Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **13**   *L* **42**   # r01-14

Remein, Duane   Futurewei Technologie

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

     Amendment number has been set by Mr. Law

SuggestedRemedy

     Add "Amendment 5-"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **13**   *L* **42**   # r01-1

Anslow, Peter   Ciena Corporation

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

     http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html has:
     Physical Layer (always capped)

SuggestedRemedy

     Change "physical layer" to "Physical Layer"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **FM**   *SC* **FM**   *P* **27**   *L* **16**   # r01-2

Anslow, Peter   Ciena Corporation

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

     Page 27 does not reflect the latest version of the 802.3 boilerplate.

SuggestedRemedy

     Change "Implementors" to "Implementers".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P*   *L*   # r01-7

Anslow, Peter   Ciena Corporation

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

     The order of IEEE 802.3 amendments is to have all annexes after all clauses (as it was in
     D3.0), as shown in the 802.3 FrameMaker template. In D3.1, Annex A and Annex 31A are
     interleaved with the clauses. Why was this change made?

SuggestedRemedy

     Move Annex A and Annex 31A to be after Clause 103

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P*   *L*   # r01-31

Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **G**   *Comment Status* **X**

     You may mark all my D3.0 comments as satisfied as remaining errors are covered by
     comments on D3.1

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P* **31**   *L* **1**   # r01-15

Remein, Duane   Futurewei Technologie

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **X**

     Clauses mis-ordered

SuggestedRemedy

     Change to FM, 1, 30, 45, 56, 67, 76, 100, 101, 102, 103 Annex A, Annex 31A, Annex 100A.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **00**   Page 1 of 5
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   *SC* **0**   5/11/2016 4:43:56 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **1**   *SC* **1.2.7**   *P* **29**   *L* **6**   # r01-3

Anslow, Peter   Ciena Corporation

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

(Page number from CMP version)
unusual editing instruction

SuggestedRemedy

Change to: "Insert 1.2.7 after 1.2.6 "Accuracy and resolution of numerical quantities".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **1**   *SC* **1.3**   *P* **29**   *L* **17**   # r01-4

Anslow, Peter   Ciena Corporation

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

(Page number from CMP version)
In the editing instruction, "reference" should be "references"

SuggestedRemedy

Change "reference" to "references"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **1**   *SC* **1.4.134**   *P* **28**   *L* **41**   # r01-10

Law, David   Hewlett Packard Enter

Comment Type **G**   *Comment Status* **X**

The text '(For 10BROAD36,' should not be shown in underscore as this text was added by
IEEE P802.3by.

SuggestedRemedy

See comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **1**   *SC* **1.4.144a**   *P* **29**   *L* **46**   # r01-5

Anslow, Peter   Ciena Corporation

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

(Page number from CMP version)
In the editing instruction, there is a spurious extra "("

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "Clocked Violation LO (CVL)"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **1**   *SC* **1.4.331**   *P*   *L*   # r01-26

Grow, Robert   RMG Consulting

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

Format problem?

SuggestedRemedy

There does not appear to be a space after subclause number, make style the same as
other definitions.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

Cl **1**   *SC* **1.4.345a**   *P* **30**   *L* **45**   # r01-6

Anslow, Peter   Ciena Corporation

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

(Page number from CMP version)
Now that 1.4.345b has been removed, in the editing instruction, "definitions" should be
"definition"

SuggestedRemedy

Change "definitions" to "definition"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **1**   Page 2 of 5
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   *SC* **1.4.345a**   5/11/2016 4:43:56 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45**　　　　　　*P*　　　　*L*　　　　# r01-30
Grow, Robert　　　　　　　RMG Consulting

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**X**
Verify the remainder of the numbering.

SuggestedRemedy
Per comment

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.1**　　　　　*P* **38**　　*L* **17**　　　# r01-8
Anslow, Peter　　　　　　　Ciena Corporation

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**X**
(Page number from CMP version)
IEEE 802.3bw-2015 made changes to Table 45-3 which show 1.17 as Reserved.

SuggestedRemedy
Change the editing instruction to: "Change the reserved row for 1.17 in Table 45-3 (as inserted by IEEE Std 802.3bw-2015) as follows (unchanged rows not shown):"
in the row for 1.17 add "Reserved" in strikethrough font and underline "EPoC PMA/PMD ability" in the "Register name" column, underline "45.2.1.14aa" and remove the row below.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.1**　　　　　*P* **38**　　*L* **17**　　　# r01-27
Grow, Robert　　　　　　　RMG Consulting

Comment Type　**TR**　　　*Comment Status*　**X**
Incorrect base text for Table 45-3. IEEE Std 802.3bw-2015 has 1.17 listed as a single reserved row because 802.3bw defined 1.18. No need to change reserved rows except 1.17. The new reserved row in this draft also conflicts with definition of 1.19 in P802.3by.

SuggestedRemedy
Change editorial instruction to simply read, Change the 1.17 row of Table 45-3 (as modified by IEEE Std 802.3bw) as shown below. Only show 1.17 row in Table 45-3 changes with Reserved in strikethrough and new register name and subclause underscore.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.1**　　　　　*P* **39**　　*L* **1**　　　# r01-28
Grow, Robert　　　　　　　RMG Consulting

Comment Type　**TR**　　　*Comment Status*　**X**
Incorrect base text for Table 45-3. IEEE Std 802.3bw-2015 has changed the reserved row in 802.3-2015 (what is includede in the current draft) to define registers starting at 1.2100.

SuggestedRemedy
The 32767 should be 2099 in first (strikethrough text) and last (plain text) row of the changes. Add ("as modified by IEEE Std 802.3bw") to the editing instruction to indicate where the correct base text is found.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.1**　　　　　*P* **41**　　*L* **5**　　　# r01-9
Anslow, Peter　　　　　　　Ciena Corporation

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**X**
(Page number from CMP version)
IEEE 802.3by-201x made changes to Table 45-3 which show the appropriate reserved row as "1.1809 through 1.2099"

SuggestedRemedy
Change the editing instruction to: "Change the reserved row for 1.1809 through 1.2099 in Table 45-3 (as inserted by IEEE Std 802.3bw-2015) as follows (unchanged rows not shown):"
in the first row change the strikethrough text to "2099"
in the last row change "1.1959 through 1.32767" to "1.1959 through 1.2099"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.2.7a.5**　　　*P* **66**　　*L* **41**　　　# r01-13
Remein, Duane　　　　　　　Futurewei Technologie

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**X**
extra period at end of line. "shown in Table 45-211f. ."

SuggestedRemedy
strike spare period.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general　　　　*Cl* **45**　　　　Page 3 of 5
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn　　*SC* **45.2.7a.5**　　5/11/2016 4:43:56 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **45**　　　*SC* **45.21.131b6**　　　*P* **61**　　　*L* **49**　　　# r01-29
Grow, Robert　　　　　　　　　　　RMG Consulting

Comment Type　**ER**　　*Comment Status*　**X**

Sections jump from 45.2.1.130z5 for register 1.1948 to 45.2.1.1301b6 for register 1.1949.
Table numbers jump from 45-98az5 to 45-99a01.

SuggestedRemedy

Fix to be consecutive with the reqired convoluted numbering.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **100**　　　*SC* **100.3.1**　　　*P* **88**　　　*L* **21**　　　# r01-11
Remein, Duane　　　　　　　　　　Futurewei Technologie

Comment Type　**E**　　*Comment Status*　**X**

The reference in the following statement should be 101.4.4.4.4.
"The CNU reports supported optional modulations to the CLT via US_ModAbility variable
see 101.4.3.4.5"

SuggestedRemedy

Change to 101.4.4.4.4

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **100**　　　*SC* **100.3.3.1**　　　*P* **91**　　　*L* **23**　　　# r01-16
Laubach, Mark　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom Corporation

Comment Type　**TR**　　*Comment Status*　**X**

Change "product" to "accumulation"

SuggestedRemedy

As per comment

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **100**　　　*SC* **100.3.4.4.3**　　　*P* **105**　　　*L* **49**　　　# r01-17
Laubach, Mark　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom Corporation

Comment Type　**TR**　　*Comment Status*　**X**

The second xref in first sentence should point to Table 100-8

SuggestedRemedy

As per comment

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **100**　　　*SC* **100.3.4.4.3**　　　*P* **105**　　　*L* **51**　　　# r01-18
Laubach, Mark　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom Corporation

Comment Type　**TR**　　*Comment Status*　**X**

The first xref second/last sentence should point to Table 100-9

SuggestedRemedy

As per comment

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **100**　　　*SC* **100.3.4.6**　　　*P* **109**　　　*L* **42**　　　# r01-19
Laubach, Mark　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom Corporation

Comment Type　**TR**　　*Comment Status*　**X**

In Table 100-11, change g.e. sign to "to" to match subclause text.

SuggestedRemedy

As per comment

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**O**

Cl **100**　　　*SC* **100.3.4.6**　　　*P* **109**　　　*L* **53**　　　# r01-20
Laubach, Mark　　　　　　　　　　Broadcom Corporation

Comment Type　**TR**　　*Comment Status*　**X**

Insert "up to" before "65"

SuggestedRemedy

As per comment

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **100**
SC **100.3.4.6**

Page 4 of 5
5/11/2016 4:43:56 PM

Cl **100** *SC* **100.3.5.3.1** *P* **113** *L* **33** # r01-23
Laubach, Mark Broadcom Corporation

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **X**
Change "uses" to "can use". CLT needs to ensure that it meets a desired confidence interval provided by the manufacture. For example, the statement as written would permit the CLT to use only one upstream probe symbol, which would not create confidence.

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **100** *SC* **100.3.6.1** *P* **114** *L* **38** # r01-24
Laubach, Mark Broadcom Corporation

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **X**
Change ": <newline> For" to "and for" remove newline. Add a colon to the end of the sentence. Adjust row/line aligments.

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **100** *SC* **100.4.1** *P* **118** *L* **48** # r01-21
Laubach, Mark Broadcom Corporation

Comment Type **GR** *Comment Status* **X**
"MD1" should be "MDI"

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **101** *SC* **101.3.2.5.4** *P* **151** *L* **13** # r01-12
Remein, Duane Futurewei Technologie

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **X**
Step 1) Add burst start marker and Step 9) Add burst end marker do not happen in FEC encoding. They are part of PMA.

SuggestedRemedy
In Step 7) change "codeword and move to step 9" to "codeword, exit."
In Step 8) change "step 9 else go to step 2." to "exit else go to step 1."
Remove these steps and renumber.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **101** *SC* **101.3.2.5.4** *P* **151** *L* **13** # r01-25
Laubach, Mark Broadcom Corporation

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **X**
Bin is not defined. Looping may not be correct as drafted, i.e., should continue looping until not enough for a long codeword, move to next tests, etc. The text here should not be confused with the state machine / pseudo code used in 101.3.2.5.7, and should remain in its prior descriptive format.

SuggestedRemedy
Revert to previous text, lines 13 through 39.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **101** *SC* **101.3.2.5.4** *P* **151** *L* **13** # r01-22
Laubach, Mark Broadcom Corporation

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **X**
Layer violation. Insertion of the start/stop burst markers is performed by the symbol mapper in the PMA.

SuggestedRemedy
Remove steps 1) and 12)

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **101**
SC **101.3.2.5.4**
Page 5 of 5
5/11/2016 4:43:56 PM