
 SuggestedRemedy
 Correct the font size on the variable ""Global_PMD_signal_detect""
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 54 SC 54.5.4 P21 L 14 # 5
 Brown, Benjamin Independent
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E5
 There are 2 PICS items PF8 and PF11 for this 1 shall
 SuggestedRemedy
 Each shall needs exactly 1 PICS item
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.
 PF11 will be deleted.

CI 54 SC 54.5.4 P21 L 14 # 142
 Grow, Robert Intel
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E142
 Font size problem
 SuggestedRemedy
 Correct.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 54 SC 54.5.4 P21 L 21 # 97
 Dawe, Piers Agilent
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E97
 Missing spaces between quantities and their units
 SuggestedRemedy
 Insert (nonbreaking) space into: 175mVpp 100us 50mVpp 50mVpp 250us 50mVpp 50mVpp 500us. And p24 line 14, '15m'. And p25 line 34, p28 line 13 and following, p31 line 14.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

P802.3ak Draft 5.0 Comments

Cl 54 SC 54.5.4 P 21 L 21 # 109

Dawe, Piers Agilent

Comment Type E Comment Status A E109

Some readers have been caught out by 'UI'. It's in the abbreviations list, and I hope 802.3ah will add 'unit interval' to the definitions list, but to be kind to the reader, as this is the first use in 802.3ak,

SuggestedRemedy

Change: at least 1 UI to: at least 1 UI (unit interval). If ak is going to beat ah to publication, add 'unit interval' to the definitions list 1.4: The period of time allocated for transmission of one symbol; the inverse of signalling [signaling] rate.

Proposed Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.5.4 P 21 L 22 # 193

Law, David 3Com

Comment Type E Comment Status A E193

Typo.

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest the text '.. shall occur within 100µs after the condition for SIGNAL_DETECT = OK has been received.' should read '.. shall occur within 100µs of the condition for SIGNAL_DETECT = OK being met.'.

Proposed Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

See comment #194

Cl 54 SC 54.5.4 P 21 L 25 # 6

Brown, Benjamin Independent

Comment Type E Comment Status A E6

There is 1 PICs item, PF14, for 2 shalls, this one and the one on line 27

SuggestedRemedy

Each shall needs exactly 1 PICS item

Proposed Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.5.4 P 21 L 48 # 33

Baumer, Howard Broadcom Corp

Comment Type E Comment Status A E33

As part of the resolution to D4.0 comment #116, which with refinement during D4.1 comment resolution, an informative NOTE was left out of D4.2.

SuggestedRemedy

Add in the agreed upon informative note: Note: SIGNAL_DETECT may not activate with a continuous 1010... pattern such as the high frequency pattern of 48A.1, but it will trigger during the IPG.

Proposed Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.5.4 P 21 L 52 # 143

Grow, Robert Intel

Comment Type E Comment Status A E33

Insert Jonathan's as indicated in editor's note.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert, but correct style to IEEE NOTE -- format and correct the spelling of during (sic, durning).

Proposed Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.5.4 P 21 L 53 # 192

Law, David 3Com

Comment Type E Comment Status A E192

Typo.

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest the text '.. trigger durning ..' should read '.. trigger during ..'.

Proposed Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment #99

P802.3ak Draft 5.0 Comments

Cl 54 SC 54.5.4 P21 L 53 # 19

Dove, Daniel

HP ProCurve Networki

Comment Type E Comment Status A E19

Spelling error ""during"" is not a word.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace with the word ""during"".

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.5.5 P22 L 4 # 100

Dawe, Piers

Agilent

Comment Type E Comment Status A E100

This doesn't read well: each PMD_signal_detect_n, where n represents the lane number in the range 0:3, value shall ...

SuggestedRemedy

Move the 'value': each PMD_signal_detect_n value, where n represents the lane number in the range 0:3, shall ...

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.5.5 P22 L 4 # 197

Law, David

3Com

Comment Type E Comment Status A E100

Suggest that text '.. each PMD_signal_detect_n, where n represents the lane number in the range 0:3, value shall ..' should read '.. each PMD_signal_detect_n value, where n represents the lane number in the range 0:3, shall ..' (move the word value).

SuggestedRemedy

See comment.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

See comment #100

Cl 54 SC 54.5.5 P22 L 5 # 196

Law, David

3Com

Comment Type E Comment Status A E196

The text states '.. be continuously set in response to the ..' however it is usual in 802.3 to 'set to 1' and 'clear to 0'.

SuggestedRemedy

Reword as required.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

'.. be continuously updated in response to the ..'

Cl 54 SC 54.5.6 P22 L 10 # 174

Bill Quackenbush

Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status A E174

The text would be clearer if the sentence was changed to "The Global_PMD_transmit_disable function is optional. When implemented, it allows all of the transmitters to be disabled with a single control bit."

SuggestedRemedy

See comment.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Will change to:
"The Global_PMD_transmit_disable function is optional. When implemented, it allows all of the transmitters to be disabled with a single variable."

Cl 54 SC 54.5.6 P22 L 15 # 195

Law, David

3Com

Comment Type E Comment Status A E195

Suggest a cross reference be added for PMD_fault.

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest the text '.. PMD_fault ..' should read '.. PMD_fault (54.5.9).

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

P802.3ak Draft 5.0 Comments

CI 54 SC 54.5.6 P 22 L 16 # 34

Baumer, Howard Broadcom Corp

Comment Type E Comment Status A E34

Grammar correction: ""Loopback as defined in 54.5.8 ..."" s/b ""Loopback, as defined, in 54.5.8 ...""

SuggestedRemedy

Change ""Loopback as defined in 54.5.8 ..."" to ""Loopback, as defined, in 54.5.8 ...""

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change ""Loopback as defined in 54.5.8 ..."" to ""Loopback, as defined in 54.5.8, ...""

CI 54 SC 54.5.7 P 22 L 29 # 15

Brown, Benjamin Independent

Comment Type E Comment Status A TR59

There is a shall statement without a PICs item

SuggestedRemedy

Each shall needs exactly 1 PICS item There may be some overlap between this shall and the shalls in bullets a) and c) - my point being that this shall effectively removes the MD optional predicate on PICs items MF4 and MF6. I don't know how to fix this but it seems a little weird.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

There is no shall on page 21, line 29. The shall is on line 27 and is covered by comment #6.

See comment #57 and #59 for remedy of MF4 and MF6.

CI 54 SC 54.5.7 P 22 L 32 # 20

Dove, Daniel HP ProCurve Networki

Comment Type E Comment Status A E20

Consistency: The word ""highly"" is highly unnecessary and highly inconsistent with the similar statement on line 52.

SuggestedRemedy

remove the word ""highly"".

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 54 SC 54.5.8 P 22 L 37 # 144

Grow, Robert Intel

Comment Type E Comment Status A E144

Needs a comma.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert a comma after ""When loopback mode is selected"".

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 54 SC 54.5.8 P 22 L 45 # 67

Bradshaw, Peter BitBlitz Communicatio

Comment Type E Comment Status A E67

... through the MDIO management interface of 45 or equivalent.' I do not think the Scottish Highlander's attempt to place Bonnie Prince Charlie on the UK throne will help with controlling Loopback Mode (on second thoughts... Hmmm)

SuggestedRemedy

Insert 'Clause ' before '45'

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 54 SC 54.5.8 P 22 L 45 # 145

Grow, Robert Intel

Comment Type E Comment Status A E145

Unnecessary reduncancy on optionality of MDIO.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace with a simple cross reference to appropriate subclause of 45. ""Control of the Loopback function is specified in Clause 45.x.x.""

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

P802.3ak Draft 5.0 Comments

CI 54 SC 54.6 P 22 L # 232

Taich, Dimitry

Comment Type E Comment Status A

The first sentence of the paragraph says "The Global_PMD_transmit_disable function is optional and allows all of the transmitters to be disabled". However, PICs form (page 42, items MF1 & MF2) defines Global_PMD_transmit_disable feature as mandatory (in case that MDIO is implemented). It seems to be contradictable set of requirements.

SuggestedRemedy

Change PICs form, page 42, items MF1 and MF2, "status" field to "O" instead of "M"

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comments #54 & #55

CI 54 SC 54.6 P 23 L 16-45 # 177

Bill Quackenbush

Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status A E177

Since the MDI passes through the connector, the connector pinout should be in the section on the MDI

SuggestedRemedy

See comment.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 54 SC 54.6 P 23 L 19 # 101

Dawe, Piers

Agilent

Comment Type E Comment Status A E101

Missing period

SuggestedRemedy

54.9.1. The ...

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 54 SC 54.7 P 24 L 1 # 182

Bill Quackenbush

Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status A E182

The title of this section appears to be incorrect. The MDI is the interface between the PMD and the medium. The specifications in this clause apply to the MDI. PMD should not be in the title.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the title to "MDI Electrical Specifications"

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 54 SC 54.7.1 P 24 L 5 # 230

Taich, Dimitry

Comment Type E Comment Status A

As written one may interpret this clause as requiring AC coupling between PMD and MDI for BOTH Tx and Rx paths. But the intention was to enforce AC coupling only on the receive path (see 54.7.4.3).

SuggestedRemedy

Rephrase clause 54.7.1 as follows: The 10 GBASE-CX4 MDI is a low-swing AC-coupled differential interface. Transmitter to receiver path AC-coupling (as defined in 54.7.4.3) allows for interoperability between components operating from different supply voltages. Low-swing differential signaling provides noise immunity and improved electromagnetic interference (EMI)."

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Will change the beginning of paragraph 2 to:

"Transmitter to receiver path AC-coupling, as defined in 54.7.4.3, allows ..." with the appropriate reference.

P802.3ak Draft 5.0 Comments

Cl 54 SC 54.7.1 P 24 L 6 # 102

Dawe, Piers Agilent

Comment Type E Comment Status R E102

Dubious advertising claim in 'Low-swing differential signaling provides noise immunity and improved electromagnetic interference (EMI).' If the noise comes from somewhere else, a low swing is liable to be worse not improved. I'm sure this standard will sell on solid merits.

SuggestedRemedy

Low-swing differential signaling assists electromagnetic compatibility.' or 'Low-swing differential signaling may reduce noise generation and assist electromagnetic compatibility.' or strike the sentence.

Proposed Response Response Status C

REJECT.

Task force believes the text as stated is appropriate.

Cl 54 SC 54.7.2 P 24 L 19 # 199

Law, David 3Com

Comment Type E Comment Status A E146

Typo.

SuggestedRemedy

Table54-4' should read 'Table 54-4'.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment #146.

Cl 54 SC 54.7.3 P 24 L 19 # 146

Grow, Robert Intel

Comment Type E Comment Status A E146

Possible missing cross references.

SuggestedRemedy

Line 19 -- Insert space in Table54-4. (The lack of a space indicates that this is probably not a FrameMaker cross reference.) Line 41 -- Capitalization. The lower case indicates perhaps not a FrameMaker cross reference.)

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.7.3 P 24 L 19 # 7

Brown, Benjamin Independent

Comment Type E Comment Status A E146

missing space

SuggestedRemedy

Replace ""Table54-4"" with ""Table 54-5""

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment #146

Cl 54 SC 54.7.3 P 24 L 27 # 181

Bill Quackenbush Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status A E181

" +/- 100 ppm" is a tolerance, not a range.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "range" to "tolerance"

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Will replace "range" with "per lane", and change value to 3.125 +/- 100ppm to be consistent with 10GBASE-LX4.

Cl 54 SC 54.7.3.2 P 25 L 33 # 178

Bill Quackenbush Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status R E178

Change "differential impedance" to "differential input impedance" for greater clarity.

SuggestedRemedy

See comment.

Proposed Response Response Status C

REJECT.

This is the test fixture impedance and not a specific input impedance.

P802.3ak Draft 5.0 Comments

Cl 54 SC 54.7.3.2 P29 L27 # 107
 Dawe, Piers Agilent
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E107
 Compare '100 MHz to 2000 MHz' and '60 and 130 ps'. I think the style guide expresses a preference for repeating the unit or not (I don't have it with me to check).
 SuggestedRemedy
 Be consistent
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.
 Will change to "... 60 ps and 130 ps ..."

Cl 54 SC 54.7.3.3 P25 L38 # 200
 Law, David 3Com
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E200
 On line 38 the symbol 'GBaud' is used yet on page 24, Line 26 the symbol 'GBd' is used. The same issue exists for ohms (line 33) and the omega symbol (page 31, line 9) and 'Gbps' (page 30, line 41).
 SuggestedRemedy
 Please use a consistent symbol. It appears 'GBd', the omega symbol and 'Gb/s' were used in IEEE Std 802.3ae-2002 Clause 47. Please correct this globally.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.7.3.3 P25 L38 # 108
 Dawe, Piers Agilent
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E108
 GBaud or GBd? Mostly using GBd.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change GBaud to GBd
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.7.3.4 P26 L11 # 180
 Bill Quackenbush Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E180
 For greater specificity, change the sentence to "Figure 54-4 illustrates the definition of differential peak-to-peak voltage."
 SuggestedRemedy
 See comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Will change to "... the definition ...".

Cl 54 SC 54.7.3.4 P26 L7 # 203
 Law, David 3Com
 Comment Type E Comment Status A TR151
 Either use the term mVp-p (line 7) or mVPP (page 24, line 32). Please correct this globally.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Please use a consistent symbol. It appears Vp-p was used in Clause 47. Please correct this globally.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #151.

Cl 54 SC 54.7.3.5 P27 L3 # 110
 Dawe, Piers Agilent
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E110
 Another style thing: f is in italics in the equation but not in the main text.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Consider putting f in italics (several times)
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Current text versus equation font style appears to be consistent with other clauses (i.e. Clause 40). Will request the publications editor to check all equations for font consistency.

P802.3ak Draft 5.0 Comments

Cl 54 SC 54.7.3.5 Figure 54-5 P 27 L 39 # 183
 Bill Quackenbush Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 The minimum specification for return loss is hard to see between 100 and 625 MHz.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Make the line representing the minimum return loss wider so that it is distinct from the grid lines.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.7.3.5 Figure 54-5 P 27 L 48 # 184
 Bill Quackenbush Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status R E184
 The title should be "Minimum Transmit output differential return loss (informative)"
 SuggestedRemedy
 See comment
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 REJECT.
 This is an informative graph and the limits are set in the text.

Cl 54 SC 54.7.3.6 P 28 L 13 # 115
 Dawe, Piers Agilent
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E115
 2.5UIs
 SuggestedRemedy
 2.5 UI
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.7.3.6 P 28 L 16 # 116
 Dawe, Piers Agilent
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E116
 Can you hold these mini-equations each on one line: $V_{off} = (V_{lowp} + V_{lowm}) / 2$ and
 Normalized Waveform = (Original Waveform - Voff) * (0.69 / Vnorm).
 SuggestedRemedy
 per comment, if practicable.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.7.3.6 P 28 L 25 # 21
 Dove, Daniel HP ProCurve Networki
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E21
 Three significant digits are not necessary and inconsistent with other figures.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Reformat the axes to zero significant digits to be consistent with other figures.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Will reformat so both x-axis and y-axis are one significant digit after the decimal point.

Cl 54 SC 54.7.3.6 P 28 L 26 # 23
 Dove, Daniel HP ProCurve Networki
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E23
 For Piers Dawe: Use of half-tone in figures is unnecessary and inconsistent with IEEE 802.3 documents.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Please reformat figures to black and white.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.
 Will reformat in B&W.

Cl 54 SC 54.7.3.6 P 28 L 50 # 22
 Dove, Daniel HP ProCurve Networki
 Comment Type E Comment Status A T118
 Unnecessary term ""as measured"" in description of figure.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove ""as measured"".
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #118

P802.3ak Draft 5.0 Comments

Cl 54 SC 54.7.3.7 P 29 L 27 # 8
 Brown, Benjamin Independent
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E8
 There is 1 PICs item, DS13, for 2 shalls, this one and the one on line 28
 SuggestedRemedy
 Each shall needs exactly 1 PICS item
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.
 Pics item DS13 will be broken into 2 pics items, one for rising transition time and one for falling transition time.

Cl 54 SC 54.7.3.8 P 29 L 33 # 9
 Brown, Benjamin Independent
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E9
 There is 1 shall for 3 PICs items, DS15, DS16 & DS17
 SuggestedRemedy
 Each shall needs exactly 1 PICS item
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Will collapse DS15,16,17 into one Pics item.

Cl 54 SC 54.7.4 P 30 L 13 # 185
 Bill Quackenbush Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E185
 "+/- 100 ppm" is a tolerance, not a range.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "range" to "tolerance"
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Will replace "range" with "per lane", and change value to 3.125 +/- 100ppm to be consistent with the response to comment #181.

Cl 54 SC 54.7.4.1 P 30 L 29 # 10
 Brown, Benjamin Independent
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E10
 Extra comma
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "'loss, short, cable'" with "'loss, short cable'"
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.7.4.1 P 30 L 29 # 24
 Dove, Daniel HP ProCurve Networki
 Comment Type E Comment Status A T125
 For Piers Dawe: "'This note seems like good advice even though I can't see a comment that triggers its addition. I would prefer some form of words like "'The BER limit is met with ...'" rather than "'BER should be tested with ...'"'. Return loss, NEXT and FEXT are ratios already; if reflected signal is higher for short cable, "'return loss'" would be lower not higher. Why would NEXT depend significantly on cable length?'"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Consider rewording the note.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #125

Cl 54 SC 54.7.4.1 P 30 L 30 # 156
 Grow, Robert Intel
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E156
 Incorrect style.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Apply proper IEEE NOTE style. Also fix on line 45.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

P802.3ak Draft 5.0 Comments

Cl 54 SC 54.7.4.3 P 30 L 46 # 11

Brown, Benjamin Independent

Comment Type E Comment Status A E11
Extra comma

SuggestedRemedy

Replace ""receiver, that"" with ""receiver that"" - see the IEEE standards style manual, 13.2

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change to: "... receiver which ..."

Cl 54 SC 54.7.4.5 P 31 L 9 # 157

Grow, Robert Intel

Comment Type E Comment Status A E157
Missing period (full stop).

SuggestedRemedy

Insert "" ""

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.8.1 P 32 L 3 # 25

Dove, Daniel HP ProCurve Networki

Comment Type E Comment Status R E25
Consistency: The word ohm should be replaced by the symbol for omega.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace with the omega symbol.

Proposed Response Response Status C

REJECT.

Will use ohms through out document.

Cl 54 SC 54.8.2 P 32 L 11 # 121

Dawe, Piers Agilent

Comment Type E Comment Status A E121
I'm told that style guide prefers x to . to represent multiplication in equations.

SuggestedRemedy

Check (sorry not to be more complete for you!)

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment #158

Cl 54 SC 54.8.2 P 32 L 11 # 210

Law, David 3Com

Comment Type E Comment Status A E121
Please use a 'x' symbol rather than '.' for multiplication.

SuggestedRemedy

See comment.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

See comment #121

Cl 54 SC 54.8.3 P 33 L 19 # 27

Dove, Daniel HP ProCurve Networki

Comment Type E Comment Status A E27
Format of figure 54-8 Y axis was supposed to be changed to zero trailing zeroes.

SuggestedRemedy

Change axis to be from 10dB to 25dB with no decimal point or trailing zeroes or exponents.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

P802.3ak Draft 5.0 Comments

Cl 54 SC 54.8.3 P 33 L 7 # 122
 Dawe, Piers Agilent
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E122
 For consistency,
 SuggestedRemedy
 Insert subscript 10 after 'log' in the equations where you have not already done so.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #158

Cl 54 SC 54.8.4.2 P 34 L 30 # 123
 Dawe, Piers Agilent
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E123
 For consistency,
 SuggestedRemedy
 Index i in italics or not?
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #158

Cl 54 SC 54.8.5.1 P 35 L 38 # 158
 Grow, Robert Intel
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E158
 Style usage. I believe usage of italics for V is incorrect.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Fix six instances on this page.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 10GBASE-CX4 Editor is instructed to check and make sure all equations are formatted consistent with IEEE style guides.

Cl 54 SC 54.8.5.1 P 35 L 45 # 39
 Baumer, Howard Broadcom Corp
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E39
 Missing ""the"".
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change: "".. voltage of disturbing signal ..."" to "".. voltage of the disturbing signal ...""
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.8.5.1 P 35 L 46 # 40
 Baumer, Howard Broadcom Corp
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E40
 Missing ""the"".
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change: ""... at far end of disturbed ..."" to ""... at the far end of the disturbed ...""
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.8.5.1 P 35 L 47 # 41
 Baumer, Howard Broadcom Corp
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E41
 Missing ""the""
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change: ""... loss of disturbed ..."" to ""... loss of the disturbed ...""
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.8.7 P 37 L 51 # 189
 Bill Quackenbush Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E189
 The title of Figure 54-11 should be "Default Cable Wiring"
 SuggestedRemedy
 See comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Default denotes that there are other optional alternatives. This is the one and only cable wiring allowed. "default" will be removed from line 35 so text and figure title match.

P802.3ak Draft 5.0 Comments

Cl 54 SC 54.9.1 P 38 L 27 # 190
 Bill Quackenbush Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E190
 For correctness, change "connector" to "recepticle" or "socket".
 SuggestedRemedy
 See comment
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Will use recepticle.

Cl 54 SC 54.x P multiple L # 176
 Bill Quackenbush Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E176
 The terms "lane" and "channel" are both used and appear to refer to the same thing.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Pick one term, I suggest "lane", and use it consistently.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC 54.x P numerous L # 179
 Bill Quackenbush Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type E Comment Status R E179
 I think it would be better to use the phrase "signaling rate" rather than the phrase "signaling speed".
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change each instance of "signaling speed" to "signaling rate".
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 REJECT.
 Rate and speed are synonymous in these contexts, therefore no change is needed.

Cl 54 SC Figure 54-1 P 19 L 14 # 88
 Dawe, Piers Agilent
 Comment Type E Comment Status R E88
 The XGMII sublayer is much taller than most sublayers in most layer diagrams (I guess it was inherited from 53-1 which may have once been like 52-1).
 SuggestedRemedy
 Shrink the height of the XGMII sublayer, reducing the height of the LAN stack and the whole figure.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 REJECT.

The drawing will stay as is so that the bottom of the two model stacks remain horizontally aligned.

Cl 54 SC Figure 54-14 P 38 L 30 # 213
 Law, David 3Com
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E213
 Why is the board connection footprint shown - it is not a compliance point and isn't any footprint that meets the performance requirements acceptable.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove Figure 54-14.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC Figure 54-3 P 25 L 6 # 148
 Grow, Robert Intel
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E148
 Fix style.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Serif font used in figure. Correct capitalization of title ""Transmit test fixture""
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

P802.3ak Draft 5.0 Comments

Cl 54 SC Figure 54-4 P 26 L 25 # 201

Law, David 3Com

Comment Type E Comment Status A E201

Note sure why the note text is included within '[' and ']'. Also shouldn't the note appear after the figure (need to check with IEEE editor to confirm this).

SuggestedRemedy

See comment.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Will remove "[" & "]" and fix format to conform to IEEE note style.

Cl 54 SC Figure 54-4 P 27 L 23 # 113

Dawe, Piers Agilent

Comment Type E Comment Status A E113

Labels and titles are hard to read (especially legend on fig 54-9).

SuggestedRemedy

Use bigger fonts.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Will change text to 10pt sans serif font.

Cl 54 SC Figure 54-4 P 27 L 23 # 112

Dawe, Piers Agilent

Comment Type E Comment Status A E112

Template is hard to see where it coincides with grid line, 100 to 625 MHz.

SuggestedRemedy

Use thicker lines for templates.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC Figure 54-5 P 27 L 23 # 111

Dawe, Piers Agilent

Comment Type E Comment Status A E111

Filesize bloat D5.0 complete: 44 pages, 1056 KB D5.0 without the pages with graphs: 38 pages, 635 KB or 16.7 KB/page Difference: 6 pages for 421 KB or 70 KB/page

SuggestedRemedy

Is there less data-hungry way to incorporate the graphs?

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Graphs will be converted from grey scale to black and white.

Cl 54 SC Figure 54-5 P 27 L 38 # 150

Grow, Robert Intel

Comment Type E Comment Status A E112

Hard to tell if Equation-1 is plotted.

SuggestedRemedy

Fix.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

See comment #112

Cl 54 SC Figure 54-5 P 27 L 48 # 205

Law, David 3Com

Comment Type E Comment Status A E205

Please check with the IEEE project editor that these figures can be edited as they appear to be from some tool other than Frame. Also note that the format of the numbers such as '1,000' on the axis isn't in IEEE style and may need to be edited prior to publication.

SuggestedRemedy

Check this and other similar figures with the IEEE project editor.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

See editor's note on page 17 line 5 as well as comment #136.

P802.3ak Draft 5.0 Comments

Cl 54 SC Figure 54-6 P 28 L 46 # 119
 Dawe, Piers Agilent
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E21
 Redundant trailing zeroes
 SuggestedRemedy
 Please remove the .000's
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #21

Cl 54 SC Figure 54-6 P 28 L 50 # 204
 Law, David 3Com
 Comment Type E Comment Status A T118
 Suggest that the title be changed to simply read 'Normalized transmit template' or 'Normalized transmit template at TP2'. The information that it is 'as measured at TP2 using Figure 54-3' is specified clearly in the text related to this figure and doesn't need to appear in the figure title.
 SuggestedRemedy
 See comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #118

Cl 54 SC General P L # 153
 Grow, Robert Intel
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E153
 Not using subscripts seems to be common for other parameters, I am expect I only list part of them below.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Search appropriate strings and make variable names consistent to IEEE style. Candidate searches include: Vlowp, Vlowm, Voff, Vnorm, Vpds, Vpcn. Please include any others the TF is aware of.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC Table 54-1 P 18 L 22 # 87
 Dawe, Piers Agilent
 Comment Type E Comment Status R E87
 In order to avoid wasted space...
 SuggestedRemedy
 Please make the table wider, to use fewer lines for its footnote.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 REJECT.
 Space is not being waisted, there is not enough room for the following figure even if the footnote only took one line.

Cl 54 SC Table 54-2 P 21 L 36 # 98
 Dawe, Piers Agilent
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E98
 Table width
 SuggestedRemedy
 Redo table 'shrink to fit' and save a line
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC Table 54-5 P 29 L 10 # 152
 Grow, Robert Intel
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E152
 Inconsistent application of table line styles.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Fix
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC Table 54-5 P 29 L 8 # 120
 Dawe, Piers Agilent
 Comment Type E Comment Status A E152
 Line thicknesses
 SuggestedRemedy
 Please use the thick or double line between 2nd and 3rd columns and between 6th and 7th. Please reset line thickness under '0.740'.
 Proposed Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

P802.3ak Draft 5.0 Comments

Cl 54 SC Table 54-56 P 30 L 11 # 154

Grow, Robert Intel

Comment Type E Comment Status A E154

Inconsistent application of table line styles.

SuggestedRemedy

Fix both horizontal and vertical lines in table body.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC Table 54-7 P 24 L 36 # 105

Dawe, Piers Agilent

Comment Type E Comment Status A E105

Notational problems: the capital S, the implication of a function Signal<x>, the implication of division with /. Simple fix!

SuggestedRemedy

Delete 'Signal<p>/<n>' leaving 'Common mode voltage limits'.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC Table 54-7 P 24 L 41 # 104

Dawe, Piers Agilent

Comment Type E Comment Status A

References with wrong Frame style/format? in '[See figure (54-6) and table (54-9)]

SuggestedRemedy

See Figure 54-6 and Table 54-9'. Also p30 Table 54-6.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 54 SC Table 54-7 P 31 L 23 # 155

Grow, Robert Intel

Comment Type E Comment Status A E155

Inconsistent application of table line styles.

SuggestedRemedy

Fix both horizontal and vertical lines in table body.

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.