

Please configure project comments

CI 104 SC 104.3.1 P 16 L 22 # 1 [REDACTED]  
 D'Ambrosia, John Dell

Comment Type ER Comment Status D  
 Per 104.3.1 - "there are two types of PSEs:...." However, Section 1.4 already defines two types of PSEs, see 1.4.403 and 1.4.405. Further clarification is needed to prevent reader confusion.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Add simple intro  
 "For PoDL system types, there are...."

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

CI 104 SC 104.3.3.4 P 17 L 24 # 36 [REDACTED]  
 Dwelley, David Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D  
 mr\_ prefix is inherited from PoE and is meaningless here

SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove mr\_ prefixes throughout

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

CI 104 SC 104.3.3.4 P 18 L 18 # 38 [REDACTED]  
 Dwelley, David Linear Technology

Comment Type E Comment Status D  
 "If true then valid. If false then invalid" is unnecessarily terse.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Change to "True indicates that valid class information was received."

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

CI 104 SC 104.3.3.5 P 18 L 38 # 39 [REDACTED]  
 Dwelley, David Linear Technology

Comment Type T Comment Status D  
 tclass\_watchdog\_timer is unlike other timer names - "watchdog" is superfluous

SuggestedRemedy  
 Change to "tclass\_timer" throughout.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

CI 104 SC 104.3.3.6 P 20 L 12 # 40 [REDACTED]  
 Dwelley, David Linear Technology

Comment Type T Comment Status D  
 Figure 104-4 (PSE state machine): mr\_pse\_enable term in exit of IDLE state is redundant since !mr\_pse\_enable globally leads to the DISABLED state

SuggestedRemedy  
 Change exit condition to pse\_ready only.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

CI 104 SC 104.3.3.6 P 20 L 38 # 41 [REDACTED]  
 Dwelley, David Linear Technology

Comment Type T Comment Status D  
 Exit from POWER\_UP state to POWER\_ON state: !tpon\_timer\_done term is redundant since tpon\_timer\_done exits to RESTART\_DELAY without other conditions

SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove !tpon\_timer\_done term

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Please configure project comments

---

CI 104 SC 104.1 P 13 L 7 # 44  
XU, Dayin Rockwell Automation

Comment Type ER Comment Status D  
the first letter of "power" and "interface" words should be capital letter

SuggestedRemedy  
Change "power interface" to "Power Interface"

Proposed Response Response Status W  
PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

---

CI 104 SC 104.1.2.1 P 13 L 51 # 45  
XU, Dayin Rockwell Automation

Comment Type E Comment Status D  
The subclause 104.1.2.1 has no relationship to 104.1.2, should remove it or move the subclause 104.1.2.1 to somewhere else.

SuggestedRemedy  
Remove subclause 104.1.2.1, and combine the description into the subclause 104.1.4

Proposed Response Response Status W  
PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

---

CI 104 SC 104.1.3 P 14 L 1 # 46  
XU, Dayin Rockwell Automation

Comment Type ER Comment Status D  
The format of the title of the subclause in IEEE802.3 standard should be "only first letter of first work is in capital, all other words' first letter is in lower case". This comment applies to all similar places (e.g. line 21 page 15) in this draft.

SuggestedRemedy  
Change "Relationship of 1-pair PoDL to the IEEE802.3 Architecture" to "Relationship of 1-pair PoDL to the IEEE802.3 architecture". Review all titles of subclause in this draft, ensure the correct format is used.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

---

CI 104 SC 104.1.3 P 14 L 3 # 47  
XU, Dayin Rockwell Automation

Comment Type ER Comment Status D  
The power entity in a device supporting 1-pair PoDL should not be optional.

SuggestedRemedy  
Change "1-pair PoDL comprises an optional power entity ..." to "1-pair PoDL comprises a power entity ...".

Proposed Response Response Status W  
PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

---

CI 104 SC 104.2 P 15 L 29 # 48  
XU, Dayin Rockwell Automation

Comment Type ER Comment Status D  
Table 104-1  
The reader may not clearly understand the meaning of unreg and reg in Table 104-1. Description on the meaning is necessary.

SuggestedRemedy  
Adding description of "unreg" and "reg" in Table 104-1.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

---

CI 104 SC 104.3.3 P 20 L 15 # 49  
XU, Dayin Rockwell Automation

Comment Type T Comment Status D  
Figure 104-4  
The name of "START\_DETECTION" and "START\_CLASSIFICATION" is more like a behavior not a state.

SuggestedRemedy  
Change "START\_DETECTION" to "PD\_DETECTION" or "DETECTION", and change "START\_CLASSIFICATION" to "PD\_CLASSIFICATION" or "CLASSIFICATION"

Proposed Response Response Status W  
PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Please configure project comments

Cl 104 SC 5.3.1 P 33 L 1 # 71  
 Donahue, Curtis UNH-IOL  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D  
 Font of Equation 104-2 doesnt seem right.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use appropriate font in equation 104-2.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 104 SC 6.3.2 P 35 L 39 # 75  
 Donahue, Curtis UNH-IOL  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D  
 "Figure 104-11" should be "Figure 104-10".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 104 SC 5.3.1 P 33 L 13 # 72  
 Donahue, Curtis UNH-IOL  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D  
 "Equation 104-1" should be "Equation 104-2".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 104 SC 6.3.3 P 36 L 12 # 76  
 Donahue, Curtis UNH-IOL  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D  
 "Figure 104-11" should be "Figure 104-10".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 104 SC 6.2 P 34 L 30 # 73  
 Donahue, Curtis UNH-IOL  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D  
 "Figure 104-9" should be "Figure 104-8".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 104 SC 6.3.4 P 37 L 16 # 77  
 Donahue, Curtis UNH-IOL  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D  
 Item 8 is missing from Table 104-7  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Renumber Items 9-14 as Items 8-13.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 104 SC 6.3.1 P 35 L 10 # 74  
 Donahue, Curtis UNH-IOL  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D  
 "Figure 104-10" should be "figure 104-9".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Cl 104 SC 6.4.3 P 38 L 12 # 78  
 Donahue, Curtis UNH-IOL  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D  
 "Figure 104-13" should be "Figure 104-12".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Please configure project comments

CI 104A SC 1 P 42 L 35 # 79  
 Donahue, Curtis UNH-IOL  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D  
 "at short cable length?"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change to "a short cable length" or "short cable lengths".  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

CI 104A SC 2 P 42 L 41 # 80  
 Donahue, Curtis UNH-IOL  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D  
 Break first paragraph into 2 sentences.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change to "RLoop is defined as the sum of the PSE source resistance, RPSE, and link segment round trip resistance. The maximum resistance of the link segment wire pair (per unit length) is given by:".  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

CI 104 SC 99 P 1 L 22 # 81  
 Donahue, Curtis UNH-IOL  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D  
 The Draft version in the text is D1.1.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Update to the appropriate draft revision.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

CI 104 SC 1 P 13 L 7 # 82  
 Donahue, Curtis UNH-IOL  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D  
 "power interface (PI)" is all lowercase but "Power Source Equipment (PSE)" and "Powered Device (PD)" have capitalized first letters. This happens many times throughout the draft. Is this intentional?  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Make "PI", "PSE", and "PD" consistent with capitalized letters.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

CI 104 SC 1.3 P 14 L 11 # 83  
 Donahue, Curtis UNH-IOL  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D  
 Figure number is "104-1-1", also "modell".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change to "Figure 104-1 1-Pair PoDL power sourcing equipment (PSE) relationship to the physical interface circuitry and the IEEE 802.3 Ethernet model".  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

CI 104 SC 1.3 P 14 L 31 # 84  
 Donahue, Curtis UNH-IOL  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D  
 ure number is "104-2-1", also "modell". As well as "PHY", which is not in the title for Figure 104-1.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change to "Figure 104-2 1-Pair PoDL powered device (PD) relationship to the physical interface circuitry and the IEEE 802.3 Ethernet model".  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Please configure project comments

CI 104 SC 1.4 P 14 L 54 # 85  
 Donahue, Curtis UNH-IOL  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D  
 I'm no expert but to me "compatible with 100BASE-T1 Ethernet" doesnt roll off the tongue very easily.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "with 100BASE-T1 Ethernet" to "with a 100BASE-T1 PHY". This also happens in 104.3.1 and 104.4.1.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

CI 104 SC 1.4 P 15 L 1 # 86  
 Donahue, Curtis UNH-IOL  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D  
 Same as last comment except for "1000BASE-T1"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change "with 1000BASE-T1 Ethernet" to "with a 1000BASE-T1 PHY". This also happens in 104.3.1 and 104.4.1.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

CI 104 SC 1.4 P 15 L 6 # 87  
 Donahue, Curtis UNH-IOL  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D  
 Figure number is "104-3-1".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove "-1".  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

CI 104 SC 2 P 15 L 30 # 88  
 Donahue, Curtis UNH-IOL  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D  
 I believe there should be a space between the 12/24/48 and "V".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change to "12 V", "24 V", and "48 V". Also happens in Table 104-6. Fix and make consistent throughout draft.  
 FrameMaker: Use ctrl+space.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

CI 104 SC 3.3.2 P 16 L 46 # 89  
 Donahue, Curtis UNH-IOL  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D  
 "21.5" is an external reference and should be green.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment. This also happens in 104.4.3.2.  
 FrameMaker: Right-click on text, Character > External.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

CI 104 SC 3.3.3 P 18 L 7 # 90  
 Donahue, Curtis UNH-IOL  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D  
 "IPort" and "ISleep" need to be capital "I" and subscript "Port" or "Sleep".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See comment. Make consistent throughout draft.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

Please configure project comments

---

Cl **104** SC **3.3.4** P **18** L **29** # **91**

Donahue, Curtis UNH-IOL

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D**

"14.2.3.2" is an external reference and should be green.

*SuggestedRemedy*

See comment. This also happens in 104.4.3.4.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.

---

Cl **104** SC **3.3.6** P **19** L **13** # **92**

Donahue, Curtis UNH-IOL

Comment Type **T** Comment Status **D**

"Table 104-11" doesnt exist.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Update with correct cross-reference.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT. EZ.