Analysis of comments on D3.0

Editorial Staff 802.3an

(650) 704 7686
skasturia@teranetics.com

Introduction

- **Draft 3.0 has been online; sympathy goes to**
    - Brad Booth for Clause 1, 30 & 44
    - Eric Lynskey for Clause 28 & 55.6
    - Mike McConnell for Clause 45
    - Jose Tellado for PCS and PMA sections
    - Sandeep Gupta for the PMA Electrical
    - Chris DiMinico for the Link Segment
    - Terry Cobb for the MDI and environmental specification
- **The draft has been updated from D2.4**
- **We have ~275 comments**
    - 60 are TRs, 42 are Ts
    - 14 are new ERs, 94 are Es

Comment stats by sections

- On clause 28: 32
  - TR: 2, GR: 7, ER: 5, G: 1, E: 17
- On clause 30/30A: 8
  - TR: 1, T: 3, G: 0, E: 4
- On clause 44: 8
  - TR: 1, T: 1, E: 6
- On clause 45: 64
  - TR: 7, GR: 6, ER: 8, T: 11, G: 3, E: 29
- On clause 55: 124
  - TR: 29, GR: 2, ER: 8, T: 20, G: 12, E: 53
    - On overview: 14 (TR: 5, GR: 1, ER: 1, T: 1, E: 6)
    - On PCS: 9 (TR: 1, ER: 1, T: 2, G: 1, E: 4)
    - On PMA: 45 (TR: 5, ER: 6, T: 7, G: 3, E: 24)
    - On PMA electricals: 11 (TR: 6, T: 4, E: 1)
    - On Management: 3 (TR: 1, E:2)
    - On link segment: 29 (TR: 10, ER: 1, T: 3, G:3, E:12)
    - On MDI/Environmental: 3 (TR: 1, G: 1, E: 1)
    - On 55 Annexes: 3
- On whole draft 00, 99: 29
  - TR: 6, GR: 7, ER:1, T: 2, G: 5, E: 8

Some broad issues

- Constellation choice/margin
- Short reach/low power modes
- Organization/clarity
  - Link segment specifications
  - Startup

Short Reach Comment Summary

- #17 (Joel Goergen): no details
- #28 (Ali Ghiasi): 30m cat6a
- #33 (Dan Dove): 30m cat7
- #62/63/64 (Hugh Barrass):
    - Modes: 15m, 30m, 55m, 100m
    - No AutoNeg changes
    - Additional C45 registers
    - Add short reach tests to 55.5
- #149 (Geoff Thomson): Autoneg bits, 35m Cat7
- #159/160/161 (James Barnette) and #271 (Colin Mick) :
    - Modes: 30m STP and 30m 6a
    - Additional AutoNeg bits
    - Additional C45 registers
- #163 (Gottfried Ungerboek): <55m of cat6a
- #169 (Michael Teener) 30m cat6a, 10m cat5e
- #170/182/183 (Sanjay Kasturia)
    - Modes:
        - Reach: 30m, 55m, 75m, 100m
        - Cabling type: Any, Screened, 6A
    - Additional C45 registers to indicate each mode
    - No AutoNeg changes
    - Add short reach tests to 55.5
- Multiple presentations – see individual presentation for details

Clause 55.1-4 – PCS/PMA: Jose Tellado

- Comment stats: Total: ~75
  - E+ER: ~42. Proposal to accept 40, and reject 2
  - G+GR: ~5
  - TR+T: ~25
- Major items or issues
  - Power Backoff. Settings for fixed steps, Master/Slave diff
  - PHY control (Start-up): IF message bits, Slave to Master bit,
  - THP: Adjust PBO before training, train with DSQ
  - Margin: Suggesting to change DSQ to PAM8 or PAM12
  - Several clarification/clean-up comments

Comment resolution in Myballot

- Comment stats: Total: ~75
  - E+ER: ~42. Proposal to accept 40, and reject 2
  - G+GR: ~5
  - TR+T: ~25
- Major items or issues
  - Power Backoff. Settings for fixed steps, Master/Slave diff
  - PHY control (Start-up): IF message bits, Slave to Master bit,
  - THP: Adjust PBO before training, train with DSQ
  - Margin: Suggesting to change DSQ to PAM8 or PAM12
  - Several clarification/clean-up comments

Clause 55.1-4 – PCS/PMA: Jose Tellado

- Comment stats: Total: ~75
    - E+ER: ~42. Proposal to accept 40, and reject 2
    - G+GR: ~5
    - TR+T: ~25
- Major items or issues
    - Power Backoff. Settings for fixed steps, Master/Slave diff
    - PHY control (Start-up): IF message bits, Slave to Master bit,
    - THP: Adjust PBO before training, train with DSQ
    - Margin: Suggesting to change DSQ to PAM8 or PAM12
    - Several clarification/clean-up comments

Comment resolution in MyBallot

1. All comments associated with a Disapprove vote that are marked as Must be Satisfied are re-circulated.
2. Once a comment associated with a Disapprove vote that is marked as Must be Satisfied has been recirculated the requirement to recirculate has been satisfied. The comment will not appear in subsequent comment databases.
3. Comments cannot be Withdrawn.
   1. If a commenter wishes to withdraw a comment before the ballot closes they can submit a new comment stating that they withdraw the particular comment.
   2. If a commenter wishes to withdraw a comment after the ballot close we can mark the comment as Rejected and note that the commenter stated that they wish to withdraw the comment. This has already been implemented in the Comment resolution tool.
4. Comments cannot be added from the floor
   1. MyBallot does not support this as the only way it can accept comments after the ballot is closed is via the 'Insert Rogue Comment' interface in MyBallot that only the Sponsor and the Sponsor Designee have access to.
   2. The MyBallot database would then have to be downloaded again so that the comment is correctly identified in the comment database before a response can be created. This is not ideal and the only alternative I can think of is to add such comments as part of the responses to other existing comments.
5. THIS CONFORMS TO THE IEEE SA REQUIREMENTS