

Meeting Minutes: IEEE 802.3bt DTE Power via MDI over 4-pair Task Force
November, 9-12, 2015
Dallas, Texas, USA
Prepared by Jairo Bustos Heredia

November Plenary Meeting of the IEEE 802.3bt DTE Power via MDI over 4-pair Task Force meeting convened at 8:22 a.m., Tuesday, November 10, 2015 by Dave Abramson, 802.3bt Task Force Comment Editor.

ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS

Call to order

Mr. Dave Abramson, Task Force Comment Editor and Acting Chair, called the meeting to order at 8:22 a.m. on behalf of Mr. Chad Jones, Chair of the IEEE 802.3bt Task Force, who was temporarily unavailable.

Mr. Dave Abramson called for introductions and affiliations. Participants introduced themselves.

Mr. Dave Abramson appointed Jairo Bustos Heredia acting recording secretary for the session.

Mr. Dave Abramson reviewed the Agenda, focused on resolving comments on draft D1.4 and hearing associated contributions.

Motion #1: Motion to approve Agenda for November 2015 Task Force Meeting ([agenda_1115.pdf](#))

Mover: Dave Dwelley Second: Dylan Walker

Approved by voice vote without opposition (Procedural > 50%) November, 10 2015, 8:37 a.m.

Mr. Dave Abramson introduced the "Task Force Decorum" inviting anyone attending from the press, including those who would run a public blog on this meeting, to point themselves out. There were no indications.

Mr. Dave Abramson noted that there should be no recording or photography without permission.

Goals of the meeting, Reflector & Web and Ground Rules were read by Mr. Dave Abramson. He also reminds attendees to record their attendance in the IMAT Tool for the sessions, as well as reminds participants to wear their badges in public at all times.

Mr. Abramson reminded the attendees of inappropriate topics that should not be discussed. These included price, no matter which currency.

Mr. Abramson asks if anyone has not heard about the patent policy. Having nobody in the room who has not, Mr. Abramson proceeds to call for potentially essential patents at 8:36 a.m. with no responses to the call for patents.

Mr. Abramson reads through "Other guidelines for IEEE WG Meetings".

Mr. Abramson goes through the overview of the Standards Process, indicating at which point the WG finds itself.

We make a recess being 8:45 a.m. The session resumes being 8:50 a.m.

LIAISONS

Mr. Abramson notes two liaisons for this meeting.

- From TIA TR42: TR42-2015-10-113 Liaison to IEEE 802.3bt re TSB-184-A Draft 3.0
- From ISO/IEC JTC1 SC25 to IEEE 802.3 on cable heating

AD HOC REPORTS

There are no Ad Hoc Reports.

Motion #2: Approve the Minutes from October 2015

Mover: *Matthias Wendt*

Secunder: *Dan Dove*

Approved by voice vote without opposition (Procedural > 50%), November, 10 2015, 8:54 a.m.

Meeting Minutes from the October Interim may be found under the following hyperlink: [October 2015 Minutes](#).

Comment Resolution and Presentations

Mr. Abramson then moves on to main business of the meeting, which is comment resolution. Resolution of comments by consensus or motion is listed in the comment database. Procedural events and significant motions are below. Please see the comment resolution files posted for detailed action in the meeting.

In the case of a presentation associated to a comment, it is noted along with the presenter and comment number. In the case of a motion, it is recorded along with the comment number (if applicable.)

EZ Bucket

Mr. Abramson noted several comments were requested over the reflector to be removed from the EZ bucket. He then proposed the following motion:

Motion #3: Approve the responses for the EZ bucket comments as found in the file [802d3bt_D1p4_EZ_DraftOrder.pdf](#) with the exception of comments: 5, 30, 38, 42, 52, 113, 122, 137, 145, 211 and 217

Mover: *Dave Abramson*

Secunder: *Lennart Yseboodt*

Mr. Abramson asks if there is any discussion on the motion. Being none, voting process proceeds.

Yes: 22; No: 0; Abstain: 1 (Technical > 75%)

Motion passes. November, 10 2015, 8:58 a.m.

Mr. Abramson goes through the comments removed from EZ bucket. Being 9:23 a.m., removed EZ Bucket comments have already been reviewed. Mr. Abramson moves on to nonEZ Bucket comments

(106 in total), focusing first on those comments which do not have any associated presentations. These may be found under the following hyperlink: [nonEZ Bucket comments](#).

Break: recess at 10:13 a.m. Session resumes at 10:32 a.m.

Lunch: recess at 11:55 a.m. Session resumes at 1:27 p.m.

The group proceeds with comment resolution. Mr. Abramson reminds attendees to log in to IMAT Tool and record their attendance.

Mr. Yseboodt would like to have Straw Poll for comment #201 (2:04 p.m.). It was voted to either leave the text as it is or change to X and Y (see comment #201 in [nonEZBucket comments](#))

Result of Straw Poll:

As it is: 4

Change to X and Y: 8

Break recess at 3:01 p.m. Session resumes at 3:19 p.m.

Due to an endless discussion on comment #205, Mr. Abramson proposes to vote for accepting or rejecting it.

Accept: 10

Reject: 0

Abstain: 8

Comment is accepted.

At 3:58 p.m., all non-presentation-related documents which have no relation with State Diagram were resolved. Discussion proceeds to comments with related presentations.

Presentations

Title: New Clause for Type 3 & 4 ([yseboodt_1_1115_newclause_v120.pdf](#))

Presenter: Lennart Yseboodt

Related to comments: 102

Discussion: Presenter presents his proposal of splitting up Clause 33 and having a new Clause for Types 3 and 4 and their interaction with Types 1 and 2. He described the reasons for which under his opinion a splitting of the Clause would be beneficial, as well as describing the procedure to follow when splitting.

Title: Two PoE chapters vs. 1: pro's and con's. ([darshan_06_1115.pdf](#)).

Presenter: Yair Darshan

Related to comments: 102

Discussion: Presenter presents his proposal of keeping only one Clause for PoE, which describe all Types. He enumerated the different benefits of keeping one Clause.

Straw Poll (following Chicago rules) takes place regarding splitting or keeping Clause 33.

Splitting: 11

Keeping: 17

Title: LLDP Extensions II ([wendt_1_1115_LLDP_Extensions_v100.pdf](#))

Presenter: Matthias Wendt

Related to comment: 153, 155

Mr. Abramson indicates that Task Force Meeting will resume either Wednesday at 8:30 a.m. or when the State Machine Ad Hoc finishes, whichever comes later, but no later than 1:00 p.m.

Meeting recesses for the day at 5:41 p.m.

November Plenary Meeting of the IEEE 802.3bt DTE Power via MDI over 4-pair Task Force meeting convened at 10:25 AM, Wednesday, November 11, 2015 by Chad Jones, 802.3bt Task Force Chair

Mr. Chad Jones, Task Force Chair, calls back in session at 10:25 a.m. resuming comment resolution with presentation-related comments ([nonEZBucket comments](#)). He also reminds attendees to log on to IMAT Tool and record attendance for the day, passing around the attendance sheet.

Mr. Abramson recommends resuming with comments related to State Diagram, as we have just finished the State Diagram Ad Hoc.

At 10:26 a.m. there was a new straw poll, following Non-Chicago rules, regarding the splitting of the Clause:

Split: 10

Keep: 8

Abstain: 3

Lunch: recess at 11:55 a.m. Session resumes at 1:22 p.m.

Comment #201 appears again. Mr. Abramson proceeds to open a voting process:

Accept: 10

Reject: 5

Abstain: 13

Comment is rejected.

At 1:46 p.m. comments not related to presentations are finished.

Title: Baseline for Figure 33-14 v310 ([yseboodt_10_1115_Figure_33_14_v310.pdf](#))

Presenter: Lennart Yseboodt

Related to comment: 8, 40 and 139

Session jumps out of comment resolution to presentations at 2:42 p.m.

Title: Conductor Ampacity 4-pair Communications Cables ([diminico_1_1115.pdf](#))

Presenter: Chris DiMinico

Related to comment: N.A.

Break: recess at 3:29 p.m. Session resumes at 4:01 p.m.

Task Force continues with presentations.

Title: Baseline for Ptype v110 ([Yseboodt_6_1115_Ptype_baseline_v110.pdf](#))

Presenter: Lennart Yseboodt

Related to comment: 33, 47, 207, 203, 206

Voting process is opened for this presentation, 4:20 p.m. Adopt
"Yseboodt_6_1115_Ptype_baseline_v110.pdf" with 45W replaced with TBD

Yes: 13

No: 10

Abstain: 11

Voting fails.

Voting process for accepting comment #207:

Accept: 16

Reject: 0

Abstain: 20

Comment is accepted.

Title: Proposed response to comment 146, 147 ([darshan_07_1115.pdf](#))

Presenter: Yair Darshan

Related to comment: 146, 147

Title: Figure 33-1- Rpair_max_PD and Rpair_min_PD PD common mode input effective impedance
([darshan_01_1115.pdf](#))

Presenter: Yair Darshan

Related to comment: 10, 222

Title: Addressing the changes in Table 33-1 for supporting Type 3 and 4 PSEs Inrush
([darshan_04_1115Rev009.pdf](#))

Presenter: Yair Darshan

Related to comment: 11

Meeting recess for the day at 5:53 p.m.

.....

November Plenary Meeting of the IEEE 802.3bt DTE Power via MDI over 4-pair Task Force meeting convened at 8:00 AM, Thursday, November 12, 2015 by Chad Jones, 802.3bt Task Force Chair

Mr. Chad Jones, Task Force Chair, calls back in session at 8:00 a.m.

Title: Figure 33-17.1 – PSE-PD simplified Cport interpretation model ([darshan_02_1115.pdf](#))

Presenter: Yair Darshan

Related to comment: 202, 221

Title: Updating 33.3.7.10 per D1.4 requirements ([darshan_03_1115.pdf](#))

Presenter: Yair Darshan

Related to comment: 13, 186

Comment #102. Voting process for splitting Clause 33 into separate subclauses, within Clause 33 (see Lennart's TOC in the reflector).

Split: 19

Not split: 11

Abstain: 11

Voting fails. Comment is rejected.

Break: recess at 10:06 a.m. Session resumes at 10:25 a.m.

Mr. David Law presents "Use of PowerPriceIndex information in measurement TLV".
([law_1_1115.pdf](#))

After Mr. Law's presentation, the session continues with comment resolution at 10:50 a.m.

Title: Type 3 and Type 4 PSE state diagram – variables, functions and timers
([walker_1_1115_rev_2.pdf](#))

Presenter: Dylan Walker

Related to comment: n.A.

Mr. Chad Jones presents a new timeline proposition, version 3

Motion #4: Adopt the Approved Timeline v3

Mover: *Lennart Yseboodt* **Secunder:** *Yair Darshan*

Approved by voice vote without opposition (Procedural > 50%). November, 12 2015, 11:23 a.m.

Motion #5: Adopt comment resolutions in the comment database and charter the editor to create D1.5 by incorporating the comments for review by November 30, 2015

Mover: *Dave Abramson* Seconder: *Matthias Wendt*

Yes: 41; No: 0; Abstain: 0

Motion passes (Technical >= 75%). November, 12 2015, 11:28 a.m.

Motion #6: Move that the Chair holds a comment cycle on D1.5 starting no later than November 30, and ending January 10, 2016 11:59 p.m. AOE, with resolutions posted by January 13, 2016

M: *Dave Abramson* S: *Fred Schindler*

Yes: 42; No: 0; Abstain: 0

Motion passes (Technical >= 75%). November 12, 2015, 11:30 a.m.

The Chair moved to liaisons at 11:34 a.m., and noted two liaisons for this meeting, assigned to the group in September. The Chair reads the liaisons to the group and takes on the homework to draft a response to the ISO/IEC letter for review in January. It is deemed that the TIA Liaison letter does not need a response.

Motion #7: Move to adjourn the meeting

Approved by voice vote without opposition (Procedural > 50%). November, 12 2015, 11:44 a.m.

The Meeting was adjourned at 11:44 a.m., Thursday, November 12, 2015.

Nov '15

Name	Employer	Affiliation	11/10	11/11	11/12
David Abramsen	TI	TI	Da	Da	Da
Andy Gardner	LTC	LTC	AG	AG	AG
George Zhunen	CME Consulting	LTC / Commscope / Aquatic	gz	gz	gz
5 GEOF T THOMPSON	GRACASI	Indep	G	G was to G	G
GAOLING Zou	MAXIM	MAXIM	G.Z.	G.Z.	G.Z.
Yan ZHUANG	Huawei	Huawei	Y.Z.	Y.Z.	Y.Z.
Rui Hua	Huawei	Huawei	R.H.	R.H.	R.H.
Richard Mei	CommScope	CommScope	RM	✓	
MASOOD SHARIFF	CommScope	CommScope	MS	MS	MS
10 Phill. p Brunlee	TDK	TDK	B	B	B
Craig Chabot	UNH-TOL	UNH-TOL	CC	CC	CC
FRED DAWSON	Chemours	Chemours	FD	FD	FD
Dylan Walker	Cisco	Cisco	DW	DW	DW
Chris Bullock	Cisco	Cisco	CB	CB	CB
15 SCOTT SOMMERS	Molex	Molex	S		
Richard Froese	PHitong	PHitong	RF	RF	RF
Dennis Koantz	Chemours	Chemours	DK	DK	
JEAN PICARD	TI	TI	JP	JP	JP
Eric DiBiasi	TE	TE	ED	ED	ED
20 Andrew Jimenez	Anixter	Anixter	AG	AG	

4PPoE Task Force Attendance

NOV '15

Initial to indicate attendance

Name	Employer	Affiliation	11/10	11/11	11/12
Christian Beiz	ST	ST	B	B	B
ROBERT AEKINS	LEGRAND	LEGRAND	A	/	
David Tremblay	Hewlett-Packard Enterprise	Hewlett-Packard Enterprise	DT	DT	DT
DAN DOVE	DNS	LTC	DD	DD	DD
5 Matthias Wendt	Philips	Philips	W	W	W
Jairo Bustos Heredia	Wirth Elektronik	Wirth Elektronik	W	W	W
Yair Darskun	MSCC	MSCC	Z	Z	Z
Fred Schindler	Seen Simply	CISCO, Broadcom, TI	JRS	JRS	JRS
DAVID STOUER	LTC	LTC	DMS	DMS	DMS
10 DALE DWELLEY	LTC	LTC	DMD	DMD	DMD
SHAMAR FELDMAN	MICROSEMI	MICROSEMI	SF.	SF.	
Mohammad Ahmed	TE Connectivity	TE Connectivity	MA	MA	MA
Oscar Deurloo	Philips	Philips	W	W	W
Seoha Panguluri	Broadcom	Broadcom	B	B	B
15 Leonard Stencel	Bourns	Bourns	LS	LS	LS
Miklos Lukacs	Silicon Labs	Silicon Labs	Lukacs Miklos	Lukacs Miklos	Lukacs Miklos
David Hoglund	Johnson Controls	Johnson Controls	DEH	DEH	
Keng Hua Chuang	Hewlett Packard Enterprise	Hewlett Packard Enterprise	CHC	/	
Jun Yi	Champlain Cable	Champlain Cable	JY	JY	
20 FRANK KIM	LEVITON	LEVITON	JK	/	

Name	Employer	Affiliation	11/10	11/11	11/12
DAVID LAW	HEWLETT PACKARD ENTERPRISES	HEWLETT PACKARD ENTERPRISES	DL	/	D.L
Ardeshir Mohammadian	Brocade	Brocade	AM	AM	AM
Chad Jones	CISCO	CISCO		CJT	CJT
LENNART SKIBOOT	PHILIPS	PHILIPS			
5 Kurt Smith	Coilcraft	Coilcraft		KS	KS
Brett Prudhom	Coilcraft	Coilcraft		BP	BP
Farid Hamidy	Pulse	Pulse		FH	FH
CHRIS DIMMILLO	MCCOMM/PANDUIT UNICATIONS	PANDUIT		C.O	
PAUL NIKALICH	SELF	SELF		PEN	
10 WAZEL DIARS	HUAWEI	HUAWEI		WD	
RADHAKRISHNA CANCHI	KYOCERA	Kyocera communications In		CK	
DAVE HESS	CORD DATA	CORD DATA			
STERLING VADEN	SURTEC VE.	VADEN ENT.		SV	SV
Curtis Donahue	UNH-IOL	UNH-IOL		CKD	
15 Michael Klempa	UNH IOL	UNH IOL		MK	MK
Paul Vanderlaan	Berk-Tek	Berk-Tek		PTC	
Shadi Abu Gharaeh	Hubbell	Hubbell		SA	
Victor Renteria	Bal Fuse	Bal Fuse		VR	VK
JON LEWIS	Dell	Dell		JL	
20 Mark Bohm	Microchip	Microchip			
Bryan Maffitt	Commscope	Commscope			BM

4PPoE Task Force Attendance

NOV '15

Initial to indicate attendance

Name	Employer	Affiliation	10/16	11/11	11/12	
AMRIK BAINS	CISCO	CISCO			AB	
5						
10						
15						
20						