

2.3bu D3.1 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet 1st Sponsor recirculation ballot

Cl FM SC FM P 13 L 34 # r01-1
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation
Comment Type E Comment Status D ezbucket
 The em-dash between the amendment number and "This" should not be preceded or followed by a space.
 "Amendment 3--This" is shown correctly. Amendments 4 through 8 are not.
SuggestedRemedy
 Remove the spaces around the em-dashes in Amendments 4 through 8.
Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 1 SC 1.4.415 P 20 L 36 # r01-3
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation
Comment Type E Comment Status D ezbucket
 Comment i-3 was ACCEPT but the part:
 In 1.4.415, change "IEEE 802.3" to IEEE Std 802.3" has not been implemented.
SuggestedRemedy
 In 1.4.415, change "IEEE 802.3" to IEEE Std 802.3"
Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl FM SC FM P 19 L 8 # r01-8
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
Comment Type E Comment Status D ezbucket
 In the title "Single Balanced Twisted Pair Ethernet" does not hyphenate Twisted-Pair despite the fact its descriptive of the type of wire.
SuggestedRemedy
 Search/Replace "Twisted Pair" with "Twisted-Pair" where appropriate.
 P12L9,P19L8,P27L48, P37L51, P38L5, P41L1, P73L2, P73L8, P73L37, P74L27
Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Cl 30 SC 30.2.5 P 25 L 13 # r01-4
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation
Comment Type E Comment Status D ezbucket
 the cross-reference to "Table 30-10" should be underlined and the "." at the end of the sentence is missing.
SuggestedRemedy
 Underline "Table 30-10" and add the "."
Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Editor given editorial license to implement suggested remedy.

Cl 1 SC 1.4.338 P 20 L 29 # r01-2
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation
Comment Type E Comment Status D ezbucket
 the cross-reference to "Clause 104" should be underlined.
SuggestedRemedy
 Underline "Clause 104"
Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.15.1.1.9 P 29 L 54 # r01-5
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation
Comment Type E Comment Status D ezbucket
 A ";" has been added after "(see 104.4.3.3)." but this is not the end of the BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS: section (which is on the next page).
SuggestedRemedy
 Change "(see 104.4.3.3).;" to "(see 104.4.3.3)."
Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

2.3bu D3.1 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet 1st Sponsor recirculation ballot

Cl 30 SC **30.15.1.2.1** P **31** L **14** # **r01-38**
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** ezbucket
 The symbol 'aPoDLPSEAdminControl' is associated with an action, so the proper symbol prefix is 'ac' instead of 'a'.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change 'aPoDLPSEAdminControl' to 'acPoDLPSEAdminControl' in 30.15.1.2.1 and globally.
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Editor given editorial license to implement suggested remedy.

Cl 45 SC **45.2.7b.3** P **37** L **20** # **r01-10**
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** ezbucket
 The table is not technically correct in the fact that "1xx" is reserved, but "111" (which falls into the set of 1xx) is not reserved. I think it would be accurate to replace "1xx = Reserved" with two lines that explicitly show reserved values.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "1xx = Reserved" with "110 = Reserved, 10x = Reserved" in the table and include that information in the explanatory text by adding "Values of '10x' and '110' are reserved." to the end of the paragraph in 45.2.7b.3.2
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC **104.3** P **44** L **18** # **r01-18**
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** ezbucket
 Pclass for Class 4 is incorrect (must've been a typo by the editor).
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change Pclass value for Class 4 from 11.4W to 1.14W.
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC **104.4.3.1** P **45** L **21** # **r01-19**
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology
 Comment Type **T** Comment Status **D** ezbucket
 The text "Additionally, while full operating voltage is applied, the PSE monitors the current drawn and removes power if it detects an overload, short-circuit or other fault." implies that the PSE may not monitor current drawn when applying a voltage other than the full operating voltage which is not the case.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change text to read "Additionally, while voltage is applied, the PSE monitors the current drawn and removes power if it detects an overload, short-circuit or other fault."
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC **104.4.3.3** P **45** L **28** # **r01-11**
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** ezbucket
 typo
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace "a" with "an" in both sentences in this definition.
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Comment refers to overload_detected on page 46, line 28. Change to:
 "overload_detected
 TRUE: The PSE has detected an overload condition (see 104.4.6.2.1).
 FALSE: The PSE has not detected an overload condition."

Cl 104 SC **104.4.3.3** P **46** L **6** # **r01-22**
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** ezbucket
 The cross reference in the definition of MFVS_valid is incorrect.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change 104.4.7 to 104.4.7.1.
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

2.3bu D3.1 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet 1st Sponsor recirculation ballot

Cl 104 SC 104.4.3.3 P 48 L 12 # r01-24
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology
Comment Type ER Comment Status D ezbucket
 The text "12V unreg" in the row header for PD Classes 2 and 3 should be "12V reg"
SuggestedRemedy
 See comment
Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.5 P 53 L 6 # r01-12
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
Comment Type T Comment Status D ezbucket
 Duplication of information. It would be better to point to the correct text in 104.7
SuggestedRemedy
 Delete "Implementation of SCCP by a PSE is also optional." and replace with "See 104.7."
Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.5 P 53 L 9 # r01-25
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology
Comment Type E Comment Status D ezbucket
 Cross reference to Table 104-3 for Tclass is incorrect.
SuggestedRemedy
 Change cross reference to Table 104-4.
Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6 P 53 L 37 # r01-27
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology
Comment Type E Comment Status D ezbucket
 Cross references for items 3 and 4 in Table 104-4 are to Equation 104-1, but should be to subclause 104.4.6.3.
SuggestedRemedy
 Change the cross references for items 3 and 4 in Table 104-4 from Equation 104-1 to 104.4.6.3.
Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6 P 54 L 14 # r01-40
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology
Comment Type E Comment Status D ezbucket
 Font size for 'Overload delay timing' may be one point too big relative to other text in Table 104-4.
SuggestedRemedy
 Correct font size to be consistent with rest of Table 104-4.
Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Editor given editorial license to implement suggested remedy.

Cl 104 SC 104.4.6 P 54 L 43 # r01-30
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology
Comment Type E Comment Status D ezbucket
 The cross reference to 104.4.6.7 for item 22, Disable time, is incorrect.
SuggestedRemedy
 Change the cross reference for item 22 from 104.4.6.7 to 104.4.6.6.
Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

2.3bu D3.1 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet 1st Sponsor recirculation ballot

Cl 104 **SC 104.4.6.2.3** **P 55** **L 44** # **r01-31**
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology
Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** ezbucket
 The cross reference to Table 104-3 for TWakeup min is incorrect.
SuggestedRemedy
 Change the cross reference from Table 104-3 to Table 104-4.
Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 **SC 104.5.6** **P 62** **L 17** # **r01-33**
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology
Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** ezbucket
 Min values entries for items 4a-4e in Table 104-7 are not specified and should an em-dash.
SuggestedRemedy
 Add em-dash to min value fields for items 4a-4e in Table 104-7.
Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 **SC 104.5.6** **P 62** **L 41** # **r01-43**
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology
Comment Type **TR** **Comment Status** **D** ezbucket
 Given the new PSE detection criteria in Table 104-3 and the definition of a valid PD with a bad high signature, the absence of a minimum PD input capacitance value during detection in Table 104-5 or 104-7 may be problematic for PSE implementers.
SuggestedRemedy
 A complete remedy will be proposed in presentation gardner_3bu_01_0916.pdf at the meeting in Fort Worth.
Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**
 TFTD after presentation of gardner_3bu_01_0916.pdf

Cl 104 **SC 104.5.6.1** **P 61** **L 50** # **r01-32**
 Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology
Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** ezbucket
 Clause 104.5.6.1 text is split before and after Table 104-7, but Table 104-7 is part of 104.5.6.
SuggestedRemedy
 Move the start of 104.5.6.1 after Table 104-7.
Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editor given editorial license to implement suggested remedy.
Cl 104 **SC 104.7.1.3** **P 68** **L 4** # **r01-13**
 Dove, Daniel Linear Technology
Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** ezbucket
 Typo
SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "PI-as" with "PI- as"; ie; insert a space between "PI-" and the word "as".
Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 **SC 104.8.5** **P 72** **L 15** # **r01-6**
 Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation
Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **D** ezbucket
 "a 100 source resistance" should be "a 100 omega source resistance" and 56 Vdc should not split across lines.
SuggestedRemedy
 change "a 100 source resistance" to "a 100 omega source resistance" [where "omega" is a capital omega] and make the space in 56 Vdc non-breaking (Ctrl-space).
Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

2.3bu D3.1 Power over Datalines (PoDL) of Single Balanced Pair Ethernet 1st Sponsor recirculation ballot

Cl 104 SC 104.8.5 P 72 L 20 # r01-37
Gardner, Andrew Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ezbucket
Typo in last paragraph of 104.8.5.

SuggestedRemedy

Change text in 104.8.5 from:

"...shall not result preclude ..."

to:

"...shall not preclude..."

Proposed Response Response Status Z

PROPOSED REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Cl 104 SC 104.8.5 P 72 L 20 # r01-7
Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type E Comment Status D ezbucket
"shall not result preclude conformance" doesn't make sense.
104.8.1 and 104.8.2 should be cross-references.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "shall not result preclude conformance" to "shall not result in non-conformance"
Make 104.8.1 and 104.8.2 cross-references.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 104 SC 104.9.8 P 81 L 27 # r01-15
Dove, Daniel Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D ezbucket
Typo

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "s" with "a", as in "classified as a Limited Power Source".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Comment refers to item ENV3 in sub-clause 104.9.4.8. Change Value/Comment field to:
"To be classified as Limited Power Source in accordance with IEC 60950-1"