

P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

CI FM SC FM P1 L2 # i-116
 Zimmerman, George Commscope and Line

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

Amendment is of 802.3-2015 as amended by several amendments: e.g., "IEEE Std 802.3-2015 as amended by IEEE Std 802.3bw(TM)-2015), IEEE Std 802.3by(TM)-201X, IEEE Std 802.3bq(TM)-201X, IEEE Std 802.3bp(TM)-201X, IEEE Std 802.3br(TM)-201X, and IEEE Std 802.3bz(TM)-201X) "

SuggestedRemedy

Update "Amendment of IEEE Std 802.3-2015" to include amendments preceding 802.3bu, for example: "IEEE Std 802.3-2015 as amended by IEEE Std 802.3bw(TM)-2015), IEEE Std 802.3by(TM)-201X, IEEE Std 802.3bq(TM)-201X, IEEE Std 802.3bp(TM)-201X, IEEE Std 802.3br(TM)-201X, and IEEE Std 802.3bz(TM)-201X) "

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI FM SC FM P1 L26 # i-114
 Zimmerman, George Commscope and Line

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

twisted pair should be hyphenated when used as an adjective. "with single twisted pair IEEE 802.3 interfaces"

SuggestedRemedy

change "with single twisted pair IEEE 802.3 interfaces" to "with single twisted-pair IEEE 802.3 interfaces"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI FM SC FM P2 L1 # i-218
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology

Comment Type ER Comment Status D ez

There is no acknowledgement to Maxim Integrated Products, Inc. for the use of 1-wire material in Clause 104.

SuggestedRemedy

Add the following acknowledgment to page 2 with insertion point starting at beginning of line 1: 'Portions of the material contained herein are reprinted with permission from Maxim Integrated Products, Inc., DS18B20 "Programmable Resolution 1-Wire Digital Thermometer" Data Sheet, Rev. 042208, (C) 2008.'

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI FM SC FM P2 L3 # i-111
 Zimmerman, George Commscope and Line

Comment Type T Comment Status D ez

"for the provision of power via a single twisted pair to connected Data Terminal Equipment (DTE) with IEEE 802.3 interfaces." This amendment, as designed, isn't made to work on a single-twisted pair of a 4-pair IEEE 802.3 interface. It is only designed for the BASE-T1, single-pair, interfaces. (this same text occurs on P2 L3 and P12 L44)

SuggestedRemedy

Change "with IEEE 802.3 interfaces" to "with IEEE 802.3 single twisted-pair interfaces", on both P2L3 and P12L44.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI FM SC FM P12 L15 # i-1
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

The character after "Amendment 1" should be an em-dash. Likewise for Amendments 2 through X

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "--" with em-dash (Ctrl-q Shft-q)

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI FM SC FM P12 L18 # i-76
 Law, David Hewlett Packard Enter

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

IEEE Std 802.3by-2016, IEEE Std 802.3bq-2016 and IEEE Std 802.3bp-2016 were all approved as IEEE standards on 30th June 2016.

SuggestedRemedy

Change 'IEEE Std 802.3by(TM)-201x' to read 'IEEE Std 802.3by(TM)-2016', 'IEEE Std 802.3bq(TM)-201x' to read 'IEEE Std 802.3bq(TM)-2016', and 'IEEE Std 802.3bp(TM)-201x' to read 'IEEE Std 802.3bp(TM)-2016'.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

CI **FM** SC **FM** P **12** L **37** # **i-136**
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** ez

DL: Since it seems likely that IEEE P802.3br and IEEE P802.3bn will be published before IEEE P802.3bu add these to the list of prior amendments.

SuggestedRemedy

Add the following text between the IEEE Std 802.3bp-201x entry and the IEEE Std 802.3bu-201x entry:

IEEE Std 802.3br-201X

Amendment 5--This amendment includes changes to IEEE Std 802.3-201x and adds Clause 99. This amendment adds a MAC Merge sublayer and a MAC Merge Service Interface to support for Interspersing Express Traffic over a single link.

IEEE Std 802.3bn-201X

Amendment 6--This amendment adds the physical layer specifications and management parameters for symmetric and/or asymmetric operation of up to 10 Gb/s on point-to-multipoint Radio Frequency (RF) distribution plants comprising either amplified or passive coaxial media. It also extends the operation of Ethernet Passive Optical Networks (EPON) protocols, such as Multipoint Control Protocol (MPCP) and Operation Administration and Management (OAM).

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Duplicate comment with i-75. Remedy as per remedy for comment i-75:

Add the following text between the IEEE Std 802.3bp-201x entry and the IEEE Std 802.3bu-201x entry:

IEEE Std 802.3br-2016

Amendment 5--This amendment includes changes to IEEE Std 802.3-2015 and adds Clause 99. This amendment adds a MAC Merge sublayer and a MAC Merge Service Interface to support for Interspersing Express Traffic over a single link.

IEEE Std 802.3bn-201X

Amendment 6--This amendment adds the physical layer specifications and management parameters for symmetric and/or asymmetric operation of up to 10 Gb/s on point-to-multipoint Radio Frequency (RF) distribution plants comprising either amplified or passive coaxial media. It also extends the operation of Ethernet Passive Optical Networks (EPON) protocols, such as Multipoint Control Protocol (MPCP) and Operation Administration and Management (OAM).

IEEE Std 802.3bz-201X

Amendment 7-- This amendment includes changes to IEEE Std 802.3-2015 and adds Clause 125 and Clause 126. This amendment adds new rates of 2.5 Gb/s and 5 Gb/s and new Physical Layers for operation at 2.5 Gb/s and 5 Gb/s over balanced twisted-pair structured cabling systems.

CI **FM** SC **FM** P **12** L **37** # **i-75**
 Law, David Hewlett Packard Enter

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** ez

Since IEEE Std 802.3br-2016 was approved as an IEEE standard on 30th June 2016 and it seems likely that IEEE P802.3bn and IEEE P802.3bz will be published before IEEE P802.3bu add these to the list of prior amendments.

SuggestedRemedy

Add the following text between the IEEE Std 802.3bp-201x entry and the IEEE Std 802.3bu-201x entry:

IEEE Std 802.3br-2016

Amendment 5--This amendment includes changes to IEEE Std 802.3-2015 and adds Clause 99. This amendment adds a MAC Merge sublayer and a MAC Merge Service Interface to support for Interspersing Express Traffic over a single link.

IEEE Std 802.3bn-201X

Amendment 6--This amendment adds the physical layer specifications and management parameters for symmetric and/or asymmetric operation of up to 10 Gb/s on point-to-multipoint Radio Frequency (RF) distribution plants comprising either amplified or passive coaxial media. It also extends the operation of Ethernet Passive Optical Networks (EPON) protocols, such as Multipoint Control Protocol (MPCP) and Operation Administration and Management (OAM).

IEEE Std 802.3bz-201X

Amendment 7-- This amendment includes changes to IEEE Std 802.3-2015 and adds Clause 125 and Clause 126. This amendment adds new rates of 2.5 Gb/s and 5 Gb/s and new Physical Layers for operation at 2.5 Gb/s and 5 Gb/s over balanced twisted-pair structured cabling systems.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

CI **FM** SC **FM** P 12 L 38 # i-104
Marris, Arthur Cadence Design Syst

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** ez

Now that 802.3br has been approved add that to the list of approved amendments

SuggestedRemedy

Add after 802.3bp:

IEEE Std 802.3br(TM)-2016

Amendment 5 --This amendment includes changes to IEEE Std 802.3-201x and adds Clause 99. This amendment adds a MAC Merge sublayer and a MAC Merge Service Interface to support for Interspersing Express Traffic over a single link.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI **FM** SC **FM** P 12 L 38 # i-112
Zimmerman, George Commscope and Line

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** ez

There are at least 3 more amendments missing which will be ahead of 802.3bu - 802.3br (Amendment 5), which was approved at the June standards board, 802.3bn and 802.3 bz, which has passed its first sponsor recirc with minimal comments.

SuggestedRemedy

Add IEEE Std 802.3br-201x and IEEE Std 802.3bz-201x to the amendments in front of 802.3bu. Descriptive text may be obtained from D3.1 of IEEE Std 802.3bz. Consult IEEE 802.3 leadership for other amendments and any ordering.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Adopt remedy to i-75 as follows:

Add the following text between the IEEE Std 802.3bp-201x entry and the IEEE Std 802.3bu-201x entry:

IEEE Std 802.3br-2016

Amendment 5--This amendment includes changes to IEEE Std 802.3-2015 and adds Clause 99. This amendment adds a MAC Merge sublayer and a MAC Merge Service Interface to support for Interspersing Express Traffic over a single link.

IEEE Std 802.3bn-201X

Amendment 6--This amendment adds the physical layer specifications and management parameters for symmetric and/or asymmetric operation of up to 10 Gb/s on point-to-multipoint Radio Frequency (RF) distribution plants comprising either amplified or passive coaxial media. It also extends the operation of Ethernet Passive Optical Networks (EPON) protocols, such as Multipoint Control Protocol (MPCP) and Operation Administration and Management (OAM).

IEEE Std 802.3bz-201X

Amendment 7-- This amendment includes changes to IEEE Std 802.3-2015 and adds Clause 125 and Clause 126. This amendment adds new rates of 2.5 Gb/s and 5 Gb/s and new Physical Layers for operation at 2.5 Gb/s and 5 Gb/s over balanced twisted-pair structured cabling systems.

P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

CI **FM** SC **FM** P 12 L 42 # i-214

Maguire, Valerie

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** ez

The terms "twisted pair" and "twisted-pair" are often used interchangeably throughout the document. Please standardize on one style. "Twisted-pair" is recommended to align with structured cabling Standards.

SuggestedRemedy

Perform a global search for the term "twisted pair" and replace with "twisted-pair" where appropriate.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI **FM** SC **FM** P 17 L 1 # i-105

Marris, Arthur

Cadence Design Syst

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** ez

Add new line after Ethernet in "Draft Standard for Ethernet Amendment:"

SuggestedRemedy

Change to:
Draft Standard for Ethernet
Amendment:

Make the same change on page 1 line 8.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI **FM** SC **FM** P 17 L 13 # i-2

Anslow, Peter

Ciena Corporation

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** ez

Page 17 does not reflect the latest version of the 802.3 boilerplate.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Implementors" to "Implementers".

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI **0** SC **0** P L # i-55

Maytum, Michael

RETIRED

Comment Type **GR** Comment Status **D** ez

Has power up two times and power-up two times

SuggestedRemedy

Make consistent - suggest all to power-up

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editor to change all instances of 'power-up' to 'power up'.

CI **0** SC **0** P L # i-51

Maytum, Michael

RETIRED

Comment Type **GR** Comment Status **D** ez

Has falling edge three times and falling-edge once

SuggestedRemedy

Make consistent - suggest all to falling edge

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI **0** SC **0** P L # i-52

Maytum, Michael

RETIRED

Comment Type **GR** Comment Status **D** ez

Has implementation-specific two times and implementation specific once

SuggestedRemedy

Make consistent - suggest all to implementation-specific

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editor to change all instances of 'implementation specific' to 'implementation-specific'.

P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

CI 0 SC 0 P L # i-53
 Maytum, Michael RETIRED
 Comment Type GR Comment Status D ez
 Has information-byte once and information byte once
 SuggestedRemedy
 Make consistent - suggest all to information byte
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 As per the remedy to comment i-166, "information-byte" and "information byte" will be changed to 'information' in the definition of do_classification_done (p41, line 27).

CI 0 SC 0 P L # i-54
 Maytum, Michael RETIRED
 Comment Type GR Comment Status D ez
 Has open-circuit voltage once and open circuit voltage two times
 SuggestedRemedy
 Make consistent - suggest all to open-circuit voltage
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Editor to change all instances of 'open- circuit voltage' to 'open circuit voltage'.

CI 0 SC 0 P L # i-56
 Maytum, Michael RETIRED
 Comment Type GR Comment Status D ez
 Has pull up two times and pull-up nine times
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change pull-up at and pull-up within to be pull up at and pull up within
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Editor to change all instances of 'pull up at' to 'pull-up at' and all instances of 'pull up within' to pull-up within'.

CI 0 SC 0 P L # i-57
 Maytum, Michael RETIRED
 Comment Type GR Comment Status D ez
 Figures 104-12/13/14 pull down and PULLUP
 SuggestedRemedy
 change PULLUP to PULL UP
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 0 SC 0 P L # i-58
 Maytum, Michael RETIRED
 Comment Type GR Comment Status D ez
 rising edge four times and rising-edge two times
 SuggestedRemedy
 change twice rising-edge at its.. to change rising edge at its..
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 0 SC 0 P L # i-50
 Maytum, Michael RETIRED
 Comment Type GR Comment Status D ez
 Has constant voltage signature three time and constant-voltage signature twice
 SuggestedRemedy
 Make consistent - suggest all to constant-voltage signature
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Editor to change all instances of 'constant voltage signature' to 'constant-voltage signature'.

P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

Cl 0 SC 0 P L # i-61
 Maytum, Michael RETIRED
 Comment Type GR Comment Status D ez
 behavior(s) eighteen times and behaviour twenty times
 SuggestedRemedy
 mixture of international and american english. Suggest using behavior throughout
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 802.3 style uses behaviour in Clause 30 and behavior everywhere else.

Cl 0 SC 0 P L # i-60
 Maytum, Michael RETIRED
 Comment Type GR Comment Status D ez
 sub-clause three times and subclause twelve times
 SuggestedRemedy
 Be consistent change sub-clause to subclause (three times)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 0 SC 0 P L # i-59
 Maytum, Michael RETIRED
 Comment Type GR Comment Status D ez
 dropout six times and drop-out twice
 SuggestedRemedy
 Make consistent - suggest all to dropout
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 0 SC 0 P 11 L 40 # i-62
 Maytum, Michael RETIRED
 Comment Type GR Comment Status D ez
 twisted pair cabling
 SuggestedRemedy
 change to twisted-pair cabling (like the other four instances)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 0 SC 0 P 43 L 2 # i-63
 Maytum, Michael RETIRED
 Comment Type GR Comment Status D ez
 steady state one and steady-state once
 SuggestedRemedy
 change has begun steady state operation to has begun steady-state operation
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 0 SC 0 P 47 L 7 # i-64
 Maytum, Michael RETIRED
 Comment Type GR Comment Status D ez
 re-attempting
 SuggestedRemedy
 change to reattempting (like the other instance)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

Cl 1 SC 1.4 P 18 L 8 # i-3
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

References to "Clause xxx" should either be cross-references or be in Forest green. 802.3 should be referred to as "IEEE Std 802.3"

SuggestedRemedy

In 1.4.330a, make "Clause 104" a cross-reference
 In 1.4.330b, make "Clause 104" a cross-reference
 In 1.4.338, apply character tag External to "Clause 33"
 In 1.4.338, make "Clause 104" a cross-reference
 In 1.4.415, change "IEEE 802.3" to IEEE Std 802.3"
 In 1.4.415, apply character tag External to "Clause 33"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 1 SC 1.4 P 18 L 16 # i-227
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

ROGUE: For consistency, should the definition refer to "A PoDL PSE" instead of "A PSE" ?

SuggestedRemedy

Change "A PSE" to "A PoDL PSE"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 1 SC 1.4 P 18 L 19 # i-228
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

ROGUE: For consistency, should the definition refer to "A PoDL PSE" instead of "A PSE" ?

SuggestedRemedy

Change "A PSE" to "A PoDL PSE"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 1 SC 1.4 P 18 L 45 # i-229
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

ROGUE: Does the second sentence for Type C PoDL System add anything useful. It seems redundant

SuggestedRemedy

Remove Second sentence.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 1 SC 1.4.338 P 1 L 8 # i-132
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

"balanced" missing

SuggestedRemedy

replace "twisted-pair" with "balanced twisted-pair". S&R document for consistent use of either "twisted pair" or "twisted-pair".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Remedy overlaps with comment i-214

Cl 1 SC 1.4.338 P 18 L 24 # i-138
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

DL: The text 'Power Sourcing Equipment (PSE)' (line 24) and 'Type 1 PD' (line 34) should be in bold.

SuggestedRemedy

See comment.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

: P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

Cl 1 SC 1.4.338 P 18 L 24 # i-77
 Law, David Hewlett Packard Enter
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 The text 'Power Sourcing Equipment (PSE)' (line 24) and 'Type 1 PD' (line 34) should be in bold.
 SuggestedRemedy
 See comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 1 SC 1.4.338 P 18 L 28 # i-78
 Law, David Hewlett Packard Enter
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 Suggest the text '... single twisted-pair (BASE-T1 PHYs), ...' should be changed to read '... single twisted-pair (BASE-T1) PHYs, ...' to match similar text on line 26.
 SuggestedRemedy
 See comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 1 SC 1.4.338 P 18 L 28 # i-115
 Zimmerman, George Commscope and Line
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 Parentheses is in the wrong place. "When used with single twisted-pair (BASE-T1 PHYs)," should be "When used with single twisted-pair (BASE-T1) PHYs,"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "When used with single twisted-pair (BASE-T1 PHYs)," to "When used with single twisted-pair (BASE-T1) PHYs,"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 1 SC 1.4.338 P 18 L 30 # i-113
 Zimmerman, George Commscope and Line
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 The descriptions of PSE should note that when a single-pair device is used, it may be referred to as a PoDL PSE.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Insert "A PSE used with single twisted-pair PHYs is also referred to as a PoDL PSE." following the last sentence of 1.3.338
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 1 SC 1.4.338 P 18 L 28 # i-139
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 DL: Suggest the text '... single twisted-pair (BASE-T1 PHYs), ...' should be changed to read '... single twisted-pair (BASE-T1) PHYs, ...' to match similar text on line 26.
 SuggestedRemedy
 See comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 1 SC 1.4.415 P 18 L 34 # i-24
 Stover, David Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 "provides a Class 0, 1, 2 or 3 signature" does not follow apparent style convention.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace with "provides a Class 0, 1, 2, or 3 signature".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

Cl 1 SC 1.4.418c P 18 L 46 # i-140
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

AB: The sentence "Type C PoDL system elements are compatible with both 100BASE-T1 and 1000BASE-T1 PHYs." is redundant with the immediately preceding sentence.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete this sentence

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.2.3 P 22 L 3 # i-86
 Law, David Hewlett Packard Enter

Comment Type GR Comment Status D ez

*** Comment submitted with the file 89975600003-IEEE_P802d3bu_Clause_30_250416.pdf attached ***

Since IEEE Std 802.3br-2016 was approved as an IEEE standards on 30th June 2016 the DTE system entity relationship diagram needs to be updated to reflect the changes being made to it by IEEE P802.3br to add support for the oMACMergeEntity.

SuggestedRemedy

Please replace Figure 30-3 with the new figure in IEEE_P802d3bu_Clause_30_250416.pdf attached to this comment.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.2.3 P 22 L 28 # i-4
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

Cross-references external to the draft should be in forest green.
 For a "replace" editing instruction, the figure should be as is expected to appear (as far as possible).

SuggestedRemedy

Make "30.14.1" forest green as it is an external cross-reference.
 Make the "oPoDLPSE" text and lines black as they will be in the final standard.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.2.5 P 23 L 25 # i-142
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

sentence is incomplete

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "PSE, PoDL PSE and PD management" with "PSE, PD, PoDL PSE and PoDL PD management"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.15 P 24 L 45 # i-5
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

There is no need for "new sub-clause" in the editing instruction.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Insert new sub-clause 30.15" to "Insert 30.15"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.15 P 29 L 14 # i-230
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

ROGUE: Title is: acPoDLPSEAdminControl. The "c" seems to be a mistake.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "acPoDLPSEAdminControl" with "aPoDLPSEAdminControl"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

Cl 30 SC 30.15.1.1.2 P 25 L 30 # i-6
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

As documented in http://www.ieee802.org/3/WG_tools/editorial/requirements/words.html
 "The text contained in the 'BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS:' description must be terminated by a semi-colon, to not do so would be a syntax error."

SuggestedRemedy

Add a semi-colon after the "." at the end of:
 30.15.1.1.2, 30.15.1.1.3, 30.15.1.1.4, 30.15.1.1.5, 30.15.1.1.6, 30.15.1.1.7, 30.15.1.1.8,
 30.15.1.1.9, 30.15.1.1.10, 30.15.1.1.11, 30.15.1.2, 30.15.1.3, 30.15.1.4

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.15.1.1.3 P 25 L 52 # i-143
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

DD: Semantic improvement required. See remedy.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "the PSE state diagram variable pi_de- tecting or pi_classifying is true" with "either of the PSE state diagram variables pi_de- tecting or pi_classifying is true"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.15.1.1.3 P 25 L 53 # i-144
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

"expression" is not the best descriptor here.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "expression" with "combination"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.15.1.2 P 28 L 33 # i-7
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

The structure for 30.9 is:
 30.9 Management for DTE Power via MDI
 30.9.1 PSE managed object class
 30.9.1.1 PSE attributes
 30.9.1.1.1 aPSEID
 30.9.1.1.2 aPSEAdminState
 ...
 30.9.1.2 PSE actions
 30.9.1.2.1 acPSEAdminControl

The structure for 30.15 starts off following this:
 30.15 Layer management for Power over Data Lines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet

30.15.1 PoDL PSE managed object class
 30.15.1.1 PoDL PSE attributes
 30.15.1.1.1 aPoDLPSEID
 ...
 30.15.1.1.11 aPoDLPSEMaintainFullVoltageSignatureAbsentCounter
 but then changes:
 30.15.1.2 aPoDLPSEActualPower
 30.15.1.3 aPoDLPSEPowerAccuracy
 30.15.1.4 aPoDLPSECumulativeEnergy
 30.15.2 PoDL PSE actions
 30.15.2.1 acPoDLPSEAdminControl

SuggestedRemedy

Change the heading levels of the 5 headings so that they become:
 30.15.1.1.12 aPoDLPSEActualPower
 30.15.1.1.13 aPoDLPSEPowerAccuracy
 30.15.1.1.14 aPoDLPSECumulativeEnergy
 30.15.1.2 PoDL PSE actions
 30.15.1.2.1 acPoDLPSEAdminControl

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7b P 32 L 9 # i-8
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

The P802.3bq draft has inserted Table 45-211a and Table 45-211b in 45.2.7
 The P802.3bp draft has inserted Table 45-211c through Table 45-211h in 45.2.7
 The P802.3bn draft is inserting 7 further tables after Table 45-211h in 45.2.7a and a
 comment has been submitted to re-number these as Table 45-211i through Table 45-211o
 Consequently, Table 45-211h through Table 45-211k in the P802.3bu draft should be Table
 45-211p through Table 45-211s

SuggestedRemedy

Renumber Table 45-211h through Table 45-211k to be Table 45-211p through Table 45-211s

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7b P 32 L 19 # i-25
 Stover, David Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

The terms "PoDL PSE" and "PoDL PD" are defined and used through all sections of the
 draft with the exception of Clause 45.2.7b where the undefined term "Single-Pair PSE" is
 used.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace all instances of "Single-Pair PSE" in 45.2.7b with "PoDL PSE".

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7b.1 P 32 L 32 # i-9
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

There is no need to capitalise "Enable Power Classification"

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "Enable power classification" as per heading 45.2.7b.1.1

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7b.1 P 32 L 34 # i-10
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

1= PSE Enabled
 0= PSE Disabled
 Has a spurious indent

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the indent

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7b.2 P 33 L 21 # i-11
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type T Comment Status D ez

For table entries in Clause 45 that define the state of multiple bits, the columns are headed
 with the bit number to clarify the order. See for example Table 45-7 bits 1.7.5:0

SuggestedRemedy

In Table 45-211j rows for bits 13.1.9:7, 13.1.6:3, and 13.1.2:0 and also in Table 45-211k
 row for bits 13.2.2:0, add the bit number at the head of each column.

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7b.2.1 P 33 L 45 # i-27
 Stover, David Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

Missing a space: "Power Denied(13.1.15)"

SuggestedRemedy

Replace with "Power Denied (13.1.15)".

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

: P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7b.2.1 P 33 L 45 # i-12
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 Space missing in "Denied(13.1.15)"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to "Denied (13.1.15)"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7b.2.7 P 34 L 36 # i-146
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez
 The PSE Type bits are explicitly defined, but do not include the values for reserved bits.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add "Values of 1xx and 011 are reserved."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7b.2.1 P 33 L 47 # i-145
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 DD: Two instances of the word "removed" were not replaced with "denied".
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "removed" and replace with "denied" maintaining capitalization as required.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7b.2.9 P 34 L 52 # i-148
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 DD: Semantic improvement required. See remedy.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "When read as '011', bits 13.1.2:0 indicate that pi_detecting or pi_classifying is asserted true." with "When read as '011', bits 13.1.2:0 indicate that either pi_detecting or pi_classifying is are asserted true."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7b.2.1 P 33 L 48 # i-13
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation
 Comment Type T Comment Status D ez
 "The Power Removed bit shall be ..." should be "The Power Denied bit shall be ..."
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "The Power Removed bit shall be ..." to "The Power Denied bit shall be ..."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7b.2.9 P 34 L 54 # i-117
 Zimmerman, George Commscope and Line
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 All the states are described in binary order except for Sleeping (001), which is stuck between 101 and 111. (it is OK that the reserved combination is last).
 SuggestedRemedy
 Move sentence beginning with "When read as "001"..." (L54) between sentences beginning with "When read as "000"..." and "When read as "010"..." (L51)
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7b.2.4 P 34 L 14 # i-28
 Stover, David Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 Missing a space: "Class Timeout(13.1.12)"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace with "Class Timeout (13.1.12)".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7b.2.9 P 34 L 54 # i-149
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 The term "expression" may not be the best term.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "expression" with "combination"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7b.3.1 P 35 L 27 # i-15
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 Space missing in "indicated.The"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to "indicated. The"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7b.3.1 P 35 L 16 # i-151
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez
 Update required to address value of "111" and also the validity of classification being essential to reporting this information.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "Bits 13.2.2:0 report the PD Type of a detected PD as specified in 104.5.1." with "Bits 13.2.2:0 report a value of ""111"" until a valid classification has taken place, or if no PD is present. Once a valid classification has occurred, the value of these bits reflect the PD Type of an attached PD as specified in 104.5.1."
 Delete "The value in this register is valid while a PD is connected, i.e., while the PSE Status (13.1.2:0) bits are reporting "delivering power"."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7b1 P 32 L 34 # i-26
 Stover, David Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 Indentation of "Description" cell for row "13.0.0" is irregular.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Fix indentation.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7b.3.1 P 35 L 16 # i-150
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez
 How does a PSE know what type of PD is attached? This can only be done via classification. Without classification, this register does not have a defined value.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add a value of "111 = Unknown", adjust adjacent entries in the table, and add text instructing the user that "a value of 111 indicates that the PSE has not performed classification and therefore cannot indicate the proper value for the PD Type".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104 P 37 L 3 # i-118
 Zimmerman, George Commscope and Line
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 Editor's note has served its purpose, delete it
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete editors note indicating figures converted to frame
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

Cl 104 SC 104.1 P 37 L 10 # i-152
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

Some minor editorial changes are required to be more accurate.

SuggestedRemedy

replace "balanced pair" with "balanced twisted-pair"
 replace "These entities allow devices to draw/supply power using the same cabling that is used for data transmission. PoDL is intended to provide an Ethernet Physical Layer device with a single interface to both the data it requires and the power to process this data." with "These entities allow devices to *supply/draw* power using the same cabling that *may be* used for data transmission. PoDL is intended to provide a "single balanced twisted-pair" Ethernet Physical Layer device with a single interface to both the data it requires and the power to process this data." (Remove the *s from this sentence)

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.1 P 37 L 28 # i-153
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

I propose an addition to the sentence to make it more complete.

SuggestedRemedy

replace "related devices." with "related devices within a PoDL System".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.1.3 P 39 L 15 # i-120
 Zimmerman, George Commscope and Line

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

Note says "PSE interface elements", but aren't these both on the PSE and on the PD?

SuggestedRemedy

Change "PSE interface elements" to "PI interface elements"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.2 P 39 L 32 # i-159
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type T Comment Status D ez

The term 'system power Class' (page 39, line 32), 'system class' (page 40, line 49) and 'Class Code' (page 40, line 12) all seem to be used interchangeably.]

SuggestedRemedy

I believe 'system class' is the correct term as Table 104-1 defines more than just power, and while there can be a power associated with a system class, there are other parameters associated with a system class. Please update text as required.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editor to replace all instances of 'system power Class' and 'Class Code' with 'system class'.

Cl 104 SC 104.2 P 39 L 32 # i-83
 Law, David Hewlett Packard Enter

Comment Type T Comment Status D ez

The term 'system power Class' (page 39, line 32), 'system class' (page 40, line 49) and 'Class Code' (page 40, line 12) all seem to be used interchangeably.]

SuggestedRemedy

I believe 'system class' is the correct term as Table 104-1 defines more than just power, and while there can be a power associated with a system class, there are other parameters associated with a system class. Please update text as required.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editor to replace all instances of 'system power Class' and 'Class Code' with 'system class'.

Cl 104 SC 104.2 P 39 L 34 # i-89
 Stover, David Linear Technology

Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez

There is no 48V unregulated power class

SuggestedRemedy

Change the last part of the sentence to "and 48V regulated system power classes"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

: P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

Cl 104 SC 104.2 P 39 L 34 # i-160
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 The term "system power classes" is not used in Table 104-1. I recommend using consistent terminology.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "system power classes" with "system classes".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.3 P 40 L 18 # i-161
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D ez
 AB: In Table 104-1, the numeric entry "1360" does not comply with the IEEE 802 .3 numeric formatting convention.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to "1 360" (i.e. add a space between "1" and "3")
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.3 P 40 L 21 # i-90
 Stover, David Linear Technology
 Comment Type T Comment Status D ez
 Table 104-3 indicates P_Class (PSE sourced power) is defined in Table 104-1; it is not.
 SuggestedRemedy
 In Table 104-1, add P_Class and populate the values in the table (TFTD). Also, change all references of P_PD to P_Class_PD.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Editor to add row to Table 104-1 for P_Class and populate with PPSE max. PPSE max is the product of VPSE min and IPI max. For example in Class 5 the power sourced at the PSE PI is 11.7V X 0.339A = 3.97W.
 No change to P_PD.

Cl 104 SC 104.3 P 40 L 25 # i-162
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez
 The word "guaranteed" seems to be an inappropriate term to include in an international standard. It suggests a warranty or promise. In addition, this term is referred to in another section as "maximum average power", which I think is a better term.
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace "guaranteed" with "maximum average".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4 P 40 L 34 # i-163
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 some minor editorial suggestions are warranted.
 SuggestedRemedy
 item b) replace "the detected" with "a detected"
 item c) replace " power on the" with "power applied to a"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4 P 40 L 36 # i-123
 Zimmerman, George Commscope and Line
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez
 Here's why explanatory text gets you into trouble... If one of the main function sof the PSE is to monitor the power, I assume a main function is also to remove power in case of an overload, short circuit or other fault. (also, the sentence doesn't have a period at the end)
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "To remove the operating voltage when no longer required or when transitioning to the SLEEP state" to "To remove the operating voltage when no longer required, when transition to the SLEEP state, or when a short-circuit or other fault is detected."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

: P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.1 P 41 L 3 # i-164
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez

I see an inconsistent use of the term "full voltage" or "operating voltage" in the text when "full operating voltage" has a clear meaning. Other operating voltages for instance include Vsleep.

SuggestedRemedy

replace "Prior to application of operating voltage" with "Prior to application of full operating voltage"
 search & replace for other instances of "operating voltage" and "full voltage" and replace to ensure consistency.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.1 P 41 L 11 # i-124
 Zimmerman, George Commscope and Line

Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez

It is important to say that the state diagram monitors the current draw as well and removes power in case of a fault.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert new paragraph at end of 104.4.3.1 before 104.4.3.2 "Additionally, while operating voltage is applied, the PSE monitors the current drawn and removes power if it detects an overload, short-circuit or other fault."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.3 P 41 L 22 # i-125
 Zimmerman, George Commscope and Line

Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez

there is no "idle sequence" defined in the text or diagram, but there is an "idle state".

SuggestedRemedy

change "since the last idle sequence" to "since the last entry to the IDLE state", make change on P41 L22 and L24 ; P42 L6 and L11

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.3 P 41 L 23 # i-165
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez

A required term is missing.

SuggestedRemedy

replace "result of a valid 22 signature being detected or the tdet_timer timing out." with "result of a valid signature being detected, an invalid signature being detected, or the tdet_timer timing out." in both the TRUE and FALSE definitions.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.3 P 41 L 29 # i-166
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type G Comment Status D ez

Super-Nit-Picky - The "information byte" is not a technically correct term given that the information is a word (16 bits)?!

SuggestedRemedy

delete "-byte". I think the sentence stands that way.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.3 P 41 L 41 # i-167
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

There is a reference on the TRUE description, but lacking on the FALSE description?

SuggestedRemedy

add a reference "(see 104.4.6.2.3)"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.3 P 41 L 45 # i-168
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 missing space
 SuggestedRemedy
 insert a space between " FALSE:" and "the"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.3 P 42 L 23 # i-170
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez
 The term "PSE is sleeping" is vague.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "PSE is sleeping" with "PSE is in the SLEEP state".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.3 P 42 L 16 # i-169
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez
 I believe that a change to terminology is required.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "short circuit" with "overload".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.3 P 42 L 27 # i-171
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 Super-Nit-Picky - A PSE performs classification AT the PI, not through it. The PI is a point on a line. The channel/link-segment is a line.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "through" with "at" in both definitions.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.3 P 42 L 22 # i-126
 Zimmerman, George Commscope and Line
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 Definition of overload_held simply says "latched", not giving any indication when it is released, and isn't in normal TRUE/FALSE style.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "Latched high version of overload_detected" to describe both TRUE and FALSE values as "overload_detected has been TRUE/FALSE since last entry to the IDLE state."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.3 P 43 L 23 # i-172
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez
 An odd sentence/structure "the device that contains the PSE overall state diagrams".. I think the issue is "contains". A page contains the state diagrams. A device implements the state diagrams.. or state machines based upon the state diagrams.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "contains" with "implements".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.3 P 43 L 28 # i-91
 Stover, David Linear Technology
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** ez
 No DO_DETECTION state in PSE state diagram, but it is referenced here.
SuggestedRemedy
 Change both references to "DO_DETECTION" with "DETECTION".
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.3 P 43 L 28 # i-92
 Stover, David Linear Technology
 Comment Type **T** Comment Status **D** ez
 V_good, a PD parameter, is referenced here. I believe V_good_PSE is the intended reference.
SuggestedRemedy
 Change both references to "V_good" with "V_good_PSE".
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.3 P 43 L 52 # i-93
 Stover, David Linear Technology
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** ez
 TLIM_timer is not mentioned in the state diagram
SuggestedRemedy
 T_LIM is the time duration used to derive the short circuit (overload) condition which in turn decides the state of the variable overload_detected. The variable overload_detected is used in the state diagram. Thus the description of TLIM_timer should be removed from the Timers section (104.4.3.4).
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.4 P 43 L 31 # i-33
 Stover, David Linear Technology
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** ez
 Timers do not reference the symbol of the specific parameter to which they refer. In some cases (e.g., tod_timer), the intended symbol is never referenced elsewhere in the document.

SuggestedRemedy
 Modify Table references in all PSE timer definitions to include the specific symbol of the parameter to which they refer. For example, modify tod_timer definition as follows:
 "A timer used to regulate a subsequent attempt to power a PD after an overload condition that causes a fault; see T_od in Table 104-3."

Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Editor to add symbols next to Table cross references in all timer definitions in PSE subclause.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.4 P 43 L 36 # i-231
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** ez
 ROGUE: tclass should read tClass, according to Table 104-3
SuggestedRemedy
 Replace tclass with tClass
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.4 P 43 L 46 # i-232
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** ez
 ROGUE: tinrush should read tInrush, according to Table 104-3
SuggestedRemedy
 Replace tinrush with tInrush
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.4 P 43 L 49 # i-233
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 ROGUE: tmfvdo should read tMFVDO, according to Table 104-3
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace tmfvdo with tMFVDO
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.4 P 44 L 1 # i-234
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 ROGUE: toff should read tOFF, according to Table 104-3
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace toff with tOFF
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Editor to replace all instances of toff with tOff.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.4 P 44 L 6 # i-235
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 ROGUE: trestart should read tRestart according to Table 104-3
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace trestart with tRestart
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.6 P 45 L 28 # i-173
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D ez
 AB: The far left transition from DETECTION_EVAL to POWER_UP is missing an arrow head
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add an arrow head to this transition.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

The arrow head was replaced when the PSE SD was redrawn in Framemaker native format for D3.0.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.4 P 47 L 4 # i-175
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez
 The sentence doesn't clarify WHEN detection takes place.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Insert "When in the DETECTION state," prior to "The PSE shall..."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.4 P 47 L 28 # i-176
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 The values of 4.05 and 5.15 in the table are of the wrong font/style
 SuggestedRemedy
 Correct the font/style.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

Cl 104 SC 104.4.5 P 48 L 9 # i-16
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

"Table 104-3" should be a cross-reference:
 Page 48 line 9, Page 50, line 33
 "Table 104-6" should be a cross-reference:
 Page 59 lines 10 and 13
 "Table 104-2" should be a cross-reference:
 Page 71 line 12

SuggestedRemedy

Make "Table 104-3" a cross-reference:
 Page 48 line 9, Page 50, line 33
 Make "Table 104-6" a cross-reference:
 Page 59 lines 10 and 13
 Make "Table 104-2" a cross-reference:
 Page 71 line 12

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6 P 48 L 34 # i-29
 Stover, David Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

"Output voltage dV/dt" parameter is used in the draft but the symbol "|dV_PSE/dt|" is never referenced.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove unused symbol "|dV_PSE/dt|"

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6 P 48 L 34 # i-177
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez

Output Voltage dv/dt is an inaccurate parameter name.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "Output Voltage dv/dt" with "Output Slew Rate (dv/dt)"

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6 P 48 L 44 # i-178
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez

Item 5 Maximum value refers to a non-existent parameter IPI_Class(max).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "IPI_Class(max)" with "IPI(max)"

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6 P 48 L 49 # i-30
 Stover, David Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

Mixed case usage in draft, "T_Inrush" and "T_inrush". "T_Inrush" is the defined symbol.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace all instances of "T_inrush" with "T_Inrush".

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6 P 49 L 6 # i-31
 Stover, David Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

Mixed case usage in draft, "T_OFF" and "T_Off". "T_OFF" is the defined symbol.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace all instances of "T_Off" with "T_OFF".

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

: P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6 P 49 L 8 # i-32
 Stover, David Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 Mixed case usage in draft, "V_Sleep", "V_Sleep_PD" and "V_sleep", "V_sleep_PD".
 "V_Sleep" and "V_Sleep_PD" are the defined symbols.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace all instances of "V_sleep" and "V_sleep_PD" with "V_Sleep" and "V_Sleep_PD",
 respectively.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6 P 49 L 14 # i-34
 Stover, David Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 Mixed case usage in draft, "T_Restart" and "T_restart". "T_Restart" is the defined symbol.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace all instances of "T_restart" with "T_Restart".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6 P 49 L 22 # i-35
 Stover, David Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 Mixed case usage in draft, "I_Wakeup" and "I_wakeup". "I_Wakeup" is the defined symbol.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace all instances of "I_wakeup" with "I_Wakeup".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6 P 49 L 27 # i-36
 Stover, David Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 Mixed case usage in draft, "I_wakeup_bad_hi" and "I_Wakeup_bad_hi".
 "I_wakeup_bad_hi" is the defined symbol.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace all instances of "I_Wakeup_bad_hi" with "I_wakeup_bad_hi".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6.1 P 49 L 44 # i-179
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez
 In this subclause, there are multiple instances of "SLEEP_SETTLE" referring to the
 "SETTLE_SLEEP" state.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Do a Search & Replace "SLEEP_SETTLE" with "SETTLE_SLEEP" throughout the
 document.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6.1 P 49 L 44 # i-99
 Stover, David Linear Technology
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D ez
 PSE states SETTLE_SLEEP is referred as SLEEP_SETTLE in error in a few places in the
 document
 SuggestedRemedy
 Do a global search-and-replace of SLEEP_SETTLE to SETTLE_SLEEP
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6.2 P 50 L 1 # i-37
 Stover, David Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 "I_inrush is the PSE output current during the POWER_UP state". The symbol "I_inrush" is defined here, but never used anywhere in the draft. This sentence is purely explanatory, and has no purpose when the symbol is not used.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Strike the aforementioned sentence from the draft.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6.2.1 P 50 L 4 # i-180
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez
 The name of this subclause is inaccurate.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "short circuit" with "overload".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6.2.1 P 50 L 7 # i-23
 Nikolich, Paul IEEE member / Self E
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 The "Table 104-3" instance in this line has a link to the Table (which is a useful feature, but the other instances of "Table 104-3" in the document don't have the link.
 Why are the instances of "Table 104-3" treated differently?
 As a side note, it appears that the instance of "Table 104-3" with the link is not searchable using the PDF search function.
 SuggestedRemedy
 With respect to linking instances of "Table 104-3", please make them consistent.
 Either do it for all of them or none of them. Your choice.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Editor will link all instances of Table 104-3. Editor to check all cross references and correct linkages as necessary.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6.2.1 P 50 L 9 # i-100
 Stover, David Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 I_PORT is same as current sourced by PSE
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change I_PORT to I_PSE globally
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6.2.1 P 50 L 15 # i-181
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type T Comment Status D ez
 This subclause does not provide direction on how the PSE sets the Overload_Detected variable to TRUE, and that makes the State Diagram more difficult to implement.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "If the PSE is limiting current in the POWER_UP state, POWER_ON state, or any state when VSleep is 15 applied at the PI, power removal from the PI shall begin within TLIM of the initiation of current limiting." with "If the PSE is limiting current in any state when pi_powered, pi_sleeping or pi_prebias are true, within TLIM of the initiation of current limiting, Overload_Detect is set true and power removal from the PI shall begin."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6.2.2 P 50 L 28 # i-38
 Stover, David Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 When referencing "min" and "max" corners of symbols, "min" and "max" should not be subscript.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove subscript formatting from "min" and "max" on this line.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

: P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6.3 P 50 L 46 # i-182
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type ER Comment Status D ez
 AB: The first usage of the term "DUT" is not defined.

SuggestedRemedy

Based on similar instances in 802.3-2015, change the first instance of "DUT" to "device under test (DUT)".

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6.3 P 50 L 48 # i-183
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez
 There are descriptions of requirements for Type A and Type B PSEs, but not for Type C.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "Type A" with "Type A or Type C"

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6.5 P 52 L 2 # i-184
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 The term "cleared" is not consistent with the logic definitions.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "cleared" with "set to FALSE".

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.7 P 52 L 15 # i-185
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez
 The organization of this sentence is not optimal, and lacking some required logic.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "Operating voltage shall be removed from the PSE PI in the absence of the PD MFVS while the PSE is operating in the POWER_ON state." with "While the PSE is operating in the POWER_ON state, full operating voltage shall be removed from the PSE PI in the absence of the PD MFVS or if Overload_Detected is true."

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.7 P 52 L 32 # i-187
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez
 Missing condition

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "in the PD detection algorithm." with "in the PD detection or classification algorithms."

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.5.3.1 P 53 L 10 # i-39
 Stover, David Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 Symbol reference to "t_powerdly", which does not exist. The defined symbol is "T_power_dly".

SuggestedRemedy

Replace reference to "t_powerdly" with "T_power_dly"

Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

: P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

CI 104 SC 104.5.3.1 P 53 L 11 # i-188
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 the statement "enable MDI power" is not clear
 SuggestedRemedy
 Insert "to the load" after "MDI power".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.5.3.1 P 53 L 35 # i-189
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 application of "power" is inconsistent with the actual function.
 SuggestedRemedy
 I believe this should say "application of full operating voltage". Note, other instances of "operating voltage" on this page should be caught with the S&R in my earlier comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.5.3.3 P 53 L 21 # i-130
 Zimmerman, George Commscope and Line
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 "Disconnect_PD" - normal style is not to capitalize variable names of this sort (voltages like "V_PD" are an exception).
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change Disconnect_PD to "disconnect_pd" on P53 L21 and Figure 104-8
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.5.3.3 P 53 L 50 # i-190
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type T Comment Status D ez
 Suggest that '... wakeup signature current is to be applied ...' should be changed to read '... wakeup signature is to be applied ...'.
 SuggestedRemedy
 See comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.5.3.3 P 53 L 50 # i-85
 Law, David Hewlett Packard Enter
 Comment Type T Comment Status D ez
 Suggest that '... wakeup signature current is to be applied ...' should be changed to read '... wakeup signature is to be applied ...'.
 SuggestedRemedy
 See comment.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.5.3.3 P 54 L 2 # i-191
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 when referencing the "wakeup signature current" I think it would be helpful to reference the actual parameter lwakeup_PD
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace "wakeup signature current" with "wakeup signature current (lwakeup_PD)"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

: P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

Cl 104 SC 104.5.3.3 P 54 L 19 # i-192
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez
 Missing Variable/Term
 SuggestedRemedy
 Vpd is referred to in multiple locations, but never defined. Add "Vpd The voltage measured at the PI interface of the PD".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.5.3.4 P 54 L 30 # i-43
 Stover, David Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 Timers do not reference the symbol of the specific parameter to which they refer. In some cases (e.g., sccp_watchdog_timer), the intended symbol (T_SCCP_watchdog) is never referenced elsewhere in the document.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add/Modify Table references in all PD timer definitions to include the specific symbol of the parameter to which they refer. For example, modify sccp_watchdog_timer definition as follows:
 "A timer used to limit the time in the DO_CLASSIFICATION state in the event serial communication between the PSE and PD is idle or stalled; see T_SCCP_watchdog in Table 104-6."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editor to add timer symbols next to Table 104-6 cross references for all timers defined in PD subclause.

Cl 104 SC 104.5.3.4 P 54 L 36 # i-40
 Stover, David Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 Timer name "tpowerdly_timer" could be made to better reflect parameter symbol.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace all instances of "tpowerdly_timer" in 104.5.3 with "tpower_dly_timer".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.5.4 P 55 L 45 # i-194
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 The text says "A valid PD detection signature shall have the characteristics of Table 104-4." which is ambiguous. Does it mean "all of the characteristics" or "at least one"?
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace with "A valid PD detection signature shall have all of the characteristics of Table 104-4."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.5.4 P 55 L 49 # i-66
 Law, David Hewlett Packard Enter
 Comment Type T Comment Status D ez
 While it is correct that 'A PD that presents a signature within the limits set out in Table 104-4 is assured to pass detection.', it may however be prudent to add that it may not necessarily be powered due to the PSE not having sufficient available power (transition from CLASSIFICATION_EVAL to RESTART due to !power_available).
 SuggestedRemedy
 Suggest the text '... pass detection.' be changed to read '... pass detection, although may not necessarily be powered due to the PSE being unable to source the required power.'
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED REJECT.
 While the explanatory text is useful, it is inappropriate because it describes PSE behaviour. See 104.4.4.

Cl 104 SC 104.5.4 P 56 L 1 # i-67
 Law, David Hewlett Packard Enter
 Comment Type T Comment Status D ez
 Subclause 104.1.2 'Relationship of PoDL to the IEEE 802.3 architecture' states that 'The Power Interface (PI) is the generic term that refers to the mechanical and electrical interface between the PSE or PD and the transmission medium.'. Based on this suggest the term 'PI' should be used rather than 'connector' when referencing a measurement point.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Suggest that that text '... measured at PD connector' should be changed to read '... measured at PD PI' here and on line 12 as well.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

: P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

Cl 104 SC 104.5.4 P 56 L 1 # i-196
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type T Comment Status D ez

Subclause 104.1.2 'Relationship of PoDL to the IEEE 802.3 architecture' states that 'The Power Interface (PI) is the generic term that refers to the mechanical and electrical interface between the PSE or PD and the transmission medium.'. Based on this suggest the term 'PI' should be used rather than 'connector' when referencing a measurement point.

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest that that text '... measured at PD connector' should be changed to read '... measured at PD PI' here and on line 12 as well.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.5.6 P 57 L 6 # i-197
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type T Comment Status D ez

Subclause 104.5.6.1 'PD input voltage' states that 'The PD shall remain off until the input voltage reaches a value in the range of VOn, as specified in Table 104-6, after a delay greater than Tpower_dly.'. For the case of a 12 V unregulated PSE 104-6 however lists Von max as 5.75 V (item 4a).

Subclause 104.5.6.1 however also states that 'The PD shall turn on or off without startup oscillation and within the first trial when a voltage in the range of VPSE (as defined in Table 104-1) is applied with a series resistance within the range of valid channel resistance.'. For the case of a 12 V unregulated PSE Table 104-1 lists VPSE(min) for a Class code 0 PSE as 5.6 V.

Based on the above it appears that a conformant class code 0 PD need not turn on until 5.75 V (Von max), yet Subclause 104.5.6.1 requires that it turn on when a PSE supplies 5.6 V through a series resistance within the range of valid channel resistance.

SuggestedRemedy

Please verify the respective values.

Proposed Response Response Status Z

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Duplicate comment with i-68. Remedy as per remedy for comment i-68.

Cl 104 SC 104.5.6 P 57 L 6 # i-41
 Stover, David Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

Mixed case usage in draft, "V_On" and "V_ON". "V_On" is the defined symbol.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace all instances of "V_ON" with "V_On".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.5.6 P 57 L 30 # i-17
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

The IEEE style manual says "Dashes should never be used because they can be misconstrued as subtraction signs."

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Classes 1-3 and 5-9" to "Classes 1 to 3 and 5 to 9"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.5.6 P 57 L 44 # i-70
 Law, David Hewlett Packard Enter

Comment Type T Comment Status D ez

There is no SLEEP and WAKEUP states that I can see in the PD state diagram.

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest that 'Power supply voltage during SLEEP and WAKEUP states' should be changed to read 'Power supply voltage during PD_SLEEP state'.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

Cl 104 SC 104.5.6 P 57 L 44 # i-199
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type T Comment Status D ez

DL: There is no SLEEP and WAKEUP states that I can see in the PD state diagram.

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest that 'Power supply voltage during SLEEP and WAKEUP states' should be changed to read 'Power supply voltage during PD_SLEEP state'.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.5.6 P 58 L 11 # i-18
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

The IEEE style manual says "An em dash (--) should be used to indicate the lack of data for a particular cell in a table."

SuggestedRemedy

Insert an em dash (Ctrl-q Shft-q) in Table 104-6, Item 13, Min column and Table 104-7, Item 4, Min column

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.5.6.1 P 58 L 22 # i-200
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez

The structure of this sentence is not optimum and lacks some specific technical content.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "The PD shall remain off until the input voltage reaches a value in the range of VOn, as specified in Table 104-6, after a delay greater than Tpower_dly. " with "The PD shall remain off for a time greater than Tpower_dly after the input voltage (Vpd) reaches a value in the range of VOn, as specified in Table 104-6." Add "When the input voltage is greater than vsig_disable, then the signature is disabled."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.5.6.1 P 58 L 28 # i-201
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type T Comment Status D ez

DL: Subclause 104.5.6.1 'PD input voltage' requires that a voltage '... is applied with a series resistance within the range of valid channel resistance. While I see that subclause 104.2 'Link segment' defines a maximum DC loop resistance, I'm not able to find a definition of the 'valid channel resistance'.

SuggestedRemedy

Please add a cross reference to the subclause where valid channel resistance is defined.

Proposed Response Response Status Z

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Duplicate comment with i-68. Adopt remedy as per remedy for comment i-68:

The values are correct. Since the open-circuit VPSE min for class 0 is 6V, the PD is assured of being able to turn on if its Von max is 5.75V. After the PD is drawing power from the PI, the VPSE may drop to as low as 5.6V and VPD may drop as low as 4.94V. The PD Voff min of 3.6V ensures that the PD will remain on.

Cl 104 SC 104.5.6.2 P 58 L 40 # i-103
 Stover, David Linear Technology

Comment Type ER Comment Status D ez

V_Sleep max refers to the PD voltage

SuggestedRemedy

"...when V_PD is within the range of V_Sleep_PD"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.5.6.3 P 58 L 47 # i-202
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

Missing term

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "to the voltage at the PD PI" with "to the voltage or current at the PD PI"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

CI 104 SC 104.5.6.3 P 59 L 11 # i-236
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 ROGUE: No PICS entry for this shall
 SuggestedRemedy
 PICS editor to create entry for this shall
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Editor to add new entry to PICs table per input provided by PICS editor.

CI 104 SC 104.5.6.3 P 59 L 14 # i-237
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 ROGUE: No PICS entry for this shall
 SuggestedRemedy
 PICS editor to create entry for this shall
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Editor to add new entry to PICs table per input provided by PICS editor.

CI 104 SC 104.5.6.5 P 59 L 46 # i-203
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 The structure of this sentence is not optimum and lacks specifics.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace the sentence with "When any voltage between VPSE min and VPSE max (with Rloop_max in series) is applied to the PI of the PD, PPD is defined as shown in Equation (104-5);
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.5.7 P 60 L 9 # i-204
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez
 Missing information
 SuggestedRemedy
 Insert "signal the PSE to" between the words "In order to... and ... maintain full operating voltage". Note, delete "input" also.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.5.7 P 60 L 12 # i-205
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez
 extra word, missing details
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace "full input operating voltage shall" with "full operating voltage at the PI shall"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 104 SC 104.6.1 P 60 L 20 # i-206
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez
 The requirement of a test voltage of greater than 5V does not prohibit or exclude 1,000,000 volts for the requirement.
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace "using at least a 5V source voltage." with "using a 5V+- 20% source voltage."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

Cl 104 SC 104.6.2 P 60 L 30 # i-19
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 IEEE does not precede references to other subclauses with "sub-clause"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "in sub-clause 104.4" to "in 104.4" here and on Page 75, line 47
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.6.3.1.1 P 60 L 47 # i-210
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez
 I believe this spec should apply to Type A or Type C
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "Type A" with "Type A or Type C"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.6.3.2 P 61 L 24 # i-211
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez
 The spec doesn't articulate whether it applies only to Type A, Type A and Type C
 SuggestedRemedy
 Insert "Type A and Type C" before "MDI Return Loss" in the title of the subclause. Also replace "Type A" with "Type A or Type C" in the text.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.6.3.2 P 61 L 28 # i-20
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 "in clause 96" should be "in Clause 96" where the word "Clause" is in forest green
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "in clause 96" to "in Clause 96" where the word "Clause" is in forest green
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.6.3.2 P 61 L 29 # i-131
 Zimmerman, George Commscope and Line
 Comment Type T Comment Status D ez
 "Type A (100BASE-T1)..." shouldn't this requirement also apply to Type C (100BASE-T1 and 1000BASE-T1)?
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change Type A to "Type A and Type C"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.6.3.2 P 62 L 11 # i-21
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation
 Comment Type T Comment Status D ez
 In Figure 104-11:
 The title "Return loss calculated using Equation (104-3)" should be "Return loss calculated using Equation (104-6)" where "Equation (104-6)" is a cross-reference.
 "frequency (Mhz)" should be "Frequency (MHz)"
 "dB" should be "Return loss (dB)"
 SuggestedRemedy
 In Figure 104-11, change:
 The title "Return loss calculated using Equation (104-3)" to "Return loss calculated using Equation (104-6)" where "Equation (104-6)" is a cross-reference.
 "frequency (Mhz)" to "Frequency (MHz)"
 "dB" to "Return loss (dB)"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.7 P 63 L 21 # i-44
 Stover, David Linear Technology
 Comment Type E Comment Status D ez
 "SCCP is a current-sinking, wire-OR..." I believe the correct term is, "wired-OR".
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "wire-OR" with "wired-OR".
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

Cl 104 SC 104.7.1.1 P 63 L 35 # i-212 ez
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

Figure 104-12 is out of place. It should be dropped below the first sentence in 104.7.1.1 to allow the reader to read the description and look at the figure simultaneously.

SuggestedRemedy

Move the figure per the comment.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.7.1.1 P 63 L 37 # i-213 ez
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

Semantic improvement required. See remedy.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "the PSE shall transmit the reset pulse by first pulling VPSE low and then pull-up at tRSTL. The PSE shall then go into receive mode (RX)." with "the PSE shall transmit the reset pulse by first *driving* VPSE low and then releasing to the pull-up at tRSTL. The PSE shall then go into receive mode (RX)."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.7.1.2 P 63 L 53 # i-45 ez
 Stover, David Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

"...during a write 1 or write 0 operation." Capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

"...during a Write 1 or Write 0 operation."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.7.1.4 P 64 L 4 # i-46 ez
 Stover, David Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ez

"All voltages are referenced to the PI minus terminal" seems strange. The only instance of definition I've found is Figure 104-3, which depicts "PI".

SuggestedRemedy

"All voltages are referenced to PI- as shown in Figure 104-3."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.7.2.4 P 67 L 5 # i-22 ez
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type T Comment Status D ez

In Table 104-8, alternative values are given for b[15:12] and b[9:0]. However it is not clear which bits correspond to which columns

SuggestedRemedy

Remove "Type:" and replace it with the bit number for each column (space the columns out by adding spaces as in Table 45-77).
 Remove "Class:" and replace it with the bit number for each column (space the columns out by adding spaces).

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.8 P 69 L 1 # i-224 ez
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology

Comment Type TR Comment Status D ez

PICs need to be updated.

SuggestedRemedy

Update PICs as needed.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editor to add new entry to PICs table per input provided by PICS editor. Editor to provide complete list of PICs changed in his proposed response.

: P802.3bu D3.0 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet Initial Sponsor ballot com

Cl Intro **SC Intro** **P 17** **L 8** # **i-137**
Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **ez**

The title of the amendment is not explicitly defined to support "twisted" pair despite alignment with PHY projects that only support twisted-pair.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "Single Balanced Pair Ethernet" with "Single Balanced Twisted Pair Ethernet".

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl na **SC na** **P 1** **L 15** # **i-133**
Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **ez**

The title of the amendment is not explicitly defined to support "twisted" pair despite alignment with PHY projects that only support twisted-pair.

SuggestedRemedy

Revise the title, and do S&R through document to replace "Single Balanced Pair Ethernet" with "Single Balanced Twisted Pair Ethernet". Also search for "Balanced Pair" and replace with "Balanced Twisted Pair" and search for "pair" and replace with "twisted pair" where appropriate

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl na **SC na** **P 9** **L 3** # **i-134**
Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** **ez**

I presume the list of sponsor ballot participants will be given to the editor and included in D3.1

SuggestedRemedy

Please include Sponsor Ballot participants

Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.