C/ 01 SC 1.4 Zimmerman, George	P 16 CME Consultir	L 13 ng	# 14	C/ 33 SC 3.1.4 P 20 L 19 # 5 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting
Comment Type TR Definition of pair-set is	Comment Status D missing.		Definitions	Comment Type ER Comment Status D Definitions Term "per 2-pair" should be "per pair-set" as defined elsewhere, in note 1 D D D
SuggestedRemedy Insert definition of pair-	set agreed in task force			SuggestedRemedy Replace "2-pair" with "pair-set" in note 1
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT	Response Status W			Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT.
… "pair-set" and⊺its del listed in 33.2.3.	inition as referring to either of	the two valid 4	wireconnections as	EZ
EZ				C/ 33 SC 33.1.4 P 20 L 26 # 24 Rimboim, Pavlick Microsemi
2/ 33 SC 33.1 Limboim, Pavlick	P 17 Microsemi	L 11	# 22	Comment Type TR Comment Status D Channel "All four twisted pairs, connected from PSE PI to PD PI are required for Type 3 Channel Channel
Comment Type E missing "," after 25	Comment Status D		Text Improvements	operation." this ststaement is not true, for instance, you can have type 3 2P only, type 3 that uses the
"and the PHYs defined devices to draw"	in Clause 25 Clause 40 and 0	Clause 55. The	se entities allow	new MPS but uses only 30W 2P, with all the charecteristics meeting the 2P and type 3 requirements.
SuggestedRemedy and the PHYs defined i	in Clause 25, Clause 40 and 0	Clause 55. The	se entities allow	SuggestedRemedy Type 3 system can use two twisted pair or 4 twisted pair
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT	Response Status W			Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
EZ				This text needs to be changed, but it should be stated that operation above class 4 power levels requires 4 twisted pairs. See comment #132 for suggested remedy.
C/ 33 SC 1.1 Schindler, Fred	P 17 Seen Simply	L 52	# 44	EZ
Comment Type TR Type 4 is missing from	Comment Status D c) Compatability.		Type 4	
SuggestedRemedy See related comment f	or page 20 for a potential solu	ition. i.e. reuse	the suggested text.	
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT	Response Status W IN PRINCIPLE.			
See comment # 92 for	suggested remedy.			
EZ				
	ed ER/editorial required GR/g			

COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Page, Line

CI 33 SC 1.4 P 20 L 26 # 55 Schindler, Fred Seen Simply Seen Simply Seen Simply Seen Simply	C/ 33 SC 33.1.4.1 P 20 L 46 # 6 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting 6
Comment Type TR Comment Status D Channel Explanitory text missing on +lcable and -lcable. SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy replace " operation." with " operationtwo pair-sets each having one carrying (+lcable) and one carrying (-lcable), from the perspective of the PI. Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.	Comment Type ER Comment Status D Channel TIA TR42.7 is updating TSB-184 to TSB-184A. Reference is or will be obsolete. (likely something similar has to happen for ISO) SuggestedRemedy Update reference to TSB-184A in anticipation or, add editors note to remind about updating. Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. V V V V
Suggested text is not clear. Suggested Fix: replace " operation." with " operationtwo pair-sets each having one twisted pair carrying (+Icable) and one twisted pair carrying (-Icable), from the perspective of the PI. EZ	EZ Cl 33 SC 33.1.4.3 P 21 L 24 # 7 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting Comment Type ER Comment Status D Text Improvement NOTE is more properly an "Editors Note" - the text is not suitable for the final standard.
C/ 33 SC 33.1.4.1 P 20 L 35 # 15 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting	SuggestedRemedy Make "NOTE" "Editor's note" (to be removed prior to publication).
Comment Type TR Comment Status D Channel Title change makes section generic, yet the text doesn't apply to types 1 & 4 Channel Channel	Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
SuggestedRemedy Change section title to read "Type 2 and Type 3 Cabling requirements" Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.	See Comment # 64 for suggested remedy. EZ
Type 4 needs to be added to this section.	
Change title to read "Type 2, Type 3, and Type 4 Cabling requirements".	
EZ	

Pa **21** Li **24**

33 SC 33.1.4.3 P 21 L 24 arshan, Yair Microsemi	# 64	<i>CI</i> 33 Darshan, Ya	SC 33.2.2 ir	P 22 Micros		L 19	# 81	
omment Type ER Comment Status D The following text is not accurate: "NOTE - The pair-to-pair resistance unbalance values are prelin used for"	Unbalance	Comment Ty In 33.2.2 SuggestedRe	2 Midspan PS	Comment Status E types, the text for 100		e included.		10G
We need the channel pair to pair resistance unbalance. The channel is the cabling and connectors per TIA definition fo the P2P resistance unbalance from the face of the first equipment equipment or equivalent term but it cannot be cable+cordage of	ent to the face of the end	10GBAS A Midspa					ASE-TX,	
uggestedRemedy		Proposed Re	esponse	Response Status	W			
Change to:		PROPO	SED ACCEPT	IN PRINCIPLE.				
NOTE - The channel pair-to-pair resistance unbalance values a numbers used for characterizing cabling while awaiting input fro (developing the second edition of ISO/IEC TR 29125) and TIA of TIA TSB-184). These groups have works in progress	om ISO/IEC SC25	See com EZ	ment #17 for	suggested remedy.				
that are expected to include channel pair-to-pair resistance unb	alance specifications	C/ 33	SC 33.2.2	P 22		L 9	# 17	
suitable for reference.		Zimmerman,	George	CME C	Consulting			
roposed Response Response Status W		Comment Ty	vpe TR	Comment Status	D			10G
working numbers used for characterizing cabling while awaiting (developing the second edition of ISO/IEC TR 29125) and TIA of TIA TSB-184). These groups have works in progress that are expected to include channel pair-to-pair resistance unb suitable for reference.	TR42 (developing a revision	looks jus We have	st like a 1000B	BASE-T midspan, whi ASE-T midspan. -pair powering (Type 3				
		SuggestedR	emedy					
EZ 7 33 SC 33.1.4.2 P 21 L 5 welley, David Linear Technology	# 95	PSE des "10GBA	scription: SE-T Midspan	"several variations", in PSE: esults in a link that can		Ū		·
omment Type E Comment Status D	Text Improvements	T and 10	GBASE-T op	eration (see Figure 33-	4)."			
Long list of Types is awkward.	Text improvements	Modify ti overview		3-4 to read "1000BASE	=-1 or 10GI	BASE-1 Midspa	an PSE locatio	on
uggestedRemedy		Then ad	d the following	Sentence:"Additionall	v. 1000BAS	SE-T and 10GE	BASE-T Midso	ban
"Operation for all Types requires". This text may move to an i	nformative annex but the	PSEs" m	hay be capable	e of 4-pair power (see	Figure 33-5	5).		
remedy should still work.		See con	tribution for fig	jure 33-5 showing 4-pa	air PSE sim	ilar to Figure 33	3-4	
remedy should still work. roposed Response Response Status W						0	0 11	
-		Proposed Re	esponse	Response Status	w	5		

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general Pa **22** 1/14/2015 8:17:09 AM COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn Li 9 SORT ORDER: Page, Line

C/ 33 SC 33.2.2 Feldman, Shahar	P 24 Microsemi	L 46	# 58		<i>Cl</i> 33 Darshan, Y	SC 33.2.	4.1	P 28 Microsemi	L 21	# 83
Comment Type TR	Comment Status D E-T Endpoint PSE location C	Overview" Missir	ng 10GBASE-T	10G	Comment 7	Type TR	dbo a	Comment Status D Igorithm is not required for 4	P systems.	4-Pair Powe
SuggestedRemedy	\SE-T" add "/10GBASE-T" Response Status W				А Туре	e following t 3 or Type 4	PSE	er line 25: that is delivering power over ackoff algorithm.	Altenative A	and Alternative B pairs
PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ	Nesponse Status W				Proposed F PROPO	'		Response Status W		
C/ 33 SC 33.2.2 Darshan, Yair	P 26 Microsemi	L 53	# 82		Sugges	sted fix:				
Comment Type TR Missing drawing for:	Comment Status D			10G		e 3 or Type d to meet b		that is delivering power ove algorithm."	r Altenative A	and Alternative B is not
- 10/BASE-T/100BASE	-TX Alternative A and Alterna	tive B Midspan	PSE		C/ 33	SC 33.2.	4.4	P 31	L 29	# 9
- 1000BASE-T/10GBas	eT Alternative A and Alterna	tive B Midspan	PSE		Zimmermar	n, George		CME Consultir	g	
- 1000BASE-T/10GBas	-TX Alternative A and Alterna eT Alternative A and Alterna	tive B Midspan			and mo Suggestedi Insert a	L_capable in ore descripti <i>Remedy</i> after See 33	teracts on. .6, "foi	Comment Status D s with allowable variations in r a description of Data Link L	ayer function	ality and Table 33-3 for
-	_D0.2_Midspan drawings" file					•		of this variable with PSE Ty	/pe and class_	_num_events."
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ	Response Status W				Proposed F PROP(Response DSED ACC		Response Status W		
					EZ					

Pa **31** Li **29**

C/ 33 SC 33.2.4.4 Zimmerman, George	P34 L2 CME Consulting	28 # 1	C/ 33 SC 33.2.4.7 P 38 L 1 # 104 Dwelley, David Linear Technology Linear Technology <td< th=""></td<>				
Comment Type E	Comment Status D	PSE State Diagram	Comment Type E Comment Status D PSE State Diagram				
tinrush_timer, per table	33-11 is the timer to monitor the "pe ther tinrush, because it is mentione	r pair-set" inrush event.	Typo in exit logic from state CLASS_EV1: should be pse_skips_multiclass per page 32 line 3 SuggestedRemedy				
SuggestedRemedy			change "pse skips multievent" to "pse skips multiclass" (or change page 32 line 3)				
add "per pair-set" before	e "inrush event".		Proposed Response Response Status W				
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT I	Response Status W N PRINCIPLE.		PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ				
Change definition to "A t pair-set".	imer used to monitor the duration o	f the inrush event on a single	C/ 33 SC 2.6 P 43 L 32 # 40 Schindler, Fred Seen Simply				
EZ			Comment Type TR Comment Status D PSE Detection				
C/ 33 SC 33.2.4.5 Dwelley, David	P 34 L: Linear Technology	34 # 100	Most requirements are specified on a pair-set bases. This text covers both a pair-set and two pair-sets in parallel. The text is not clear.				
SuggestedRemedy	Comment Status D y to all Mark events except the last of used to limit mark event times for all		Replace " and RChan = RCh max or RChan = RCh max/2 for two-pair, four-pair systems respectively and" with " and RChan = RCh max when powering using two-pairs, or RChan = RCh max/2 when powering using four-pair systems"				
Multiple Event classifica	tion"	, and the second s	Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT.				
	page 48: row 6 Parameter: "Mark ev r: "Last Mark event timing"	vent timing (except last Mark	EZ				
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT.	Response Status W		C/ 33 SC 33.2.6 P 43 L 33 # 2 Zimmerman, George CME Consulting				
EZ			Comment Type E Comment Status D PSE Detection				
/ 33 SC 2.4.5	P34 L8	3 # 38	comma in place of "or" (precedent language is linked by an or				
chindler, Fred	Seen Simply		SuggestedRemedy				
Comment Type TR The name TLCF TIMEF	Comment Status D R is not correct in some locations. C	PSE State Diagram	change "for two-pair, four-pair systems respectively" to read, "for two-pair or four-pair systems respectively".				
selected.			Proposed Response Response Status W				
SuggestedRemedy Scan for TCLF_TIMER a	and replace with TLCF_TIMER. ex.	see line 13.	PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.				
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ	Response Status W		See comment #40 for suggested remedy. EZ				
•	ER/editorial required GR/general patched A/accepted R/rejected	•					

<i>Cl</i> 33 <i>SC</i> 33.2.6 Lukacs, Miklos	P 44 Silicon Labs	L 15	# 32	C/ 33 SC 33.2.6 Lukacs, Miklos	P 45 Silicon Labs	L 34	# 33
Comment Type E Comment S This comment address Table 33-7.	tatus D		PSE Classification	Comment Type E C The new classes also shoul	<i>comment Status</i> D d be mentioned		PSE Classification
The number is the brackets at Classes SuggestedRemedy	s 5,6 and 7 sho	ould be describe	d	SuggestedRemedy change the text: "Valid classification results a	are Classes 0, 1, 2, 3, an	d 4, as"	
Proposed Response Response Si PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE We can remove the class signatures i		that was added	I to the working	to "Valid classification results : Proposed Response Re PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ	are Classes from 0 to 7, a esponse Status W	as"	
document, but is no longer needed. Suggested Fix:			J. J	C/ 33 SC 33.2.6.2	P 46 Silicon Labs	L 20	# 31
Remove brackets and numbers inside EZ	of them.			Comment Type E C The tile is about 2-event cla	comment Status D ssification		Text Improvements
Cl 33 SC 33.2.6 Balasubramanian, Koussalya Comment Type T Comment S Table 33-8 - The note below the table levels" - It will be more clear to cal SuggestedRemedy Suggest note to be changed to "A Typ Proposed Response Response Si PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE	says "A Type 3 Il out the powe be 3 PSE that is tatus W	3 PSE that is lin r level than as	sociate it with a Type.	SuggestedRemedy change the text: "PSE 2-Event Physical Laye to: "PSE Multiple-Event Physic Proposed Response Re PROPOSED ACCEPT IN P See comment #30 for sugge EZ	al Layer classification" esponse Status W RINCIPLE.		
See comment #108 for suggested rem				CI 33 SC 33.2.6.2 Rimboim, Pavlick Comment Type ER C "33.2.6.2 PSE 2-Event Phys title is misleading, it is discu	5	L 20	# <u>30</u> Text Improvements
				SuggestedRemedy "33.2.6.2 PSE Multiple-Even	0		
				Proposed Response Re PROPOSED ACCEPT.	esponse Status W		

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/generalPa 46Page 6 of 10COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejectedRESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawnLi 201/14/2015 8:17:09 AMSORT ORDER: Page, Line

C/ 33 SC 33.2	6.2	P 46	L 24	# 109	C/ 33	SC 33	3.2.6.2	P 46	L 38	# 110
Dwelley, David		Linear Techno	ology		Dwelley, D	avid		Linear Techr	nology	
Comment Type T	Comme	ent Status D		PSE Classification	Comment	Туре І	E	Comment Status D		Text Improvements
1-EVENT_CLASS	and CLASS_E	V1_LCF are missi	ng from the list	of states	This se	ection is u	unneces	sarily verbose		
SuggestedRemedy					Suggestea	lRemedy				
		SS_EV1_LCF to the EV1) for 1-EVENT		and add a descriptive	"When	n a PSE is		/1-4 and CLASS_EV3-5 se state MARK_EV1, MARK_E		8, or MARK_EV4, the
Proposed Response	Respon	se Status W			PSE s		in the c	tate CLASS_EV3, CLASS	EV/4 or CLASS	EV/5 the DSE shall "
PROPOSED ACC	EPT IN PRINC	IPLE.						ne as Tcle2, CLASS_EV2		
Add CLASS_EV1_ Multiple-Event sec EZ		of states. 1-EVEN	IT_CLASS does	not belong in the	Proposed PROP EZ	Response OSED AC		Response Status W		
C/ 33 SC 33.2	6.2	P 46	L 34	# 27	C/ 33	SC 33	3.2.6.2	P 46	L 53	# 28
Rimboim, Pavlick		Microsemi			Rimboim, I	Pavlick		Microsemi		
	erved current a	ent Status D according to Table 3 typo? or am i miss		Text Improvements		oserved c		Comment Status D ccording to Table 33–9a." id table 33-9a, is the "a" a t	уро?	Text Improvement
SuggestedRemedy					Suggestea	IRemedy				
"based on the obs	erved current a	according to Table	33–9."		"the ot	oserved c	urrent a	ccording to Table 33–9."		
Proposed Response	Respon	se Status W			Proposed	Response	Э	Response Status W		
PROPOSED ACC	EPT IN PRINC	IPLE.			PROP	OSED AC	CCEPT	N PRINCIPLE.		
The reference sho	uld be to Table	e 33-TBDA1.			The re	ference s	hould be	e to Table 33-TBDA1.		
Suggested Fix:					Sugge	sted Fix:				
"based on the obs EZ	erved current a	according to Table 3	33–TBDA1."		"the ot EZ	oserved c	urrent a	ccording to Table 33–TBDA	.1."	

Page 7 of 10 1/14/2015 8:17:09 AM

C/ 33 SC 33.2.7.1 Rimboim, Pavlick	P 49 Microsemi	L 16	# 26	Cl 33 SC 33.2.7.7 Darshan, Yair	P 55 Microsemi	L 27	# 63
Comment Type E Comme table 33-10 1st class event timing in this line is	nt Status D s defined only for ty	vpe 1 or 2	PSE Classification	Comment Type ER In drawing 33-14, at the numbers etc.	Comment Status D e 8.2msec point, there are ver	tical thick black	Text Improvements marks on the
SuggestedRemedy need to add in the additional inforr "only applies to type 1 or type 2 P Proposed Response Respons PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCI Suggested Fix:	SE" e Status W			SuggestedRemedy Remove these marks. Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT Remove any marks in EZ	Response Status W IN PRINCIPLE. the drawing, I didn't see any.		
"only applies to Type 1 or Type 2 I EZ	PSEs"			C/ 33 SC 3.1 Schindler, Fred	P 60 Seen Simply	L 11	# 47
C/ 33 SC 2.7 Schindler, Fred	P 51 Seen Simply	L 18	# 41	Comment Type ER Remove extra.	Comment Status D		Text Improvements
Type-4 PSE will support the new I SuggestedRemedy Add 4 to item 17, PSE Type colum	ın.		Table 33-11	SuggestedRemedy Remove extra . Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT EZ	Response Status W		
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCI				C/ 33 SC 3.2 Schindler, Fred	P 60 Seen Simply	L 47	# 48
Add Type 4 to the Type 3 line in It Type 4 must also be added to the EZ		3 and 19.		Comment Type ER Replace " Type 1 Typ SuggestedRemedy with " Type 1, Type 2 Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEPT	2," Response Status W		Text Improvements

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general	Pa 60	Page 8 of 10
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn	Li 47	1/14/2015 8:17:09 AM
SORT ORDER: Page, Line		

CI 33 SC 3.2 P 61 L 1 # 49 Schindler, Fred Seen Simply	C/ 33 SC 33.3.5.2 P 69 L 46 # 115 Dwelley, David Linear Technology Linear Technology Linear Technology Linear Technology
Comment Type ER Comment Status D Text Improve Improve text by, replacing "Type 3 PDs operating with a max power draw corresponding to Class 3 or le implement" SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy with "Type 3 PDs operating up to a max power draw corresponding to Class 3 implement " Free Status Proposed Response Response Status W	State names are incorrect for PD SuggestedRemedy Change CLASS_EVx to DO_CLASS_EVENTx
PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ	C/ 33 SC 3.5.2 P 70 L 26 # 53 Schindler, Fred Seen Simply
C/ 33 SC 33.3.3.5 P 65 L 5 # 112 Dwelley, David Linear Technology Inear Technology PD State Diate Di	Comment Type ER Comment Status D Text Improvements Improve the text, " for the level defined in its pse_power_level state variable." be replcing it with SuggestedRemedy " for the level defined in the pse_power_level state variable." SuggestedRemedy " for the level defined in the pse_power_level state variable." Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ EZ EZ EX EX
EZ	C/ 33 SC 33.3.5.2.1 P 71 L 5 # 117 Dwelley, David Linear Technology
Cl 33 SC 33.3.5. P 66 L 8 # 114 Dwelley, David Linear Technology Comment Type T Comment Status D PD State Diate Di	SuggestedRemedy Add state DO_CLASS_EVENT_6 to the list, or refer to all as the "DO_CLASS_EVENT states" or the "DO_CLASS_EVENT_x states".

Pa **71** Li **5**

C/ 33 SC 33 Darshan, Yair	.3.5	P 71 Microsemi	L 5	# 66	<i>Cl</i> 33 Darshan, Y	SC 33 . air	.4	P 78 Microsen	L 49 ni	#	62	
The DO_CLASS required to have VMark_th is the signature transi DO_CLASS_EV	S_EVENT_6 is mise a defined state a PI voltage thresho tions into and out o	fter maximum clas old at which the PE of the DO_CLASS	s events per PS) implementing _EVENT1, or D	PD Classification tate diagram that is SE type was used.: 2Multiple-Event class IO_CLASS_EVENT2, NT5 states as shown in	Chang The re	g 10GBas e the text: quirement)BASETX	s of 33.	Comment Status D 4 are consistent with th 00BASE-T PHYs.	e requirements of	the 10BAS	SE-T MAU	100 U and
signature transi DO_CLASS_E\	tions into and out o /ENT3, DO_CLAS		_EVENT1, or D D_CLASS_EVE	2Multiple-Event class IO_CLASS_EVENT2, INT5 or	The re the 100 Proposed I	BASETX	s of 33. , and 10	4 are consistent with th 000BASE-T and 10GBa <i>Response Status</i> W	seT PHYs.	the 10BAS	SE-T MAU	J and
Proposed Response PROPOSED AC EZ		se Status W										
C/ 33 SC 33 Beia, Christian	.3.7.6	P 77 STMicroelectro	L 10 onics	# 128								
<i>,</i>		ent Status D during transient at	PSE PI has to	PD Power be described								
SuggestedRemedy Modify the sente The current limi		ILIM) is defined by	Equation (33–	14)								
To read: the current limit	per pair-set at the	MDI (MDI ILIM-2p) is defined by	Equation (33–14)								
Then modify the	e Equation 33-14 u	ising the definition	MDI ILIM_2p									
Proposed Response PROPOSED AC EZ		se Status W										

Pa **78** Li **49**