

IEEE P802.3as Comments

Cl 00 SC 0 P 1 L 1 Comment # 1
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status R
 DVJ-1I prefer to have a specific date on the date, since drafts can sometimes be updated multiple times per month.
 Suggested Remedy
 NoRemedySupplied
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT. Only one draft version x.y will be released in a given month. In the unlikely event that the draft is revised within a given month, the revision level will change. The appropriate editors notes will be included.

Cl 01 SC 1.3 P 3 L 33 Comment # 2
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 DVJ-2Looks like large font size.
 Suggested Remedy
 Check it out.
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. (Font size is inconsistent for a reference.)

Cl 01 SC 1.4 P 3 L 40 Comment # 3
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 DVJ-3Improper capitalization.
 Suggested Remedy
 an Ethernet frame==>AnEthernet frame
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT. The new definitions should follow the pattern/style set forth in the base standard.

Cl 01 SC 1.4 P 3 L 43 Comment # 4
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 DVJ-4Improper capitalization.
 Suggested Remedy
 an Ethernet frame==>An Ethernet fram
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. The new definitions should follow the pattern/style set forth in the base standard.

Cl 01 SC 1.4 P 3 L 47 Comment # 5
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 DVJ-5Improper capitalization.
 Suggested Remedy
 an Ethernet frame==>An Ethernet fram
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. The new definitions should follow the pattern/style set forth in the base standard.

Cl 02 SC 2. P 5 L 26 Comment # 10
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status R
 DVJ-10English words should not be capitalized simply becausetheir meaning is different from normal English usage.
 Suggested Remedy
 Access Control==>access control
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

Cl 02 SC 2. P 5 L 33 Comment # 12
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status R
 DVJ-12English words should not be capitalized simply becausetheir meaning is different from normal English usage.
 Suggested Remedy
 Media Access Control==>media access control
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

Cl 02 SC 2. P 5 L 34 Comment # 11
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status R
 DVJ-11English words should not be capitalized simply becausetheir meaning is different from normal English usage.
 Suggested Remedy
 Control sublayer==>control sublayer
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

IEEE P802.3as Comments

Cl 02 SC 2. P 5 L 35 Comment # 8
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status R
 DVJ-8English words should not be capitalized simply because their meaning is different from normal English usage.
 Suggested Remedy
 LogicalLink Control==>logical link control
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

Cl 02 SC 2. P 5 L 35 Comment # 7
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status R
 DVJ-7English words should not be capitalized simply because their meaning is different from normal English usage.
 Suggested Remedy
 Bridge Relay Entity,==>bridge relay entity,
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

Cl 02 SC 2. P 5 L 40 Comment # 9
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 DVJ-9English words should not be capitalized simply because their meaning is different from normal English usage.
 Suggested Remedy
 ControlSublayer==>control sublayer
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Ensure capitalization of new text is consistent with the existing Clause 2.
 Control Sublayer==>Control sublayer

Cl 02 SC 2. P 5 L 48 Comment # 6
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 DVJ-6Type
 Suggested Remedy
 1) clause ==> subclause
 2) Use uniform font size
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 02 SC 2. P 7 L 10 Comment # 13
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 DVJ-13Capitalization within figure callouts should be limited to the first word, as per IEEE Style Guide. This rule always applies, regardless of whether the callout is split into multiple lines.
 Suggested Remedy
 MAC Control Sublayer==>MAC control sublayer
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change "MAC Control Sublayer" to "MAC Control" within figure. Below figure, change "MAC control" to "MAC Control". This will make the changed figure consistent with the existing Clause 2.

Cl 02 SC 2. P 7 L 17 Comment # 14
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status R
 DVJ-14Capitalization within figure callouts should be limited to the first word, as per IEEE Style Guide. This rule always applies, regardless of whether the callout is split into multiple lines.
 Suggested Remedy
 Medium Access Control==>Medium access control
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

IEEE P802.3as Comments

Cl 03 SC 2.6 P 11 L 36 Comment # 62
Lior, Ayal TeraChip

Comment Type TR Comment Status R

Section 3.2.6 enables using the LENRGTH/TYPE filed to indicate length for up to 1,500 bytes frame. This was sufficient before frame extension, but now there is a need to convey length for an envelope frame.

Suggested Remedy

Change the limitation to 1,982. I believe that any number less than 0x0800 (2048 decimal) does not hurt current Ethernet networks

Response Response Status C

REJECT.

Two reasons: First, the type interpretation is well established. Second, the maximum data field remains 1,500 octets. For a frame to exceed 1,518 octets, one or more Type field encapsulations are required. 802.1Q requires 4 octets and bumps the maximum frame to 1,522. 802.1ad will use a Type encapsulation that bumps the maximum to 1,526. The Length interpretation does not need to change.

Cl 03 SC 3.1.1 P 10 L 29 Comment # 16
David V James JGG

Comment Type E Comment Status R

DVJ-16Don't use ALL CAPS for callouts.1) Its against the IEEE Style Manual, unless done for all callouts2) The actual names of the values should be used.

Suggested Remedy

Eliminate ALL CAPS terms.

Response Response Status C

REJECT. The frame format figure has always used ALL CAPS for the field names.

Cl 03 SC 3.1.1 P 10 L 39 Comment # 17
David V James JGG

Comment Type E Comment Status R

DVJ-17Misspelled

Suggested Remedy

(see clause 3.2.7)==>(see 3.2.7) preferredOR(see subclause 3.2.7)

Response Response Status C

REJECT. Change "see clause 3.2.7" to "see 3.2.7"

Cl 03 SC 3.1.1 P 10 L 58 Comment # 18
David V James JGG

Comment Type E Comment Status R

DVJ-18Bits aren't transmitted left to right.

Suggested Remedy

1) Eliminate bits within frame illustration.2) State that bits are transmitted LSB first.

Response Response Status C

REJECT. While it is true that not all fields transmit left to right (FCS being the exception), removing this from the figure could cause more confusion about bit ordering changes within the 802.3as project.

Cl 03 SC 3.1.1 P 9 L 48 Comment # 15
David V James JGG

Comment Type E Comment Status R

DVJ-15English words should not be capitalized simply becausetheir meaning is different from normal English usage.

Suggested Remedy

Start Frame Delimiter==>start frame delimiter

Response Response Status C

REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

Cl 03 SC 3.1.2 P 11 L 11 Comment # 19
David V James JGG

Comment Type E Comment Status R

DVJ-19Don't use ALL CAPS for callouts.1) Its against the IEEE Style Manual, unless done for all callouts2) The actual names of the fields should be used.

Suggested Remedy

Eliminate ALL CAPS terms.

Response Response Status C

REJECT. Figure 3-2 matches precedent set by Figure 3-1.

IEEE P802.3as Comments

CI 03 SC 3.2.9 P 12 L 54 Comment # 20
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status R
 DVJ-20Capitalization within a clause or subclause titleshould be limited to the first word, as per theIEEE Style Guide.
 Suggested Remedy
 Frame Check Sequence (FCS) field==>Frame check sequence (FCS) field
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

CI 03 SC 3.2.9 P 13 L 3 Comment # 21
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 DVJ-21Spell length/type only one way;its sometimes spelled Length/Type
 Suggested Remedy
 Be consistent throughout, preferably as follows:lengthType <== length/type, Length/Typedata <== DATA, datapad <== PAD, padda <== DA, destination addresssa <== SA, source addresspreamble <== PREAMBLE, preamblestartFrameDelimiter <== Start Frame Delimeter, SFD I prefer to put field names in italics, so that they are not confused with English words.
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change 'length/type' to 'Length/Type' .

CI 03 SC 3.5.9 P 17 L 26 Comment # 22
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status R
 DVJ-22Capitalization within a clause or subclause titleshould be limited to the first word, as per theIEEE Style Guide.
 Suggested Remedy
 Media Access Control==>Media access control
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

CI 04 SC 4.2.4.2.1 P 17 L 33 Comment # 24
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status R
 DVJ-24Make key words nonbreaking.
 Suggested Remedy
 nonbreaking receiveDataValidDo similar fixes throughout.
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

CI 04 SC 4.2.4.2.1 P 17 L 33 Comment # 23
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status R
 DVJ-23English words should not be capitalized simply because their meaning is different from normal English usage.
 Suggested Remedy
 Physical Layer.==>physical layer.
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

CI 04 SC 4.2.4.2.1 P 17 L 37 Comment # 25
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status R
 DVJ-25Capitalization within a clause or subclause titleshould be limited to the first word, as per theIEEE Style Guide.
 Suggested Remedy
 Maximum Frame Size.==>Maximum frame size.
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

CI 04 SC 4.2.4.2.1 P 17 L 44 Comment # 26
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status R
 DVJ-26Capitalization within a clause or subclause titleshould be limited to the first word, as per theIEEE Style Guide.
 Suggested Remedy
 Integer Number of Octets in Frame.==>Integer number of octets in frame.
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

IEEE P802.3as Comments

Cl 04 SC 4.2.7.1 P 18 L 5 Comment # 27
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status R
 DVJ-27What's this gibberish?
 Suggested Remedy
 Define this language, or use standard English.
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT. It is out of scope for the 802.3as project to replace the Pascal used in Clause 4.

Cl 04 SC 4.2.9 P 19 L 32 Comment # 28
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status R
 DVJ-28Define the language.
 Suggested Remedy
 Define the language exactly, and use only a compiler-available definition-standard language.
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT. It is out of scope for the 802.3as project to replace the Pascal used in Clause 4.

Cl 04 SC 4.2.9 P 21 L 45 Comment # 29
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status R
 DVJ-29English words should not be capitalized simply because their meaning is different from normal English usage.
 Suggested Remedy
 Physical Layers==>physical layers
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

Cl 04 SC 4.2.9 P 22 L 34 Comment # 30
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status R
 DVJ-30Bad break
 Suggested Remedy
 Make nonbreaking: extensionBit
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

Cl 04 SC 4.2.9 P 22 L 39 Comment # 31
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status R
 DVJ-31English words should not be capitalized simply because their meaning is different from normal English usage.
 Suggested Remedy
 Reconciliation Sublayer==>reconciliation sublayer
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

Cl 04 SC 4.3.2 P 24 L 17 Comment # 32
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status R
 DVJ-32Breaking.
 Suggested Remedy
 Make keywords nonbreaking
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

Cl 05 SC 5. P 39 L 25 Comment # 38
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status R
 DVJ-38Capitalization within a clause or subclause title should be limited to the first word, as per the IEEE Style Guide.
 Suggested Remedy
 Layer Management==>Layer management
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

Cl 05 SC 5. P 39 L 31 Comment # 39
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status R
 DVJ-39English words should not be capitalized simply because their meaning is different from normal English usage.
 Suggested Remedy
 Layer Management==>layer management
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

IEEE P802.3as Comments

Cl 3 SC 3.2.7 P 12 L 1 Comment # 53

Matt Squire Hatteras Networks

Comment Type E Comment Status A

Suggested Remedy

"Data fields" -> "Data field"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.3.1.1.25 P 41 L 42 Comment # 58

Matt Squire Hatteras Networks

Comment Type E Comment Status A

Indentation wrong. Shouldn't this be a "NOTE" like it used to be? References the deleted 3.5. Uses maxUntaggedFrameSize (seems like that's been eliminated).

Suggested Remedy

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Restore "NOTE" formatting.
Change:
maxUntaggedFrameSize -> maxBasicFrameSize

Cl 30 SC 30.3.1.1.25 P 41 L 45 Comment # 57

Matt Squire Hatteras Networks

Comment Type E Comment Status A

References the deleted 3.5.

Suggested Remedy

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change
" the frame received is a basic or tagged frame (see 3.2 and 3.5)" -> " the frame received is a basic, tagged, or envelope frame (see 3.2)".

Cl 30 SC 30.4.3.1.8 P 42 L 9 Comment # 59

Matt Squire Hatteras Networks

Comment Type E Comment Status A

References the deleted 3.5.

Suggested Remedy

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change
"basic or tagged MAC frame (see 3.2 and 3.5)" -> "basic, tagged, or envelope MAC frame (see 3.2).

Cl 31 SC 31. P 43 L 35 Comment # 40

David V James JGG

Comment Type E Comment Status R

DVJ-40English words should not be capitalized simply because their meaning is different from normal English usage.

Suggested Remedy

Control==>control

Response Response Status C

REJECT.

Clause 31 is entitled "MAC Control" This changed figure uses MAC Control consistent with the name of the clause.

Cl 31 SC 31. P 43 L 41 Comment # 42

David V James JGG

Comment Type E Comment Status A

DVJ-42Capitalization within figure callouts should belimited to the first word, as per IEEE Style Guide.This rule always applies, regardless of whether thecallout is split into multiple lines.

Suggested Remedy

MAC Control Sublayer==>MAC control sublayer

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "MAC Control sublayer" to "MAC Control" in the figure

IEEE P802.3as Comments

Cl 31 SC 31. P 43 L 50 Comment # 41
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status R
 DVJ-41 English words should not be capitalized simply because their meaning is different from normal English usage.
 Suggested Remedy
 Control=>control
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT.
 Clause 31 is entitled "MAC Control" This changed figure uses MAC Control consistent with the name of the clause.

Cl 31 SC 31. P 44 L 17 Comment # 43
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status R
 DVJ-43 What on earth does this mean?
 Suggested Remedy
 Perhaps you meant: BEGIN + (receiveEnabled=FALSE) The parenthesis would help. One wonders, of course, why you can't use C notation, rather than the C-line conflicting ill-defined language. Ask the old timers, perhaps?
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT.
 This notation is used throughout 802.3. It means BEGIN or receiveEnabled=FALSE.

Cl 31 SC 31. P 46 L 19 Comment # 44
 David V James JGG
 Comment Type E Comment Status R
 DVJ-44 Make up your mind on names, underscores or nor. As background, 802.3 does both, apparently for variety. 802.1 does underscores, almost consistently.
 Suggested Remedy
 Use underscores in state names.
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT. Existing Annex 31B does not use underscores within state names. Changed Figure 31B-1 follows convention in Annex 31B.

Cl 4 SC 4.2.7.1 P 18 L 17-2 Comment # 54
 Matt Squire Hatteras Networks
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 References 3.7.2, but I don't think that section exists? Maybe 3.2.7?
 Suggested Remedy
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change "3.7.2" to "3.2.7" on line 17 and line 20.

Cl 4 SC 4.3.2 P 25 L 29 Comment # 55
 Matt Squire Hatteras Networks
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 Suggested Remedy
 "regardless of whether the frame is a basic or tagged frame (see 3.2 and 3.5)" ->
 "regardless of whether the frame is a basic, tagged, or envelope frame (see 3.2).
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 43B SC P 47 L Comment # 60
 Matt Squire Hatteras Networks
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 Page numbering is wrong here on out - P47 is numbered as 41 (similar on P48, ...).
 Suggested Remedy
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Fix page numbering.

IEEE P802.3as Comments

Cl 43B SC P 47 L 54 Comment # 61
 Matt Squire Hatteras Networks

Comment Type E Comment Status R

Suggest eliminating "and not the tagged or envelope" on the off, off chance that somewhere down the line a new size is introduced. Ditto for P49 L30 (OAM section). Also, for consistency, should probably just say "should be a basic frame" as we really only have one frame format of different sizes (where we used to document two frame formats, tagged & untagged).

Suggested Remedy

Response Response Status C

REJECT.

Per clause 3.1, we now have one 'frame format' and three 'frame' applications. This naming is consistent in the OAM clause. It is important to indicate that OAM frame are only basic frames.

Cl 43B SC 43B.2 P 47 L 46 Comment # 45
 David V James JGG

Comment Type E Comment Status R

DVJ-45English words should not be capitalized simply because their meaning is different from normal English usage.

Suggested Remedy

Client data==>client data

Response Response Status C

REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

Cl 4A SC 4A.2.11 P 34 L 40 Comment # 36
 David V James JGG

Comment Type E Comment Status A

DVJ-36Inconsistent notation.

Suggested Remedy

PASS TO CLIENT==>PASS_TO_CLIENT

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 4A SC 4A.2.4.2 P 29 L 38 Comment # 33
 David V James JGG

Comment Type E Comment Status R

DVJ-33English words should not be capitalized simply because their meaning is different from normal English usage.

Suggested Remedy

Physical Layer.==>physical layer.

Response Response Status C

REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

Cl 4A SC 4A.2.4.2 P 29 L 40 Comment # 34
 David V James JGG

Comment Type E Comment Status R

DVJ-34Capitalization within a clause or subclause title should be limited to the first word, as per the IEEE Style Guide.

Suggested Remedy

Maximum Frame Size.==>Maximum frame size.

Response Response Status C

REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

Cl 4A SC 4A.2.4.2 P 29 L 47 Comment # 35
 David V James JGG

Comment Type E Comment Status R

DVJ-35Capitalization within a clause or subclause title should be limited to the first word, as per the IEEE Style Guide.

Suggested Remedy

Integer Number of Octets in Frame.==>Integer number of octets in frame.

Response Response Status C

REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

IEEE P802.3as Comments

Cl 4A SC 4A.3.2 P 36 L 12 Comment # 56
 Matt Squire Hatteras Networks

Comment Type E Comment Status A

References the deleted 3.5.

Suggested Remedy

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change

"regardless of whether the frame is a basic or tagged frame (see 3.2 and 3.5)" ->

"regardless of whether the frame is a basic, tagged, or envelope frame (see 3.2).

Cl 4A SC 4A.4.2 P 36 L 31 Comment # 37
 David V James JGG

Comment Type E Comment Status A

DVJ-37Wrong font size for cells

Suggested Remedy

Fix it

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Font sizes are consistent with existing tables.

However, the table number and its reference are incorrect.

Table 0A-1 => Table 4A-2

Cl 57 SC 57. P 49 L 25 Comment # 46
 David V James JGG

Comment Type E Comment Status R

DVJ-46Capitalization within a clause or subclause titleshould be limited to the first word, as per theIEEE Style Guide.

Suggested Remedy

Operations, Administration, and Maintenance (OAM)==>Operations, administration, and maintenance (OAM)

Response Response Status C

REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

Cl 57 SC 57. P 49 L 47 Comment # 50
 David V James JGG

Comment Type E Comment Status R

DVJ-50English words should not be capitalized simply because their meaning is different from normal English usage.

Suggested Remedy

Size==>size

Response Response Status C

REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

Cl 57 SC 57. P 49 L 47 Comment # 49
 David V James JGG

Comment Type E Comment Status R

DVJ-49English words should not be capitalized simply because their meaning is different from normal English usage.

Suggested Remedy

Maximum==>maximum

Response Response Status C

REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

Cl 57 SC 57. P 49 L 49 Comment # 48
 David V James JGG

Comment Type E Comment Status R

DVJ-48English words should not be capitalized simply because their meaning is different from normal English usage.

Suggested Remedy

Size, a==>size, a

Response Response Status C

REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

Cl 57 SC 57. P 49 L 49 Comment # 47
 David V James JGG

Comment Type E Comment Status R

DVJ-47English words should not be capitalized simply because their meaning is different from normal English usage.

Suggested Remedy

Maximum==>maximum

Response Response Status C

REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

IEEE P802.3as Comments

Cl 57 SC 57. P 49 L 56 Comment # 51

David V James JGG

Comment Type E Comment Status R

DVJ-51 English words should not be capitalized simply because their meaning is different from normal English usage.

Suggested Remedy

Maximum==>maximum

Response Response Status C

REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.

Cl 57 SC 57. P 49 L 56 Comment # 52

David V James JGG

Comment Type E Comment Status R

DVJ-52 English words should not be capitalized simply because their meaning is different from normal English usage.

Suggested Remedy

Information==>information

Response Response Status C

REJECT. Comment is not on new or changed text and is thus out of scope.