Cl **01**   *SC* **1.1**   *P* **28**   *L* **10**   # 4318
Hajduczenia, Marek   Bright House Networks

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ, 802.1AS Fmt*
Wrong format for IEEE 802.1AS

SuggestedRemedy
Change to "IEEE Std 802.1AS^{TM}-2011<,> IEEE Standard for Local and metropolitan area networks—

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Ther is a special character for the trademark symbol (Ctrl-q *)

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.1**   *P* **28**   *L* **4**   # 4319
Hajduczenia, Marek

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
Wrong subclause

SuggestedRemedy
Is "1.1" and should be "1.3"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.4.331**   *P* **29**   *L* **16**   # 4320
Hajduczenia, Marek   Bright House Networks

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**   *P2MP def*
There are issues with the new definition of P2MP

SuggestedRemedy
Change "connected to a number end stations" to "connected to a number of end stations"
Strike statement: "Frames transit the network between the central station and the end stations and do not transit directly from end station to end station." - we do not restrict ONU/CNU to ONU/CNU communication, if one desired to deploy links between them - these are outside of the scope of our definitions.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Include the "if" in the 1st sentence.
Donot strike the phrase regarding end station to end station communications. If ONU/CNUs could communicate directly it would not be P2MP but MP2MP

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.4.331**   *P* **29**   *L* **19**   # 4321
Hajduczenia, Marek   Bright House Networks

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ, and and*
Extra "and" in "Clause 64 and Clause 65"

SuggestedRemedy
mark this "and" as strikethroug and replace with underlined ","

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.5.1.3**   *P* **32**   *L* **10**   # 4322
Hajduczenia, Marek   Bright House Networks

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**   *OLT/CLT*
Changes to 30.3.5.1.3 make no sense - Clause 103 does not define OLT and ONU

SuggestedRemedy
Enumeration for aMPCPMode should be extended to include CLT and CNU
Then behavior description "An interface that can provide the Multipoint MAC Control sublayer functions specified in Clause 64 and Clause 77 operates as an OLT when this attribute has the enumeration "OLT".
When this attribute has the enumeration "ONU", the interface acts as an ONU."
should be augmented to read as follows:
An interface that can provide the Multipoint MAC Control sublayer functions specified in Clause 64 and Clause 77 operates as an OLT when this attribute has the enumeration "OLT".
An interface that can provide the Multipoint MAC Control sublayer functions specified in Clause 103 operates as an CLT when this attribute has the enumeration "CLT".
When this attribute has the enumeration "CNU", the interface acts as an CNU.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.149**   *P* **42**   *L* **1**   # 4323
Hajduczenia, Marek   Bright House Networks

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ, NW?*
"NW = Multi-word" does not exist in Table 45–98s

SuggestedRemedy
Change "NW = Multi-word" to "MW = Multi-word"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Comment ID* **4323**   Page 1 of 13
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   12/10/2015 6:43:59 PM
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Cl **00**	*SC* **100.3.4.2**	*P* **90**	*L* **33**	# 4324

Hajduczenia, Marek   Bright House Networks

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

Incorrect format of NOTE

SuggestedRemedy

It should be "NOTE-" and not "NOTE:"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Note: emdash is ctrl q shift q
Also:
Change two occurences in Table 100-5, page 93, lines 35 and 39.
Change page 115, line 46.
Change in Figure 101-10, page 149, line 19.
Change page 155, line 16.
Change two occurences on Page 171, lines 48 and 52.
Change page 173, line 35.
Change page 185, line 40.
Change in Figure 101-29, page 198, line 4.
Change in Figure 101-35, page 216, line 25.
Change in Figure 101-36, page 217, line 22.
Change in Figure 101-37, page 220, line 16.
Change in Figure 101-38, page 220, line 45.
Change page 229, line 25.
Change page 249, line 12.

Cl **00**	*SC* **100.3.6.2**	*P* **110**	*L* **20**	# 4325

Hajduczenia, Marek   Bright House Networks

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**

Per "3.2.7 MAC Client Data field", "Ethernet implementations shall support at least one of three maximum MAC Client Data field sizes defined
as follows", but it does not guarantee that envelope frame is supported. Is it implied that EPoC requires the support of envelope frames?

SuggestedRemedy

Add statement on what types of frames are required by EPoC, or alternatively list all possible frame sizes supports by 3.2.7
Similar change on line 34 would be required
Similar changes in 100.3.7.2 as well

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Summary of AIP: 1) restructure to move all conditions into the dashed list, 2) amend 100.3.6.2 and 100.3.7.2 text to cross reference appropriate CL 4A subclauses, these in turn reference 3.2.7, the CL 4A references in turn reference 4A.2.7.1 for maxEnvelopeFrameSize (which is 2000 bytes). This is to move explicit frame sizes out of CL100 and reference the places where they are specified for the Ethernet standard, and 3) add a note to beginning of 101.3.1 PCS overview on recommendation for supporting maximum length envelope frames (see 3.2.7), even though this may be redundant give the largest codeword size information word of 16200 bits, consider/discuss at resolution.
++++++++++++++++++++++++
Clause 100.3.6.2, Page 110
Line 20, change the entire paragraph preceding the dashed list to read:
"The CLT shall achieve a received frame loss ratio of less than or equal to 10^{-6} under the following input load and channel conditions:
Line , insert new dashed list line after "Input power.." line:.
"- Received signal having a CNR greater than or equal to that shown in Table 100-13."
Line 34, change "- Large bursts consisting of both 64-byte and 2000-byte Ethernet frames." To
"- Large bursts consisting of frames of any allowed sizes, including bursts consisting only of minimum-size frames (4A.2.3.2.4) and bursts consisting only of maximum-size frames (4A.2.4.2)."

Clause 100.3.7.2, Page 113
Line 10, change the entire paragraph preceding the dashed list to read:
"The CNU shall achieve a received frame loss ratio of less than or equal to 10^{-6} under the following input load and channel conditions:

Line 27 , insert new dashed list line after "Average power.." line:
"- Received signal having a CNR greater than or equal to that shown in Table 100-15."

Line 30, change "- Large bursts consisting of both 64-byte and 2000-byte Ethernet frames." To
"- Large bursts consisting of frames of any allowed sizes, including bursts consisting only of minimum-size frames (4A.2.3.2.4) and bursts consisting only of maximum-size frames (4A.2.4.2)."

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **4325**   Page 2 of 13
12/10/2015 6:43:59 PM

Clause 101.3.1, Page 136,
Line 26, add the following note:
"NOTE-Many implementations of the transmit and receive buffers might be dependent on the maximum length of frame supported. It is recommended that these frame buffers should be sized to accommodate maximum length envelope
frames (see 3.2.7). It is also recommended that the FEC function should accommodate maximum length envelope frames."

Cl **00**　　　*SC* **101.1.4**　　　　　*P* **133**　　　*L* **40**　　　# 4326
Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　　　　Bright House Networks

Comment Type **T**　　　*Comment Status* **D**
"PMD_SIGNAL.request()" has no argument

SuggestedRemedy
Either show it with no argument as "PMD_SIGNAL.request" or (preferred approach) show the argument

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change to "PMD_SIGNAL.request"
Globally search for PMD_SIGNAL.request() and change as appropriate.
Also in Fig 102-3
Pg 84 ln 48, 120 ln 39

Cl **101**　　　*SC* **101.3.3.1**　　　　*P* **166**　　　*L* **16**　　　# 4327
Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　　　　Bright House Networks

Comment Type **ER**　　　*Comment Status* **D**
Different font styles in SEND_OUT_BLOCK state in Figure 101–17
Also, figure 101-17 is visually different from 101-16 for some reason (boxes are thicker, font is larger, etc.) - please fix style in Figure 101-17

SuggestedRemedy
Per comment
Similar issue with multiple other SDs in the draft - some have thin lines (seems like these are drawn in Framemaker) and some have thick lines (I suspect these are drawn in Visio and imported into Frame)

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
In Fig 101-17 correct Font in state SEND_OUT_BLOCK,
Convert lines around state boxes to 0.5 pt. in Fig 101-17, 18, 31, 32, & 33

Cl **103**　　　*SC* **103.2.2.3**　　　　*P* **312**　　　*L* **11**　　　# 4328
Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　　　　Bright House Networks

Comment Type **T**　　　*Comment Status* **D**
Is there any reason for tqSizeC to be marked as Integer?

SuggestedRemedy
Change to "unsigned integer" - it is always positive

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **FM**　　　*SC* **FM**　　　　　　　*P* **1**　　　*L* **30**　　　# 4329
Anslow, Pete　　　　　　　　　　Ciena　　　　　　　　　　　　　　　*EZ*

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**
"IEEE P802.3bn Working Group review." should be "IEEE P802.3bn Working Group ballot recirculation."

SuggestedRemedy
Change "IEEE P802.3bn Working Group review." to "IEEE P802.3bn Working Group ballot recirculation."

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**　　　*SC* **1.1**　　　　　　　*P* **28**　　　*L* **10**　　　# 4330
Anslow, Pete　　　　　　　　　　Ciena

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　*EZ, 802.1AS Fmt*
In "IEEE Std 802.1ASTM-2011", the "TM" is for Trademark, so should be a superscripted TM symbol.

SuggestedRemedy
In "IEEE Std 802.1ASTM-2011", make the "TM" a superscripted TM symbol as per page 13, line 13.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general　　　　　*Comment ID* **4330**　　　Page 3 of 13
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn　　　　　12/10/2015 6:43:59 PM
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Cl **01** *SC* **1.4.134** *P* **28** *L* **21** *#* **4331**
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*
"as modified by P802.3by as follows:" should be "as modified by IEEE Std 802.3by-201x as follows:"

SuggestedRemedy
change "as modified by P802.3by as follows:" to "as modified by IEEE Std 802.3by-201x as follows:"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01** *SC* **1.4.331** *P* **29** *L* **20** *#* **4332**
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ, and and*
In "(See IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 64 and Clause 65, Clause 76, Clause 77, Clause 101, and Clause 103)", there are two instances of "and" and "Clause 103" should be underlined.

SuggestedRemedy
Show "Clause 64 and Clause 65" as being changed to "Clause 64, Clause 65"
Underline "Clause 103"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01** *SC* **1.4.400** *P* **29** *L* **34** *#* **4333**
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*
In "See Clause 64, Clause 77, and Clause 103.", the first comma has been added but is not underlined and the two clause references should be forest green.
In "The value of time_quantum is defined in 64.2.2.1." the reference to 64.2.2.1 should be forest green.

SuggestedRemedy
Show the first comma in underline font and apply the character tag "External" to "Clause 64", "Clause 77", and "64.2.2.1"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.3.5.1.2** *P* **31** *L* **37** *#* **4334**
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D**
In the editing instruction, "Behaviour Defined As" should be "BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS" to match the text below.
Same issue in the editing instruction for 30.3.5.1.3

SuggestedRemedy
In the editing instruction, change "Behaviour Defined As" to "BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS"
Make the same change in the editing instruction for 30.3.5.1.3

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **30** *SC* **30.3.5.1.3** *P* **32** *L* **10** *#* **4335**
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **D** *OLT/CLT*
Clause 103 has devices operating as a CLT not as an OLT. Similarly, Clause 103 has devices operating as a CNU not as an ONU.

SuggestedRemedy
Show "... operates as an OLT when ..." changing to "... operates as an OLT or a CLT when ..."
Also, show "... the interface acts as an ONU." changing to "... the interface acts as an ONU or a CNU."

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Coordinate changes with comment #4322

Cl **45** *SC* **45.2.1.4** *P* **37** *L* **3** *#* **4336**
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D**
As the P802.3by amendment is very likely to complete before P802.3bn, that amendment will have to show bit 1.4.10 as Reserved.
A comment has been submidded against P802.3by D3.0 to make this change.

SuggestedRemedy
Change the editing instruction to: "Change the reserved row for 1.4.10 in Table 45–6 as inserted by IEEE Std 802.3by-201x as follows
(unchanged rows not shown):"
Show the Name entry as changing from "Reserved"
Show the Description entry as changing from "Value always 0"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **4336** Page 4 of 13
12/10/2015 6:43:59 PM

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.4.b**   *P* **37**   *L* **22**   # 4337
Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
   Spurious " at the end of 45.2.1.4.b (as noted in comment 4301).

SuggestedRemedy
   Delete the "

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.14aa**   *P* **38**   *L* **17**   # 4338
Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**
   The editing instruction needs to include more information.

SuggestedRemedy
   Change the editing instruction to: "Insert 45.2.1.14aa and Table 45–17aa before 45.2.1.14a as inserted by IEEE Std 802.3by-201x as follows:"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.149**   *P* **52**   *L* **1**   # 4339
Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ, NM?*
   "NW = Multi-word" should be "MW = Multi-word"

SuggestedRemedy
   Change "NW = Multi-word" to "MW = Multi-word"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **100A**   *SC* **100A.2**   *P* **354**   *L* **18**   # 4340
Anslow, Pete   Ciena

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**
   In D2.1, "DOCSIS" had a registered trademark symbol and footnote: "DOCSIS is a registered trademark of CableLabs." This has disappeared in D2.2

SuggestedRemedy
   Reinstate them.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.
   See comment #4359

Cl **100**   *SC* **100.2.1.4**   *P* **84**   *L* **48**   # 4341
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**
   "101.3.2.5.7 needs to be an xref

SuggestedRemedy
   Make it so.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **100**   *SC* **100.3.4.1**   *P* **90**   *L* **10**   # 4342
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**
   put a space between the minus sign and "9.4 MHz", supposed to read like an equation.

SuggestedRemedy
   As per comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Comment ID* **4342**   Page 5 of 13
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   12/10/2015 6:43:59 PM
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Cl **100**	*SC* **100.3.4.2**	*P* **91**	*L* **19**	# 4343

Mark, Laubach　　　　　　　　　　　Broacom

Comment Type　**ER**　　*Comment Status*　**D**
In Table 100-3, lower case "Format"

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status*　**W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **100**	*SC* **100.3.5.2**	*P* **99**	*L* **15**	# 4344

Mark, Laubach　　　　　　　　　　　Broacom

Comment Type　**ER**　　*Comment Status*　**D**
In Equation 100-10, put a mult symbol between "10" and "log₁₀". Do the same for Equation 100-11, Line 48.

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment

Proposed Response　　*Response Status*　**W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **100**	*SC* **100.3.7.2**	*P* **113**	*L* **10**	# 4345

Mark, Laubach　　　　　　　　　　　Broacom

Comment Type　**ER**　　*Comment Status*　**D**
Make "2000-byte" no breaking.

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status*　**W**
PROPOSED REJECT.
Target text disappears when #4325 is applied.

Cl **100**	*SC* **100.4.4**	*P* **118**	*L* **23**	# 4346

Mark, Laubach　　　　　　　　　　　Broacom

Comment Type　**ER**　　*Comment Status*　**D**
Paragraph is of wrong type, change to T.text

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment

Proposed Response　　*Response Status*　**W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **100**	*SC* **100.4.4**	*P* **119**	*L* **4**	# 4347

Mark, Laubach　　　　　　　　　　　Broacom

Comment Type　**E**　　*Comment Status*　**D**
Change table to not leave a hanging single row.

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status*　**W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **100**	*SC* **100.3.4.5**	*P* **87**	*L* **53**	# 4348

Mark, Laubach　　　　　　　　　　　Broacom

Comment Type　**ER**　　*Comment Status*　**D**
Remove space in "Neqport '"

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status*　**W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **100**	*SC* **100.3.5.2**	*P* **90**	*L* **27**	# 4349

Mark, Laubach　　　　　　　　　　　Broacom

Comment Type　**ER**　　*Comment Status*　**D**
In "Pmax" the "max" may need to be capitalized, italized, and subscripted. Look for other occurences and editor to make consistent within this clause, e.g. line 40 same page.

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status*　**W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **4349**

Page 6 of 13
12/10/2015 6:43:59 PM

Cl **100**   *SC* **100.3.4.5.1**   *P* **92**   *L* **16**   # 4350
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**
    Look for occurences of "X db" in paragraph text and change the space to a non-breaking space here and elsewhere as appropriate.

SuggestedRemedy
    As per comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **100**   *SC* **100.3.5.6**   *P* **99**   *L* **49**   # 4351
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**
    Remove period for this "See Table 100-2." entry for "Modulation format" row. Editor to check for consistency of "see <xref>" entries in tables.

SuggestedRemedy
    As per comment

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **100**   *SC* **100.3.7.3**   *P* **114**   *L* **35**   # 4352
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**
    Use of "10xlog10" in RxMER subclauses and Page 115, Line 17, Figure 100-4 change to "10xlog$_{10}$". .

SuggestedRemedy
    In RxMER subclauses, change any occurences as per comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **100**   *SC* **100.3.5.4.3**   *P* **104**   *L* **2**   # 4353
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**
    Change "10xlog10" to "10xlog$_{10}$".

SuggestedRemedy
    As per comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **100**   *SC* **100.3.7.1**   *P* **105**   *L* **35**   # 4354
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**
    In Table 100-14, Use of "10xlog(24)" change to "10xlog$_{10}$(24)". I checked with the technical author of this material.

SuggestedRemedy
    As per comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **100**   *SC* **100.3.7.3**   *P* **106**   *L* **27**   # 4355
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**
    In equation 100-19, chage "10log$_{10}$" to "10xlog$_{10}$"; i.e. add the explicit multiplication sign for consistency.

SuggestedRemedy
    As per comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **4355**

Page 7 of 13
12/10/2015 6:43:59 PM

Cl **100**   *SC* **100.3.7.3**   *P* **98**   *L* **37**   # 4356
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**
In Equation 100-9, add a multiplication symbol between "10" and "log"
Page 99, Line 15, same for 100-10, line 48, same for Equestion 100-11.

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **100A**   *SC* **100A.2**   *P* **354**   *L* **13**   # 4357
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**
Put a comma after the first "I₀".

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **100A**   *SC* **100A.3**   *P* **356**   *L* **15**   # 4358
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**
lower case "Upstream". line 16 change "an" to "any"

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **100A**   *SC* **100A**   *P* **354**   *L* **18**   # 4359
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**
Return the copyright (c) and footnote for the use of DOCSIS that was in Draft 2.1. This
disappeared in D2.2.

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **100A**   *SC* **100A.2**   *P* **354**   *L* **14**   # 4360
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**
These got dropped from Draft 2.1: Expand "NCTA" to "National Cable & Telecommunications
Association".   Line 18, expand "UCER" to "uncorrectable codeword error rate"

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **101**   *SC* **101.3.2.1.5**   *P* **141**   *L* **26**   # 4361
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
Text extends outside UPDATE_COUNTERS box. Resize/position box to fix.

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Comment ID* **4361**   Page 8 of 13
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   12/10/2015 6:43:59 PM
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Cl **00**   *SC* **101.3.2.5.7**   *P* **154**   *L* **37**   # 4362
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status*   **D**
In other places, function pseudo code begin with the word "function" and the font size is a little smaller. Make all function code blocks look consistent.

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Changed to Cl 00
Create a Paragraph Tag for Code:
Name – code
1st indent – 18 pt
Left – 18 pt
Line space – 11 pt.
Tabs: 36 pt repeated every 18 pt
Font: Courier New, 9 pt.
All else normal

Apply to all pseudo code in the draft.
Begin all pseudo code with the kewords
Function function_name(param1, param2, …) {
where:
function_name is the name of the function defined by the code.
param1, param2 - is a list of parameters required by the function

Include code located at:
Pg ln
153 7
153 52
154 37
155 5
312 43

Cl **101**   *SC* **101.4.3.2**   *P* **173**   *L* **45**   # 4363
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **D**
Change "*" characters to multiplication symbols. Change "log" to "log₁₀" in both occurences.

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **101**   *SC* **101.4.3.4.5**   *P* **176**   *L* **28**   # 4364
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**   *EZ*
Make "DS_ModTypeSC(1)" non breaking

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **101**   *SC* **101.4.3.8.3**   *P* **185**   *L* **8**   # 4365
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**   *line spacing*
The supercript "Ai(k)" trespasses in to line above it. See if can fix line spacing or similar to prevent the overlap.

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Move offending text to numbered eq and replace the embedded refer to new Eq.

See similar comment #4386

Cl **101**   *SC* **101.4.3.10**   *P* **193**   *L* **53**   # 4366
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**
Consider doing a "keep with next 2", to keep it with next two lines on same page.

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Comment ID* **4366**   Page 9 of 13
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   12/10/2015 6:43:59 PM
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Cl **101**   *SC* **101.4.3.12**   *P* **198**   *L* **13**   # 4367
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**   *EZ*
The "t" of "output" is running into the vertical dashed line. Consider providing a little bit of space to avoid overrun.

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Also move "DSNrp" outside of arrow markers in 4 places.

Cl **101**   *SC* **101.4.3.13**   *P* **200**   *L* **6**   # 4368
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**
In Table 101-12 resize "Item" column a little larger to prevent the "cy" hypenation.

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Make offensive hyphenated word non-breaking (Esc n s):
Row 1/2 - configuration
Row 3 - placement
Row 4 - indexing, frequency
Row 5 - frequency
Row 6 - Spectrum
Row 7 - overlap

Cl **101**   *SC* **101.4.4.3.5**   *P* **203**   *L* **11**   # 4369
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**   *EZ*
sentence missing ending period, add it.

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **101**   *SC* **101.4.4.4.4**   *P* **205**   *L* **49**   # 4370
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**   *EZ*
"show" should be "shown". Consider changing "below." to "below:"

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **101**   *SC* **101.5.4**   *P* **231**   *L* **21**   # 4371
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**
Paragraph indenting looks odd after the first line. Fix if needed.

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.
Change to para tag T, Text

Cl **00**   *SC* **101.6.4.10**   *P* **238**   *L* **44**   # 4372
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**
Do a keep with next for the heading and the following table.

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Chnaged to Cl 00, apply to all PICS clauses.

Try
1) removing all empty para marks.
2) change "Start" param in all PICS Tables to anywhere

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Comment ID* **4372**   Page 10 of 13
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   12/10/2015 6:43:59 PM
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Cl **102** *SC* **102.1.4.2.1** *P* **247** *L* **27** # 4373
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D**   EZ
 Sentence missing terminating period, add it.

SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **102** *SC* **102.1.8** *P* **249** *L* **10** # 4374
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **D**   EZ
 "Clause 45" needs to be an xref.

SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **102** *SC* **102.2.1.1** *P* **253** *L* **11** # 4375
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **D**   EZ
 Dashed lines should be set to "send to back" or what is need to avoid the visual overlap.

SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **102** *SC* **102.2.7.1** *P* **263** *L* **7** # 4376
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D**   EZ
 Missing ending period on lines 7, 12, 18, 22, 28. (Note there is a period ending linse 37, 41, 45, and 51.)

SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **102** *SC* **102.2.7.4** *P* **266** *L* **18** # 4377
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D**   EZ
 Missing period at end of sentence, add it.

SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **102** *SC* **102.2.7.5** *P* **267** *L* **38** # 4378
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D**
 "LEN(PhyTxFifo) = 0" needs a little separate from the horizontal line above.

SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 As per comment
 FmLen < MaxMBlen (ln 39) could use some more room also.

Cl **102** *SC* **102.3.5.5** *P* **272** *L* **28** # 4379
Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **D**
 This subclause has not content, remove it.
 Line 31, subclause 102.3.5.6 has no content, remove it.
 Line 37, need a space between "in" and "Figure 102-18".

SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.
 Page changed to 272

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **4379** Page 11 of 13
12/10/2015 6:43:59 PM

Cl **102**　　　*SC* **102.4.1.1**　　　　*P* **274**　　　*L* **32**　　　　# 4380
Mark, Laubach　　　　　　　　　　　Broacom

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**D**
Did we get rid of "+=" notation? If so, this one has to go also.

SuggestedRemedy
Fix if needed.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**
PROPOSED REJECT.
++ is still used in pseudo code, just omitted it from SD's.

Cl **102**　　　*SC* **102.4.1.4**　　　　*P* **275**　　　*L* **40**　　　　# 4381
Mark, Laubach　　　　　　　　　　　Broacom

Comment Type　**ER**　　　*Comment Status*　**D**　　　　　　　*EZ*
Make "32-bit" non-breaking.

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **102**　　　*SC* **102.4.1.6**　　　　*P* **278**　　　*L* **44**　　　　# 4382
Mark, Laubach　　　　　　　　　　　Broacom

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**D**　　　　　　　*EZ*
Please a return between "CNU_ID" and "Allocation" to avoid hyphenation.

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **102**　　　*SC* **102.4.1.8**　　　　*P* **279**　　　*L* **24**　　　　# 4383
Mark, Laubach　　　　　　　　　　　Broacom

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**D**　　　　　　　*EZ*
Needs period at end of sentence.

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **102**　　　*SC* **102.4.9.2**　　　　*P* **281**　　　*L* **5**　　　　# 4384
Mark, Laubach　　　　　　　　　　　Broacom

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**D**　　　　　　　*EZ*
Font is size 9 on lines 4 through 7, reset to size 10.
Line 25 and 30, put a period at end of sentence.

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **102**　　　*SC* **102.4.2.2**　　　　*P* **283**　　　*L* **9**　　　　# 4385
Mark, Laubach　　　　　　　　　　　Broacom

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**D**　　　　　　　*EZ*
Change from parenthetical to type note.

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.
"NOTE--" (long dash, Ctrl q Shft Q)

Cl **102**　　　*SC* **102.4.2.4**　　　　*P* **285**　　　*L* **42**　　　　# 4386
Mark, Laubach　　　　　　　　　　　Broacom

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**D**　　　　　*line spacing*
Superscripts are running into text of line above. Increase line spacing slightly on this or
something else to prevent the overlap.

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See cmt#4365
Move the polynomioal to a new numbered Eq and Ref in text as:
"defined by the polynomial in Equation (102-X) seeded"

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general　　　　　*Comment ID* **4386**　　　Page 12 of 13
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn　　　　　12/10/2015 6:43:59 PM
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Cl **102**   *SC* **102.4.2.7**   *P* **287**   *L* **33**   # 4387

Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
   4 Lines 34 through 38 are font size 9, set to font size 10.

SuggestedRemedy
   As per comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **102**   *SC* **102.5.4.3**   *P* **296**   *L* **9**   # 4388

Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*
   Remove period from end of sentence for consistency.

SuggestedRemedy
   As per comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.2.1.2**   *P* **31**   *L* **16**   # 4389

Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**
   Convert to non-breaking spaces in "10 Gb/s" and "1.6 Gb/s". Do same on line 27.

SuggestedRemedy
   As per comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **56**   *SC* **56.1**   *P* **61**   *L* **30**   # 4390

Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**
   Add non-breaking spaces to numbers and units for "10 Gb/s" and "1 Gb/s" (four places)

SuggestedRemedy
   As per comment

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **56**   *SC* **56.1.2.2**   *P* **63**   *L* **30**   # 4391

Mark, Laubach   Broacom

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**
   Convert to non-breaking space in "100 Mb/s"

SuggestedRemedy
   As per comment

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Comment ID* **4391**   Page 13 of 13
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   12/10/2015 6:43:59 PM
SORT ORDER: Comment ID