IEEE P802.3bf D2.0 comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.101 P6 L4 # 315

Dimitrios Giannakopoulos

Comment Type T Comment Status X

It is not clear between which points the latency value is relevant to. First, the end points are not explicitly defined. Second, the register is in device 1 and so may be assumed to be MDI to PCS. Third, in the case of a PHY that is in a different device than the MAC (a) the latency of the PHY device would be from MDI to PHY XGXS and (b) the latency of the XGXS is not accounted for and could not be reported in device 1 as this would conflict with the separate PHY device.

SuggestedRemedy

Several things are required:

- (1) clearly define the start and end points for measuring latency
- (2) include support for cases where PHY is integrated with the MAC or in a separate device
- (3) For 10G PHYS clearly specify end points for various scenarios (a) MAC device with integrated PHY (b) MAC device with DTE XGXS (c) PHY device with PHY XGXS
- (4) for MAC device with DTE XGXS specify registers for latency from XGXS to \mathbf{xMII}
- (5) for PHY device with XGXS specify latency (using currently defined registers) from MDIO to XGXS

Proposed Response Status O

C/ 90 SC 90.2 P9 L 25 # 316

Dimitrios Giannakopoulos

Comment Type T Comment Status X

This standard also defines PHY management interface to indicate PHY latency.

SuggestedRemedy

Add second note:

(b) Addition of management registers to indicate the maximum and minimum PHY latencies for link latency estimation.

Proposed Response Status O

C/ 90 SC 90.4.3.1 P9 L11 # 317

Dimitrios Giannakopoulos

Comment Type T Comment Status X

It is not clear what is meant by the SFD. SFD is explicitly specified in 3.1.1 and is normally detected by the MAC layer. However, each RS has a mechanism to detect the beginning of a packet. To simplify the implementation SFD in this context should be defined to employ the native method of detecting start of frame.

SuggestedRemedy

Clearly define that "valid SFD" is based upon mechanism native to RS as opposed to rules for detecting a valid SFD specifed for the MAC.

Proposed Response Response Status O

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ **90** SC **90.4.3.1** Page 1 of 1 22/09/2010 01:48:14