Cl **33**   *SC* **33.1.1**   *P* **19**   *L* **52**   # 115

Yseboodt, Lennart   Philips

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Cabling*

Reference to ISO/IEC 11801:1995.
In other parts of Clause 33 we refer to ISO/IEC 11801:2002 for channel parameters.
ISO/IEC 11801:1995 has been withdrawn by ISO.

SuggestedRemedy

Change ISO/IEC 11801:1995 to ISO/IEC 11801:2002

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.1.4**   *P* **22**   *L* **10**   # 111

Yseboodt, Lennart   Philips

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Cabling*

Table 33-1 lists the "Channel Pair-set maximum DC loop resistance" parameter name as "Rchan".
This is not correct, Rchan is the actual DC loop resistance in a system.

SuggestedRemedy

What is meant is Rch. In 802.3-2012 this parameter was also called Rch.
Replace Rchan by Rch.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.1.4**   *P* **22**   *L* **15-1**   # 116

Yseboodt, Lennart   Philips

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Cabling*

Reference to ISO/IEC 11801:1995.
In other parts of Clause 33 we refer to ISO/IEC 11801:2002 for channel parameters.
ISO/IEC 11801:1995 has been withdrawn by ISO.

SuggestedRemedy

Change ISO/IEC 11801:1995 to ISO/IEC 11801:2002

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.1.4**   *P* **22**   *L* **22**   # 4

Maguire, Valerie   Siemon

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Cabling*

Clarify type of unbalance (i.e. resistance or current)

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "inter-pair unbalance" with "inter-pair resistance unbalance"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

OBE by comment #50.

EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.1.4**   *P* **22**   *L* **22**   # 50

Beia, Christian   STMicroelectronics

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Cabling*

Note1 after able 33-1 refers to Annex 33A inaccurately. It is about channel pair to pair resistance unbalance, not about inter-pair unbalance

SuggestedRemedy

Replace:
See informative annex 33A for inter-pair unbalance.
With:
See informative annex 33A for Channel pair to pair resistance unbalance.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **33**
SC **33.1.4**

Page 1 of 14
5/19/2015 10:08:30 AM

Cl **33**　　*SC* **33.1.4**　　　　*P* **22**　　*L* **23**　　# 12
Darshan, Yair　　　　　　　　Microsemi

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*Cabling*
Comment number 2 below Table 33-1.
The comment is correct for Type 3 and 4 but yet it is reffering to Type 3 only.

SuggestedRemedy
Change "In Type 3, 60W operation, the current............ See details in section TBD"

To:
"In Type 3 and 4 operation, the current............ See details in Table 33-11 item 4a"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33**　　*SC* **33.1.4**　　　　*P* **22**　　*L* **23**　　# 113
Yseboodt, Lennart　　　　　　　Philips

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*Cabling*
Footnote 2 below Table 33-1
"In Type 3, 60W Operation, the current per pair-set might be impacted by pair to pair
system resistance unbalance."
Better to refer to class.

SuggestedRemedy
"In Type 3, Class 6 Operation, the current per pair-set might be impacted by pair to pair
system resistance unbalance."

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

OBE by comment #12.

EZ

Cl **33**　　*SC* **33.1.4.1**　　　*P* **22**　　*L* **41**　　# 140
Jones, Chad　　　　　　　　　Cisco

Comment Type **T**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*Cabling*
Maintenance WG Ballot comment #59 on behalf of GEOFF THOMPSON, GRACASI
S.A./LINEAR TECHNOLOGY

(through line 6, i.e. the first paragraph of 33.1.4.1)
Simplify the first paragraph by updating the reference to the 2002 version of 11801 which
incorporates the additional requirement.

SuggestedRemedy
33.1.4.1 Cabling requirement
Operation requires Class D, or better, cabling as specified in ISO/IEC 11801:2002. These
requirements are also met by Category 5e or better cable and components as specified in
ANSI/TIA-568-C.2; or Category 5 cable and components as specified in ANSI/TIA/EIA-568-
A.
The second paragraph of this clause can remain unchanged unless the referenced cabling
documents already cover this material.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33**　　*SC* **33.1.4.1**　　　*P* **23**　　*L* **5**　　# 1
Maguire, Valerie　　　　　　　Siemon

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*Cabling*
Use correct draft Standards name

SuggestedRemedy
Globally replace "TSB-184A" with "TSB-184-A" (3 locations)

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **33**
SC **33.1.4.1**

Page 2 of 14
5/19/2015 10:08:30 AM

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.2.1**   *P* **24**   *L* **42**   # 49
Stencel, Len   Bourns, Inc.

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Types*

Need to Add 2 diagrams showing Alt A and Alt B for an End PSE. Only midspan version is shown.

SuggestedRemedy

Add 2 Additional figures:
figure 33-1a   10BASE-T/100BASE-TX Endpoint PSE Alt A and Alt B
Figure 33-2a   1000BASE-T/10GBASE-T Endpoint PSE Alt A and Alt B
or
Add Figure 33-5 to text and make these two diagrams figures 33-5a and 33-5b.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Need to create figures…

EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.2.3**   *P* **31**   *L* **1**   # 117
Yseboodt, Lennart   Philips

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *Types*

"A PSE device may provide power via one of two valid four-wire connections."
Forbids 4P power.

SuggestedRemedy

"A PSE device may provide power via one or both of two valid four-wire connections."
or
"A PSE device may provide power via at least one of two valid four-wire connections."
or
"A PSE device may provide power via one or two valid four-wire connections."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Replace text with "A PSE device may provide power via one or both of two valid four-wire connections."

EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.2.4.1**   *P* **32**   *L* **20-2**   # 118
Yseboodt, Lennart   Philips

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *PSE Detection*

"A Type 3 or Type 4 PSE that is capable of delivering power over both Alternative A and Alternative B simultaneously is not required to meet backoff algorithm."
'the' misses between meet and backoff

SuggestedRemedy

"A Type 3 or Type 4 PSE that is capable of delivering power over both Alternative A and Alternative B simultaneously is not required to meet the backoff algorithm."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.2.4.1**   *P* **32**   *L* **21**   # 43
Stencel, Len   Bourns, Inc.

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *PSE Detection*

text correction

SuggestedRemedy

Change "meet backoff algorithm" to "meet the backoff algorithm requirement".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

OBE by comment #118.

EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **33**
SC **33.2.4.1**

Page 3 of 14
5/19/2015 10:08:30 AM

Cl **33** *SC* **33.2.4.1** *P* **32** *L* **31** *#* 9

Bustos Heredia, Jairo Würth Elektronik eiSo

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *PSE Detection*

If a PSE performing detection using Alternative A detects an invalid signature, it should complete a second detection in less than Tdbo min after the beginning of the first detection attempt.

SuggestedRemedy

As we are referring to a time value, it may bring the reader to confusion on whether "min" stands for "minimum" or "minutes". Actually, Tdbo has only one defined value in Table 33-11. Therefore I believe "min" is not needed. Thus, I would suggest the followin:

If a PSE performing detection using Alternative A detects an invalid signature, it should complete a second detection in less than Tdbo after the beginning of the first detection attempt.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33** *SC* **33.2.4.4** *P* **37** *L* **37-3** *#* 89

Yseboodt, Lennart Philips

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *PSE Classification*

"or a PSE that has hardware limitation."

SuggestedRemedy

"or a PSE that has a hardware limitation."

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33** *SC* **33.2.4.5** *P* **38** *L* **13** *#* 21

Darshan, Yair Microsemi

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *PSE State Diagram*

It seems that there is a Typo here:
The timer name is tlcf_timer and then the text says in line 16: See Tclf in Table 33-7. So we need to decide if it is tclf or tlcf.

In addition, it is Table 33-10 and not 33-7 in lines 13, 15, 36, 40, 44.
In Table 33-10 it is Tclf.

SuggestedRemedy

Change Tlcf_timer to Tclf.
Change "..in Table 33-7" to "...in Table 33-10 and verify the link is correct.
Correct in lines 13, 15, 36, 40, 44.
Scan the draft for similar for all Tlcf and Tclf occurrences and correct accordingly.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change all occurences of Tclf to Tlcf. The "lcf" was meant to stand for long class finger. The state diagram uses lcf and everything should match it.

EZ

Cl **33** *SC* **33.2.4.5** *P* **38** *L* **15** *#* 68

Schindler, Fred Seen Simply

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **D** *PSE State Diagram*

Fix Typo for TCLf

SuggestedRemedy

Use TCLF

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

OBE by comment # 21.

EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general *Cl* **33** Page 4 of 14
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn *SC* **33.2.4.5** 5/19/2015 10:08:30 AM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.2.5.1**   *P* **44**   *L* **25, 4**   # 92
Yseboodt, Lennart   Philips

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *PSE Detection*
Figure numbers 33-1 and 33-2 are incorrect, also references to them incorrect.

SuggestedRemedy
Figure 33-1 => Figure 33-11
Figure 33-2 => Figure 33-12

References to fix:
Lines: 10, 29 and 44/45

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.2.5.1**   *P* **44**   *L* **49**   # 48
Stencel, Len   Bourns, Inc.

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *PSE Detection*
incorrect table number`

SuggestedRemedy
change Table 33-1 to Table 33-4.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Fix all table references in the PSE Detection sections (33.2.5.1-33.2.5.5).

EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.2.5.2**   *P* **45**   *L* **46**   # 45
Stencel, Len   Bourns, Inc.

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *PSE Detection*
Incorrect tablenumber. link is good.

SuggestedRemedy
change table 33-1 to table 33-4.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

OBE by comment # 48.

EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.2.5.3**   *P* **45**   *L* **54**   # 46
Stencel, Len   Bourns, Inc.

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *PSE Detection*
Incorrect table number

SuggestedRemedy
change table 33-2 to Table 33-5

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

OBE by comment # 48.

EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.2.5.4**   *P* **46**   *L* **30**   # 47
Stencel, Len   Bourns, Inc.

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *PSE Detection*
incorrect table number

SuggestedRemedy
change table 33-3 to Table 33-6

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

OBE by comment # 48.

EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **33**
SC **33.2.5.4**

Page 5 of 14
5/19/2015 10:08:30 AM

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.2.6**   *P* **47**   *L* **30-3**   # 110
Yseboodt, Lennart   Philips

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *PSE Classification*

"Alternatively, PSE implementations may use V PSE = V Port_PSE-2P min and R Chan =
R Ch max when powering
using two-pairs, or R Chan = R Ch max/2 when powering using four-pair ***systems and***
to arrive at over-
margined values as shown in Table 33–4."

Issue 1: ***systems and*** should be removed.
Issue 2: R_Ch max is redundant. R_Ch is the maximum DC loop resistance of a pairset.

SuggestedRemedy

1: remove "and"
2: change Rch max to Rch

"Alternatively, PSE implementations may use V_PSE = V_Port_PSE-2P min and R_Chan
= R_Ch when powering
using two-pairs, or R_Chan = R_Ch/2 when powering using four-pairs to arrive at over-
margined values as shown in Table 33–4."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.2.6**   *P* **48-49**   *L* **-**   # 119
Yseboodt, Lennart   Philips

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *PSE Classification*
Table 33-8 is incorrectly broken up over pages 48 and 49.

SuggestedRemedy
Close table on page 48.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Possibly OBE by comment # 112.

EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.2.6**   *P* **49**   *L* **34-3**   # 81
Yseboodt, Lennart   Philips

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *PSE Classification*

"Subsequent to successful detection, all Type 2 PSEs perform classification using at least
one of the
following: 2-Event Physical Layer classification; 2-Event Physical Layer classification and
Data Link Layer
classification; or 1-Event Physical Layer classification and Data Link Layer classification."

2-Event should be Multiple-Event.

SuggestedRemedy

"Subsequent to successful detection, all Type 2 PSEs perform classification using at least
one of the
following: Multiple-Event Physical Layer classification; Multiple-Event Physical Layer
classification and Data Link Layer
classification; or 1-Event Physical Layer classification and Data Link Layer classification."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.2.6**   *P* **49**   *L* **8**   # 99
Yseboodt, Lennart   Philips

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *PSE Classification*
Table 33-8, Type 2, Physical Layer Classification column, first cell says "2-Event".
Should be "Multiple-Event".

SuggestedRemedy
Replace "2-Event" by "Multiple-Event".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Possible OBE by comment # 112.

EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **33**   Page 6 of 14
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **33.2.6**   5/19/2015 10:08:30 AM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.2.6.1**   *P* **50**   *L* **3**   # 83
Yseboodt, Lennart   Philips

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *PSE Classificaiton*

"Polarity shall be the same as defined for V Port_PSE-2P in 33.2.3 and timing specifications shall be as defined
by T pdc in Table 33â€"7."
T_pdc is not defined in Table 33-7, but in 33-10.

SuggestedRemedy

"Polarity shall be the same as defined for V Port_PSE-2P in 33.2.3 and timing specifications shall be as defined
by T_pdc in Table 33-10."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.2.6.1**   *P* **50**   *L* **5-6**   # 85
Yseboodt, Lennart   Philips

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *PSE Classification*

"All measurements of I Class shall be taken after the minimum relevant class event timing
in Table 33-7."
Wrong Table reference.

SuggestedRemedy

"All measurements of I Class shall be taken after the minimum relevant class event timing
in Table 33-10."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.2.6.1**   *P* **50**   *L* **5-6**   # 84
Yseboodt, Lennart   Philips

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *PSE Classification*

"The PSE shall measure the resultant I Class and classify the PD based on the observed current according to
Table 33-6."
I believe Table 33-9 is meant (please check).

SuggestedRemedy

"The PSE shall measure the resultant I Class and classify the PD based on the observed current according to
Table 33-9."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.2.6.2**   *P* **50**   *L* **31**   # 60
Schindler, Fred   Seen Simply

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *PSE Classification*

a TBD table (figure etc) exists please begin using a construct like TBD-# to identify the table to be used. If the table (figure etc) needs to be created use a construct like TBD-unavailable.

SuggestedRemedy

Please consider using the above suggestion to make the text easier to review.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

OBE by comment # 33.

EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **33**   Page 7 of 14
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **33.2.6.2**   5/19/2015 10:08:30 AM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **33** *SC* **33.2.6.2** *P* **50** *L* **31** *#* 33

Darshan, Yair Microsemi

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **D** *PSE Classification*

Table 33-TBD is Table 33-9

SuggestedRemedy

Replace Table 33-TBD with Table 33-9.
Same in line 45 and 53

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33** *SC* **33.2.6.2** *P* **50-51** *L* **1-54** *#* 87

Yseboodt, Lennart Philips

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *PSE Classification*

There are 10 references to Table 33-7, all incorrect.

SuggestedRemedy

Change every instance of Table 33-7 to Table 33-10 in 33.2.6.2

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33** *SC* **33.2.7** *P* **52** *L* **46** *#* 22

Darshan, Yair Microsemi

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **D** *PSE Classification*

The intention of the additional information for TME2 in Table 33-10 was meant to say that the fact that the maximum value of TME3 is not defined, doesn't mean that it can be any number, it actually limited by Tpon.
This may not be clear by the additional information however.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the additional information text from:
The time from end of detection until power-on is limited by 33.2.7.12.

Change the additional information text to:
The maximum value of TME2 is limited by the maximum allowed time from the end of detection until power-on according to 33.2.7.12.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33** *SC* **33.2.7** *P* **55** *L* **40** *#* 62

Schindler, Fred Seen Simply

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **D** *PSE Unbalance*

Define variable a.

SuggestedRemedy

Define variable a.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Alpha is the unbalance factor between the pair sets. It should be noted somewhere.

OBE by comment # 30

EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **33**
SC **33.2.7**

Page 8 of 14
5/19/2015 10:08:31 AM

Cl **33**　　　*SC* **33.2.7**　　　　　*P* **55**　　　*L* **41**　　　# 30

Darshan, Yair　　　　　　　　　　　Microsemi

Comment Type **T**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*PSE Unbalance*

The parameter "a" is not explained in Note 1.
To define "a" and explain it.

SuggestedRemedy

a=The effect of the system end to end pair to pair resistance/current unbalance that is not specified in this standard explicitly.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33**　　　*SC* **33.2.7**　　　　　*P* **55**　　　*L* **41**　　　# 29

Darshan, Yair　　　　　　　　　　　Microsemi

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*PSE Unbalance*

Missing full stop at the end of Note 1.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert full stop at the end of Note 1 text.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33**　　　*SC* **33.2.7.7**　　　　*P* **59**　　　*L* **19**　　　# 90

Yseboodt, Lennart　　　　　　　　　Philips

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*PSE Power*

"A PSE may remove power from a pair-set of a PI if the *the* pair-set current..."

SuggestedRemedy

"A PSE may remove power from a pair-set of a PI if the pair-set current..."

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33**　　　*SC* **33.2.9.1.1**　　　*P* **62**　　　*L* **30-3**　　　# 130

Yseboodt, Lennart　　　　　　　　　Philips

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*PSE MPS*

Reference to Table 33-1 wrong.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace Table 33-1 by Table 33-12.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33**　　　*SC* **33.2.9.1.1**　　　*P* **63**　　　*L* **1**　　　# 82

Yseboodt, Lennart　　　　　　　　　Philips

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*PSE MPS*

The Table titled "PSE PI parameters for AC disconnect-detection functions" is incorrectly numbered Table 33-1.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "Table 33-1" by Table "33-12".

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33**　　　*SC* **33.2.9.1.2**　　　*P* **63**　　　*L* **2**　　　# 34

Darshan, Yair　　　　　　　　　　　Microsemi

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*PSE MPS*

Duplicate table 33-1 name.
We have Table 33-1 in page 22.
I belive it is 33-12 (AC disconnect parameters)

SuggestedRemedy

Change to 33-12.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general　　　　　*Cl* **33**　　　Page 9 of 14
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn　　*SC* **33.2.9.1.2**　　5/19/2015 10:08:31 AM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **33**　　*SC* **33.2.9.1.2**　　*P* **64**　　*L* **18**　　# 131
Yseboodt, Lennart　　　　　Philips

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　*PSE MPS*
Reference to Table 33-1 wrong.

SuggestedRemedy
Replace Table 33-1 by Table 33-12.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33**　　*SC* **33.3.1**　　*P* **65**　　*L* **6**　　# 97
Yseboodt, Lennart　　　　　Philips

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　*PD PI*
In Table 33-13, conductor 2, mistyped Positive V_p

SuggestedRemedy
Replace by "Positive V_PD"

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33**　　*SC* **33.3.2**　　*P* **65**　　*L* **32**　　# 65
Schindler, Fred　　　　　Seen Simply

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　*PD Types*
Replace the Type 1 row, "May be" with "Allowed."

SuggestedRemedy
See above.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Possible OBE by comment # 109

make change if comment #109 is not resolved with a change to this text.

EZ

Cl **33**　　*SC* **33.3.2**　　*P* **65**　　*L* **33**　　# 106
Yseboodt, Lennart　　　　　Philips

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　*PD Types*
Table 33-13a, column DLL classification, Type 1 / 13W row, content = "May be".
Strange formulation, optional would be more apt.

SuggestedRemedy
Replace "May be" with "Optional".
See replacement table suggestion in yseboodt_D04_Table_33-13a_v100.pdf

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Possible OBE by comment # 109

make change if comment #109 is not resolved with a change to this text.

EZ

Cl **33**　　*SC* **33.3.2**　　*P* **66**　　*L* **10**　　# 134
Yseboodt, Lennart　　　　　Philips

Comment Type **T**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　*PD Classification*
"Type 3 and Type 4 PDs operating with a max power draw corresponding to Class 4 or greater implement
both multiple-Event Physical Layer classification (see 33.3.5.2) and Data Link Layer classification (see
33.6) and advertise a class signature of 4, 5, 6, or 7."

Class 8 missing.

SuggestedRemedy
"Type 3 and Type 4 PDs operating with a max power draw corresponding to Class 4 or greater implement
both multiple-Event Physical Layer classification (see 33.3.5.2) and Data Link Layer classification (see
33.6) and advertise a class signature of 4, 5, 6, 7, or 8."

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **33**
SC **33.3.2**

Page 10 of 14
5/19/2015 10:08:31 AM

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.3.2**   *P* **66**   *L* **4-8**   # `132`
Yseboodt, Lennart   Philips

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *PD Types*
'Max power' should be 'Maximum power' (two instances)

SuggestedRemedy
Replace 'Max power' by 'Maximum power'

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.3.3.3**   *P* **68**   *L* **34**   # `55`
Beia, Christian   STMicroelectronics

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**   *PD State Diagram*
pse_power_level value #4 in pse_power_level variable description should indicate the
maximum power supplied by a Type4 PSE, which is Class 8.

SuggestedRemedy
Replace:
4: The PSE is delivering the PD's requested power or Class 7 power, whichever is less.
With:
4: The PSE is delivering the PD's requested power or Class 8 power, whichever is less.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

OBE by comment #136

EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.3.3.3**   *P* **68**   *L* **34**   # `136`
Yseboodt, Lennart   Philips

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *PD State Diagram*
"4: The PSE is delivering the PD's requested power or Class 7 power, whichever is less."

Should be Class 8.

SuggestedRemedy
"4: The PSE is delivering the PD's requested power or Class 8 power, whichever is less."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.3.3.4a**   *P* **69**   *L* **8**   # `93`
Yseboodt, Lennart   Philips

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *PD State Diagram*
Bad reference to Table 33-7

SuggestedRemedy
Table 33-7 => Table 33-10

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

OBE by comment #56.

EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.3.5.1**   *P* **74**   *L* **14**   # `135`
Yseboodt, Lennart   Philips

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *PD Classification*
"Since 1-Event classification is a subset of Multiple-
Event classification, Type 2, Type 3 and Type 4 PDs operating with a maximum power
draw corresponding
to class 4, 5, 6 , or 7 respond to 1-Event classification with a Class 4 signature.

Class 8 missing.

SuggestedRemedy
"Since 1-Event classification is a subset of Multiple-
Event classification, Type 2, Type 3 and Type 4 PDs operating with a maximum power
draw corresponding
to class 4, 5, 6, 7, or 8 respond to 1-Event classification with a Class 4 signature."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

"Since 1-Event classification is a subset of Multiple-
Event classification, Type 2, Type 3 and Type 4 PDs operating with a maximum power
draw corresponding
to class or higher respond to 1-Event classification with a Class 4 signature."

EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **33**   Page 11 of 14
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **33.3.5.1**   5/19/2015 10:08:31 AM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.3.5.3**   *P* **76**   *L* **20**   # 66
Schindler, Fred   Seen Simply

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *PSE Classification*
    Replace " the PD to which it is connected." with

SuggestedRemedy
    " the connected PD."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.

    EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.3.7**   *P* **77**   *L* **29**   # 23
Darshan, Yair   Microsemi

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *PD Power*
    Typo.
    Redundant 33.3.7.1 in additional informatione columnn of Table 33-18 item 1.

SuggestedRemedy
    Change from 33.3.7.133.3.7.1 to 33.3.7.1.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.

    EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.3.7**   *P* **78**   *L* **45-4**   # 126
Yseboodt, Lennart   Philips

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *PD Power*
    Item 11, Von/Voff only listed for Type 1 and 2.

SuggestedRemedy
    Add extra lines for Type 3 and 4 with TBD.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.

    EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.3.8**   *P* **84**   *L* **33**   # 57
Schindler, Fred   Seen Simply

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *PD MPS*
    Strike "In addition," to make the sentence more consise and powerful.

SuggestedRemedy
    See above.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.

    EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.3.8**   *P* **84**   *L* **40**   # 124
Yseboodt, Lennart   Philips

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *PD MPS*
    Reference to Zac2 in Table 33-1.
    This should be Table 33-12, but note, Table 33-12 is erroneously listed as Table 33-1.
    See other comment on this.

SuggestedRemedy
    Change reference to Table 33-12.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.

    EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.4.8**   *P* **92**   *L* **15**   # 2
Maguire, Valerie   Siemon

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *AES*
    Use terminology consistent with rest of draft.

SuggestedRemedy
    Replace "channel unbalance currents" with "channel current unbalance"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
    PROPOSED ACCEPT.

    EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **33**   Page 12 of 14
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **33.4.8**   5/19/2015 10:08:31 AM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.4.9.1.2**   *P* **96**   *L* **33-3**   # 127

Yseboodt, Lennart   Philips

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *AES*

"For 10GBASE-T operation, insertion loss for **Mispan** PSE devices shall meet the
values determined by
Equation (33-19a) when measured **fro** the **trasmit** and receive pairs from 1 MHz to
500 MHz."

SuggestedRemedy

Mispan -> Midspan
fro -> from
trasmit -> transmit

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.4.9.1.3**   *P* **96**   *L* **50**   # 129

Yseboodt, Lennart   Philips

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *AES*

Reference to Table 33-1 wrong.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace Table 33-1 by Table 33-20.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.4.9.1.3**   *P* **97**   *L* **1**   # 128

Yseboodt, Lennart   Philips

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *AES*

Table "Connector return loss" should be numbered Table 33-20.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace Table 33-1 by Table 33-20.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.4.9.2.1**   *P* **99**   *L* **23**   # 52

Beia, Christian   STMicroelectronics

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *AES*

Figure 33-1.
The figures numbering on this page till the end of clause 33 is wrong, because it restarts
from 33-1, while it should continue as 33-26.

SuggestedRemedy

Renumber Figure 33-1 on page 99 as 33-26; 33-2 on page 110 as 33-27; 33-3 on page
111 as 33-28.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33**   *SC* **33.6**   *P* **104**   *L* **24-2**   # 79

Yseboodt, Lennart   Philips

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *DLL*

"Type 2 PDs that require more than 13.0 W support Data Link Layer classification (see
33.3.5).
Data Link Layer classification is optional for all other devices."

Last scentence needs to be adjusted for Type 3 and 4.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace text by:
"Type 2, 3 and 4 PDs that require more than 13.0 W support Data Link Layer classification
(see 33.3.5).
Data Link Layer classification is optional for all other devices."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **33**   Page 13 of 14
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **33.6**   5/19/2015 10:08:31 AM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **33**　　　*SC* **33.6.2**　　　　　*P* **104**　　　*L* **41**　　　# 80

Yseboodt, Lennart　　　　　　　　　Philips

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**D**　　　　　　　　　　*DLL*

"*A* Type 2, 3, and 4 PSEs shall send an LLDPDU containing..."

SuggestedRemedy

"Type 2, 3, and 4 PSEs shall send an LLDPDU containing..."

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl **33**　　　*SC* **33.6.3.3**　　　　*P* **108**　　　*L* **38-4**　　　# 133

Yseboodt, Lennart　　　　　　　　　Philips

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**D**　　　　　　　　　　*DLL*

'Max power' should be 'Maximum power' (two instances)

SuggestedRemedy

Replace 'Max power' by 'Maximum power'

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **33**
SC **33.6.3.3**

Page 14 of 14
5/19/2015 10:08:31 AM