---

*Cl* **00**  *SC* **0**    *P*    *L*    # 96
Skinner, John      Sifos Technologies, In

*Comment Type* **E**  *Comment Status* **D**    *Editorial*

There are a number of sentence constructs that use the "Oxford" comma style, example:

"...MARK_EV1, MARK_EV2, MARK_EV3, or MARK_EV4..."

and constructs that do not use this form, where the last comma is omitted, example:

"...MARK_EV1, MARK_EV2, MARK_EV3, MARK_EV4 and MARK_EV_LAST...".

*SuggestedRemedy*

The document should use a consistent comma style for listing multiple associated entities. (this commenter's preference is the Oxford style)

*Proposed Response*  *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

A man after my own heart…

EZ

---

*Cl* **1**  *SC* **1.4**    *P* **20**  *L* **30**  # 190
Dove, Daniel      Dove Networking Solut

*Comment Type* **ER**  *Comment Status* **D**    *Editorial*

Link to 33.2.3 not valid

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add a hyperlink

*Proposed Response*  *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **25**  *SC* **25.1**    *P* **1**  *L* **1**  # 6
Zimmerman, George      CME Consulting, Inc.

*Comment Type* **ER**  *Comment Status* **D**    *Editorial*

Page numbers jumped back to 1. (this is going to make hell of your comment processing) Note that there is another jump back to 1 after PDF page 200 (annex 33D start)

*SuggestedRemedy*

check page numbering parameters in frame file for clause 25, and annex 33D and make them continue from previous document in book.

*Proposed Response*  *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **25**  *SC* **25.4.7**    *P* **25**  *L* **43**  # 193
Dove, Daniel      Dove Networking Solut

*Comment Type* **TR**  *Comment Status* **D**    *PMD*

Text says Type 2, but earlier reference (pg 24, line 1) states "Type 2 or greater".

*SuggestedRemedy*

add the words "or greater" behind the words "Type 2" twice in this paragraph.

*Proposed Response*  *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **30**  *SC* **30.9**    *P* **6**  *L* **5**  # 113
Yseboodt, Lennart      Philips

*Comment Type* **ER**  *Comment Status* **D**    *Management*

We need to visit Clause 30.9 when Clause 33 is stable to implement all additions.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add editors note to 30.9: "TODO: visit this section and make consistent with Clause 33 & 79".

*Proposed Response*  *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

TYPE: TR/technical required  ER/editorial required  GR/general required  T/technical  E/editorial  G/general  *Cl* **30**  Page 1 of 19
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched  A/accepted  R/rejected  RESPONSE STATUS: O/open  W/written  C/closed  Z/withdrawn  *SC* **30.9**  10/8/2015  9:35:00 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

_Cl_ **30**     _SC_ **30.9.1.1.4**     _P_ **7**     _L_ **1**     # 7

Zimmerman, George                CME Consulting, Inc.

_Comment Type_ **TR**     _Comment Status_ **D**     _Mangement_

PSE Power Pairs needs updating to 4 pair and new contents of 33.5.1.1.4

_SuggestedRemedy_

Add enumerated values:
both "PSE Pinouts on both Alternative A and B"
Add sentence on line 12, prior to "If a Clause 22...":
"The enumeration "both" indicates that PSE Pinout uses both Alternatives A and B for detection and power."

_Proposed Response_     _Response Status_ **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

_Cl_ **30**     _SC_ **30.9.1.1.4**     _P_ **7**     _L_ **1**     # 164

Yseboodt, Lennart                Philips

_Comment Type_ **T**     _Comment Status_ **D**

original text: "An ENUMERATED VALUE that has one of the following entries: ... Pinout A and B listed"
    4 pair pinout missing

_SuggestedRemedy_

Amend to list:
    both        PSE Pinout Alternative A and Alternative B

_Proposed Response_     _Response Status_ **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

OBE by comment 7.

EZ

---

_Cl_ **30**     _SC_ **30.12.2.1.11**     _P_ **13**     _L_ **36**     # 11

Zimmerman, George                CME Consulting, Inc.

_Comment Type_ **E**     _Comment Status_ **D**     _Editorial_

30.12.2.1.11 through 30.12.2.1.13,
30.12.2.1.19 through 30.12.2.1.20,
30.12.2.1.22 through 30.12.2.1.33,
30.12.3.1.1 through 30.12.3.1.4,
30.2.3.1.11 through 30.2.3.1.13, and
 30.2.3.1.19 through 30.2.3.1.27 are not related to PoE and are not needed in the draft.

_SuggestedRemedy_

Delete P13 L36 through P14 L14
Delete P16 L28 through P17 L1
Delete P17 L20 through P20 L4
Delete P20 L13 through P21 L7
Delete P22 L17 through P22 L49, and
Delete P25 L1 through P26 L44

_Proposed Response_     _Response Status_ **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

_Cl_ **30**     _SC_ **30.12.2.1.18a**     _P_ **15**     _L_ **44**     # 167

Yseboodt, Lennart                Philips

_Comment Type_ **T**     _Comment Status_ **D**     _Editorial_

original text: "The PD measured voltage value is encoded according to Equation (79-x), where x is the decimal value of aLldpXdot3LocPDMeasuredVoltageValue."
        This calculation is actually in Table 79-6c.

_SuggestedRemedy_

"The PD measured voltage value is encoded according to Table 79-6c, the decimal value of bits is aLldpXdot3LocPDMeasuredVoltageValue."

_Proposed Response_     _Response Status_ **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

TYPE: TR/technical required  ER/editorial required  GR/general required  T/technical  E/editorial  G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched  A/accepted  R/rejected     RESPONSE STATUS: O/open  W/written  C/closed  Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

_Cl_ **30**
_SC_ **30.12.2.1.18a**

Page 2 of 19
10/8/2015  9:35:00 PM

*Cl* **30**　　*SC* **30.12.2.1.18b**　　　*P* **16**　　*L* **2**　　　# 168
Yseboodt, Lennart　　　　　　　Philips

*Comment Type* **T**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*Editorial*

original text: "The PD measured current value is encoded according to Equation (79-x), where x is the decimal value of aLldpXdot3LocPDMeasuredCurrentValue"
　　This calculation is actually in Table 79-6c.

*SuggestedRemedy*

"The PD measured current value is encoded according to Table 79-6c, the decimal value of bits is aLldpXdot3LocPDMeasuredCurrentValue"

*Proposed Response*　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **30**　　*SC* **30.12.2.1.18c**　　　*P* **16**　　*L* **14**　　　# 169
Yseboodt, Lennart　　　　　　　Philips

*Comment Type* **T**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*Editorial*

original text: "The PSE measured voltage value is encoded according to Equation (79-x), where x is the decimal value of aLldpXdot3LocPSEMeasuredVoltageValue"
　　This calculation is actually in Table 79-6d.

*SuggestedRemedy*

"The PSE measured voltage value is encoded according to Table 79-6d, the decimal value of bits is aLldpXdot3LocPSEMeasuredVoltageValue"

*Proposed Response*　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **30**　　*SC* **30.12.2.1.18d**　　　*P* **16**　　*L* **26**　　　# 170
Yseboodt, Lennart　　　　　　　Philips

*Comment Type* **T**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*Editorial*

original text: "The PSE measured voltage value is encoded according to Equation (79-x), where x is the decimal value of aLldpXdot3LocPSEMeasuredCurrentValue"
　　This calculation is actually in Table 79-6d.

*SuggestedRemedy*

"The PSE measured voltage value is encoded according to Table 79-6d, the decimal value of bits is aLldpXdot3LocPSEMeasuredCurrentValue"

*Proposed Response*　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **30**　　*SC* **30.12.3**　　　*P* **12**　　*L* **28**　　　# 12
Zimmerman, George　　　　　　　CME Consulting, Inc.

*Comment Type* **ER**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*Editorial*

Need clause 30.12 header, otherwise Table of contents runs straight from 30.10.2 to 30.12.2.1.5 without heirarchy

*SuggestedRemedy*

Insert on P34 L28:
30.12 Layer Management for Link Layer Discovery Protocol (LLDP)
30.12.2 LLDP Local System Group managed object class
30.12.2.1 LLDP Local System Group attributes

*Proposed Response*　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**　　*SC* **0**　　　*P* **0**　　*L*　　　# 111
Yseboodt, Lennart　　　　　　　Philips

*Comment Type* **ER**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　*Editorial*

The capitalization of Class should only have been done when referring to a power Class.
eg. Class 5, Class 7.
Something like a 'class event' should not be capitalized.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Editor to go through document and check capitalization of Class and class.

*Proposed Response*　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

TYPE: TR/technical required  ER/editorial required  GR/general required  T/technical  E/editorial  G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched  A/accepted  R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open  W/written  C/closed  Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

*Cl* **33**
*SC* **0**

Page 3 of 19
10/8/2015 9:35:00 PM

*Cl* **33**　　*SC* **33**　　　　　　*P* **0**　　　*L* **0**　　　# 112
Yseboodt, Lennart　　　　　　　　Philips

*Comment Type* **ER**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*Editorial*
　Page numbers in the PDF reset on clause boundary.

*SuggestedRemedy*
　Editor to make sure page numbering keeps going such that PDF page nr matches with document page nr.

*Proposed Response*　　*Response Status* **W**
　PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

　OBE by comment 6

　EZ

---

*Cl* **33**　　*SC* **33.1.4**　　　　　*P* **30**　　*L* **22**　　# 15
Zimmerman, George　　　　　　CME Consulting, Inc.

*Comment Type* **ER**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*Editorial*
　Table 33-1, header: R_ch (the underscore denotes subscript)
　This parameter appears everywhere else as R_Ch , with the C capitalized.  The nomenclature for this is very close to R_Chan, which is the channel max, so it's confusing enough already.

*SuggestedRemedy*
　Make all references to R_ch R_Ch, consistent.
　(change Table 33-1 header to R_Ch)

*Proposed Response*　　*Response Status* **W**
　PROPOSED ACCEPT.

　EZ

---

*Cl* **33**　　*SC* **33.1.4**　　　　　*P* **30**　　*L* **24**　　# 154
Yseboodt, Lennart　　　　　　　　Philips

*Comment Type* **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*Editorial*
　DC loop resistance values are not centered in Y-axis of cell.

*SuggestedRemedy*
　Center values.

*Proposed Response*　　*Response Status* **W**
　PROPOSED ACCEPT.

　EZ

---

*Cl* **33**　　*SC* **33.1.4**　　　　　*P* **30**　　*L* **42**　　# 228
Dwelley, David　　　　　　　　　Linear Technology

*Comment Type* **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*Editorial*
　End of Note 2: "(fix reference when finalized)" is sure to be forgotten

*SuggestedRemedy*
　Fix reference to 33.2.7.4.1. Remove paranthetical note.

*Proposed Response*　　*Response Status* **W**
　PROPOSED ACCEPT.

　EZ

---

*Cl* **33**　　*SC* **33.2.0a**　　　　*P* **33**　　*L* **1**　　# 264
Stover, David　　　　　　　　　Linear Technology

*Comment Type* **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*Editorial*
　Link to 33.3.8 not valid

*SuggestedRemedy*
　Add hyperlink

*Proposed Response*　　*Response Status* **W**
　PROPOSED ACCEPT.

　EZ

---

*Cl* **33**　　*SC* **33.2.3**　　　　　*P* **41**　　*L* **36**　　# 196
Dove, Daniel　　　　　　　　　Dove Networking Solut

*Comment Type* **TR**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*Types*
　I don't think this statement is explicit enough

*SuggestedRemedy*
　replace "use" with "use only the"

*Proposed Response*　　*Response Status* **W**
　PROPOSED ACCEPT.

　EZ

---

TYPE: TR/technical required  ER/editorial required  GR/general required  T/technical  E/editorial  G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched  A/accepted  R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open  W/written  C/closed  Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

*Cl* **33**
*SC* **33.2.3**

Page 4 of 19
10/8/2015 9:35:00 PM

*Cl* **33**     *SC* **33.2.4**          *P* **42**     *L* **1**        # 231
Dwelley, David                    Linear Technology

*Comment Type* **E**       *Comment Status* **D**                    *Editorial*
   Editor's note on page 65 line 1 covers this

*SuggestedRemedy*
   Strike this editor's note.

*Proposed Response*       *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

   EZ

---

*Cl* **33**     *SC* **33.2.4.1**        *P* **42**     *L* **7**        # 58
Darshan, Yair                     Microsemi

*Comment Type* **TR**      *Comment Status* **D**                    *PSE SD*
   The text "Detection, classification, and power turn-on timing shall meet the specifications in
   Table 33–4, Table 33–10, and Table 33–11."
   Need to be updated to include more tables with timing information.

*SuggestedRemedy*
   Change ""Detection, classification, and power turn-on timing shall meet the specifications
   in Table 33–4, Table 33–10, and Table 33–11."
   To:
   "Connection Check, Detection, classification, and power turn-on timing shall meet the
   specifications in Table 33-3a, Table 33–4, Table 33–10, Table 33-10a and Table 33–11."

*Proposed Response*       *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

   EZ

---

*Cl* **33**     *SC* **33.2.4.1**        *P* **42**     *L* **23**       # 76
Johnson, Peter                    Sifos Technologies

*Comment Type* **T**       *Comment Status* **D**                    *Editorial*
   "If a PSE perorms detection using Alternative B (see 33.2.5.5...)" is a wierd phrase.
   Suggest replacing this.

*SuggestedRemedy*
   Eliminate text up to and including parenthesis and just say:

   "See 33.2.5.5 for more information on Alternative B detection backoff requirements."

*Proposed Response*       *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

   EZ

---

*Cl* **33**     *SC* **33.2.4.4**        *P* **45**     *L* **23**       # 116
Yseboodt, Lennart                 Philips

*Comment Type* **T**       *Comment Status* **D**                    *PSE SD*
   "1: PSE performs Single-Event Physical Layer classification."

   Since we now consider 1 class_ev + 1 mark_ev = Multiple-event, this is no longer correct
   for Type 3 and 4.

*SuggestedRemedy*
   "1: A Type 1 PSE performs Single-Event Physical Layer Classification.
   A Type 2 PSE performs Single-Event Physical Layer Classification or Multiple-Event
   Physical Layer classification with a maximum of 1 Class event.
   A Type 3 or Type 4 PSE performs Multiple-Event Physical Layer classification with a
   maximum of 1 Class event."

*Proposed Response*       *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

   EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required  ER/editorial required  GR/general required  T/technical  E/editorial  G/general          *Cl* **33**          Page 5 of 19
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched  A/accepted  R/rejected     RESPONSE STATUS: O/open  W/written  C/closed  Z/withdrawn          *SC* **33.2.4.4**     10/8/2015 9:35:00 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

_Cl_ **33**    _SC_ **33.2.4.4**    _P_ **45**    _L_ **50**    # 61

Darshan, Yair        Microsemi

_Comment Type_  **TR**    _Comment Status_  **D**        _PSE SD_

The definition of Iport-2P_other is incorrect.
See details in updated Figure 33-14/a/b/c in page 5 of darshan_04_1015.pdf.

_SuggestedRemedy_

Change "Iport-2P-other
 Output current on the other pairset, defined as  IPort-2P-other = IPort - IPort-2P."
To:
Iport-2P-other
 Output current on the other pairset, defined as IPort-2P-other =    IPort - IPort-2P. Iport-2P and Iport-2P-other are pairs of the same polarity.

_Proposed Response_    _Response Status_  **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

_Cl_ **33**    _SC_ **33.2.4.4**    _P_ **46**    _L_ **15**    # 117

Yseboodt, Lennart        Philips

_Comment Type_  **T**    _Comment Status_  **D**        _PSE SD_

"The PSE monitors either the DC or AC Maintain Power Signature (MPS, see 33.2.9.1)."
AC MPS does not exist anymore in Type 3 and 4

_SuggestedRemedy_

"Type 1 and Type 2 PSEs monitor either the DC or AC Maintain Power Signature (MPS).
Type 3 and Type 4 PSEs monitor the DC Maintain Power Signature (MPS, see 33.2.9.1)."

_Proposed Response_    _Response Status_  **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

_Cl_ **33**    _SC_ **33.2.4.4**    _P_ **48**    _L_ **39**    # 172

Yseboodt, Lennart        Philips

_Comment Type_  **TR**    _Comment Status_  **D**        _PSE SD_

"pse_skips_multiclass:
The PSE can choose to bypass a portion of the classification state flow. A variable that is set in an implementation-dependent manner."

Only applies to Type 2 PSEs that support DLL.

_SuggestedRemedy_

"pse_skips_multiclass:
A Type 2 PSE can choose to bypass a portion of the classification state flow. A variable that is set in an implementation-dependent manner."

_Proposed Response_    _Response Status_  **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

_Cl_ **33**    _SC_ **33.2.4.6**    _P_ **51**    _L_ **40**    # 66

Darshan, Yair        Microsemi

_Comment Type_  **ER**    _Comment Status_  **D**        _PSE SD_

The mr_pd_class_detected is variable or function?
It looks like variable and not belongs to the functions section.
Is it part of the functio do_classification?
In addition, there are missing values for class 5-8 or it is shown in other place?

_SuggestedRemedy_

Clarify if mr_pd_class_detected is part of do_classification. If YES than move mr_pd_class_detected to be alligned with the other function outputs. If NO than use the following remedy:
1. Move mr_pd_class_detected to section 33.2.4.4
Clarify where class 5-8 is used in mr_pd_class_detected or follow the suggested remedy:
2. add values for class 5-8.

_Proposed Response_    _Response Status_  **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

It is part of the do_classification function.

Editor to move mr_pd_class_detected to the proper indentation so that it aligns with the other variables under the do_classification function.

EZ

---

TYPE: TR/technical required  ER/editorial required  GR/general required  T/technical  E/editorial  G/general        _Cl_ **33**        Page 6 of 19
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched  A/accepted  R/rejected    RESPONSE STATUS: O/open  W/written  C/closed  Z/withdrawn    _SC_ **33.2.4.6**        10/8/2015 9:35:00 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

---

*Cl* **33**      *SC* **33.2.4.6**      *P* **53**      *L* **32**      # 24
Darshan, Yair                           Microsemi

*Comment Type* **TR**      *Comment Status* **D**                    *PSE SD*

There are missing parameter in the list of the following text:
"When a PSE powers a PD of lower Type (TypePD) than its own
native type (TypePSE), the PSE shall meet the PI electrical requirements of the PD Type
(TypePD), except for ICon, ILIM-2P, IInrush, IInrush-2P, TLIM-2P, and PType (see Table
33-11), for which the PSE shall select to meet the requirements of any Type such that,
TypePD <= applied Type <= TypePSE."
The missing parameters is: Icon-2P_unb,

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change text to:
"When a PSE powers a PD of lower Type (TypePD) than its own
native type (TypePSE), the PSE shall meet the PI electrical requirements of the PD Type
(TypePD), except for ICon, Icon-2P_unb, ILIM-2P, IInrush, IInrush-2P, TLIM-2P, and
PType (see Table 33-11), for which the PSE shall select to meet the requirements of any
Type such that, TypePD <= applied Type <= TypePSE."

*Proposed Response*      *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

This adds Icon-2p-unb.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**      *SC* **33.2.4.7**      *P* **55**      *L* **1**      # 67
Darshan, Yair                           Microsemi

*Comment Type* **TR**      *Comment Status* **D**

Figure 33-9 is Type 1 and 2 state diagram.
We agree that for Type 3 and 4 we will generate new state machine and we leave Type 1
and 2 state machine as it is in IEEE802.3-2012 version.

*SuggestedRemedy*

To verify with Dan Dove if it was changed.
If Yes, to restore to the IEEE802.3-2012 version we will not have to spend time to review it.

*Proposed Response*      *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

We reverted to the original Figure 33-9.

No changes result from this comment.

eZ

---

*Cl* **33**      *SC* **33.2.4.7**      *P* **56**      *L* **7**      # 146
Yseboodt, Lennart                       Philips

*Comment Type* **ER**      *Comment Status* **D**                    *PSE SD*

State "1-EVENT_CLASS" was renamed to "Single-Event_CLASS", probably by accident in
the bulk rename of 1-Event to Single-Event.
Undesired in state names.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Revert to "1-EVENT_CLASS".

*Proposed Response*      *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**      *SC* **33.2.4.7**      *P* **65**      *L* **3**      # 155
Yseboodt, Lennart                       Philips

*Comment Type* **E**      *Comment Status* **D**                    *Editorial*

Editors note on the state diagram.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Append:
"State diagram for Type 3 and 4 does not address dual-signature. Preferably this goes into
a separate diagram to keep complexity manageable."

*Proposed Response*      *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**      *SC* **33.2.5**      *P* **87**      *L* **37**      # 248
Schindler, Fred                         Seen Simply

*Comment Type* **ER**      *Comment Status* **D**                    *Editorial*

Clause reference 33.2.7.1 is not a hyperlink.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Use a hyperlink.

*Proposed Response*      *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

TYPE: TR/technical required  ER/editorial required  GR/general required  T/technical  E/editorial  G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched  A/accepted  R/rejected     RESPONSE STATUS: O/open  W/written  C/closed  Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

*Cl* **33**
*SC* **33.2.5**

Page 7 of 19
10/8/2015 9:35:00 PM

*Cl* **33**      *SC* **33.2.5.0a**      *P* **66**      *L* **9**      # 156
Yseboodt, Lennart      Philips

*Comment Type* **E**      *Comment Status* **D**      *Editorial*

"While the exact method of the connection check is left to the implementer, the PSE shall..."

Implementation is always decoupled from the specification. No need to call this out specifically here.

*SuggestedRemedy*

"During connection check, the PSE shall..."

*Proposed Response*      *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**      *SC* **33.2.5.0a**      *P* **66**      *L* **26**      # 157
Yseboodt, Lennart      Philips

*Comment Type* **E**      *Comment Status* **D**      *Editorial*

Table 33-3a, Items 1 and 2, Max value is 0.40
Convention seems to be to use 3 digits after the dot.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Replace 0.40 by 0.400 (twice).

*Proposed Response*      *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**      *SC* **33.2.5.0a**      *P* **66**      *L* **35**      # 268
Stover, David      Linear Technology

*Comment Type* **E**      *Comment Status* **D**      *Editorial*

Paragraph is indented

*SuggestedRemedy*

Remove indentation

*Proposed Response*      *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**      *SC* **33.2.6**      *P* **70**      *L* **48**      # 93
Skinner, John      Sifos Technologies, In

*Comment Type* **E**      *Comment Status* **D**      *Editorial*

Description of classification missing clarifying language.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Replace:

"...the PD responds with a current representing a limited number of power classifications."

with:

"...the PD responds to each class event with a current representing one of a limited number of power classifications."

*Proposed Response*      *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**      *SC* **33.2.6**      *P* **71**      *L* **14**      # 158
Yseboodt, Lennart      Philips

*Comment Type* **E**      *Comment Status* **D**      *Editorial*

The Pclass formula 33-3 and the parameter description have a Autoclass paragraph in between.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Reconnect Formula and parameter description.

*Proposed Response*      *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

TYPE: TR/technical required  ER/editorial required  GR/general required  T/technical  E/editorial  G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched  A/accepted  R/rejected     RESPONSE STATUS: O/open  W/written  C/closed  Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

*Cl* **33**
*SC* **33.2.6**

Page 8 of 19
10/8/2015 9:35:00 PM

---

*Cl* **33**    *SC* **33.2.6**    *P* **71**    *L* **20**    # 94

Skinner, John    Sifos Technologies, In

*Comment Type* **E**    *Comment Status* **D**    *Editorial*

Paragraph discussing Autoclass based PSE minimum power setting refers to non-existent information from Table 33-10a.

*SuggestedRemedy*

The end of the last sentence on lines 19 and 20:

"...may choose to use a lower Autoclass margin than those listed in Table 33-10a."

should be changed to refer to the correct location of the margin information:

"...may choose to use a lower Autoclass margin than those listed in Equation (33-3a)."

*Proposed Response*    *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**    *SC* **33.2.6**    *P* **72**    *L* **7**    # 79

Johnson, Peter    Sifos Technologies

*Comment Type* **E**    *Comment Status* **D**    *Editorial*

"NOTE 1 ..." pertains specifically to Pclass in header of column 3 of Table 33-7.  This should be communincated.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Follow "(Pclass)" in column 3 heading with either footnote "1" or "see NOTE 1".

*Proposed Response*    *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**    *SC* **33.2.6.1**    *P* **74**    *L* **37**    # 82

Johnson, Peter    Sifos Technologies

*Comment Type* **E**    *Comment Status* **D**    *Editorial*

Missing space between "5" and "Class".

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change to "... maximum of 5 Class and 5 mark events."

*Proposed Response*    *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

OBE by 159

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**    *SC* **33.2.6.2**    *P* **74**    *L* **33**    # 81

Johnson, Peter    Sifos Technologies

*Comment Type* **E**    *Comment Status* **D**    *Editorial*

Paragraph ends with   "- as defined in the state diagram in Figure 33-9".

Ultimately, reference could be to different or additional state diagram(s).

*SuggestedRemedy*

Editor Note:  "Update Figure reference when state diagrams are completed."

*Proposed Response*    *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

TYPE: TR/technical required  ER/editorial required  GR/general required  T/technical  E/editorial  G/general    *Cl* **33**    Page 9 of 19

COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched  A/accepted  R/rejected    RESPONSE STATUS: O/open  W/written  C/closed  Z/withdrawn    *SC* **33.2.6.2**    10/8/2015 9:35:00 PM

SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

*Cl* **33**　　*SC* **33.2.6.2**　　　　*P* **74**　　　*L* **37**　　　# 159
Yseboodt, Lennart　　　　　　　　Philips

*Comment Type* **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　*Editorial*

"Type 2 PSEs shall provide a maximum of 2 Class and 2 mark events. Type 3 PSEs shall provide a maximum of 4 Class and 4 mark events. Type 4 PSEs shall provide a maximum of 5Class and 5 mark events."

Capitalization gone wrong.

*SuggestedRemedy*

"Type 2 PSEs shall provide a maximum of 2 class and 2 mark events. Type 3 PSEs shall provide a maximum of 4 class and 4 mark events. Type 4 PSEs shall provide a maximum of 5 class and 5 mark events."

*Proposed Response*　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**　　*SC* **33.2.6.2**　　　　*P* **74**　　　*L* **44**　　　# 160
Yseboodt, Lennart　　　　　　　　Philips

*Comment Type* **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　*Editorial*

Iclass is smaller letters than normal subscript.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change the subscript to a larger font

*Proposed Response*　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**　　*SC* **33.2.6.2**　　　　*P* **75**　　　*L* **16**　　　# 161
Yseboodt, Lennart　　　　　　　　Philips

*Comment Type* **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　*Editorial*

"... as defined in Table 33-10 The timing specification... "
Missing dot after 33-10

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add dot (period)

*Proposed Response*　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**　　*SC* **33.2.6.2**　　　　*P* **76**　　　*L* **4**　　　# 147
Yseboodt, Lennart　　　　　　　　Philips

*Comment Type* **ER**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*Editorial*

"A Type 3 or Type 4 PSE connected to a single-signature PD shall..."
"A Type 3 or Type 4 PSE connected to a dual-signature PD shall..."

*SuggestedRemedy*

dual-signature should be Dual-signature.
Ditto for Single-signature.

*Proposed Response*　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**　　*SC* **33.2.6.2**　　　　*P* **76**　　　*L* **10**　　　# 16
Zimmerman, George　　　　　　　　CME Consulting, Inc.

*Comment Type* **ER**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*Editorial*

"See Annex 33E for an overview of Multiple Event Physical Layer classification. See Annex 33D for an overview of Multiple-Event physical layer classification."

33D is the table of classification outcomes on type 3 and type 4 PSEs, and 33E is Rload_max and Rload_min

*SuggestedRemedy*

Delete "See Annex 33E... classification."

*Proposed Response*　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

TYPE: TR/technical required  ER/editorial required  GR/general required  T/technical  E/editorial  G/general　　　　*Cl* **33**　　　Page 10 of 19
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched  A/accepted  R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open  W/written  C/closed  Z/withdrawn　　*SC* **33.2.6.2**　　10/8/2015  9:35:00 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

*Cl* **33**    *SC* **33.2.6.2**    *P* **77**    *L* **1**    # 148
Yseboodt, Lennart                    Philips

*Comment Type*  **ER**    *Comment Status*  **D**    *Editorial*
Table 33-10 still uses "1-Event" terminology.

*SuggestedRemedy*
Change to Single-event in:
- Header
- Line 1,2 and 11.

*Proposed Response*    *Response Status*  **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**    *SC* **33.2.6.3**    *P* **78**    *L* **7**    # 68
Johnson, Peter                    Sifos Technologies

*Comment Type*  **E**    *Comment Status*  **D**    *Editorial*
"Please see" seems like unusual language for a standard.

Engineers usually aren't that polite.

*SuggestedRemedy*
Replace "Please see" with just "See".

*Proposed Response*    *Response Status*  **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**    *SC* **33.2.6.3**    *P* **78**    *L* **44**    # 120
Yseboodt, Lennart                    Philips

*Comment Type*  **T**    *Comment Status*  **D**    *Autoclass*
Autoclass window Tauto_PSE2 is not the correct.

*SuggestedRemedy*
Change to: "Autoclass window between Tauto_PSE1 and Tauto_PSE2"

*Proposed Response*    *Response Status*  **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**    *SC* **33.2.7**    *P* **78**    *L* **51**    # 162
Yseboodt, Lennart                    Philips

*Comment Type*  **E**    *Comment Status*  **D**    *Editorial*
"Table 33-11 limits show values that support worst-case operating limits."

*SuggestedRemedy*
"Table 33-11 limit values support operation under worst-case operating conditions."

*Proposed Response*    *Response Status*  **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**    *SC* **33.2.7**    *P* **79**    *L* **1**    # 234
Dwelley, David                    Linear Technology

*Comment Type*  **E**    *Comment Status*  **D**    *Editorial*
I think we got them all

*SuggestedRemedy*
Strike this editor's note.

*Proposed Response*    *Response Status*  **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**    *SC* **33.2.7**    *P* **79**    *L* **14**    # 17
Zimmerman, George                    CME Consulting, Inc.

*Comment Type*  **E**    *Comment Status*  **D**    *Editorial*
33.2.7.1 is forest green (an external reference) on item 1 - elsewhere it is a cross reference.  Needs to be a live cross reference.

Same goes for 33.2.9 twice, on lines 49 & 52 of page 81 (items 18 & 19 in the table)

*SuggestedRemedy*
Change references in items 1, 18 & 19 to cross references, and make same color as normal text (remove external tag)

*Proposed Response*    *Response Status*  **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

TYPE: TR/technical required  ER/editorial required  GR/general required  T/technical  E/editorial  G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched  A/accepted  R/rejected     RESPONSE STATUS: O/open  W/written  C/closed  Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

*Cl* **33**
*SC* **33.2.7**

Page 11 of 19
10/8/2015 9:35:00 PM

*Cl* **33**    *SC* **33.2.7**    *P* **82**    *L* **33**    # 40
Darshan, Yair    Microsemi

*Comment Type* **T**    *Comment Status* **D**    *Editorial*
Editor Note #1 can be removed.

*SuggestedRemedy*
Remove "1. PSE Vdiff is still under investigation. It may be changed."

*Proposed Response*    *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**    *SC* **33.2.7**    *P* **101**    *L* **14**    # 249
Schindler, Fred    Seen Simply

*Comment Type* **ER**    *Comment Status* **D**    *Editorial*
Clause reference 33.2.7.1 is not a hyperlink.

*SuggestedRemedy*
Use a valid hyperlink.

*Proposed Response*    *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**    *SC* **33.2.7.2**    *P* **83**    *L* **24**    # 18
Zimmerman, George    CME Consulting, Inc.

*Comment Type* **ER**    *Comment Status* **D**    *Editorial*
"VPort_PSE-
2P" split across lines

*SuggestedRemedy*
supress hyphenation breaking this up so it stays on one line.

*Proposed Response*    *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**    *SC* **33.2.7.7**    *P* **87**    *L* **38**    # 126
Yseboodt, Lennart    Philips

*Comment Type* **E**    *Comment Status* **D**    *Editorial*
"Figure 33-14--POWER_ON state, per pairset operating current templates for PSEs that operate in 2-pair mode, Type 3 and Type 4 dual-signature PSEs"

*SuggestedRemedy*
dual-signature PSEs => Dual-signature PDs.

*Proposed Response*    *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**    *SC* **33.2.7.7**    *P* **89**    *L* **36**    # 129
Yseboodt, Lennart    Philips

*Comment Type* **E**    *Comment Status* **D**    *Editorial*
"is the maximum power PSE Type power" is strange sentence

*SuggestedRemedy*
"is the maximum power for a given PSE Type"

*Proposed Response*    *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**    *SC* **33.2.7.11**    *P* **91**    *L* **22**    # 252
Schindler, Fred    Seen Simply

*Comment Type* **TR**    *Comment Status* **D**    *Unbalance*
The text,
"Type 2, Type 3 and Type 4 Endpoint PSEs shall meet the requirements of 25.4.5 in the presence of (Iunb / 2)."

Should be restricted to 100BASE-T operation.

*SuggestedRemedy*
Replace the sentence with,
"A 100BASE-TX transmitter in a
Type 2, Type 3, and Type 4 Endpoint PSEs shall meet the requirements of 25.4.5 for in the presence of (Iunb / 2)."

*Proposed Response*    *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

TYPE: TR/technical required  ER/editorial required  GR/general required  T/technical  E/editorial  G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched  A/accepted  R/rejected     RESPONSE STATUS: O/open  W/written  C/closed  Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

*Cl* **33**    Page 12 of 19
*SC* **33.2.7.11**    10/8/2015 9:35:00 PM

---

*Cl* **33**  *SC* **33.3.2**  *P* **96**  *L* **42**  *#* 179
Yseboodt, Lennart  Philips

*Comment Type* **TR**  *Comment Status* **D**  *PD Class*

"Type 3/SS PDs operating up to a maximum power draw corresponding to Class 3 or less implement a minimum of Single-Event Physical Layer Classification and advertise a Single-Event Class signature of 1,2, or 3."

Only Type 1 PDs perform Single-Event classification.
Replace Single-Event classification => Multiple-Event classification

*SuggestedRemedy*

"Type 3/SS PDs operating up to a maximum power draw corresponding to Class 3 or less implement a minimum of Multiple-Event Physical Layer Classification and advertise a Class signature of 1,2, or 3."

*Proposed Response*  *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**  *SC* **33.3.3.5**  *P* **102**  *L* **33**  *#* 130
Yseboodt, Lennart  Philips

*Comment Type* **E**  *Comment Status* **D**  *Editorial*

"Editor's Note: PD state diagram needs to be updated for Autoclass."

*SuggestedRemedy*

"Editor's Note: PD state diagram needs to be updated for Autoclass and detecting long class event."

*Proposed Response*  *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**  *SC* **33.3.5.1**  *P* **106**  *L* **30**  *#* 188
Yseboodt, Lennart  Philips

*Comment Type* **TR**  *Comment Status* **D**  *PD Class*

The Type 3 specific Class 0 signature current was removed from Table 33-16. While Class 0 no longer exists for Type 3, the Class signature '0' still does.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Restore missing Type 3 specific Class 0 signature from D1.2.

*Proposed Response*  *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Why was it removed?

---

*Cl* **33**  *SC* **33.3.5.2**  *P* **106**  *L* **47**  *#* 99
Skinner, John  Sifos Technologies, In

*Comment Type* **E**  *Comment Status* **D**  *Editorial*

The state names "DO_CLASS_EV1", "DO_CLASS_EV2", "DO_CLASS_EV3", "DO_CLASS_EV4", "DO_CLASS_EV5", and "DO_CLASS_EV6" used in the text do not match the state names used in the state diagram shown in Figure 33-16. The state names in Figure 33-16 use the form "DO_CLASS_EVENTn".

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change the names of the states listed in lines 47 and 48 to match the names used in the state diagram shown in Figure 33-16.

*Proposed Response*  *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

TYPE: TR/technical required  ER/editorial required  GR/general required  T/technical  E/editorial  G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched  A/accepted  R/rejected    RESPONSE STATUS: O/open  W/written  C/closed  Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

*Cl* **33**
*SC* **33.3.5.2**

Page 13 of 19
10/8/2015  9:35:00 PM

---

*Cl* **33**     *SC* **33.3.5.2**     *P* **107**     *L* **40**     # 131

Yseboodt, Lennart        Philips

*Comment Type* **E**     *Comment Status* **D**        *Editorial*

" a Type 2, Type 3 and Type 4 PD's pse_power_level state variable is set to '1.' "

Period not at end of sentence.

*SuggestedRemedy*

" a Type 2, Type 3 and Type 4 PD's pse_power_level state variable is set to '1'. "

*Proposed Response*     *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**     *SC* **33.3.5.3**     *P* **108**     *L* **47**     # 71

Johnson, Peter        Sifos Technologies

*Comment Type* **E**     *Comment Status* **D**        *Editorial*

Another "Please see"....

Engineers aren't that polite.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Replace "Please see.." with "See...".

*Proposed Response*     *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

I am that polite (and I wrote it).

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**     *SC* **33.3.5.3**     *P* **108**     *L* **47**     # 132

Yseboodt, Lennart        Philips

*Comment Type* **E**     *Comment Status* **D**        *Editorial*

original text: "Please see Annex 33B for more information on Autoclass."
Wrong annex referenced

*SuggestedRemedy*

Please see Annex 33C for more information on Autoclass.

*Proposed Response*     *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**     *SC* **33.3.5.3**     *P* **109**     *L* **19**     # 181

Yseboodt, Lennart        Philips

*Comment Type* **TR**     *Comment Status* **D**        *Autoclass*

Table 33-17a, Item 3, Autoclass power draw end time needs to be updated to reflect changes in PSE section made to D1.3.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change T_auto_pd2 from 3.28 to 3.65 seconds.

*Proposed Response*     *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**     *SC* **33.3.7**     *P* **110**     *L* **27**     # 183

Yseboodt, Lennart        Philips

*Comment Type* **TR**     *Comment Status* **D**        *PD Power*

Table 33-18, Item 1, PD input voltage.
The values for Class 5/DS and Class 8 are different. They must be the same.
Recalculating this results in 41.1826V.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change Item 1, row Class 5/DS to 41.2V.

*Proposed Response*     *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**     *SC* **33.3.7.5**     *P* **116**     *L* **9**     # 133

Yseboodt, Lennart        Philips

*Comment Type* **E**     *Comment Status* **D**        *PD Power*

"is the voltage at PSE"

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change to: "is the voltage at the PSE PI"

*Proposed Response*     *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

TYPE: TR/technical required  ER/editorial required  GR/general required  T/technical  E/editorial  G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched  A/accepted  R/rejected     RESPONSE STATUS: O/open  W/written  C/closed  Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

*Cl* **33**
*SC* **33.3.7.5**

Page 14 of 19
10/8/2015 9:35:00 PM

*Cl* **33**    *SC* **33.3.7.6**         *P* **116**      *L* **38**         # 134
Yseboodt, Lennart                        Philips

*Comment Type*  **E**         *Comment Status*  **D**                        *Editorial*
   PClass_PD_max needs to be subscripted.

*SuggestedRemedy*
   Change to subscript

*Proposed Response*        *Response Status*  **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

   EZ

---

*Cl* **33**    *SC* **33.3.7.6**         *P* **116**      *L* **39**         # 135
Yseboodt, Lennart                        Philips

*Comment Type*  **E**         *Comment Status*  **D**                        *Editorial*
   "A Type 4 PD with peak power draw that does not exceed PClass PD max and has an
   input capacitance of 360mF or less requires no special considrations with regards to
   transients at the PD PI."

            Typo.

*SuggestedRemedy*
   "A Type 4 PD with peak power draw that does not exceed PClass PD max and has an
   input capacitance of 360mF or less requires no special _considerations_ with regards to
   transients at the PD PI."

*Proposed Response*        *Response Status*  **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

   EZ

---

*Cl* **33**    *SC* **33.3.7.6**         *P* **116**      *L* **48**         # 124
Yseboodt, Lennart                        Philips

*Comment Type*  **T**         *Comment Status*  **D**                        *Editorial*
   "A Type 2 ,Type 3, and Type 4 PD that demand less than Class 5 power levels shall ..."

   There are no Type 4 PDs at Class 5 or lower.
   s/demand/demands.

*SuggestedRemedy*
   "A Type 2 or Type 3 PD that demands less than Class 5 power levels shall …"

*Proposed Response*        *Response Status*  **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

   EZ

---

*Cl* **33**    *SC* **33.3.7.6**         *P* **117**      *L* **17**         # 125
Yseboodt, Lennart                        Philips

*Comment Type*  **T**         *Comment Status*  **D**                        *Editorial*
   "A Type 3 or Type 4 PD that demands Class 5 power levels shall meet both of the
   following:"

   There are no Type 4 PDs at Class 5.

*SuggestedRemedy*
   "A Type 3 that demands Class 5 power levels shall meet both of the following:"

*Proposed Response*        *Response Status*  **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

   EZ

---

*Cl* **33**    *SC* **33.3.7.6**         *P* **117**      *L* **24**         # 136
Yseboodt, Lennart                        Philips

*Comment Type*  **E**         *Comment Status*  **D**                        *Editorial*
   original text: "....The input votage source drives both PD Modes ..."
            typo "votage"

*SuggestedRemedy*
   "... The input voltage source drives both PD Modes ..."

*Proposed Response*        *Response Status*  **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

   EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required  ER/editorial required  GR/general required  T/technical  E/editorial  G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched  A/accepted  R/rejected     RESPONSE STATUS: O/open  W/written  C/closed  Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

*Cl*  **33**
*SC*  **33.3.7.6**

Page 15 of 19
10/8/2015  9:35:00 PM

---

*Cl* **33**     *SC* **33.3.7.6**          *P* **117**     *L* **36**          # 137
Yseboodt, Lennart                    Philips

*Comment Type*  **E**      *Comment Status*  **D**                    *Editorial*
original text: "....The input votage source drives both PD Modes ..."
again typo "votage"

*SuggestedRemedy*
....The input voltage source drives both PD Modes ...

*Proposed Response*      *Response Status*  **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**     *SC* **33.3.7.8**          *P* **118**     *L* **8**          # 138
Yseboodt, Lennart                    Philips

*Comment Type*  **E**      *Comment Status*  **D**                    *Editorial*
"... shall be valid within T_Class as specified in Table 33-18 ..."

Parameter name is T_class (no capital)

*SuggestedRemedy*
"... shall be valid within T_class as specified in Table 33-18 ..."

*Proposed Response*      *Response Status*  **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**     *SC* **33.3.7.9**          *P* **118**     *L* **44**          # 139
Yseboodt, Lennart                    Philips

*Comment Type*  **E**      *Comment Status*  **D**                    *Editorial*
Table 33-18a, item 3, add. info says "See Annex 33A,5"
Should be period.

*SuggestedRemedy*
"See Annex 33A.5"

*Proposed Response*      *Response Status*  **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**     *SC* **33.3.7.10.1**          *P* **119**     *L* **17**          # 41
Darshan, Yair                    Microsemi

*Comment Type*  **T**      *Comment Status*  **D**                    *Editorial*
The title of figure 33-18a is incorrect.

*SuggestedRemedy*
Change from "Figure 33–18a—PI fault tolerance test circuit"
To: "Figure 33–18a—PD PI pair-to-pair test circuit"

*Proposed Response*      *Response Status*  **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**     *SC* **33.3.8**          *P* **119**     *L* **31**          # 140
Yseboodt, Lennart                    Philips

*Comment Type*  **E**      *Comment Status*  **D**                    *Editorial*
"or a PD which does not detect a long first Class event,"

In this case Class does not need to be capitalized.
Occurs on line 31, 34 and 35.

*SuggestedRemedy*
"or a PD which does not detect a long first class event,"

*Proposed Response*      *Response Status*  **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**     *SC* **33.3.8**          *P* **119**     *L* **34**          # 141
Yseboodt, Lennart                    Philips

*Comment Type*  **E**      *Comment Status*  **D**                    *Editorial*
"Types 3 and 4 PDs which detect..."

*SuggestedRemedy*
"Type 3 and Type 4 PDs that detect..."

*Proposed Response*      *Response Status*  **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

TYPE: TR/technical required  ER/editorial required  GR/general required  T/technical  E/editorial  G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched  A/accepted  R/rejected     RESPONSE STATUS: O/open  W/written  C/closed  Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

*Cl* **33**
*SC* **33.3.8**

Page 16 of 19
10/8/2015  9:35:00 PM

*Cl* **33**     *SC* **33.3.8**     *P* **119**     *L* **46**     # 142
Yseboodt, Lennart                    Philips

*Comment Type* **E**     *Comment Status* **D**     *Editorial*
original text: "See Annex TBD for PD design guidelines for MPS behavior."
  Annex TBD referenced.

*SuggestedRemedy*
Generate it as an empty structure and reference correctly.

*Proposed Response*     *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editor to assign next available Annex, create the annex and fill it with:

"Editor's Note:  This Annex to be filled with PD design guidelines for MPS."

EZ

*Cl* **33**     *SC* **33.3.8**     *P* **121**     *L* **36**     # 143
Yseboodt, Lennart                    Philips

*Comment Type* **E**     *Comment Status* **D**     *Editorial*
Table 33-19a, lowermost/rightmost cell contains "by "short_mps = TRUE (T_LCF)"
Some garbage crept in.

*SuggestedRemedy*
Replace by "short_mps = TRUE"

*Proposed Response*     *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

*Cl* **33**     *SC* **33.4.3**     *P* **124**     *L* **19**     # 144
Yseboodt, Lennart                    Philips

*Comment Type* **E**     *Comment Status* **D**     *Editorial*
"for a 10GBASE-T PHY" seems to be misplaced somehow.

*SuggestedRemedy*
Not clear where it belongs.

*Proposed Response*     *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editor to figure out what was the goal here.

EZ

*Cl* **33**     *SC* **33.4.9**     *P* **129**     *L* **1**     # 27
Darshan, Yair                    Microsemi

*Comment Type* **E**     *Comment Status* **D**     *Editorial*
Type 4 was adressed.
We can remove the editor note.

*SuggestedRemedy*
Remove the Editor Note.

*Proposed Response*     *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

*Cl* **33**     *SC* **33.4.9**     *P* **129**     *L* **1**     # 242
Dwelley, David                    Linear Technology

*Comment Type* **E**     *Comment Status* **D**     *Editorial*
Section 33.1.4.1 is updated

*SuggestedRemedy*
Strike this editor's note.

*Proposed Response*     *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

OBE by 27

EZ

*Cl* **33**     *SC* **33.5.1.2.2**     *P* **139**     *L* **38**     # 225
Dove, Daniel                    Dove Networking Solut

*Comment Type* **ER**     *Comment Status* **D**     *Editorial*
Typo

*SuggestedRemedy*
Replace "pss_dll_enabled" with "pse_dll_enabled"

*Proposed Response*     *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required  ER/editorial required  GR/general required  T/technical  E/editorial  G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched  A/accepted  R/rejected     RESPONSE STATUS: O/open  W/written  C/closed  Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line
*Cl* **33**
*SC* **33.5.1.2.2**
Page 17 of 19
10/8/2015 9:35:00 PM

*Cl* **33**　　　*SC* **33.6.3.3**　　　　　*P* **145**　　　*L* **10**　　　# 270

Stover, David　　　　　　　　　　Linear Technology

*Comment Type* **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*Management*

pse_power_type has since been renamed to pse_power_level in Figure 33-16 and supporting text

*SuggestedRemedy*

Rename pse_power_type to pse_power_level

*Proposed Response*　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**　　　*SC* **33.6.3.5**　　　　　*P* **148**　　　*L* **9**　　　# 271

Stover, David　　　　　　　　　　Linear Technology

*Comment Type* **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*Management*

pse_power_type has since been renamed to pse_power_level in Figure 33-16 and supporting text

*SuggestedRemedy*

Rename pse_power_type to pse_power_level

*Proposed Response*　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**　　　*SC* **33.8.3.3**　　　　　*P* **161**　　　*L* **5**　　　# 272

Stover, David　　　　　　　　　　Linear Technology

*Comment Type* **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*Management*

pse_power_type has since been renamed to pse_power_level in Figure 33-16 and supporting text

*SuggestedRemedy*

Rename pse_power_type to pse_power_level

*Proposed Response*　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33**　　　*SC* **33.8.3.3**　　　　　*P* **161**　　　*L* **36**　　　# 273

Stover, David　　　　　　　　　　Linear Technology

*Comment Type* **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*Management*

pse_power_type has since been renamed to pse_power_level in Figure 33-16 and supporting text

*SuggestedRemedy*

Rename pse_power_type to pse_power_level

*Proposed Response*　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33A**　　　*SC* **33A**　　　　　*P* **171**　　　*L* **1**　　　# 2

Zimmerman, George　　　　　　　　CME Consulting, Inc.

*Comment Type* **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*Editorial*

All annexes should be at the end of the book. I understand that they are easier to digest for task force review where they currently are, therefore, at this time I suggest an editorial note reminding the editor to move them before WG ballot.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add editorial note immediately prior to Annex 33A:
"Editorial note (to be removed prior to Working Group ballot) - All annexes are to be at the end of the draft.  Prior to Working Group ballot, editor should move Clause 79 before Annex 33A in the frame book."

*Proposed Response*　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **33D**　　　*SC* **33D.1**　　　　　*P* **4**　　　*L* **1**　　　# 153

Yseboodt, Lennart　　　　　　　　Philips

*Comment Type* **ER**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*Annex*

Table 33D-2 on dual signature classification has a CLASS_EV5 column. There is no 5th event for DS PDs.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Remove CLASS_EV5 column.

*Proposed Response*　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

TYPE: TR/technical required  ER/editorial required  GR/general required  T/technical  E/editorial  G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched  A/accepted  R/rejected    RESPONSE STATUS: O/open  W/written  C/closed  Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

*Cl* **33D**　　Page 18 of 19
*SC* **33D.1**　　10/8/2015  9:35:00 PM

---

*Cl* **79**      *SC* **79.3.2.6b**      *P* **13**      *L* **48**      # 253

Schindler, Fred                    Seen Simply

*Comment Type*  **ER**      *Comment Status*  **D**                    *Editorial*

Correct text, "PD 4PID".

*SuggestedRemedy*

Replace this text with, "PD 4P-ID".

*Proposed Response*      *Response Status*  **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

*Cl* **79**      *SC* **79.3.2.6d**      *P* **15**      *L* **22**      # 145

Yseboodt, Lennart                  Philips

*Comment Type*  **E**      *Comment Status*  **D**                    *Editorial*

original text: "Table 79-6c  PD measurements"
         Table caption wrong.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Table 79-6d  PSE measurements

*Proposed Response*      *Response Status*  **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

---

TYPE: TR/technical required  ER/editorial required  GR/general required  T/technical  E/editorial  G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched  A/accepted  R/rejected     RESPONSE STATUS: O/open  W/written  C/closed  Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

*Cl* **79**
*SC* **79.3.2.6d**

Page 19 of 19
10/8/2015  9:35:00 PM