

Cl FM **SC FM** **P 1** **L 30** # **4329**
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **X**
 "IEEE P802.3bn Working Group review." should be "IEEE P802.3bn Working Group ballot recirculation."
SuggestedRemedy
 Change "IEEE P802.3bn Working Group review." to "IEEE P802.3bn Working Group ballot recirculation."
Proposed Response **Response Status** **O**

Cl 01 **SC 1.1** **P 28** **L 4** # **4319**
 Hajduczenia, Marek
Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **X**
 Wrong subclause
SuggestedRemedy
 Is "1.1" and should be "1.3"
Proposed Response **Response Status** **O**

Cl 01 **SC 1.1** **P 28** **L 10** # **4318**
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks
Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **X** *802.1AS Fmt*
 Wrong format for IEEE 802.1AS
SuggestedRemedy
 Change to "IEEE Std 802.1ASTM-2011<, > IEEE Standard for Local and metropolitan area networks—
Proposed Response **Response Status** **O**

Cl 01 **SC 1.1** **P 28** **L 10** # **4330**
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **X** *802.1AS Fmt*
 In "IEEE Std 802.1ASTM-2011", the "TM" is for Trademark, so should be a superscripted TM symbol.
SuggestedRemedy
 In "IEEE Std 802.1ASTM-2011", make the "TM" a superscripted TM symbol as per page 13, line 13.
Proposed Response **Response Status** **O**

Cl 01 **SC 1.4.134** **P 28** **L 21** # **4331**
 Anslow, Pete Ciena
Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **X**
 "as modified by P802.3by as follows:" should be "as modified by IEEE Std 802.3by-201x as follows:"
SuggestedRemedy
 change "as modified by P802.3by as follows:" to "as modified by IEEE Std 802.3by-201x as follows:"
Proposed Response **Response Status** **O**

Cl 01 **SC 1.4.331** **P 29** **L 16** # **4320**
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks
Comment Type **TR** **Comment Status** **X**
 There are issues with the new definition of P2MP
SuggestedRemedy
 Change "connected to a number end stations" to "connected to a number of end stations"
 Strike statement: "Frames transit the network between the central station and the end stations and do not transit directly from end station to end station." - we do not restrict ONU/CNU to ONU/CNU communication, if one desired to deploy links between them - these are outside of the scope of our definitions.
Proposed Response **Response Status** **O**

CI 01 SC 1.4.331 P 29 L 19 # 4321
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks

Comment Type E Comment Status X and and
 Extra "and" in "Clause 64 and Clause 65"

SuggestedRemedy
 mark this "and" as strikethrough and replace with underlined ","

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 01 SC 1.4.331 P 29 L 20 # 4332
 Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status X and and
 In "(See IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 64 and Clause 65, Clause 76, Clause 77, Clause 101, and Clause 103)", there are two instances of "and" and "Clause 103" should be underlined.

SuggestedRemedy
 Show "Clause 64 and Clause 65" as being changed to "Clause 64, Clause 65"
 Underline "Clause 103"

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 01 SC 1.4.400 P 29 L 34 # 4333
 Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status X
 In "See Clause 64, Clause 77, and Clause 103.", the first comma has been added but is not underlined and the two clause references should be forest green.
 In "The value of time_quantum is defined in 64.2.2.1." the reference to 64.2.2.1 should be forest green.

SuggestedRemedy
 Show the first comma in underline font and apply the character tag "External" to "Clause 64", "Clause 77", and "64.2.2.1"

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 30 SC 30.3.2.1.2 P 31 L 16 # 4389
 Mark, Laubach Broacom

Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Convert to non-breaking spaces in "10 Gb/s" and "1.6 Gb/s". Do same on line 27.

SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 30 SC 30.3.5.1.2 P 31 L 37 # 4334
 Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status X
 In the editing instruction, "Behaviour Defined As" should be "BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS" to match the text below.
 Same issue in the editing instruction for 30.3.5.1.3

SuggestedRemedy
 In the editing instruction, change "Behaviour Defined As" to "BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS"
 Make the same change in the editing instruction for 30.3.5.1.3

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 30 SC 30.3.5.1.3 P 32 L 10 # 4335
 Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type T Comment Status X OLT/CLT
 Clause 103 has devices operating as a CLT not as an OLT. Similarly, Clause 103 has devices operating as a CNU not as an ONU.

SuggestedRemedy
 Show "... operates as an OLT when ..." changing to "... operates as an OLT or a CLT when ..."
 Also, show "... the interface acts as an ONU." changing to "... the interface acts as an ONU or a CNU."

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 30 SC 30.3.5.1.3 P 32 L 10 # 4322
Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks

Comment Type TR Comment Status X OLT/CLT

Changes to 30.3.5.1.3 make no sense - Clause 103 does not define OLT and ONU

SuggestedRemedy

Enumeration for aMPCMode should be extended to include CLT and CNU
Then behavior description "An interface that can provide the Multipoint MAC Control sublayer functions specified in Clause 64 and Clause 77 operates as an OLT when this attribute has the enumeration "OLT".
When this attribute has the enumeration "ONU", the interface acts as an ONU."
should be augmented to read as follows:
An interface that can provide the Multipoint MAC Control sublayer functions specified in Clause 64 and Clause 77 operates as an OLT when this attribute has the enumeration "OLT".
An interface that can provide the Multipoint MAC Control sublayer functions specified in Clause 103 operates as an CLT when this attribute has the enumeration "CLT".
When this attribute has the enumeration "CNU", the interface acts as an CNU.

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.4 P 37 L 3 # 4336
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status X

As the P802.3by amendment is very likely to complete before P802.3bn, that amendment will have to show bit 1.4.10 as Reserved.
A comment has been submitted against P802.3by D3.0 to make this change.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the editing instruction to: "Change the reserved row for 1.4.10 in Table 45-6 as inserted by IEEE Std 802.3by-201x as follows (unchanged rows not shown):"
Show the Name entry as changing from "Reserved"
Show the Description entry as changing from "Value always 0"

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.4.b P 37 L 22 # 4337
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Spurious " at the end of 45.2.1.4.b (as noted in comment 4301).

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the "

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.149 P 42 L 1 # 4323
Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks

Comment Type E Comment Status X NW?

"NW = Multi-word" does not exist in Table 45-98s

SuggestedRemedy

Change "NW = Multi-word" to "MW = Multi-word"

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.149 P 52 L 1 # 4339
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status X NM?

"NW = Multi-word" should be "MW = Multi-word"

SuggestedRemedy

Change "NW = Multi-word" to "MW = Multi-word"

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.14aa P 38 L 17 # 4338
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status X

The editing instruction needs to include more information.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the editing instruction to: "Insert 45.2.1.14aa and Table 45-17aa before 45.2.1.14a as inserted by IEEE Std 802.3by-201x as follows:"

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 56 **SC 56.1** **P 61** **L 30** # **4390**
 Mark, Laubach Broacom
Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **X**
 Add non-breaking spaces to numbers and units for "10 Gb/s" and "1 Gb/s" (four places)
SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment
Proposed Response **Response Status** **O**

CI 100 **SC 100.3.4.2** **P 90** **L 33** # **4324**
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks
Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **X**
 Incorrect format of NOTE
SuggestedRemedy
 It should be "NOTE—" and not "NOTE:"
Proposed Response **Response Status** **O**

CI 56 **SC 56.1.2.2** **P 63** **L 30** # **4391**
 Mark, Laubach Broacom
Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **X**
 Convert to non-breaking space in "100 Mb/s"
SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment
Proposed Response **Response Status** **O**

CI 100 **SC 100.3.4.2** **P 91** **L 19** # **4343**
 Mark, Laubach Broacom
Comment Type **ER** **Comment Status** **X**
 In Table 100-3, lower case "Format"
SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.
Proposed Response **Response Status** **O**

CI 100 **SC 100.2.1.4** **P 84** **L 48** # **4341**
 Mark, Laubach Broacom
Comment Type **ER** **Comment Status** **X**
 "101.3.2.5.7 needs to be an xref"
SuggestedRemedy
 Make it so.
Proposed Response **Response Status** **O**

CI 100 **SC 100.3.4.5** **P 87** **L 53** # **4348**
 Mark, Laubach Broacom
Comment Type **ER** **Comment Status** **X**
 Remove space in "Neqport "
SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.
Proposed Response **Response Status** **O**

CI 100 **SC 100.3.4.1** **P 90** **L 10** # **4342**
 Mark, Laubach Broacom
Comment Type **ER** **Comment Status** **X**
 put a space between the minus sign and "9.4 MHz", supposed to read like an equation.
SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.
Proposed Response **Response Status** **O**

CI 100 **SC 100.3.4.5.1** **P 92** **L 16** # **4350**
 Mark, Laubach Broacom
Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **X**
 Look for occurrences of "X db" in paragraph text and change the space to a non-breaking space here and elsewhere as appropriate.
SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.
Proposed Response **Response Status** **O**

CI 100 SC 100.3.5.2 P 90 L 27 # 4349
 Mark, Laubach Broacom
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X
 In "Pmax" the "max" may need to be capitalized, italicized, and subscripted. Look for other occurrences and editor to make consistent within this clause, e.g. line 40 same page.
 SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 100 SC 100.3.5.2 P 99 L 15 # 4344
 Mark, Laubach Broacom
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X
 In Equation 100-10, put a mult symbol between "10" and "log₁₀". Do the same for Equation 100-11, Line 48.
 SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 100 SC 100.3.5.4.3 P 104 L 2 # 4353
 Mark, Laubach Broacom
 Comment Type T Comment Status X
 Change "10xlog10" to "10xlog₁₀".
 SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 100 SC 100.3.5.6 P 99 L 49 # 4351
 Mark, Laubach Broacom
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Remove period for this "See Table 100-2." entry for "Modulation format" row. Editor to check for consistency of "see <xref>" entries in tables.
 SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 100 SC 100.3.6.2 P 110 L 20 # 4325
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks
 Comment Type TR Comment Status X
 Per "3.2.7 MAC Client Data field", "Ethernet implementations shall support at least one of three maximum MAC Client Data field sizes defined as follows", but it does not guarantee that envelope frame is supported. Is it implied that EPoC requires the support of envelope frames?
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add statement on what types of frames are required by EPoC, or alternatively list all possible frame sizes supports by 3.2.7
 Similar change on line 34 would be required
 Similar changes in 100.3.7.2 as well
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 100 SC 100.3.7.1 P 105 L 35 # 4354
 Mark, Laubach Broacom
 Comment Type T Comment Status X
 In Table 100-14, Use of "10xlog(24)" change to "10xlog₁₀(24)". I checked with the technical author of this material.
 SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 100 SC 100.3.7.2 P 113 L 10 # 4345
 Mark, Laubach Broacom
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X
 Make "2000-byte" no breaking.
 SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 100 SC 100.3.7.3 P 98 L 37 # 4356
 Mark, Laubach Broacom
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 In Equation 100-9, add a multiplication symbol between "10" and "log"
 Page 99, Line 15, same for 100-10, line 48, same for Equation 100-11.
 SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 100 SC 100.3.7.3 P 106 L 27 # 4355
 Mark, Laubach Broacom
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 In equation 100-19, change "10log₁₀" to "10xlog₁₀"; i.e. add the
 explicit multiplication sign for consistency.
 SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 100 SC 100.3.7.3 P 114 L 35 # 4352
 Mark, Laubach Broacom
 Comment Type T Comment Status X
 Use of "10xlog10" in RxMER subclauses and Page 115, Line 17, Figure 100-4 change to
 "10xlog₁₀".
 SuggestedRemedy
 In RxMER subclauses, change any occurrences as per comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 100 SC 100.4.4 P 118 L 23 # 4346
 Mark, Laubach Broacom
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X
 Paragraph is of wrong type, change to T.text
 SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 100 SC 100.4.4 P 119 L 4 # 4347
 Mark, Laubach Broacom
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Change table to not leave a hanging single row.
 SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 100A SC 100A P 354 L 18 # 4359
 Mark, Laubach Broacom
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X
 Return the copyright (c) and footnote for the use of DOCSIS that was in Draft 2.1. This
 disappeared in D2.2.
 SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 100A **SC 100A.2** **P 354** **L 13** # **4357**
 Mark, Laubach Broacom

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **X**
 Put a comma after the first "`₀`".

SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.

Proposed Response **Response Status** **O**

Cl 100A **SC 100A.2** **P 354** **L 14** # **4360**
 Mark, Laubach Broacom

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **X**
 These got dropped from Draft 2.1: Expand "NCTA" to "National Cable & Telecommunications Association". Line 18, expand "UCER" to "uncorrectable codeword error rate"

SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.

Proposed Response **Response Status** **O**

Cl 100A **SC 100A.2** **P 354** **L 18** # **4340**
 Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **X**
 In D2.1, "DOCSIS" had a registered trademark symbol and footnote: "DOCSIS is a registered trademark of CableLabs." This has disappeared in D2.2

SuggestedRemedy
 Reinstate them.

Proposed Response **Response Status** **O**

Cl 100A **SC 100A.3** **P 356** **L 15** # **4358**
 Mark, Laubach Broacom

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **X**
 lower case "Upstream". line 16 change "an" to "any"

SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.

Proposed Response **Response Status** **O**

Cl 101 **SC 101.1.4** **P 133** **L 40** # **4326**
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks

Comment Type **T** **Comment Status** **X**
 "PMD_SIGNAL.request()" has no argument

SuggestedRemedy
 Either show it with no argument as "PMD_SIGNAL.request" or (preferred approach) show the argument

Proposed Response **Response Status** **O**

Cl 101 **SC 101.3.2.1.5** **P 141** **L 26** # **4361**
 Mark, Laubach Broacom

Comment Type **ER** **Comment Status** **X**
 Text extends outside UPDATE_COUNTERS box. Resize/position box to fix.

SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.

Proposed Response **Response Status** **O**

Cl 101 **SC 101.3.2.5.7** **P 154** **L 37** # **4362**
 Mark, Laubach Broacom

Comment Type **ER** **Comment Status** **X**
 In other places, function pseudo code begin with the word "function" and the font size is a little smaller. Make all function code blocks look consistent.

SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.

Proposed Response **Response Status** **O**

CI 101 SC 101.3.3.1 P 166 L 16 # 4327
 Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks

Comment Type ER Comment Status X
 Different font styles in SEND_OUT_BLOCK state in Figure 101-17
 Also, figure 101-17 is visually different from 101-16 for some reason (boxes are thicker, font is larger, etc.) - please fix style in Figure 101-17

SuggestedRemedy
 Per comment
 Similar issue with multiple other SDs in the draft - some have thin lines (seems like these are drawn in Framemaker) and some have thick lines (I suspect these are drawn in Visio and imported into Frame)

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 101 SC 101.4.3.2 P 173 L 45 # 4363
 Mark, Laubach Broacom

Comment Type T Comment Status X
 Change "*" characters to multiplication symbols. Change "log" to "log₁₀" in both occurrences.

SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 101 SC 101.4.3.4.5 P 176 L 28 # 4364
 Mark, Laubach Broacom

Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Make "DS_ModTypeSC(1)" non breaking

SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 101 SC 101.4.3.8.3 P 185 L 8 # 4365
 Mark, Laubach Broacom

Comment Type E Comment Status X
 The superscript "Ai(k)" trespasses in to line above it. See if can fix line spacing or similar to prevent the overlap.

SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 101 SC 101.4.3.10 P 193 L 53 # 4366
 Mark, Laubach Broacom

Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Consider doing a "keep with next 2", to keep it with next two lines on same page.

SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 101 SC 101.4.3.12 P 198 L 13 # 4367
 Mark, Laubach Broacom

Comment Type E Comment Status X
 The "t" of "output" is running into the vertical dashed line. Consider providing a little bit of space to avoid overrun.

SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 101 SC 101.4.3.13 P 200 L 6 # 4368
 Mark, Laubach Broacom

Comment Type E Comment Status X
 In Table 101-12 resize "Item" column a little larger to prevent the "cy" hyphenation.

SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 101 SC 101.4.4.3.5 P 203 L 11 # 4369
 Mark, Laubach Broacom
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 sentence missing ending period, add it.
 SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 102 SC 102.1.4.2.1 P 247 L 27 # 4373
 Mark, Laubach Broacom
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Sentence missing terminating period, add it.
 SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 101 SC 101.4.4.4.4 P 205 L 49 # 4370
 Mark, Laubach Broacom
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 "show" should be "shown". Consider changing "below." to "below:"
 SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 102 SC 102.1.8 P 249 L 10 # 4374
 Mark, Laubach Broacom
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X
 "Clause 45" needs to be an xref.
 SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 101 SC 101.5.4 P 231 L 21 # 4371
 Mark, Laubach Broacom
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Paragraph indenting looks odd after the first line. Fix if needed.
 SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 102 SC 102.2.1.1 P 253 L 11 # 4375
 Mark, Laubach Broacom
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X
 Dashed lines should be set to "send to back" or what is need to avoid the visual overlap.
 SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 101 SC 101.6.4.10 P 238 L 44 # 4372
 Mark, Laubach Broacom
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Do a keep with next for the heading and the following table.
 SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 102 SC 102.2.7.1 P 263 L 7 # 4376
 Mark, Laubach Broacom
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Missing ending period on lines 7, 12, 18, 22, 28. (Note there is a period ending linse 37, 41, 45, and 51.)
 SuggestedRemedy
 As per comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

