C/ FM SC FM P1 L 30 # 4329

Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status X

"IEEE P802.3bn Working Group review." should be "IEEE P802.3bn Working Group ballot recirculation."

SuggestedRemedy

Draft 2.2

Change "IEEE P802.3bn Working Group review." to "IEEE P802.3bn Working Group ballot recirculation."

Proposed Response Status O

C/ 01 SC 1.1 P 28 L 4 # 4319

Hajduczenia, Marek

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Wrong subclause

SuggestedRemedy

Is "1.1" and should be "1.3"

Proposed Response Status O

 C/ 01
 SC 1.1
 P 28
 L 10
 # 4318

 Hajduczenia, Marek
 Bright House Networks

Comment Type E Comment Status X 802.1AS Fmt

Wrong format for IEEE 802.1AS

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "IEEE Std 802.1ASTM-2011<,> IEEE Standard for Local and metropolitan area networks—

Proposed Response Status O

C/ 01 SC 1.1 P 28 L 10 # 4330

Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status X 802.1AS Fmt

In "IEEE Std 802.1ASTM-2011", the "TM" is for Trademark, so should be a superscripted TM symbol.

SuggestedRemedy

In "IEEE Std 802.1ASTM-2011", make the "TM" a superscripted TM symbol as per page 13, line 13

Proposed Response Status O

C/ 01 SC 1.4.134 P 28 L 21 # 4331

Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status X

"as modified by P802.3by as follows:" should be "as modified by IEEE Std 802.3by-201x as follows:"

SuggestedRemedy

change "as modified by P802.3by as follows:" to "as modified by IEEE Std 802.3by-201x as follows:"

Proposed Response Status O

C/ 01 SC 1.4.331 P 29 L 16 # 4320

Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks

Comment Type TR Comment Status X

There are issues with the new definition of P2MP

SuggestedRemedy

Change "connected to a number end stations" to "connected to a number of end stations" Strike statement: "Frames transit the network between the central station and the end stations and do not transit directly from end station to end station." - we do not restrict ONU/CNU to ONU/CNU communication, if one desired to deploy links between them - these are outside of the scope of our definitions.

Proposed Response Status O

Received

"Clause 77", and "64,2,2,1"

Response Status O

Proposed Response

P 29 C/ 01 SC 1.4.331 L 19 # 4321 C/ 30 SC 30.3.2.1.2 P 31 L 16 # 4389 Hajduczenia, Marek **Bright House Networks** Mark, Laubach Broacom Comment Type Ε Comment Status X and and Comment Type Comment Status X Extra "and" in "Clause 64 and Clause 65" Convert to non-breaking spaces in "10 Gb/s" and "1.6 Gb/s". Do same on line 27. SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy As per comment. mark this "and" as strikethroug and replace with underlined "," Proposed Response Proposed Response Response Status O Response Status 0 SC 1.4.331 P 29 L 20 # 4332 C/ 30 SC 30.3.5.1.2 P 31 L 37 C/ 01 # 4334 Anslow. Pete Ciena Anslow. Pete Ciena Comment Status X Comment Type Comment Status X and and Comment Type In "(See IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 64 and Clause 65, Clause 76, Clause 77, Clause 101, and In the editing instruction, "Behaviour Defined As" should be "BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS" to Clause 103)", there are two instances of "and" and "Clause 103" should be underlined. match the text below. Same issue in the editing instruction for 30.3.5.1.3 SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy Show "Clause 64 and Clause 65" as being changed to "Clause 64. Clause 65" Underline "Clause 103" In the editing instruction, change "Behaviour Defined As" to "BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS" Make the same change in the editing instruction for 30.3.5.1.3 Proposed Response Response Status O Proposed Response Response Status O C/ 01 SC 1.4.400 P 29 L 34 # 4333 C/ 30 SC 30.3.5.1.3 P 32 L 10 # 4335 Ciena Anslow. Pete Anslow, Pete Ciena Comment Type Ε Comment Status X Comment Type T Comment Status X OLT/CLT In "See Clause 64, Clause 77, and Clause 103.", the first comma has been added but is not underlined and the two clause references should be forest green. Clause 103 has devices operating as a CLT not as an OLT. Similarly, Clause 103 has devices In "The value of time quantum is defined in 64.2.2.1." the reference to 64.2.2.1 should be operating as a CNU not as an ONU. forest green. SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy Show "... operates as an OLT when ..." changing to "... operates as an OLT or a CLT when ..." Show the first comma in underline font and apply the character tag "External" to "Clause 64". Also, show "... the interface acts as an ONU," changing to "... the interface acts as an ONU or

a CNU."

Proposed Response

Cl 45 C/ 30 SC 30.3.5.1.3 P 32 L 10 # 4322 SC 45.2.1.4.b P 37 L 22 Hajduczenia, Marek **Bright House Networks** Anslow, Pete Ciena Comment Type TR Comment Status X OLT/CLT Comment Type E Comment Status X Changes to 30.3.5.1.3 make no sense - Clause 103 does not define OLT and ONU Spurious " at the end of 45.2.1.4.b (as noted in comment 4301). SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy Enumeration for aMPCPMode should be extended to include CLT and CNU Delete the ' Then behavior description "An interface that can provide the Multipoint MAC Control sublaver Proposed Response Response Status O functions specified in Clause 64 and Clause 77 operates as an OLT when this attribute has the enumeration "OLT". When this attribute has the enumeration "ONU", the interface acts as an ONU." Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.149 P 42 should be augmented to read as follows: / 1 # 4323 An interface that can provide the Multipoint MAC Control sublayer functions specified in Clause Haiduczenia. Marek **Bright House Networks** 64 and Clause 77 operates as an OLT when this attribute has the enumeration "OLT". NW? An interface that can provide the Multipoint MAC Control sublayer functions specified in Clause Comment Type Comment Status X 103 operates as an CLT when this attribute has the enumeration "CLT". "NW = Multi-word" does not exist in Table 45-98s When this attribute has the enumeration "CNU", the interface acts as an CNU. SuggestedRemedy Proposed Response Response Status O Change "NW = Multi-word" to "MW = Multi-word" Proposed Response Response Status O Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.4 P 37 L 3 # 4336 Anslow, Pete Ciena C/ 45 SC 45.2.1.149 P 52 L 1 Comment Type Comment Status X Anslow, Pete Ciena As the P802.3by amendment is very likely to complete before P802.3bn, that amendment will have to show bit 1.4.10 as Reserved. Comment Type Comment Status X NM? A comment has been submidded against P802.3by D3.0 to make this change. "NW = Multi-word" should be "MW = Multi-word" SuggestedRemedy SugaestedRemedy Change the editing instruction to: "Change the reserved row for 1.4.10 in Table 45-6 as Change "NW = Multi-word" to "MW = Multi-word" inserted by IEEE Std 802.3by-201x as follows (unchanged rows not shown):" Proposed Response Response Status O Show the Name entry as changing from "Reserved" Show the Description entry as changing from "Value always 0" Proposed Response Response Status O Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.14aa P 38 L 17 # 4338 Anslow, Pete Ciena Comment Status X Comment Type The editing instruction needs to include more information. SuggestedRemedy Change the editing instruction to: "Insert 45.2.1.14aa and Table 45-17aa before 45.2.1.14a as inserted by IEEE Std 802.3by-201x as follows:"

Proposed Response

C/ 56 SC 56.1 Mark, Laubach	P 61 Broacom	L 30	# 4390	Cl 100 SC 100.3.4.2 Hajduczenia, Marek	P 90 Bright House	L 33 Networks	# 4324
Comment Type E Add non-breaking space	Comment Status X ses to numbers and units for "10"	0 Gb/s" and "1 Gl	o/s" (four places)	Comment Type E Incorrect format of NOT	Comment Status X		
SuggestedRemedy As per comment				SuggestedRemedy It should be "NOTE—" a	and not "NOTE:"		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
CI 56 SC 56.1.2.2 Mark, Laubach	P 63 Broacom	L 30	# [4391	CI 100 SC 100.3.4.2 Mark, Laubach	P 91 Broacom	L 19	# 4343
Comment Type E Convert to non-breaking	Comment Status X ng space in "100 Mb/s"			Comment Type ER In Table 100-3, lower ca	Comment Status X ase "Format"		
SuggestedRemedy As per comment				SuggestedRemedy As per comment.			
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status 0		
CI 100 SC 100.2.1.4 Mark, Laubach	4 P 84 Broacom	L 48	# 4341	C/ 100 SC 100.3.4.5 Mark, Laubach	P 87 Broacom	L 53	# 4348
Comment Type ER "101.3.2.5.7 needs to b	Comment Status X be an xref			Comment Type ER Remove space in "Neq	Comment Status X		
SuggestedRemedy Make it so.				SuggestedRemedy As per comment.			
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
Cl 100 SC 100.3.4.	1 P 90 Broacom	L 10	# 4342	Cl 100 SC 100.3.4.5. Mark, Laubach	.1 P 92 Broacom	L 16	# 4350
	Comment Status X ne minus sign and "9.4 MHz", si	upposed to read	like an equation.	Comment Type E Look for occurences of here and elsewhere as a	Comment Status X "X db" in paragraph text and appropriate.	change the space	to a non-breaking spa
SuggestedRemedy As per comment.				SuggestedRemedy As per comment.			
Proposed Response	Response Status 0			Proposed Response	Response Status O		

Proposed Response

C/ 100 SC 100.3.5.2 P 90 L 27 # 4349 C/ 100 SC 100.3.5.6 P 99 Mark, Laubach Broacom Mark, Laubach Comment Type ER Comment Status X Comment Type E In "Pmax" the "max" may need to be capitalized, italized, and subscripted. Look for other occurences and editor to make consistent within this clause, e.g. line 40 same page. SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy As per comment. As per comment Proposed Response Proposed Response Response Status O SC 100.3.5.2 P 99 C/ 100 SC 100.3.6.2 P 110 C/ 100 L 15 # 4344 Mark, Laubach **Broacom** Hajduczenia, Marek Comment Type Comment Status X Comment Type TR In Equation 100-10, put a mult symbol between "10" and "log₁₀". Do the same for Equation 100-11, Line 48. maximum MAC Client Data field sizes defined SuggestedRemedy requires the support of envelope frames? As per comment SuggestedRemedy Proposed Response Response Status O frame sizes supports by 3.2.7 Similar change on line 34 would be required C/ 100 SC 100.3.5.4.3 P 104 L 2 Similar changes in 100.3.7.2 as well # 4353 Mark, Laubach Broacom Proposed Response Comment Type T Comment Status X Change "10xlog10" to "10xlog₁₀". P 105 C/ 100 SC 100.3.7.1 SuggestedRemedy Mark. Laubach As per comment. Comment Type Proposed Response Response Status 0

L 49 # 4351 Broacom Comment Status X Remove period for this "See Table 100-2." entry for "Modulation format" row. Editor to check for consistency of "see <xref>" entries in tables. Response Status O L 20 # 4325 **Bright House Networks** Comment Status X Per "3.2.7 MAC Client Data field". "Ethernet implementations shall support at least one of three as follows", but it does not guarantee that envelope frame is supported. Is it implied that EPoC Add statement on what types of frames are required by EPoC, or alternatively list all possible Response Status O L 35 # 4354 Broacom Comment Status X In Table 100-14, Use of "10xlog(24)" change to "10xlog₁₀(24)". I checked with the technical author of this material. SuggestedRemedy As per comment.

4345 C/ 100 SC 100.3.7.2 P 113 L 10 C/ 100 SC 100.3.7.3 P 114 L 35 # 4352 Mark, Laubach Broacom Mark, Laubach Broacom Comment Type ER Comment Status X Comment Type Comment Status X т Make "2000-byte" no breaking. Use of "10xlog10" in RxMER subclauses and Page 115, Line 17, Figure 100-4 change to "10xlog₁₀"... SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy As per comment. In RxMER subclauses, change any occurences as per comment. Proposed Response Response Status O Proposed Response Response Status O C/ 100 SC 100.3.7.3 P 98 L 37 # 4356 C/ 100 SC 100.4.4 P 118 L 23 # 4346 Mark, Laubach Broacom Mark, Laubach Broacom Comment Type Comment Status X Comment Type Comment Status X In Equation 100-9, add a multiplication symbol between "10" and "log" Page 99. Line 15, same for 100-10, line 48, same for Equestion 100-11. Paragraph is of wrong type, change to T.text SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy As per comment. As per comment Proposed Response Proposed Response Response Status O Response Status O C/ 100 SC 100.3.7.3 P 106 L 27 # 4355 C/ 100 SC 100.4.4 P 119 L 4 # 4347 Mark, Laubach **Broacom** Mark. Laubach Broacom Comment Status X Comment Type Ε Comment Type Ε Comment Status X In equation 100-19, chage "10log₁₀" to "10xlog₁₀"; i.e. add the Change table to not leave a hanging single row. explicit multiplication sign for consistency. SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy As per comment. As per comment. Proposed Response Response Status O Proposed Response Response Status O C/ 100A SC 100A P 354 L 18 # 4359 Mark. Laubach Broacom Comment Type ER Comment Status X Return the copyright (c) and footnote for the use of DOCSIS that was in Draft 2.1. This disappeared in D2.2. SuggestedRemedy As per comment. Proposed Response Response Status O

P 354 # 4357 C/ 100A SC 100A.2 L 13 Mark, Laubach Broacom Comment Type Е Comment Status X Put a comma after the first "I₀". SuggestedRemedy As per comment. Proposed Response Response Status O C/ 100A SC 100A.2 P 354 L 14 # 4360 Mark, Laubach **Broacom** Comment Type Comment Status X These got dropped from Draft 2.1: Expand "NCTA" to "National Cable & Telecommunications Association". Line 18, expand "UCER" to "uncorrectable codeword error rate" SuggestedRemedy As per comment. Proposed Response Response Status O C/ 100A SC 100A.2 P 354 L 18 # 4340 Ciena Anslow. Pete Comment Type Comment Status X Ε In D2.1, "DOCSIS" had a registered trademark symbol and footnote: "DOCSIS is a registered trademark of CableLabs." This has disappeared in D2.2 SuggestedRemedy Reinstate them. Proposed Response Response Status O

P 356

Broacom

Comment Status X

C/ 101 SC 101.1.4 P 133 L 40 # 4326 Hajduczenia, Marek **Bright House Networks** Comment Type T Comment Status X "PMD_SIGNAL.request()" has no argument SuggestedRemedy Either show it with no argument as "PMD SIGNAL.request" or (preferred approach) show the argument Proposed Response Response Status O SC 101.3.2.1.5 C/ 101 P 141 L 26 # 4361 Mark, Laubach Broacom Comment Type Comment Status X Text extends outside UPDATE COUNTERS box. Resize/position box to fix. SuggestedRemedy As per comment. Proposed Response Response Status O SC 101.3.2.5.7 P 154 C/ 101 L 37 # 4362 Mark. Laubach Broacom Comment Type ER Comment Status X In other places, function pseudo code begin with the word "function" and the font size is a little smaller. Make all function code blocks look consistent. SuggestedRemedy As per comment. Proposed Response Response Status O

lower case "Upstream". line 16 change "an" to "any" SuggestedRemedy

As per comment.

SC 100A.3

Ε

C/ 100A

Mark, Laubach

Comment Type

Proposed Response Status O

L 15

4358

C/ 101 SC 101.3.3.1 P 166 L 16 # 4327 C/ 101 SC 101.4.3.8.3 P 185 L 8 # 4365 Hajduczenia, Marek **Bright House Networks** Mark, Laubach Broacom Comment Type ER Comment Status X Comment Type Ε Comment Status X Different font styles in SEND OUT BLOCK state in Figure 101–17 The supercript "Ai(k)" trespasses in to line above it. See if can fix line spacing or similar to Also, figure 101-17 is visually different from 101-16 for some reason (boxes are thicker, font is prevent the overlap. larger, etc.) - please fix style in Figure 101-17 SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy As per comment. Per comment Proposed Response Response Status O Similar issue with multiple other SDs in the draft - some have thin lines (seems like these are drawn in Framemaker) and some have thick lines (I suspect these are drawn in Visio and imported into Frame) C/ 101 SC 101.4.3.10 P 193 L **53** # 4366 Proposed Response Response Status O Mark, Laubach Broacom Comment Type Comment Status X C/ 101 SC 101.4.3.2 P 173 L 45 # 4363 Consider doing a "keep with next 2", to keep it with next two lines on same page. Mark, Laubach **Broacom** SuggestedRemedy Comment Type Т Comment Status X As per comment. Change "*" characters to multiplication symbols. Change "log" to "log₁₀" in both Proposed Response Response Status O occurences. SuggestedRemedy As per comment. C/ 101 SC 101.4.3.12 P 198 L 13 # 4367 Proposed Response Response Status O Mark. Laubach Broacom Comment Type Comment Status X The "t" of "output" is running into the vertical dashed line. Consider providing a little bit of C/ 101 SC 101.4.3.4.5 P 176 L 28 # 4364 space to avoid overrun. Mark, Laubach Broacom SuggestedRemedy Comment Type Comment Status X Ε As per comment. Make "DS ModTypeSC(1)" non breaking Proposed Response Response Status O SuggestedRemedy As per comment. C/ 101 SC 101.4.3.13 P 200 L 6 # 4368 Proposed Response Response Status O Mark, Laubach Broacom Comment Status X Comment Type In Table 101-12 resize "Item" column a little larger to prevent the "cy" hypenation. SuggestedRemedy As per comment. Proposed Response Response Status O

C/ 101 SC 101.4.4.3		L 11	# 4369	C/ 102 SC 102.1.4.2		L 27	# 4373	
Mark, Laubach	Broacom			Mark, Laubach	Broacom			
Comment Type E Comment Status X sentence missing ending period, add it.				Comment Type E Sentence missing termi	Comment Status X nating period, add it.			
SuggestedRemedy As per comment.				SuggestedRemedy As per comment.				
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status 0			
C/ 101 SC 101.4.4.4		L 49	# 4370	C/ 102 SC 102.1.8	P 249	L 10	# 4374	
Mark, Laubach	Broacom			Mark, Laubach	Broacom			
Comment Type E "show" should be "show"	Comment Status X vn". Consider changing "below	v." to "below:"		Comment Type ER "Clause 45" needs to be	Comment Status X e an xref.			
SuggestedRemedy As per comment.				SuggestedRemedy As per comment.				
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O			
C/ 101 SC 101.5.4	P 231	L 21	# 4371	C/ 102 SC 102.2.1.1		L 11	# 4375	
Mark, Laubach	Broacom			Mark, Laubach	Broacom			
Comment Type E Paragraph indenting loc	Comment Status X bks odd after the first line. Fix	if needed.		Comment Type ER Dashed lines should be	Comment Status X set to "send to back" or wh	nat is need to avoid t	the visual overlap.	
SuggestedRemedy As per comment.				SuggestedRemedy As per comment.				
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O			
C/ 101 SC 101.6.4.1	0 P 238	L 44	# 4372	C/ 102 SC 102.2.7.1	P 263	L 7	# 4376	
Mark, Laubach	Broacom			Mark, Laubach	Broacom			
Comment Type E Comment Status X Do a keep with next for the heading and the following table.				Comment Type E Comment Status X Missing ending period on lines 7, 12, 18, 22, 28. (Note there is a period ending linse 37, 41, 45, and 51.)				
SuggestedRemedy As per comment				SuggestedRemedy				
Proposed Response	Response Status O			As per comment.				
i ioposeu nesponse	nesponse status 😈			Proposed Response	Response Status O			

4377 C/ 102 P 274 C/ 102 SC 102.2.7.4 P 266 L 18 SC 102.4.1.1 L 32 # 4380 Mark, Laubach Broacom Mark, Laubach Broacom Comment Type Ε Comment Status X Comment Type Ε Comment Status X Missing period at end of sentence, add it. Did we get rid of "+=" notation? If so, this one has to go also. SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy As per comment. Fix if needed. Proposed Response Proposed Response Response Status O Response Status 0 C/ 102 SC 102.2.7.5 P 267 L 38 # 4378 C/ 102 SC 102.4.1.4 P 275 L 40 # 4381 Mark, Laubach Broacom Mark. Laubach Broacom Comment Type Ε Comment Status X Comment Type ER Comment Status X "LEN(PhyTxFifo) = 0" needs a little separate from the horizontal line above. Make "32-bit" non-breaking. SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy As per comment. As per comment. Proposed Response Proposed Response Response Status 0 Response Status O C/ 102 SC 102.3.5.5 C/ 102 SC 102.4.1.6 P 278 L 44 P 28272 L 28 # 4379 # 4382 Mark, Laubach Mark, Laubach Broacom Broacom Comment Type Comment Status X Comment Type Comment Status X Т This subclause has not content, remove it. Please a return between "CNU_ID" and "Allocation" to avoid hyphenation. Line 31, subclause 102.3.5.6 has no content, remove it. SuggestedRemedy Line 37, need a space between "in" and "Figure 102-18". As per comment. SuggestedRemedy Proposed Response Response Status O As per comment. Proposed Response Response Status O C/ 102 SC 102.4.1.8 P 279 L 24 # 4383 Mark, Laubach Broacom Comment Type Comment Status X Needs period at end of sentence. SuggestedRemedy As per comment. Proposed Response Response Status O

4385 C/ 102 # 4384 C/ 102 SC 102.4.2.2 P 283 L 9 SC 102.4.9.2 P 281 L 5 Mark, Laubach Broacom Mark, Laubach Broacom Comment Type Ε Comment Status X Comment Type Ε Comment Status X Change from parenthetical to type note. Font is size 9 on lines 4 through 7, reset to size 10. Line 25 and 30, put a period at end of sentence. SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy As per comment. As per comment. Proposed Response Response Status O Proposed Response Response Status O C/ 102 SC 102.4.2.4 P 285 L 42 # 4386 Mark, Laubach Broacom C/ 102 SC 102.5.4.3 P 296 L 9 # 4388 Comment Status X Comment Type Mark, Laubach Broacom Superscripts are running into text of line above. Increase line spacing slightly on this or something else to prevent the overlap. Comment Type ER Comment Status X SuggestedRemedy Remove period from end of sentence for consistency. As per comment. SuggestedRemedy Proposed Response Response Status O As per comment. Proposed Response Response Status O C/ 102 SC 102.4.2.7 P 287 L 33 # 4387 Mark, Laubach Broacom C/ 103 SC 103.2.2.3 P 312 L 11 # 4328 Comment Type ER Comment Status X **Bright House Networks** Hajduczenia, Marek 4 Lines 34 through 38 are font size 9, set to font size 10. Comment Type T Comment Status X SuggestedRemedy Is there any reason for tqSizeC to be marked as Integer? As per comment. SuggestedRemedy Proposed Response Response Status O Change to "unsigned integer" - it is always positive Proposed Response