



IEEE 802.3 Five Criteria

The IEEE 802 Criteria for Standards Development (Five Criteria) are defined in subclause 12.5 of the 'IEEE project 802 LAN/MAN Standards Committee (LMSC) operations manual'. These are supplemented by subclause 7.2 'Five Criteria' of the 'Operating Rules of IEEE Project 802 Working Group 802.3, CSMA/CD LANs'.

The following are the Five Criteria Responses in relation to the IEEE P802.3**bm** PAR:



Broad Market Potential

A standards project authorized by IEEE 802 LMSC shall have a broad market potential.

Specifically, it shall have the potential for:

- a) Broad sets of applicability.**
- b) Multiple vendors and numerous users.**
- c) Balanced costs (LAN versus attached stations).**

1. Optical Ethernet interfaces have been widely deployed. Examples include Data Centers, Enterprise and Telecom Network Equipment for edge, distribution and core connections.
2. Internet, cloud, and higher performance computing applications, along with advances in processors, server virtualization and converged networking, are driving the need for increasing numbers of high throughput LAN connections. As the market for 100 Gb/s LAN connections grows, lower cost, higher density, and lower power alternatives become necessary.
3. There has been wide attendance and participation (avg 108 persons, 71 companies) in the study group by equipment manufacturers, component suppliers and other stakeholders. It is anticipated that there will be sufficient participation to effectively complete the standardization process.
4. 100 Gb/s Ethernet optical PHY types utilizing a 4 x 25 Gb/s electrical interface, and optimized MMF interfaces will reduce cost, size and power for links in the growing Data Center market and provide a balance in cost between network equipment and attached stations.
5. 100 Gb/s Ethernet optical PHY types utilizing a 4 x 25 Gb/s electrical interface, and optimized SMF interfaces will reduce cost, size and power for links in the growing Data Center market and provide a balance in cost between network equipment and attached stations.
6. 40 Gb/s Ethernet has been deployed beyond its originally envisioned application space of server interconnect. Extending the reach of 40 Gb/s Ethernet will allow Ethernet to continue to address markets (such as telecom) as 10 Gb/s links are upgraded to 40 Gb/s.
7. **Energy Efficient Ethernet will reduce the operational costs and the environmental footprint of Ethernet Systems.**

* Items in red were amended in November 2012



Compatibility

IEEE 802 LMSC defines a family of standards. All standards should be in conformance : IEEE Std 802, IEEE 802.1D, and IEEE 802.1Q. If any variances in conformance emerge, they shall be thoroughly disclosed and reviewed with IEEE 802.1 Working Group. In order to demonstrate compatibility with this criterion, the Five Criteria statement must answer the following questions. Each standard in the IEEE 802 family of standards shall include a definition of managed objects that are compatible with systems management standards.

- a) Does the PAR mandate that the standard shall comply with IEEE Std 802, IEEE Std 802.1D and IEEE Std 802.1Q?
 - b) If not, how will the Working Group ensure that the resulting draft standard is compliant, or if not, receives appropriate review from the IEEE 802.1 Working Group
- **Compatibility with IEEE Std 802.3**
 - **Conformance with the IEEE Std 802.3 MAC**
 - **Managed object definitions compatible with SNMP**

1. As an amendment to IEEE Std 802.3 (as amended by IEEE Std 802.3ba-2010) the proposed project will remain in conformance with the IEEE 802 Overview and Architecture, the bridging standards IEEE Std 802.1D and IEEE Std 802.1Q
2. The proposed amendment will conform to the full-duplex operating mode of the IEEE 802.3 MAC.
3. The proposed amendment will conform to the 40 Gb/s and 100 Gb/s Media Independent Interfaces (XLGMII and CGMII) specified by IEEE Std 802.3.**with optional additions for Energy Efficient Ethernet.**
4. The proposed amendment will follow the existing format and structure of IEEE 802.3 management definitions by providing a protocol-independent specification of managed objects.
5. SNMP management capability to be provided in the future by an amendment to or revision of IEEE Std 802.3.1.
6. The PAR mandates the resulting standard will comply with IEEE Std 802, IEEE Std 802.1D, and IEEE Std 802.1Q.

* Items in red were amended in November 2012



Distinct Identity (1 of 2)

Each IEEE 802 LMSC standard shall have a distinct identity. To achieve this, each authorized project shall be:

- a) Substantially different from other IEEE 802 standards.**
- b) One unique solution per problem (not two solutions to a problem).**
- c) Easy for the document reader to select the relevant specification.**
- d) Substantially different from other IEEE 802.3 specifications/solutions.**

1. While IEEE Std 802.3 does include specifications for 40 Gb/s and 100 Gb/s Ethernet on MMF and SMF cables there is a demand for reduced power, increased density and reduced cost with respect to these solutions.

2. The proposed 100 Gb/s SMF PHY(s) would use four 25 Gb/s electrical interconnect lanes in each direction **not currently defined in IEEE Std 802.3.**

3. The proposed 100 Gb/s MMF PHY(s) would use four lanes in each direction, allowing an 8 fiber link (rather than the 20 fiber link used by 100GBASE-SR10) and avoiding the need for a gearbox to/from the 25 Gb/s electrical interconnect.

4. The proposed 40 Gb/s SMF PHY would provide the only Ethernet solution at this rate for operation over distances above 10 km.



Distinct Identity (2 of 2)

Each IEEE 802 LMSC standard shall have a distinct identity. To achieve this, each authorized project shall be:

- a) Substantially different from other IEEE 802 standards.
- b) One unique solution per problem (not two solutions to a problem).
- c) Easy for the document reader to select the relevant specification.
- d) **Substantially different from other IEEE 802.3 specifications/solutions.**

5. The amendment will define one or two PMD types over MMF depending on whether one PMD type with short reach and a second with longer reach have sufficient cost, density, or power difference to justify two PMD types.

6. The amendment will enable new PHY types over SMF which consist of the existing 100GBASELR4 and 100GBASE-ER4 optical PMDs with four electrical interconnect lanes in each direction. The amendment will define a new 100 Gb/s SMF PMD in addition to these if it can be shown that a SMF PMD with a shorter reach than 100GBASE-LR4 has sufficient cost, density, or power difference to justify an additional SMF PMD type.

7. The proposed amendment to the existing IEEE 802.3 standard will be formatted as a collection of new clauses and amendments of existing clauses as appropriate, making it easy for the reader to select the relevant specification.

8. IEEE Std 802.3 does not define Energy Efficient Ethernet for 40 Gb/s or 100 Gb/s operation.

* Items in red were amended in November 2012



Technical Feasibility

For a project to be authorized, it shall be able to show its technical feasibility. At a minimum, the proposed project shall show:

- a) Demonstrated system feasibility.**
- b) Proven technology, reasonable testing.**
- c) Confidence in reliability.**

1. The operation of Ethernet at 40 Gb/s and 100 Gb/s has been established by deployment of devices compliant with IEEE Std 802.3 in operational networks.
2. The proposed project will build on the array of Ethernet fiber-optic component and sub-system design experience, and the broad knowledge base of Ethernet network operation.
3. Component vendors have provided presentations on the feasibility of the necessary components for this project, which either leverage existing technologies or employ new technologies.
4. The reliability of Ethernet components and systems can be projected in the target environments with a high degree of confidence based on existing 40 Gb/s and 100 Gb/s deployment experience.



Economic Feasibility

For a project to be authorized, it shall be able to show economic feasibility (so far as can reasonably be estimated) for its intended applications. At a minimum, the proposed project shall show:

- a) Known cost factors, reliable data.**
- b) Reasonable cost for performance.**
- c) Consideration of installation costs.**

1. The cost factors for Ethernet components and systems are well known. The proposed project may introduce new cost factors which can be quantified.
2. Prior experience in the development of optical Physical Layer specifications for ethernet indicates that the specifications developed by this project will entail a reasonable cost for the resulting performance.
3. The proposed 100 Gb/s optical PHYs will make it possible to achieve the desired density, power and cost targets for computer systems and network equipment.
4. The proposed 40 Gb/s optical PHY will enable upgrade of existing 10 Gb/s 40 km links to 40 Gb/s operation at significantly lower cost than current solutions.
5. In consideration of installation costs, the project is expected to use proven and familiar media, including multi-pair MMF, duplex SMF and possibly multi-pair SMF cabling technology.
6. Network design, installation and maintenance costs are minimized by preserving network architecture, management, and software.