

IEEE P802.3bj Task Force Working Group Ballot Overview

“The Road to a Successful Working Group Ballot”

19th March 2013,
Orlando, FL

Wael William Diab

Vice-Chair, IEEE 802.3 Working Group

wdiab@broadcom.com

Agenda

- Overview of WG Ballot Process
- Similarities to TF Review
- Differences from TF Review

WG Ballot Process

- Governed by
 - IEEE project 802 LAN MAN Standards Committee (LMSC) WG policies and procedures
 - Above supplemented by Operating Rules of IEEE Project 802 Working Group 802.3, CSMA/CD LANs section 2.8
- Process
 - WG Ballot Preview – by Monday prior to plenary
 - If any changes are made to the draft after the draft was made available for pre-view **the textual changes shall be presented for review during the closing plenary immediately prior to the vote for approval to go to WG ballot.**
 - WG Initial Ballot – Minimum of 35 days in duration
 - WG Recirculations – Minimum of 15 days in duration

Ballot Group Make-up

- “consists of all voting members of the WG as of the close of day the ballot package distribution was completed as determined by the WG Chair.”
- What this means
 - If you are a voting member of the WG (802.3) when the initial ballot is announced, you’re in the group
 - The balloting group does NOT change throughout the ballot; *including re-circulations*
- Examples
 - If you become a member at a plenary after the ballot has been launched you are not part of the ballot group
 - If you lose your membership at a plenary after the ballot group has launched you are still part of the group

Successfully Completing A Ballot

- Requirements to close a ballot
 - >= 50% participation rate AND
 - <30% abstention rate AND
 - >= 75% approval
- Requirements to complete the balloting process (Guided by OpMan 5.4.3.2)
 - Meet above
 - No need to rebut or recirculate disapprove comments
 - E.g. No new negatives
 - No need to make changes to the draft

What Does This Mean?

One guaranteed way to complete the balloting process *once you meet the closing requirements* is

STOP

MAKING

CHANGES

Agenda

- Overview of WG Ballot Process
- Similarities to TF Review
- Differences from TF Review

The Good News

- Practice makes perfect
 - Comment entry tool is the same as TF review
 - Comment resolution tool is the same as TF review
- Group can make changes based on comments *or for other reasons*
- Refer to diab_01_0512.pdf for
 - Comment entry tool tutorial
 - Tips for entering comments
 - http://www.ieee802.org/3/bj/public/may12/diab_01_0512.pdf

Agenda

- Overview of WG Ballot Process
- Similarities to TF Review
- Differences from TF Review

Differences from TF Review

- In addition to conditions highlighted in the process overview
 - E.g. Existence of a Ballot group, completion conditions etc.
- Member inputs
 - Ballot (Member's vote)
 - Designation of the comments
- Balloting group output
 - Recirculation of comments
 - Scope of the recirculations

Ways to vote during balloting (1)

- Approve without comment
 - You approve of the draft, have no comments, and are voting to move the draft to the next stage in the process.
- Approve with comment
 - You approve of the draft, and are voting to move it forward to the next stage. However, there are some changes you would like to see made but are satisfied if the changes are not made

Ways to vote during balloting (2)

- Disapprove
 - You do not approve of the draft. There are changes you feel are required to be made before the draft moves forward. Your “required” comments are associated with your negative vote
- Abstain
 - Due to lack of time or expertise you are choosing to abstain from voting on this draft.
 - May result in a loss of voting privileges during a Working Group Ballot

Meaning of the “R” Designation

- In a TF review, R has no formal meaning
 - Loosely, you care about it more passionately
- In a WG Ballot, R is associated with a disapprove ballot
 - Commenter has to be satisfied with the response OR the comment (and its associated response) HAS to be recirculated with the next draft

Recirculations

- Comments
 - R comments associated with a disapprove ballot have to be recirculated if the commenter is dissatisfied
 - Allows for other ballot group members to see the response and “pile on”
- Draft
 - Once 75% is reached, recirc scope narrows
 - Changed portions of the draft and/or sections of the draft affected by changes are within scope

FAQs

- What happens if return rate is not met?
 - Ballot can be extended up to 60 days until return rate is met
 - This is a safety net NOT a goal as it could delay the project
- What happens if approval rate is not met?
 - Scope of recirculation remains the entire document
- Refer to FAQs for more information
 - <http://www.ieee802.org/3/rules/votes.html>